FEDERALISM AND FRICTIONS IN CENTRE-STATE RELATIONS
A COMPARATIVE REVIEW OF INDIAN AND GERMAN CONSTITUTIONS

K.L. BHATIA
Professor of Law, Head of the Department,
Faculty of Law, University of Jammu, Jammu
Guest Fellow
Max-Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law
and International Law, Heidelberg, Germany

Foreword by
PROFESSOR DR. RÜDIGER WOLFRUM
Director at the Max-Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law
and International Law, Heidelberg, Germany

DEEP & DEEP PUBLICATIONS PVT. LTD.
F-159, Rajouri Garden, New Delhi-110027
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exordial Remarks</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues of Tension/Conflicts/Friction/Irritation</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Areas of Friction and Identifying Measures of Easing Tension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. FEDERALISM: RESTATEMENT OF CONCEPTS</strong></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Federal idea Rediscovered/Revisited/Re-examined from Classical to Recent Perceptions</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Historical Background of the Federal Concept in India</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Historical Background of the Federal Concept in Germany</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Federalism and Judicial Attitude: Indian Supreme Court and the Federal Constitutional Court of Germany</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS: SIMILARITIES AND DISSIMILARITIES</strong></td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Similarities and Dissimilarities</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Federal Expression—Absent in Indian Constitutional Vocabulary and Present in German Basic Law Vocabulary</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(ii) Sovereignty: Both the Constitution of India and the Basic Law of Germany Vest in the People 75

(iii) Citizenship: Peculiarities in a Federation: India and Germany 79

(iv) Just Ways and Just Means: Objectives of Constitutional Principles to Structuring Federal Scheme 83

(a) The Division of Powers in India 85
   A. Legislative 85
   B. Administrative 96

(b) The Division of Powers in Germany 102
   A. Legislative 102
   B. Administrative 116

(c) Fiscal Relations 123
   A. Indian Constitution and the Financial Relations 123
      Irritant Issues 131
   B. German Basic Law and the Financial Relations 141

4. NEW CHALLENGES TO FEDERALISM 156
   Introduction 156
   New Challenges 158
   1. From Destructive Vote of No-Confidence to Constructive Vote of No-Confidence Alternative to Article 356 158
   2. Autonomy Incompatible with Constitutional Permissibility 178
   3. Impact of Terrorism, Militancy upon Federalism 195
   4. New Information Technology, Foreign Policy and Challenge to Federal Structure 204
   5. Judicial Independence, Judicial Integrity and Judicial Appointment vis-a-vis Federalism: Independence from External and Internal Control 209
      Judicial Independence and the Constitution-making 211
      Judicial Independence: Independence from External and Internal Control 215
      Judiciary and Judicial Independence 219
## Contents

6. Internally Displaced Persons—Challenge to Federalism 233  
7. Local Government: Another Dimension of Federalism 242  
8. Environmental Problems and Federalism 255  
9. SAARC: A Study of Strategic Perceptions in the-Essence of Synergistic Federalism 276  
10. Federal Comity: Relationship of Trust and Faith between States and National Governments 284  

5. CONSTITUTION REVIEW FOR RESTRUCTURE 292  
6. RETROSPECT AND CONCLUSION 307  

*Appendix:*  
Basic Law for the Federal Republic of Germany, 1949 Amended upto 1999 337  
List of Cases 414  
Bibliography 418  
Index 427