Trade, Foreign Policy and Defence in EU Constitutional Law

The Legal Regulation of sanctions, exports of dual-use goods and armaments

PANOS KOUTRAKOS
University of Durham

HART PUBLISHING
OXFORD – PORTLAND
2001
Contents

Table of Equivalences xv
Table of Cases xxvi
Table of Legislation xxvii

Chapter 1 Introduction 1
1. The canvas: the two pillars, European Community and Common Foreign and Security Policy 1
2. The scope of the book 3
3. The structure of the book 5

Chapter 2 The Common Foreign and Security Policy of the European Union 7
1. Introduction 7
2. The past framework: genesis, development and Treaty recognition of European Political Co-operation 7
2.1. Failure leading to genesis (1950–70): foreign policy prior to European Political Co-operation 8
2.2. The informal phase of EPC (1970–86) 9
2.3. EPC under the Single European Act 12
2.4. The paradox: the dynamic, incremental and sui generis foreign policy under EPC and the limits of procedural requirements 14
3. Common Foreign and Security Policy under the Maastricht Treaty 18
3.1. The CFSP provisions of the Maastricht Treaty 19
3.2. The CFSP record under the Maastricht Treaty 21
3.3. The character of the Union’s foreign policy confirmed 24
4. The current framework: CFSP under the Amsterdam Treaty 26
4.1. The CFSP provisions under the Amsterdam Treaty 26
4.2. The sui generis character of the Union’s foreign policy confirmed: the issue of international legal personality 29
5. The principles underpinning the CFSP of the European Union 34
5.1. A “single institutional framework”: institutional interactions between EC and CFSP 35
5.2. The requirement of consistency and substantive interactions between EC and CFSP 39
5.2.1. The definition of “consistency” 39
Contents

5.2.2. Substantive interactions 40
5.2.3. Administrative interactions 43
5.3. Respect for the *acquis communautaire* 44

6. Conclusion 47

Chapter 3 Economic Sanctions by the Member States: Definition, General Issues and Past Practice 49

1. Introduction 49
2. Definition and problems regarding the effectiveness of economic sanctions 50
3. The Common Commercial Policy of the European Community 53
   3.1. The main principles of the CCP 53
   3.2. The scope of the CCP 55
4. The first phase of the imposition of sanctions prior to TEU: national measures and the relevance of Article 297 EC 58
   4.1. The "Rhodesia" doctrine: sanctions under Article 297 EC 58
   4.2. Comment on the implementation of sanctions under national measures 58
5. The second phase of the imposition of sanctions prior to TEU: recourse to Community law under Article 133 EC 60
6. Comment on the imposition of sanctions prior to the adoption of TEU 63
7. Conclusion 65

Chapter 4 Economic Sanctions under the Law of the European Union 67

1. Introduction 67
2. Typology of sanctions imposed under Article 301 EC 68
   2.1. Trade sanctions under Article 301 EC 69
   2.2. Financial sanctions under Articles 60 and 301 EC 70
   2.3. Sanctions on transport services under Article 301 EC 71
3. Common features of sanction regimes imposed under Article 301 EC 72
   3.1. Reference in the common position to the political background and the main thrust of the sanctions regime 72
   3.2. Provision for exceptions 73
   3.3. Scope for independent action left to the Member States 73
   3.4. Establishment of a co-operation procedure amongst the Member States and between them and the Commission 74
   3.5. The right of the Member States to determine the penalties for breach of Article 301 EC regulations 75
4.2. The legal formula of the Community regime on exports of dual-use goods 108

5. Conclusion 110

Chapter 6 The Court's Approach to Exports of Dual-use Goods to Third Countries 113

1. Introduction 113

2. The general framework: political issues before the judiciary 114

3. The Court's approach towards exports of dual-use goods: trade and foreign policy as within a single normative framework 117
   3.1. The Richardt case—the facts 117
   3.2. The Richardt judgment 118
   3.3. The Werner case—the facts 119
   3.4. The Werner judgment 119
   3.5. The Leifer case—the facts 121
   3.6. The Leifer judgment 121

4. Comment on the Court's rulings on exports of dual-use goods 122
   4.1. Exports of dual-use goods as within the CCP 122
   4.2. Broad definition of public security 123
   4.3. The issue of judicial control 124
   4.4. The issue of the definition of commercial policy 126

5. The implications of the Court's approach for the legal regulation of exports of dual-use goods 127

6. Conclusion 130

Chapter 7 A Fully-fledged Approach to the Interactions between Trade and Foreign Policy: The Court's Case Law on Sanctions against Third Countries 131

1. Introduction 131

2. The first step: the Bosphorus case 132
   2.1. The Bosphorus case—the facts 133
   2.2. The Bosphorus judgment 133
   2.3. Comment on the Bosphorus judgment 135

3. A step further: the Centro-Com case 138
   3.1. The requirement of consistency with Community law 139
   3.2. The issue of compatibility with the Common Commercial Policy 140
   3.3. The issue of the justification of national export restrictions under Article 307 EC 142
   3.4. Comment on the Centro-Com judgment 142

4. The Court's approach fully applied: the Ebony Maritime case 146
   4.1. The Ebony Maritime judgment 146
4.2. Comment on the *Ebony Maritime* judgment 148

5. The emergence of a fully-fledged approach to the linkage between trade and foreign policy 149

6. The Court's dynamic approach within the broader context of its jurisprudence 152
   6.1. Early indications of the Court's approach 153
   6.2. The exceptional jurisdiction of the Court under Article 298(2) EC 156

7. The emergence of the functional jurisdiction of the Court: adjudicating upon the pillars 159

8. Conclusion 161

Chapter 8 The Regulation of Defence Products under the Law of the European Union 165

1. Introduction 165

2. The multifarious functions of security 165
   2.1. The defence and political aspects of security 167
   2.2. The economic aspects of security 169
   2.3. Political and economic approaches to the problems of defence industries 171
   2.4. The intrinsic link between the multifarious functions of security 174

3. Community practice under Article 296(1)(b) EC 175
   3.1. The defence industries under Community competition law 176
   3.2. Defence procurement 179
   3.3. Imports of defence products 180
   3.4. The emerging interpretative vacuum surrounding Article 296(1)(b) EC 181

4. The interpretation of Article 296(1)(b) EC in the context of the EC Treaty 182
   4.1. The wholly exceptional character of Article 296(1)(b) EC 182
   4.2. The scope of Article 296(1)(b) EC 183
   4.3. The notion of "security" under Article 296(1)(b) EC 186
   4.4. The discretion enjoyed by Member States under Article 296(1)(b) EC and the role of the Court under Article 298(2) EC 189
   4.5. The requirement of respect for the conditions of competition in the common market regarding dual-use goods under Article 296(1)(b) EC and the role of the Commission under Article 298(1) EC 191

5. The interpretation of Article 296(1)(b) EC within the constitutional structure of the European Union 192
5.1. The interrelationship between Article 296(1)(b) EC and and Title V TEU 193
5.2. The limited effect of Article 296(1)(b) EC 196
5.3. Article 296(1)(b) EC and political realities 196

6. Conclusion 197

Chapter 9 The European Union Code of Conduct on Arms Exports and the Commission’s Proposals on Defence Industries 199

1. Introduction 199

2. Arms exports and the European Union code of conduct 199
2.1. International initiatives on the regulation of arms exports 201
2.2. Objective, scope and criteria laid down in the EU code of conduct on arms exports 202
2.3. The applicable procedures under the EU code of conduct 203
2.4. Comment on the code of conduct 204

3. The Commission Communications regarding defence-related industries 207
3.1. The thrust of the Commission’s proposals: a coherent approach 208
3.2. The Community legal framework: a strict interpretation of Article 296(1)(b) EC 209
3.3. The CFSP: the development of the economic aspects of security 209
3.4. Beyond the structure of the European Union 210
3.5. The Commission’s proposals to formalise the interactions between EC and CFSP 211

4. Comment on the Commission’s proposals 213
4.1. The Commission’s proposals as a general thesis 213
4.2. The “national” counter argument 214
4.3. The “supranational” counter argument 215
4.4. The significance of the Commission’s proposal in practical terms 217
4.5. The Commission’s proposal in the light of related developments 218

5. Conclusion 219

Chapter 10 Conclusions 221

Epilogue 225

Bibliography 227

Index 239