



A 341595

State Succession and Membership in International Organizations

Legal Theories *versus* Political Pragmatism

by

Konrad G. Bühler
✓



KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / BOSTON

CONTENTS

PREFACE	vii
ABBREVIATIONS	xv
I. INTRODUCTION.	1
II. PRELIMINARY OBSERVATIONS.	5
1. State Succession, Identity and Continuity.	5
1.1. How Should We Define "State Succession"?	5
1.2. The Classical Theories of Identity and Continuity – A Brief Critical Analysis.	7
2. Membership and Succession.	18
2.1. Membership in International Organizations – The Different Ways of Acquisition.	19
<i>(a) Acquisition of Membership by a Formal Process of Admission.</i>	21
<i>(b) Acquisition of Membership by a Mere Unilateral Act.</i>	23
<i>(c) Acquisition of Membership by Succession Pursuant to an Express Provision in the Constitution.</i>	26
2.2. The 1978 Vienna Convention and the Traditional Axiom of Non-Succession to Membership.	30
III. PRACTICE CONCERNING MEMBERSHIP BETWEEN 1945 AND 1990.	37
1. The Philippines – Independence in 1946.	37
1.1. The International Status of the Philippines before 1946.	37
1.2. Independence of the Philippines on July 4, 1946, and its Implications for Membership in International Organizations.	40
2. India and Pakistan – Independence of "British India" in 1947.	42
2.1. The International Status of "British India" before 1947.	42

2.2. Independence of "British India" on August 15, 1947, and its Implications for Membership of India and Pakistan in International Organizations.	44
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	45
(b) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	48
3. Syria and Egypt – the United Arab Republic (UAR) 1958-1961.	50
3.1. The Formation of the UAR in 1958 and its Implications for Membership in International Organizations.	50
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	51
(b) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	52
3.2. The Disintegration of the UAR in 1961 and its Implications for Syria's Membership in International Organizations.	57
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	57
(b) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	58
4. Mali and Senegal – the Dissolution of the Federation of Mali in 1960.	61
5. Tanganyika and Zanzibar – the Formation of the United Republic of Tanzania in 1964.	62
5.1. The Formation of the United Republic of Tanzania in 1964 and its Implications for Membership in International Organizations.	62
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	62
(b) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	65
6. The Democratic Republic of Vietnam (DRV, North Vietnam) and the Republic of South Vietnam (RSV) – the Unification of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam (SRV) in 1976.	68
6.1. The International Status of Vietnam prior to 1976.	68
(a) <i>A Brief Survey of the History of Vietnam: 1945-1975</i>	69
(b) <i>The Status of Vietnam prior to 1976: Three States, Two or One?</i>	72
6.2. The Unification of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam in 1976 and its Implications for Membership in International Organizations.	80
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	82
(b) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	82
7. Critical Analysis and Preliminary Conclusions.	93
7.1. Acquisition of Sovereign Statehood of a Member "State".	93
7.2. "Division" of a Member State.	94

7.3. Uniting of Two Member States.	97
(a) <i>The Unification of the United Arab Republic (UAR) and of Tanzania – Two Cases of Merger?</i>	97
(b) <i>The Unification of Vietnam – A Case of Incorporation?</i>	103
7.4. Dissolution of a Union of Two Former Member States.	113
IV. PRACTICE CONCERNING MEMBERSHIP AFTER 1990.	115
1. The Yemen Arab Republic (Northern Yemen) and the People's Democratic Republic of Yemen (Southern Yemen) – the Unification of the Republic of Yemen in 1990.	115
1.1. The Unification of the Republic of Yemen in 1990 and its Implications for Membership in International Organizations.	115
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	117
(b) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	119
1.2. Critical Analysis.	123
(a) <i>The Unification of Yemen – A Case of Merger.</i>	123
(b) <i>The Question of Membership in the United Nations and Other International Organizations.</i>	126
2. The Federal Republic of Germany (FRG) and the German Democratic Republic (GDR) – the Unification of Germany in 1990.	127
2.1. The Unification of Germany and its Implications for Membership in International Organizations.	127
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	130
(b) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	133
2.2. Critical Analysis.	142
(a) <i>The Unification of Germany – A Case of Incorporation.</i>	142
(b) <i>The Question of Membership in the United Nations and Other International Organizations.</i>	148
3. The Soviet Union (USSR) and the Russian Federation (RF): Identity/Continuity or State Succession?	151
3.1. The Dissolution of the USSR in 1991 and Russia's Take-Over of USSR Membership in International Organizations.	151
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	153
(b) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	155
3.2. Critical Analysis.	158
(a) <i>Identity/Continuity or State Succession?</i>	158
(b) <i>Russia's Continued UN Membership.</i>	166

4. Ukraine and Belarus after the Dissolution of the Soviet Union (USSR) in 1991.	171
4.1. The International Status of Ukraine and Byelorussia (Belarus) before 1991.	171
4.2. The Acquisition of Independent Statehood of Ukraine and Belarus (Byelorussia) and its Implications for Membership in International Organizations.	172
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	172
(b) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	173
4.3. Critical Analysis.	175
5. The Baltic States and the Other Former Soviet Republics.	177
5.1. Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania – the Special Position of the Baltic States.	177
5.2. The Position of the Other Former Soviet Republics after the Dissolution of the Former USSR in 1991.	179
6. The Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (SFRY) and the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (FRY): Identity/Continuity or State Succession?	180
6.1. The Process of Dissolution of Yugoslavia.	180
6.2. The Claim of the FRY to Identity/Continuity with the SFRY.	185
6.3. The Question of Membership of the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (Serbia and Montenegro) in International Organizations.	187
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	187
(b) <i>The Legal and Practical Effects of the UN Resolutions: The Divergent Views among the Member States and the Legal Office of the UN Secretariat.</i>	192
(c) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	203
6.4. The Practice of Recognition of the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia and the Agreements concluded between the Former Yugoslav Republics.	213
6.5. The Judgment of the International Court of Justice on Preliminary Objections in the Genocide Case.	216
6.6. Critical Analysis.	220
(a) <i>Identity/Continuity or State Succession?</i>	220
(b) <i>The Opinions of the EC Arbitration Commission.</i>	224

(c) <i>The UN Resolutions – Evidence of the Rejection of the Claim of the FRY to Identity/Continuity by the Community of States?</i>	231
(d) <i>The Unresolved Question of "Yugoslavia's" Membership in the United Nations and Other International Organizations.</i>	248
7. The Czech Republic and the Slovak Republic – the Dismemberment of the Czech and Slovak Federal Republic (CSFR) on December 31, 1992.	273
7.1. <i>The Dismemberment of the CSFR and its Implications for Membership in International Organizations.</i>	273
(a) <i>United Nations.</i>	274
(b) <i>Other International Organizations.</i>	275
7.2. <i>Critical Analysis.</i>	282
V. FINAL CONCLUSIONS.	285
1. Basic Principles of State Succession and Membership in International Organizations.	285
2. Theoretical Conclusions on State Succession and Membership in International Organizations.	290
2.1. <i>The 1978 Vienna Convention and the Traditional Axiom of Non-Succession to Membership Revisited.</i>	290
2.2. <i>The Established Practice of International Organizations and Succession to Membership.</i>	292
(a) <i>The Concepts of "Established Practice of the Organization" and "Subsequent Practice of the Parties".</i>	292
(b) <i>The Established Practice of Non-Succession to Membership in Cases of "Division" of a Member State.</i>	294
(c) <i>The Established Practice of Amalgamation and Substitution of Membership in Cases of Uniting of Member States.</i>	295
(d) <i>The Change of Established Practice of Several Financial Institutions in Cases of Dismemberment of a Member State.</i>	297
2.3. <i>Succession to Membership – Criteria for a Classification into "Open" and "Closed" International Organizations.</i>	299
(a) <i>The Formal Criterion – The Membership Clauses in the Constituent Instrument.</i>	299

(b) <i>The Material Criterion – The sedes materiae of the Constituent Instrument.</i>	300
(c) <i>The Functional Criterion – The Functions and Purposes of the Organization under its Constituent Instrument.</i>	301
(d) <i>Critical Analysis – The Criteria Tested Against the Practice of International Organizations.</i>	302
3. Future Outlook: Legal Theories versus Political Pragmatism – A Need for New Approaches and Paradigms?	307
3.1. The Functional Concept of Membership and Succession to Membership.	309
3.2. Partial Identity, Functional Splitting and the Strategy of Splitting <i>topoi</i> – Towards the "Deconstruction" of the Traditional Concepts of State Identity and Statehood?	312
BIBLIOGRAPHY	321
INDEX	339