Human Rights Protection for Refugees, Asylum-Seekers, and Internally Displaced Persons

A Guide to International Mechanisms and Procedures

Joan Fitzpatrick
Editor
Contents

Acknowledgments xxi
Editor's Foreword xxiii
Contributors xxv
Table of Abbreviations xxix

Chapter 1. The Human Rights of Refugees, Asylum-Seekers, and Internally Displaced Persons: A Basic Introduction

JOAN FITZPATRICK 1

1. Introduction 1
2. Who Are Refugees, Asylum-Seekers, and Internally Displaced Persons? 3
3. Identifying Rights at Risk and Framing a Human Rights Claim 6
   3.1 The Right to Life and to Physical Integrity 8
   3.2 Equality and Non-Discrimination 9
   3.3 Personal Liberty 10
   3.4 Other Civil and Political Rights 11
   3.5 Freedom of Movement 11
   3.6 The Right to Family Life 13
   3.7 Social and Economic Rights 14
   3.8 The Need for Documents 14
   3.9 Property Rights 15
4. A Basic Primer on the Nature of International Human Rights Law and the Varied Functions of Enforcement Bodies 15
   4.1 The Nature of International Human Rights Law 16
Chapter 2. Protection Under the Complaint Procedures of the United Nations Treaty Bodies

ANNE BAYEFSKY, STEPHANIE FARRIOR, KAREN HANRAHAN, AND ANDREW LANGHAM

1. Brief Overview of Individual Complaints Under International Human Rights Treaties
2. Admissibility Criteria for Individual Complaints
   2.1 Jurisdiction Ratione Personae—Eligible Complaints
      2.1.1 Who Can Bring a Complaint?
      2.1.2 Against Whom May a Complaint Be Filed?
   2.2 Jurisdiction Ratione Materiæ—What Must the Complaint Concern?
   2.3 Jurisdiction Ratione Temporis—When Must the Alleged Violation Have Occurred?
   2.4 Jurisdiction Ratione Loci—Where Must theViolation Have Occurred?
   2.5 Must Domestic Remedies Have Been Exhausted?
   2.6 Are There Any Time Limits for Bringing a Complaint?
   2.7 Concurrent and Successive Jurisdiction
   2.8 Other Admissibility Criteria
      2.8.1 Anonymity
      2.8.2 Abuse of the Right to Submit a Communication
      2.8.3 Incompatibility with the Provisions of the Treaty—Manifestly Ill-Founded
          Complaint
   2.9 Checklist for Submissions
3. Substantive Rights and Significant Jurisprudence
   3.1 Protection Under the 1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
      3.1.1 The Right to Life and Physical Integrity
3.1.2 Equality and Non-Discrimination 52
3.1.3 Personal Liberty 56
3.1.4 Right to a Fair Trial and Due Process of Law 59
3.1.5 Right to Vote and Participate in the Political Process 60
3.1.6 Freedom of Religion 60
3.1.7 Freedom of Expression 61
3.1.8 Freedom of Association 62
3.1.9 Freedom of Movement 63
3.1.10 The Right to Family and Private Life 68
3.1.11 Right to a Nationality 70
3.1.12 Recognition as a Person Before the Law 70
3.1.13 Prohibition of Trafficking of Women and Girls and Exploitation of Prostitution 71
3.1.14 Economic and Social Rights of the Child 72
3.1.15 Economic and Social Rights Through Equality Before the Law and Equal Protection of the Law 73

3.2 Protection Under the 1984 Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment 73
3.2.1 The Right to Physical and Mental Integrity—Prohibition Against Torture 76
3.2.2 Equality and Non-Discrimination 82
3.2.3 Personal Liberty 83
3.2.4 Right to a Fair Trial and Due Process of Law 83
3.2.5 Freedom of Movement 83

3.3 Protection Under the 1965 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination 84
3.3.1 The Right to Life and Physical Integrity 87
3.3.2 Equality and Non-Discrimination 88
3.3.3 Personal Liberty 89
3.3.4 Right to a Fair Trial and Due Process of Law 89
3.3.5 Right to Vote and Participate in the Political Process 89
3.3.6 Freedom of Religion 89
3.3.7 Freedom of Expression 89
3.3.8 Freedom of Association 90
3.3.9 Freedom of Movement 90
3.3.10 Right to Family and Private Life 91
3.3.11 Right to a Nationality 91
3.3.12 Right to Shelter/Housing 92
3.3.13 Right to Health Care 92
3.3.14 Right to Education 92
3.3.15 Right to Work 92
3.3.16 Right to Social Support 93
3.3.17 Property Rights 93
3.3.18 Additional Issues 94

3.4 Protection Under the 1979 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women and the 1999 Optional Protocol 95
3.4.1 Definition of “Discrimination Against Women” 95
3.4.2 The Right to Life and Physical Integrity 97
3.4.3 Equality and Non-Discrimination 99
3.4.4 Right to a Fair Trial and Due Process of Law 101
3.4.5 Right to Vote and Participate in the Political Process 101
3.4.6 Freedom of Religion 101
3.4.7 Freedom of Expression 102
3.4.8 Freedom of Association 102
3.4.9 Freedom of Movement 102
3.4.10 The Right to Family and Private Life 102
3.4.11 Rights Regarding Nationality 103
3.4.12 Right to Food, Clothing and Shelter 104
3.4.13 Access to Health Care 104
3.4.14 Right to Education 105
3.4.15 Employment Rights 106
3.4.16 Equal Rights in Economic Life 107
3.4.17 Property Rights 107

3.5 Additional Relevant Articles in the Women’s Convention 107
3.5.1 Temporary Measures to Accelerate Equality 107
Chapter 3. The United Nations Charter-Based Mechanisms

CAMILLE GIFFARD AND MEAGAN HRLE

1. Introduction
2. Setting the Context
   2.1 Context in Which the Charter-Based Mechanisms Function
   2.2 Why Are Charter-Based Mechanisms Relevant to Refugees, Asylum-Seekers, and Internally Displaced Persons?
Chapter 4. African Regional Mechanisms That Can Be Utilized on Behalf of the Forcibly Displaced

CHIDI ANSELM ODINKALU AND MONETTE ZARD

1. Introduction 259
2. African Regional Mechanisms 262
   2.1 The Organization of African Unity (OAU) 262
      2.1.1 The 1981 African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights 263
      2.1.2 The African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights 267
      2.1.3 African Court of Human and Peoples’ Rights 275
      2.1.4 The African Committee of Experts on the Rights and Welfare of the Child 277
   2.2 The OAU Division for Refugees, Displaced Persons, and Humanitarian Assistance 279
   2.3 The OAU Mechanism for Conflict Prevention, Management, and Resolution 282
3. Sub-Regional Mechanisms 283
   3.1 The Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) 283
      3.1.1 Aims and Objectives of the ECOWAS 285
      3.1.2 Institutions of the Community 287
      3.1.3 The ECOWAS, Human Rights, and Migration 287
      3.1.4 The Community Court of Justice 289
   3.2 L’Union Économique et Monétaire de l’Afrique de l’Ouest (UEMOA) 290
      3.2.1 Aims and Objectives of the UEMOA 291
      3.2.2 Institutions of the Union 291
      3.2.3 The UEMOA, Human Rights, and Migration 292
3.2.4 The Community Court of Justice

3.3 The Inter-Governmental Authority on Development (IGAD)
3.3.1 The IGAD Institutions
3.3.2 The IGAD, Human Rights, and Migration
3.3.3 The IGAD Conflict Resolution Mechanism

3.4 The East African Community (EAC)
3.4.1 The EAC Institutions
3.4.2 The EAC, Human Rights, and Migration
3.4.3 The EAC Community Court of Justice

3.5 The Southern African Development Community (SADC)
3.5.1 Aims and Objectives of the SADC
3.5.2 Institutions of the SADC
3.5.3 The SADC, Human Rights, and Migration
3.5.4 The SADC and Gender
3.5.5 The SADC Tribunal

3.6 The African Economic Community (AEC)
3.6.1 Objectives
3.6.2 Institutions

3.7 The African Union

4. Conclusion

Bibliography

Chapter 5. European Human Rights Mechanisms
Diane Atkinson-Sanford

1. Introduction
1.1 Avenues of Redress in Europe
1.2 A Note on the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union

2. Advocacy
2.1 Individual Petition Mechanisms in Europe: The European Court of Human Rights
2.2 Some Background on the ECHR and the Court
2.2.1 Institutional Framework of the Court
2.2.2 Checklist: Are You Ready and Willing to Bring a Case Before the Court?
2.2.3 Interpreting the Checklist: What Do These Considerations Mean? 321
2.2.4 Interim Measures 321
2.2.5 Friendly Settlement 322
2.2.6 Just Satisfaction 324
2.2.7 Other Considerations: Legal Aid 330
2.2.8 Legal Representation 331
2.2.9 Language Considerations 331
2.2.10 Enforcing the Court's Judgments—Effectiveness of Remedies 332

2.3 Admissibility Criteria 334
2.3.1 Jurisdiction Ratione Personae—Who Is Liable and Who Can Be Sued? 334
2.3.2 Jurisdiction Ratione Materiæ—What Must the Complaint Concern? 334
2.3.3 Jurisdiction Ratione Temporis—When Must the Alleged Events Have Occurred? 345
2.3.4 Jurisdiction Ratione Loci—Where Must the Alleged Violation Have Occurred? 346
2.3.5 Must Domestic Remedies Have Been Exhausted? 347
2.3.6 Other Admissibility Criteria 353
2.3.7 Submitting the Application to the Court 353
2.3.8 Timeline for Making an Application to the Court 354

3. ECHR Jurisprudence and Refugees, Asylum-Seekers, and IDPs 359

3.1 The Right to Life and Physical Integrity 362
3.1.1 The Prohibition on the Taking of Life 363
3.1.2 Positive Obligations under Article 2—Failure to Enforce the Criminal Law 369
3.1.3 Failure to Investigate or Prosecute 371
3.1.4 Extradition, Expulsion, and Article 2 373

3.2 Torture and Inhuman and Degrading Treatment 373
3.2.1 Standard of Proof 374
3.2.2 Torture 374
3.2.3 Inhuman Treatment 374
3.2.4 Degrading Treatment 375
3.2.5 Article 3 and Extradition, Expulsion, and Deportation—Non-Refoulement 376
3.2.6 Non-Derogability of Article 3 379
3.2.7 Capital Punishment and Article 3 380
3.2.8 Health Care and Article 3 381
3.3 Article 8—The Right to Private Life 382
3.4 Equality and Non-discrimination 282
3.5 Personal Liberty 385
  3.5.1 Article 5 and Internally Displaced Persons 385
  3.5.2 Article 5 and Asylum-Seekers and Refugees 385
3.6 Right to a Fair Trial and Due Process of Law 388
  3.6.1 Article 6—The Right to a Fair Trial and Asylum Applications 388
  3.6.2 Procedural Protections for Aliens Facing Expulsion, Article 1 Protocol 7 389
  3.6.3 The Right to a Fair Trial 390
3.7 The Right to Vote and to Participate in the Political Process 391
  3.7.1 The Right to Vote and Citizens 391
  3.7.2 The Right-to Vote and Non-Citizens (Refugees and Asylum-Seekers) 392
3.8 Freedom of Religion, Thought, and Conscience 392
  3.8.1 Article 9 and Proof of a Subjective Belief 392
  3.8.2 Limitations on the Ability to Manifest a Religious Belief 393
  3.8.3 Article 9 and Non-State Actors 393
3.9 Freedom of Expression 394
  3.9.1 Establishing the Existence of an Interference with Article 10 395
  3.9.2 Justification for the Interference 395
  3.9.3 Positive Duties Under Article 10 401
3.10 Freedom of Assembly and Association 401
  3.10.1 Freedom to Assemble Peacefully 402
  3.10.2 Restrictions on the Right to Assemble Peacefully 402
  3.10.3 Freedom of Association 403
3.10.4 The Freedom to Form and Join Political Parties 403

3.11 Freedom of Movement 404
3.11.1 Expulsion of Nationals 404
3.11.2 Collective Expulsion of Aliens 404
3.11.3 The Right to Asylum 405

3.12 The Right to Family and Private Life 405
3.12.1 Limitations on Article 8 405
3.12.2 The Home 406
3.12.3 The Right to a Personal Identity 407
3.12.4 Article 8, Deportation, and Expulsion 408
3.12.5 The Right to Reunification 411

3.13 The Right to Marry 413

3.14 The Prohibition Against Slavery, Servitude, and Forced or Compulsory Labor 414

3.15 Access to Food, Clothing, Social Support and Shelter 415

3.16 Access to Education 415

3.17 Protection of Property: The Right to the Enjoyment of One’s Possessions 416
3.17.1 Meaning of “Possessions” 416
3.17.2 A “Deprivation” of Property 416
3.17.3 Limitations on the Enjoyment of One’s Property 417
3.17.4 State Control of Property 418
3.17.5 International Law and Expropriation of the Property of an Alien 419
3.17.6 Compensation 419

4. Other European Human Rights Mechanisms 420
4.1 The 1961 European Social Charter 420
4.1.1 Collective Complaints Mechanism 422
4.2 The 1987 European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment 422
4.3 The 1995 Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities 424
4.4 Commissioner for Human Rights 425
4.5 Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) 425
4.6 The European Union 427
4.6.1 The European Union and Human Rights 428
4.6.2 Individuals and the ECJ 429
Chapter 6. The Inter-American Mechanisms

BETH LYON AND SOREN ROTTMAN

1. The Major Bodies
   1.1 The Organization of American States (OAS)
   1.2 The Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
   1.3 The Inter-American Court of Human Rights
   1.4 Inter-Institutional Coordination

2. Admissibility Criteria for Individual Complaints
   2.1 Jurisdiction Ratione Personae—The Parties to an Individual Complaint
      2.1.1 Who Can Bring a Complaint?
      2.1.2 Against Whom Can a Complaint Be Brought?
   2.2 Jurisdiction Ratione Materiæ—What Must the Complaint Concern?
      2.2.1 Rights Protected by Regional Instruments
      2.2.2 Acts or Omissions Committed by a State, Its Agents, Officials, Etc.
      2.2.3 Court of the Fourth Instance Rule
   2.3 Jurisdiction Ratione Temporis
   2.4 Jurisdiction Ratione Loci
   2.5 Must Domestic Remedies Have Been Exhausted?
      2.5.1 Due Process of Law
      2.5.2 Denial of Access to Domestic Remedies or Prevention
      2.5.3 Unwarranted Delay of Domestic Remedies
   2.6 Once Domestic Remedies Have Been Exhausted, Is There a Time Limit Within Which a Complaint Must Be Brought in Order to Be Admissible?
   2.7 Concurrent Jurisdiction—If Another International Body Is Examining the Matter, Can the Mechanism in Question Still Admit It?
   2.1 The Right to Return Home
      2.1.1 Property Rights
      2.1.2 Personal Security
      2.1.3 Discrimination
   2.2 Restitution and Transitional Justice
3. Institutional Models for the Protection of IDPs
   3.1 Mass Property Title Determination: The Property Commission
   3.2 Human Rights Standards Setting: The Human Rights Chamber and Ombudsman
   3.3 Human Rights Advocacy: The Federation Ombudsmen
   3.4 Managing Housing Stocks: Municipal Housing Offices
4. Assessing the Institutional Choices

Bibliography

Appendices
Appendix 1A Relevant Human Rights Manuals/Resources
Appendix 1B Participants at the Consultation on the International Human Rights Complaints Mechanisms Available to Refugees and Internally Displaced Persons
Appendix 1D List of States Parties to Selected Human Rights Treaties
Appendix 2A Contact Information for UN Treaty Bodies
Appendix 2B Information on Complaints to the Human Rights Committee
Appendix 2C CAT Fact Sheet and Complaint
Appendix 2D Information on Complaints to the Committee Against Torture
Appendix 2E Information on Complaints to the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
Appendix 3A Contact Information (Charter-Based Bodies)
Appendix 3B Model Complaints

3B1 Working Group on Arbitrary Detention
3B2  Working Group on Enforced and Involuntary Disappearances  594
3B3  Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Opinion and Expression  598
3B4  Special Rapporteur on Torture  601
3B5  Special Rapporteur on Violence Against Women  603

Appendix 3C  Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement  605

Appendix 3D  Principles on the Detention of Asylum-Seekers and Immigrants of the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention  619

Appendix 4A  Requirements for Complaints to the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights  623
Appendix 4B  Useful Addresses  625

Appendix 5A  Requirements for Complaints to the European Court of Human Rights  629

Appendix 6A  Sample IACHR Complaint Form  631
Appendix 6B  States Parties to the Organization of American States Charter  635

Appendix 7A  Contact Information (International Criminal Tribunals)  637

Bibliography of Cited International Instruments  639

Index  647

About The Procedural Aspects of International Law Institute  663

Procedural Aspects of International Law Monograph Series  663

Other PAIL Institute Publications  665