THE CNN EFFECT

The myth of news, foreign policy and intervention

Piers Robinson

London and New York
CONTENTS

List of tables xi

Introduction 1

Overview 1
Organisation of chapters 5
Acknowledgements 6

1 The CNN effect considered 7

Media power and world politics 7
The 1990s and intervention during humanitarian crises 7
The CNN effect debate takes off 10
Manufacturing consent and theories of media-state relations 12
Observing the ‘unobservable’ 16
Interview-based research 16
The importance of theory 19
Theory-based research 20
The CNN effect as political control 21
The CNN effect as political control reconsidered 23
The need for systematic and theoretically informed research 23

2 Developing a theory of media influence 25

Policy uncertainty 26
Observing policy uncertainty 26
Media framing 27
Developing the policy–media interaction model 30
The policy–media interaction model: offering an advanced two-way understanding of media-state relations 32
Wolfsfeld’s political contest model of media-state relations 35
Types of effect 37
CONTENTS

The weak CNN effect 38
Accelerant and impediment effects 39
Potential CNN effect 40
Enabling effect 40
Testing the CNN effect 41
Additional research strategies 43
Case selection 43
Conclusion 45

3 The CNN effect myth 46

Overview 46
The 1991–2 civil war in Somalia 46
US re-engagement in Somalia 47
The lead-up to the August 1992 airlift 47
Operation Restore Hope 48
Possible causes of intervention 49
Applying the policy-media interaction model 52
Media framing after the intervention decision 55
News media and US intervention in Somalia: a case of manufacturing consent or indexing and not the strong CNN effect 57
Consideration of other possible routes of media influence 59
The myth of the strong CNN effect and Somalia 62
Intervention in northern Iraq: the case of the Kurds 63
From policy certainty against involvement, to US ground troops in northern Iraq 64
US media coverage of the Kurdish crisis: emotive and critical of Bush 67
Assessing the impact: was operation Provide Comfort motivated by media coverage? 69
The myth of the CNN effect 71

4 The CNN effect in action 72

Overview 72
Background 72
US involvement in 1995 73
US military engagement 75
Media framing: empathising with refugees and criticising Western policy 78
‘What do we do next?’ 81
Assessing media influence 82
Recognising the importance of other factors 84
The 1994 market-place massacre 86
CONTENTS

Policy uncertainty 87
News media coverage between 5 and 9 February 1994 90
Assessing the impact 91
Conclusion 92

5 The limits of the CNN effect 93
Overview 93
Kosovo 94
September 1998 to March 1999: the lead-up to US military intervention 94
Operation Allied Force 95
Kosovo and the media 97
News media empathy and some criticism of official policy 99
'No intention to use ground troops' 103
Was there a secret decision to launch a ground invasion? 104
Media influence: enabling and impediment effects, but no strong CNN effect 107
Media performance: manufacturing consent or government watchdog? 108
Media–state relations during the Kosovo campaign 109
Genocide in Rwanda 110
PDD 25 and US policy certainty against intervention 111
Distance framing 114
Assessment 115
Media influence and performance during executive policy certainty 116

6 The CNN effect reconsidered 117
Overview 117
Determining the conditions under which the CNN effect occurs 117
The strong CNN effect: influencing air power intervention during humanitarian crises but not the deployment of ground troops 121
Future research 126
Concluding comments: media power in the post-Cold War era 128

Appendix A: Policy uncertainty 133
Theoretical development of policy uncertainty 133
Measuring levels of policy uncertainty 135