Federalism and Second Chambers

Regional Representation in Parliamentary Federations: the Australian Senate and German Bundesrat Compared

"Regionalism & Federalism"
No.2
## Contents

List of Tables ............................................................................................................. 11

Acknowledgements .................................................................................................... 15

Preface ......................................................................................................................... 17

**Chapter 1. The Role of the Second Chamber as a States House** .................................................. 25

I. Introduction: The Rationale of Second Chambers in Federal States .......................................................... 25

II. The Second Chamber as a Regional Chamber: A Framework for Analysis ................................................. 29

   A. Bicameral Strength: Composition and Powers of the Second Chamber Assessed .................................. 30
   B. Bicameral Strength and Regional Representation .............................................................................. 40
   C. The Broader Institutional Environment ............................................................................................ 43

III. Selecting the Australian Senate and the German Bundesrat for Comparative Research ..................... 56

   A. Studying Australian and German Bicameralism: the Similarities .................................................. 57
   B. Studying Australian and German Bicameralism: the Major Differences ..................................... 62

IV. Methodological Considerations: Measuring Regional Representation .................................................. 65

**Chapter 2. The Powers of the Australian Senate and German Bundesrat Compared** ..................... 71

I. Introduction ................................................................................................................ 71

II. The Power of the Second Chamber: Origins and Practical Significance ............................................. 72

   A. The Australian Senate .................................................................................................................... 72
   B. The German Bundesrat ................................................................................................................. 83
Federalism and Second Chambers

III. Centralization and How it Affects the Second Chamber Differently ............................................. 95
   A. Centralization in Australia and Germany: Similar Causes, but Different Outcomes for the Institutional Position of the Second Chamber .......... 95
   B. Centralization in Germany and the Position of the Bundesrat ...................................................... 98
   C. Delegated (Subordinate or Secondary) Legislation ................................................................. 103

IV. Conclusion ................................................................. 105

Chapter 3. The Australian Senate and German Bundesrat: Composition and Bicameral Incongruence ........................................ 107

I. Introduction ........................................................................ 107

II. Direct Elections vs. Indirect Elections ................................ 108
   A. The Directly Elected Australian Senate ..................................................................................... 108
   B. The German Bundesrat: Indirect Elections ............................................................................. 117

III. Equal or Weighted Regional Representation (ERR or WRR) ........................................................................ 124
   A. The Origins of ERR and WRR ................................................................................................. 125
   B. The Theoretical Consequences of ERR and WRR: Australian and German Gini Coefficients .......................................................................... 130
   C. The Party Political Consequences of ERR and WRR .............................................................. 135

IV. Conclusion ........................................................................ 149

Chapter 4. The Members of the Australian Senate and German Bundesrat as Party Agents ................ 153

I. Introduction ........................................................................ 153

II. The Party Organizations ...................................................... 155
   A. Party Organizations in Australia .................................................................................................. 155
   B. Party Organizations in Germany .................................................................................................. 167
   C. The Relationship between the Federal and Regional Party Branches: Interventions of the Federal Party Executive during Regional Election Campaigns and in the Building of Regional Coalition Governments .................................................. 183

III. The Parliamentary Party Groups ......................................... 186
   A. The Parliamentary Party Groups in Australia ............................................................................. 187
   B. Party Coordination without Formal Parliamentary Party Groups: The Bundesrat ..................... 193

IV. Conclusion ........................................................................ 200
C. Initiation of Legislative Proposals by the Bundesrat ................................................................. 290  
D. The Members of the Bundesrat and Their Right to Speak (or Rederecht) in the Lower House .......... 295  
III. The Bundesrat and the Tensions between Federalism and Party Politics Illustrated: A Qualitative Approach .......... 297  
   A. 1949-1966: Christian Democratic Dominance Weakened during Two Brief Periods ..................... 301  
   D. The First Nine Years of the Kohl Era (1982-1991) .... 315  
   E. The Last Seven Years of the Kohl Era (1991-1998) .. 319  
IV. Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 333  

Chapter 8. Concluding and Comparative Observations ................................................................. 337  
I. Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 337  
II. The Australian Senate and the German Bundesrat as States Houses: Concluding Observations .................. 338  
III. The Second Chamber and the Dynamics of Federalism ......................................................... 347  
IV. Comparative Observations ......................................................................................... 349  
   A. Reform of Directly Elected Second Chambers: Belgium and Spain ................................. 350  
   B. The Non-Reform of Nominated Second Chambers: The Canadian Senate and the UK House of Lords .... 358  
   C. Regional Representation in Two Indirectly Elected Second Chambers: The Austrian Bundesrat and Indian Raiya Sabha................................. 363  
   D. The German Bundesrat and Council of Ministers of the European Union ....................... 367  

List of Interviews .................................................................................................................. 371  

Bibliographical References ............................................................................................................... 373  

Appendix I ................................................................................................................................. 407  
Appendix II ................................................................................................................................. 411  
Appendix III .............................................................................................................................. 415