The UN Human Rights Treaty System in the 21st Century

Edited by
Anne F. Bayefsky
York University, Toronto, Canada

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / BOSTON
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contributors</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anne F. Bayefsky</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. An Analysis and Evaluation of the System of State Reporting</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. An Analysis and Evaluation of the System of State Reporting</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jane Connors</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. State Reporting and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carmel Shalev</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Reporting and the Committee on the Rights of the Child</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judith Karp</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. State Reporting and the Role of Non-Governmental</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laura Theytaz-Bergman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. State Reporting: an NGO Perspective</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rachel Brett</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Fact-finding as Part of Effective Implementation</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Human Rights Fact-Finding</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joan Fitzpatrick</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The Role of a Human Rights Field Presence</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ian Martin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Fact-Finding in the Inter-American System</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Douglass W. Cassel, Jr.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Fact-finding as Part of Effective Implementation: the</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strasbourg Experience</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrew Drzenczewski</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. An Effective Individual Complaint Mechanism in an</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Human Rights Context</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. An Effective Complaints Procedure in the Context of</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Human Rights Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrew Byrnes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Commentary on Complaint Processes by Human Rights</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee and Torture Committee Members</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) The Human Rights Committee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Kretzmer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The UN Human Rights Treaty System in the 21st Century

(b) The Committee Against Torture
Peter Burns

12. Reflections on the Effectiveness of the European System for the Protection of Human Rights
Michael O'Boyle

IV. Defining the Role of Non-governmental Organizations

13. Defining the Role of Non-Governmental Organizations with Regard to the UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies
Andrew Clapham

Alice M. Miller

15. The NGO Role: Implementation, Expanding Protection and Monitoring the Monitors
Stefanie Grant

16. Defining the Role of Non-Governmental Organizations: Splendid Isolation or Better Use of NGO Expertise?
Mark Thomson

17. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and Non-Governmental Organizations
Virginia Dandan

V. Follow-up of Treaty Body Conclusions

18. Follow-Up Mechanisms Before UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies and the UN Mechanisms Beyond
Markus G. Schmidt

19. The UN High Commissioner for Human Rights: A Link Between Decisions of Expert Monitoring Bodies and Enforcement by Political Bodies
Manfred Nowak

20. The Effects of Final Decisions of the Supervisory Organs Under the European Convention on Human Rights
Leo F. Zwaak

21. Follow-Up in the ILO Context
Jane Hodges

22. Follow-Up of Treaty Body Conclusions by the Treaty Bodies and the UN Mechanisms Beyond
Bert G. Ramcharan


Elizabeth Evatt
# Table of Contents

24. A Court and Two Consolidated Treaty Bodies  
   *Thomas Buergenthal*  
   299

VII. The Role of National Courts: A Canadian Example  
   303

   *Rt. Hon. Antonio Lamer*  
   305

VIII. Conference: Discussion and Recommendations  
   313

26. Discussion  
   315

27. Conclusions and Recommendations  
   331

---

## Appendices

### Appendix 1: The Text of the Treaties

(a) International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination  
   *345*

(b) International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights  
   *356*

(c) Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights  
   *372*

(d) Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights  
   *375*

(e) International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights  
   *378*

(f) Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women  
   *387*

(g) Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women  
   *398*

(h) Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment  
   *403*

(i) Convention on the Rights of the Child  
   *414*

   *431*

(k) Effective implementation of international instruments on human rights, including reporting obligations under international instruments on human rights, A/RES/47/111  
   *444*

   *448*

### Appendix 2: Status of Ratifications

(a) Status of Ratifications of the Principal International Human Rights Treaties  
   *451*
Appendix 3: Status of Individual Communications
(a) Statistical survey of individual complaints dealt with by the Human Rights Committee under the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
(b) Statistical survey of individual complaints dealt with by the Committee against Torture
(c) Statistical survey of individual complaints dealt with by the Racial Discrimination Committee

Appendix 4: Draft Amendments to the Treaties
(a) Draft Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
(b) Report of the Working Group on the Draft Optional Protocol Proposed to the Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment on its eighth session

(a) Interim report on study on enhancing the long-term effectiveness of the UN human rights treaty regime (1993)
(b) Final report on enhancing the long-term effectiveness of the UN human rights treaty system (1997)
(c) Effective Functioning Report of the Secretary General, Corrigendum, Addendum (1998)
(d) Effective Functioning Report of the Secretary General (2000)

(a) International Law Association, Committee on International Human Rights Law and Practice, Report on the UN Human Rights Treaties: Facing the Implementation Crisis

Appendix 7: Meetings of Chairpersons of the Treaty Bodies
(b) Report of the second meeting of persons chairing the human rights treaty bodies (1988)
(c) Report of the third meeting of persons chairing the human rights treaty bodies (1990) 738
(d) Report of the fourth meeting of persons chairing the human rights treaty bodies (1992) 754
(e) Report of the fifth meeting of persons chairing the human rights treaty bodies (1994) 774
(f) Report of the sixth meeting of persons chairing the human rights treaty bodies (1995) 787
(g) Report of the seventh meeting of persons chairing the human rights treaty bodies (1996) 797
(h) Report of the eighth meeting of chairpersons of the treaty bodies (1997) 810
(i) Report of the ninth meeting of chairpersons of the treaty bodies (1998) 827
(j) Report of the tenth meeting of the chairpersons of the treaty bodies (1998) 839
(k) Report of the eleventh meeting of chairpersons of the treaty bodies (1999) 853


(a) Effective implementation of international human rights instruments 873
(b) Status of International Covenants on Human Rights 877
(c) Question of the realization in all countries of the economic, social and cultural rights contained in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and in the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and study of special problems which the developing countries face in their efforts to achieve these human rights 881
(d) Torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment 888
(e) Draft optional protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment 896
(f) Rights of the child 898
(g) Racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance 914

Appendix 9: Resolutions of the General Assembly relating to the Human Rights Treaties 923

1998 925
(a) Effective implementation of international instruments on human rights 925
(b) International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination

1999

(a) International Covenants on Human Rights
(b) Torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment
(c) Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
(d) The girl child
(e) The rights of the child
(f) Measures to combat contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance

Appendix 10: Regional Human Rights Instruments

(a) Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
(b) European Social Charter – Revised
(c) European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
(d) Protocol No. 1 to the European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
(e) Protocol No. 2 to the European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
(f) American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man
(g) American Convention on Human Rights
(i) Protocol to the African Charter on the Establishment of the African Court on Human and Peoples’ Rights

Index