The Rigoberta Menchú Controversy

Arturo Arias, Editor

With a Response by David Stoll

University of Minnesota Press
Minneapolis
London
Contents

Acknowledgments ix
Abbreviations xi

I Background
Rigoberta Menchú’s History within the Guatemalan Context 3
Arturo Arias
I, Rigoberta Menchú and the “Culture Wars” 29
Mary Louise Pratt

II Documents: The Public Speaks
Tarnished Laureate 58
Larry Rohter
Stoll: “I Don’t Seek to Destroy Menchú” 66
Interview by Dina Fernández García
About Rigoberta’s Lies 70
Danilo Rodríguez
Lies by the Nobel Prize Winner 73
Jorge Palmieri
Her 76
Rosa Montero
The Pitiful Lies of Rigoberta Menchú 78
Octavio Martí
Arturo Taracena Breaks His Silence 82
Interview by Luis Aceituno
Rigoberta 95
Manuel Vásquez Montalbán

About David Stoll’s Book *Rigoberta Menchú and the Story of All Poor Guatemalans* 97
Jorge Skinner-Kléé

Let’s Shoot Rigoberta 99
Eduardo Galeano

*Rigoberta Menchú Tum: The Truth That Challenges the Future* 103
*The Rigoberta Menchú Tum Foundation*

Against Gerardi and Against Rigoberta, Attacks Are Continually Made to Make Them Lose Some of Their Luster 107
Margarita Carrera

*Rigoberta Menchú: Those Who Attack Me Humiliate the Victims* 109
*Interview by Juan Jesús Aznárez*

David Stoll Breaks the Silence 118
*David Stoll*

The Anthropologist with the Old Hat 121
*Dante Liano*

The National Council of Mayan Education and Its Twenty-two Member Organizations Publicly Declare 125

*A Hamburger in Rigoberta’s Black Beans* 127
*Carolina Escobar Sarti*

III

Responses and Implications

*Why Write an Exposé of Rigoberta Menchú?* 141
*Carol A. Smith*

Textual Truth, Historical Truth, and Media Truth: Everybody Speaks about the Menchús 156
*Claudia Ferman*

The Primacy of Larger Truths: Rigoberta Menchú and the Tradition of Native Testimony in Guatemala 171
*W. George Lovell and Christopher H. Lutz*
Telling Truths: Taking David Stoll and the Rigoberta Menchú Exposé Seriously 198
Kay B. Warren

What Happens When the Subaltern Speaks: Rigoberta Menchú, Multiculturalism, and the Presumption of Equal Worth 219
John Beverley

Las Casas's Lies and Other Language Games 237
Doris Sommer

The Poetics of Remembering, the Politics of Forgetting: Rereading I, Rigoberta Menchú 251
Elzbieta Sklodowska

Whose Truth? Iconicity and Accuracy in the World of Testimonial Literature 270
Daphne Patai

Menchú Tales and Maya Social Landscapes: The Silencing of Words and Worlds 288
Duncan Earle

Teaching, Testimony, and Truth: Rigoberta Menchú's Credibility in the North American Classroom 309
Allen Carey-Webb

Between Silence and Lies: Rigoberta Va 332
Ileana Rodríguez

Menchú after Stoll and the Truth Commission 351
Mario Roberto Morales

Truth, Human Rights, and Representation: The Case of Rigoberta Menchú 372
Victor D. Montejo

The Battle of Rigoberta 392
David Stoll

Contributors 411

Permissions 417