Immigration and Asylum Law and Policy of the European Union

KAY HAILBRONNER
Center for International and European Law on Immigration and Asylum, Universität Konstanz, Germany

KLWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / BOSTON
Contents

PREFACE xv

A. IMMIGRATION INTO THE EUROPEAN UNION

I. EUROPEAN IMMIGRATION LAW AS AN INTEGRAL PART OF A EUROPEAN-INTERNAL MARKET 1

II. MIGRATION TO GEOGRAPHICALLY AND ECONOMICALLY FAVOURABLE STATES 5

1. Migration Movements to the European Union 5

2. Third-country Nationals in the European Union – A Statistical Survey 6

a) Net Immigration to Europe from 1987 to 1997 8

b) Share of Non-EEA-Citizens in the EU as of 1 January 1996 10

c) The Employment of Foreign Workers in the EU Member States (1993) 10


3. The quantity of refugee flows and their geographical distribution 12


b) Distribution of Asylum Claims among EU Member States 14

4. The Known and Unknown Factor: Illegal Immigration 14

III. MIGRATION AS A SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC FACTOR 16

1. The Alleged Need for Increased Immigration 16

2. Demographic trends in destination countries 19

3. Migration and Labour Requirements 21

4. Migration Trends 23

IV. ENLARGEMENT AND MIGRATION 23

1. The Effects of Association Agreements and Enlargements of the European Union 23

2. CEEC Enlargement 25

3. Non-CEECs Interested in EU Membership 26

4. The CEECs' Adaptation to the Justice and Home Affairs Acquis 27

5. Transitional Arrangements in the course of CEEC Enlargement 30


I. THE CAUTIOUS APPROACH OF TITLE IV ECT TO SUPRANATIONALIZATION 35

II. THE FRAMEWORK OF COMMUNITY ACTION UNDER HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE GENEVA CONVENTION 38

1. The European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 38
1. Abolition of Internal Border Controls and Compensating Measures 77
2. Visa Policy 78
3. Asylum 79
   a) Reception of Asylum Seekers 79
   b) Minimum Standards of Procedure 80
   c) Temporary Protection 80
   d) Sudden Inflows of Third-country nationals 81
   e) The Scope of Minimum Standards in the Light of the Notion of Burden-Sharing 84
   f) Establishment of a European Asylum Agency? 85
4. Immigration 86
5. The Status of Third-Country Nationals (Article 61(b) ECT) 87

XI. INSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS 92
1. The Right of Initiative 92
2. Rights of the European Parliament 93
3. Powers of the European Court of Justice 94

XII. OPT-OUT AND OPT-IN PROVISIONS 103
1. Title IV Opt-Out and Opt-In 103
2. Schengen Opt-Out and Opt-In 104

XIII. EXTRA-TITLE IV LEGAL BASES OF COMMUNITY ACTION 106
1. Extra-Title IV Powers on European Aliens Law? 106
   a) The Need to Delineate the Scope of Application of Title IV ECT and of other Legal Bases for Community Action 106
   b) Delineation of Title IV ECT and extra-Title IV Legal Bases of Community Action 107
   c) Delineation of Powers under the Maastricht Treaty 108
   d) The Method of Delineation 110
2. The Common and Internal Market Concepts 112
3. Article 310 ECT and Association Agreements 113
4. The Impact of Market Freedoms on the Status of Third-Country-Nationals 116
5. Article 94 ECT (ex-Article 100 ECT) 118
6. Article 308 ECT (ex-Article 235 ECT) 119
7. Social Rights: Article 137 ECT 120
8. Anti-Discrimination: Article 13 ECT 120

XIV. OUTLOOK: POLICY QUESTIONS RELATED TO FURTHER SUPRANATIONALIZATION 122

C. IMMIGRATION LAW – ENTRY AND SOJOURN

I. THE NEED TO DEVELOP A COHERENT SYSTEM OF EUROPEAN IMMIGRATION LAW 125
   1. European Immigration Law After Amsterdam: An Overview 125
   2. The Creation of the Internal Market as the Objective of the Schengen Implementation Convention 126

II. CROSSING EXTERNAL AND INTERNAL BORDERS 129
   1. General Requirements for the Crossing of External Borders 129
      a) General Principles and Definitions 129
b) Execution of border controls in compliance with uniform principles 130

c) Intensified surveillance of the green and blue borders 132

2. Visa Requirements 133
   a) Negative, positive and grey listing under the SIC 134
   b) 'listing' at the Community Level: Regulation 574/99 135
   c) The SIC Provisions related to Airports and the Joint Action on Airport Transit Arrangements 138
   d) Uniform Format for Visas: Regulation 1683/95 141
   e) Harmonization of Criteria 144

3. Entry for Short-Term Visits 147
   a) Defining the Notion of "Alien" 148
   b) Possession of Travel Documents and Visa 148
   c) Sufficient Means for and Purpose of Visit 149
   d) Reporting Aliens for the Purpose of Being Refused Entry 150
   e) Public Policy and National Security: Article 5(1)(e) SIC 151
   f) Individual Rights, Direct Applicability and Judicial Review 151

4. Conditions of Intra-EU Movement of Third-Country Nationals 154
   a) Requirements for the Free Movement of Third-Country Nationals 154
   b) Reporting Requirement 155

5. Practical Experiences and the Need for Further Development 156
   a) Visa Policy 156
   b) The Rule of Law 158
   c) Public Policy 160

III. ILLEGAL IMMIGRATION AND ANTI-TRAFFICKING MEASURES 161
1. The Problem of illegal immigration and trafficking 161

2. Legislative Measures against Illegal Immigration and Trafficking at the European Level 164
   a) Cooperation in Expulsion 165
   b) Illegal Employment 166
   c) Marriages of Convenience 166
   d) Trafficking of aliens and exploitation 167

3. Cooperation with Central and Eastern European States 170
   a) The Budapest Process 170
   b) The Enlargement of the European Union 173

4. Perspectives of a future European policy against illegal immigration and trafficking 174

IV. THIRD-COUNTRY NATIONALS PRIVILEGED WITH RESPECT TO THE EXERCISE OF MARKET FREEDOMS BY EU CITIZENS 175
1. Family Members of EU Citizens 175
   a) The Market Freedoms and Secondary Community Law aimed at their Implementation 176
   b) The Concept of Family Members 182
   c) Conditions of Entry 185
   d) Non-Discrimination 186
   e) Freedom of Movement under Article 18 ECT 186
   f) The TEU's Reference to the European Convention on Human Rights 187
g) Immigration and Residence Control Measures 188
h) Scope of the Right of Residence and Loss of Status 189
2. Close Persons without Family Ties 190
   a) Divorces 190
   b) Non-Marital Relationships 192
3. Posted Workers: The Freedoms to Provide Services and of Establishment 193
   a) Legal Issues of the Posting of Workers 194
   b) Definition of Posted Worker 198
   c) Migration Control (Visa Requirements and Registration Duties) 201
   d) The Rush Portuguesa and Vander Elst Principles and the Freedom of Establishment 205
   e) Recent Commission Proposals for EC Directives in the Field of Provision of Services 206
      (i) Cross-Border Posting 206
   f) Third-country national Providers of Services 209
   g) National Discretion in Respect of the Protection of Posted Workers 210

V. PRIVILEGED THIRD-COUNTRY NATIONALS: TREATMENT IN ASSOCIATION AGREEMENTS 212
1. Relevant Agreements 212
   a) Effects of Association Agreements and Council of Association Decisions 216
   b) The Powers Conferred upon Councils of Association 220
2. The EEA Agreement 221
3. The EEC-Turkey Association Agreement 222
   a) The Progressive Integration of Turkish Workers 222
   b) The Principles Derived from Article 6 of Decision 1/80 225
   c) The Concept of Being Duly Registered as Belonging to the Labour Force 226
   d) The Concept of Legal Employment 227
   e) Further Assimilation of Status 228
   f) Some Methodological Objections against the Court’s Reasoning 229
   g) Family Members of Turkish Workers 232
   h) The Status of other Turkish Nationals 234
4. The Mediterranean Co-operation Agreements 235
   a) The EEC-Algeria and EEC-Morocco Agreements 235
   b) The Euro-Mediterranean Agreement with Tunisia 235
   c) Persons under the Sovereignty of the Palestinian Authority of the West Bank and the Gaza Strip 239
5. The Europe Agreements 239
   a) The Legal Status of CEEC National Workers 241
   b) The Legal Position of Family Members 243
   c) Decisions of Association Councils 244
   d) Freedom of Establishment 244
   e) Freedom to Provide Services 251
   f) The Ordre Public and Civil Service Reservations 251
g) Further Sources of National Discretion

6. The General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) 253

7. The EU-Switzerland Agreement 256
   a) Swiss Migration Laws 256
   b) Free Movement of Persons 257
   c) Institutional Provisions 259
   d) Future EU-Switzerland Co-operation 260

VI. NON-PRIVILEGED THIRD-COUNTRY NATIONALS 260


2. Admission on Employment 263
   a) General Principles 263
   b) Conditions of Admission 264
   c) Admission of Seasonal Workers 265
   d) Admission of Transfrontier Workers 266
   e) Self-employed Persons 267

3. Students 269

4. Trainees 273

5. Family Members 274

6. Third-Country Nationals Who Want to enter For Other Reasons 282

7. Long-term Resident Third-Country Nationals 283

8. Conclusions 288

VII. FREE MOVEMENT OF THIRD-COUNTRY NATIONALS WITHIN THE EUROPEAN UNION? 289

1. The completion of the internal market and the “right to travel” 289

2. Freedom of Movement under the Amsterdam Treaty 289

3. Freedom of Movement for Third-Country Nationals 290
   a) Proposal for a Directive on the elimination of controls on persons crossing internal frontiers – COM(95)347 final and COM(97)106 final 292
   b) Draft Directive amending secondary legislation on the free movement of persons – COM(95)348 final 293
   c) Proposal for a Council Directive on the right of third-country nationals to travel within the Community – COM(95)346 final 293
   d) Proposed Amendments to Regulation 1612/68 296

VIII. PREVENTION OF DISCRIMINATION AND RACISM 299

1. The Principle of Non-Discrimination 299

2. Article 13 ECT and Immigration and Asylum Policy 302

D. SOCIAL RIGHTS OF THIRD-COUNTRY NATIONALS

I. THE RELEVANCE OF HUMAN AND SOCIAL RIGHTS WITHIN THE TREATIES AND THE CONCEPT OF A CHARTER OF FUNDAMENTAL HUMAN RIGHTS 307

1. Third-Country Nationals within Community Law and Human Rights Instruments 307

2. Human and Social Rights within Community Law 309

3. A Charter of Fundamental Rights in the European Union 311

II. SOCIAL RIGHTS IN ARTICLES 138, 139 AND 141 ECT 311

2. Provisions Relating to Workplace Health and Safety 313
3. Gender Equality in Work 314

III. THIRD-COUNTRY NATIONALS UNDER THE CURRENT EC PROVISIONS AND THE PROPOSED EXTENSION OF THE PERSONAL SCOPE OF APPLICATION OF SOCIAL SECURITY REGULATIONS 316
1. Survey 316
2. The Existing Regulation 1408/71 318
   a) The Personal Scope of Application 318
   b) The Substantive Scope of Application 319
3. The Proposal for an Extended Personal Scope of Application and for a Council Regulation (EC) on Coordination of Social Security Systems 323
4. Equal Treatment under Community Law 324
   a) Equal Treatment and EU citizens 324
   b) Equal Treatment and Third-Country Nationals in General 325
   c) Equal Treatment under Community Agreements 327
   d) Equal Treatment after the Gaygusuz Judgment 335

IV. SOCIAL RIGHTS WITHIN THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE 337
1. Social Rights according to the European Convention on Human Rights 338
2. The European Interim Agreements on Social Security Schemes 343
3. The European Convention on Social Security 344
4. The European Social Charter and the Revised Social Charter 344
5. Other Instruments relating to Social Rights 351

E. REFUGEES AND ASYLUM SEEKERS

I. INTRODUCTION 353
1. Factors and Agents of a European Refugee Policy 353
   a) The Role of UNHCR 353
   b) The Need for a European Approach 356
   c) Cooperation in the Area of Asylum and Refugee Policies in the Framework of the Council of Europe and the OSCE 358
2. Development and Status Quo of a European Refugee Policy 360
3. The Legal Framework for a Community Policy on Visas, Asylum, Immigration and other Matters Related to Free Movement of Persons after Entry into Force of the Treaty of Amsterdam 366
   a) Asylum 367
   b) Refugees and Displaced Persons 370
   c) Visas, External Borders and the Return of Illegal Residents 372

II. HARMONIZATION OF THE CRITERIA FOR RECOGNITION AS A POLITICAL REFUGEE 372
1. The Geneva Convention as a Starting Point for a Common European Asylum and Refugee Policy 373
   a) Interpretation of the Geneva Convention 373
   b) Persecution by Non-State Agents 374
   c) Military Actions and Punishment of Deserters 375
   d) Internal Flight Alternative 376
## III. ASYLUM PROCEDURE UNDER THE DUBLIN AND SCHENGEN CONVENTIONS

### 1. Introduction

### 2. Concept of Exclusive Competence

### 3. Criteria for the Determination of the Competent State under the Dublin Convention

### 4. Personal Scope of Application

### 5. Obligations of the Contracting Parties and Individual Rights

### 6. Transfer Procedure

- a) Transfer Requests to Signatory States
- b) Transferral Requests from Signatory States

### 7. Problems of Application

- a) Retroactive Application
- b) The Dublin Convention and the Visa Regime of the Draft External Borders Convention
- c) Family Reunification
- d) Practical Problems and Experiences

### 8. EURODAC

- a) The History of Eurodac
- c) General Provisions
- d) Data on Applicants for Asylum
- e) Illegal Immigrants
- f) Individual Rights, Liability and Supervision
- g) Legal Problems: Clarity and Conformity with Human Rights

## IV. HARMONIZATION OF MINIMUM STANDARDS ON THE RECEPTION OF ASYLUM SEEKERS

## V. HARMONIZATION OF THE RULES OF THE MEMBER STATES ON TEMPORARY PROTECTION, DE FACTO PROTECTION AND HUMANITARIAN RESIDENCE PERMITS; BURDEN-SHARING

### 4. Temporary Protection

- a) The Concept of Temporary Protection
Contents

b) The Commission Proposal for a Joint Action on Temporary Protection 426
c) The Legal Nature of the Proposed Joint Action 427
d) The Scope of Application 427
e) The Procedure to Establish a Temporary Protection Regime 429
f) Rights Granted 430
g) The Relationship of the Temporary Protection Regime to the Asylum Procedure 433
h) Termination of the Regime and Return of the Persons Concerned 434
i) Burden-Sharing 436

VI. ASYLUM PROCEDURE 437

1. Minimum Standards of Procedure 437
   a) Geneva Convention and the European Human Rights Convention 437

2. The Safe Third-Country Concept in the European Union 443
   a) The 1992 Resolution of the Community Immigration Ministers 443
   b) International Law Objections 447
   c) Inherent Difficulties of the Safe Third Country Concept 449

3. Manifestly Unfounded or Abusive Asylum Claims 452
   a) Fast-Track Procedures 452
   b) The Right to Appeal and Suspensory Effect 455
   c) Asylum Application at the border 459

4. Safe Country of Origin Concept 460
   a) Conclusion on Safe Countries of Origin of 1992 460

5. Asylum Application From Nationals of EU-Member States 464

F. TERMINATION OF RESIDENCE, EXPULSION, DEPORTATION AND RETURN

I. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROBLEM 467

II. COMMON PRINCIPLES ON EXPULSION 469
   1. General policy 469
      a) The Communitarized SIC Provisions 469
      b) Joint Actions, Council Decisions, Recommendations, and Resolutions 473
      c) Voluntary repatriation 475
      d) Special Groups of Third-Country Nationals 476
      e) The Prospective Common Policy under the Amsterdam Treaty 479
   2. Responsibility for Deportation 480

III. COMMON EUROPEAN RETURN POLICY 481
   1. Obligations of States under Public International Law to Readmit their Own and Foreign Nationals 482
   2. Model Return Agreements 483
   3. Standard Travel Document 485
   4. Common Policy with Respect to Countries of Origin 485
IV. THE INTERNATIONAL LAW FRAMEWORK

1. Protection against Expulsion by International Law - The Legal Framework of Prospective European Legislation
   a) General remarks
   b) The Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
   c) The 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees

2. Protection against Expulsion by the European Convention on Human Rights
   a) Protection against expulsion by the Fourth and Seventh Protocol to the Convention
   b) The protection against expulsion in case of inhuman treatment (Article 3 ECHR)
   c) Protection against expulsion by Art. 8 ECHR (family life and privacy)

3. Other Council of Europe Conventions

V. OUTLOOK

G. BIBLIOGRAPHY

H. TABLE OF LEGISLATION AND PREPARATORY ACTS

I. ENTRY AND ADMISSION
II. INTEGRATION AND SOCIAL RIGHTS
III. COMBATING ILLEGAL RESIDENCE AND REPATRIATION
IV. ASYLUM AND REFUGEE LAW
V. ASSOCIATION AGREEMENTS CONCLUDED BY THE EUROPEAN (ECONOMIC) COMMUNITY
VI. PROPOSALS AND WORKING DOCUMENTS BY THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION ON IMMIGRATION AND ASYLUM

I. TABLE OF CASES

I. EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE
II. PENDING CASES OF THE EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE
III. JUDGMENTS OF THE COURT OF FIRST INSTANCE
IV. EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
V. EUROPEAN COMMISSION OF HUMAN RIGHTS

J. TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

INDEX