National Security and the European Convention on Human Rights

Iain Cameron

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

THE HAGUE - LONDON - BOSTON
Contents

Preface vii
List of Abbreviations xv
List of Treaties xviii
List of European Court of Human Rights Cases xx
List of European Commission of Human Rights Cases xxvii
List of Other Cases xxxii

1 Introduction 1

1.1 Overview 1

1.2 Some Basic Points Regarding the Convention System 1

1.3 The Subject Matter, Methodology and Aims of the Present Study 7

1.3.1 The Area of Study 7

1.3.2 Structure, Methodology and Aims of the Present Study 10

1.4 Application of the Convention by the Convention Organs 21

1.4.1 General Considerations 21

1.4.2 Interpretative Methods and Principles 23

1.4.3 The Margin of Appreciation 27

1.4.4 The Convention Organs’ Approach to Articles 8–11 in particular 31

1.4.5 The Approach to the Issue of Remedies 36

1.5 The Meaning of “National Security” 39

1.5.1 The Origins of the Term 39

1.5.2 The Different Contexts in which “National Security” Is Used 40

1.5.3 General Remarks on the Meaning of “National Security” in the Context of the Convention 49
1.5.3.1 Generally 49
1.5.3.2 The travaux préparatoires 49
1.5.3.3 Articles 16 and 17 51
1.5.3.4 Reservations 52
1.5.3.5 The Convention organs' approaches to the question of what falls within the scope of national security 53
1.5.3.6 An alternative approach to the judicial examination of national security 56

1.6 Some Comments on the Organisational Environment of Security in European states, The Potential for Abuse of National Security and Trends in the Field 58
1.6.1 The Organisational Environment of Security in European states 58
1.6.2 The Potential for Abuse of National Security and the Topicality of National Security Concerns 62
1.6.3 Trends in National Security 68

2 Secret Surveillance 74
2.1 Overview 74
2.2 What Is Secret Surveillance? 75
2.3 What Are the Uses of Secret Surveillance? 86
2.4 What Is an Interference with Article 8? 91
2.5 Who Can Claim to Be the Victims of Secret Surveillance Measures? 97
2.6 Accordance with the Law 102
2.6.1 Case Law on Surveillance in General 102
2.6.2 German Legislation on Security Surveillance 110
2.6.3 Luxembourg Legislation on Security Surveillance 113
2.6.4 UK Legislation on Security Surveillance 114
2.6.5 Swiss Legislation on Security Surveillance 119
2.6.6 Norwegian and Swedish Legislation on Security Surveillance 121
2.6.7 Conclusions on Security Surveillance and "Accordance with the Law" 123

2.7 Security Surveillance which Is "Necessary in a Democratic Society" 126
2.7.1 Approach of the Convention Organs 126
2.7.2 The German System of Controls 127
### 2.7.3 The Luxembourg System of Controls 131
### 2.7.4 The UK System of Controls 132
### 2.7.5 The Swedish System of Controls 137
### 2.7.6 The Norwegian System of Controls 140

#### 2.8 Remedies 142
- **2.8.1 The German System of Remedies** 142
- **2.8.2 The UK System of Remedies** 144
- **2.8.3 The Luxembourg System of Remedies** 147
- **2.8.4 The Swedish System of Remedies** 148
- **2.8.5 The Swiss System of Remedies** 149
- **2.8.6 The Norwegian System of Remedies** 150

#### 2.9 Evaluating the Control/Remedies Systems 150
- **2.9.1 Internal and External Controls in General** 150
- **2.9.2 External Authorisation v. External Review** 155
- **2.9.3 Advantages and Disadvantages**
  - with Judicial Controls 157
- **2.9.4 Notification as a Remedy** 161
- **2.9.5 Powers on Paper and Powers in Practice** 165

### 3 Secret Security Files 170

#### 3.1 Overview 170

#### 3.2 Security Intelligence: What It Is, Its Uses and Its Dangers 170

#### 3.3 How Can Security Intelligence Interfere with Article 8 and How Can This Be Proved? 184

#### 3.4 Security Intelligence and “Accordance with the Law” 196
- **3.4.1 Introduction** 196
- **3.4.2 Swedish Law Prior to 1996** 197
- **3.4.3 Swedish Law after 1996** 204
- **3.4.4 Dutch Law: the V. and Others Case** 212
- **3.4.5 Swiss Law: Amann v. Switzerland** 214
- **3.4.6 UK Law prior to and after 1989** 215
- **3.4.7 Greek Law: the Tsavachidis Case** 219
- **3.4.8 Romanian Law: the Rotaru case** 219
- **3.4.9 Conclusions on Accordance with the Law** 220

#### 3.5 Necessity in a Democratic Society 222
- **3.5.1 Introduction and General Principles** 222
- **3.5.2 Safeguards in Swedish Law at the Time of the Leander Case** 225
  - **3.5.2.1 Measures Not Regarded as Safeguards** 225
3.5.2.2 The Chancellor of Justice 228
3.5.2.3 The Parliamentary Ombudsman 229
3.5.2.4 Parliamentary Control 230
3.5.2.5 Conclusions on Swedish Safeguards Prior to 1996 234
3.5.3 The System of Safeguards in Swedish Law after 1996 234
3.5.4 The System of Safeguards in UK Law 241
3.5.5 The System of Safeguards in Swiss Law 244

3.6 Effective Remedies in the Area of Security Files and Security Vetting 246
3.6.1 Remedies in General 246
3.6.2 The Swedish System of Remedies 246
3.6.3 The UK System of Remedies 252
3.6.4 The Swiss System of Remedies 256

3.7 Concluding Remarks on Safeguards and Remedies relating to Security Files and Security Vetting 256

4 Other National Security Issues 259
4.1 Introduction 259
4.2 Article 2 – Right to Life 259
4.3 Article 3 – Prohibition of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment 265
4.3.1 Generally 265
4.3.2 Sentencing and Conditions of Detention 268
4.3.3 Deportation and Refusal to Admit 270
4.4 Article 4 – Prohibition of Slavery and Forced Labour 276
4.5 Article 5 – Right to Liberty and Security 277
4.5.1 Generally 277
4.5.2 Article 5(1): Grounds for Arrest and Detention 278
4.5.3 Article 5(2) 283
4.5.4 Article 5(3) 284
4.5.5 Article 5(4) 286
4.6 Article 6 – Right to a Fair Trial 287
4.6.1 Generally 287
4.6.2 Access to Court: Disputes Concerning Public Employees 289
4.6.3 Access to Court in Disputes with Private Employers and Public Procurement Disputes 290
4.6.4 Access to Court in Other Allegedly Civil Rights Disputes with a Security Dimension 294
4.6.5 Independence of Courts 297
4.6.6 Public Hearing 302
4.6.7 Fair Hearing in Criminal Cases: Investigation and Prosecution in General 303
4.6.8 Fair Hearing in Criminal Cases: Non-disclosure of Prosecution Material in Particular 308
4.6.9 Fair Hearing: Admission of Illegally Obtained Evidence and Agents Provocateurs 317
4.6.10 Fair Hearing in Civil Cases 320
4.6.11 Concluding Comments on Access to Court and Fair Hearings 322
4.6.12 The Presumption of Innocence and Related Matters 324

4.7 Article 7 – No Punishment Without Law 331
4.8 Article 8 – Private and Family Life 337
4.9 Article 9 – Freedom of Religion 346

4.10 Article 10: Freedom of Expression 354
4.10.1 In General 354
4.10.2 The Effect of Article 17 on Article 10 356
4.10.3 Chilling Freedom of Expression 357
4.10.4 Other Indirect Restrictions on Freedom of Expression Imposed on Security Grounds 359
4.10.5 Special Regimes: Civil Servants, the Military and the Police 365
4.10.6 Prior Restraints 373
4.10.7 Punishing Third Parties for Disclosing Official Secrets 381
4.10.8 Incitement to Disaffection, Sedition, Treason, and Related Offences 385
4.10.9 Defamation 394
4.10.10 Disclosure Orders 397

4.11 Article 11: Freedom of Association and Assembly 401
4.11.1 In General 401
4.11.2 Freedom of Assembly 401
4.11.3 Chilling Freedom of Association 403
4.11.4 Banning Political Parties 404
4.11.5 Bans and Restrictions on Associations 409
4.11.6 Special Restrictions on State Servants 411
4.12 Article 12 – Right to Marry 417
4.13 Article 1, Protocol 1 – Protection of Property 417
   4.13.1 In General 417
   4.13.2 The Right of Property and National Security 419
4.14 Article 3, Protocol 1 – Free Elections 422
4.15 Protocol 4 424
4.16 Protocol 6 427
4.17 Protocol 7 428

5 Concluding Remarks: the Limits of International Supervision 435
   5.1 Overview 435
   5.2 Assessing the Past Performance of the Convention Organs in the Area of National Security 435
   5.3 Evidential and Procedural Problems 438
   5.4 The Margin of Appreciation 444
   5.5 Issues Relating to the Form and Effect of the Court’s Judgments 448
   5.6 Future Problems, Past Value and Future Potential 451

Bibliography 454
Index 471