The Authority of the Security Council
under Chapter VII of the UN Charter

Legal Limits and the Role of
the International Court of Justice

by

David Schweigman

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / BOSTON
## Contents

Note by the Series Editor v

Preface vii

Abbreviations ix

Introduction 1
  The Problems Addressed in this Work 4
  The Structure of the Work 5

1. The Interpretation of Treaties 7
  1.1 The Need for and Purpose of Interpretation 8
  1.2 Doctrinal Approaches to Interpretation 10
  1.3 The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 12
  1.4 The United Nations Charter as a Constitution 14
  1.5 The Approach towards Interpretation Adopted in this Work 19

2. The Authority of the Security Council under the UN Charter 25
  2.1 Introduction 25
  2.2 The Establishment of the United Nations 25
  2.3 Functions and Powers of the Security Council 26
    2.3.1 Articles 24 and 25 of the Charter 27
    2.3.2 Chapter VI: 'Pacific Settlement of Disputes' 33
    2.3.3 Chapter VII: 'International Peace and Security' 33
  2.4 The Exception: Self-Defence 42
  2.5 Relationship with other Organs 43
  2.6 Composition and Procedure of the Council 45
  2.7 Summary 49

3. Subsequent Practice: The Council’s Application of its Powers 51
  3.1 South Africa 1960-1994 52
    3.1.1 Factual Background 52
3.1.2 Security Council Action concerning South Africa 53
3.1.3 Summary 56
3.1.4 Analysis: The Application of Chapter VII by the Council 56

3.2 Southern Rhodesia 1963-1979 57
3.2.1 Factual Background 57
3.2.2 Security Council Action concerning Southern Rhodesia 59
3.2.3 Summary 61
3.2.4 Analysis: The Application of Chapter VII by the Council 62

3.3 Libya and the Lockerbie Incident 1988-2000 63
3.3.1 Factual Background 63
3.3.2 Security Council Action concerning Libya 64
3.3.3 Summary 66
3.3.4 Analysis: The Application of Chapter VII by the Council 67

3.4 Iraq 1990-2000 67
3.4.1 Factual Background: The Invasion of Kuwait 68
3.4.2.1 Condemnation and Sanctions 68
3.4.2.2 The Authorization to Use Force to Liberate Kuwait 71
3.4.2.3 The Cease-Fire and Resolution 687 (1991) 72
3.4.2.3.1 The Iraq-Kuwait Boundary 73
3.4.2.3.2 Disarmament 75
3.4.2.3.3 Iraqi Reparations 78
3.4.2.3.4 Continuing Sanctions 80
3.4.2.4 The Kurds in Iraq 81
3.4.3 Summary 82
3.4.4 Analysis: The Application of Chapter VII by the Council 82

3.5 Liberia 1990-1997 87
3.5.1 Factual Background 87
3.5.2.1 Establishment of a Weapons Embargo 88
3.5.2.2 Action through Regional Arrangements 89
3.5.3 Summary 92
3.5.4 Analysis: The Application of Chapter VII by the Council 93

3.6 Former Yugoslavia 1991-2000 93
3.6.1 Factual Background: The Break up of Yugoslavia 94
3.6.2 Security Council Action concerning former Yugoslavia 97
3.6.2.1 The Establishment of Embargoes 97
3.6.2.2 The Establishment of Peacekeeping Operations 98
3.6.2.3 Humanitarian Assistance and the Embargo on Military Flights 100
3.6.2.4 The Establishment of ‘Safe Areas’ 101
3.13.1 Factual Background 146
3.13.2 Security Council Action concerning Afghanistan 147
3.13.3 Summary 148
3.13.4 Analysis: The Application of Chapter VII by the Council 149

3.14.1 Factual Background 149
3.14.3 Analysis: The Application of Chapter VII by the Council 150

3.15 Categorization and Analysis of Functions Assumed by the Council 150
3.15.1 Causes of Security Council Action 151
3.15.1.1 Humanitarian Concerns 151
3.15.1.2 Extradition of Alleged Terrorists 153
3.15.1.3 Preventive Measures 154
3.15.1.4 Quasi-Judicial Determinations 155
3.15.2 The Modalities of Chapter VII Measures 156
3.15.2.1 Determinations under Article 39 157
3.15.2.2 Measures under Article 41 of the Charter 158
3.15.2.2.1 Sanctions 158
3.15.2.2.2 The Establishment of Subsidiary Organs 159
3.15.2.3 Measures under Article 42 160

4. Sources and Content of the Legal Limits to the Council’s Powers 163
4.1 Introduction to the Problem 163
4.2 Charter-based Constraints 165
4.2.1 Purposes and Principles of the United Nations 167
4.2.1.1 Article 1(2): Self-Determination 169
4.2.1.2 Article 1(3): Respect for Human Rights 171
4.2.1.3 Article 2(1): Sovereign Equality 172
4.2.1.4 Article 2(2): Good Faith 173
4.2.1.5 Article 2(7): Domestic Jurisdiction 178
4.2.1.6 Articles 1 and 2 Generally: International Humanitarian Law 179
4.2.1.7 Interim Conclusions 181
4.2.2 Procedural Limits: Articles 27(3), 31 and 24(3) of the Charter 182
4.2.3 The provisions of Chapter VII 184
4.2.3.1 Seizure by the Council Under Article 39 184
4.2.3.2 Measures Under Articles 41 and 42 189
4.2.3.3 Article 51: Self-Defence 192
4.2.4 Miscellaneous Charter Provisions 193
4.3 Extra-Charter Constraints
   4.3.1 Treaty Law 194
   4.3.2 Customary International Law 195
   4.3.3 General Principles of Law 201

4.4 Conclusions 202

   5.1 Who Determines whether Council Decisions are ultra vires? 205
   5.2 The Right of Member States to Challenge Council Decisions 206
   5.3 Review by the International Court of Justice 210
      5.3.1.1 The Jurisdiction of the Court in Contentious Proceedings 211
      5.3.1.2 Jurisdiction of the Court in Advisory Proceedings 213
      5.3.1.3 The Court’s Compétence de la Compétence 215
      5.3.1.4 Preliminary Objections to the Exercise of Jurisdiction 216
      5.3.2.1 The Principle of Litispendence 217
      5.3.2.2 Origins of the Principle 217
      5.3.2.3 Litispendence in International Law 218
      5.3.2.4 Classification of Litispendence as a Preliminary Objection 220
      5.3.3.1 The World Court’s Case law relevant to Litispendence 220
      5.3.3.2 The League of Nations and the Permanent Court 220
      5.3.3.3 The Permanent Court on Litispendence: Polish Upper Silesia 223
      5.3.3.4 The League Council and the Court Concurrent Jurisdiction 226
      5.3.3.4.1 Settlers of German Origin 227
      5.3.3.4.2 Rights of Minorities in Upper Silesia (Minority Schools) 228
      5.3.3.4.3 Interpretation of the Statute of the Memel Territory 229
      5.3.3.5 Conclusions: The Permanent Court on Litispendence 230
      5.3.4.1 Concurrent Jurisdiction within the United Nations 231
      5.3.4.2 The International Court of Justice on Concurrent Jurisdiction 232
         5.3.4.2.1 The Aegean Continental Shelf Case 232
         5.3.4.2.2 United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran 235
         5.3.4.2.3 The Nicaragua Case 238
         5.3.4.2.4 The Bosnian Genocide Case 242
      5.3.4.3 Interim Conclusions 244
      5.3.4.4 The Lockerbie case 244
         5.3.4.4.1 The 1992 Order on Provisional Measures 246
         5.3.4.4.2 Libya’s Rights under the Montreal Convention 247
         5.3.4.4.3 Resolution 731 (1992) and the Court Proceedings 247