

A 2000

4050

**United Nations Sanctions: Effectiveness and
Effects, Especially in the Field of Human Rights**

A Multi-disciplinary Approach

**Willem J.M. van Genugten
Gerard A. de Groot
editors**

INTERSENTIA

Antwerpen - Groningen - Oxford

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	v
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS	vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	ix
ABBREVIATIONS	xiii

CHAPTER 1 - *Frans A.M. Alting von Geusau*

RECENT AND PROBLEMATIC: THE IMPOSITION OF SANCTIONS BY THE UN SECURITY COUNCIL

1. Introduction	1
2. Cases	2
3. League of Nations and United Nations	2
4. Reasons	4
4.1 Iraq	4
4.2 Former Yugoslavia	5
4.3 Internal situations as a threat to the peace before 1990	6
4.4 Internal disorders as a threat to the peace after 1990	8
4.5 International terrorism as a threat to the peace	9
4.6 Conclusions	10
5. Objectives	10
5.1 Iraq	11
5.2 Former Yugoslavia	12
5.3 Southern Rhodesia and South Africa	13
5.4 Establishing internal peace and stability	13
5.5 Suppression of acts of international terrorism	14
5.6 Conclusions	14
6. Range of measures	15
6.1 Comprehensive sanction regimes	15
6.2 Limited economic sanction regimes	16
6.3 Arms (and air) embargo's	17
6.4 Conclusions	17
7. Recent and problematic	17

CHAPTER 2 - *Roger Normand*

HUMAN RIGHTS ASSESSMENT OF SANCTIONS: THE CASE OF IRAQ, 1990-1997

19

1. Introduction: The effect of UN sanctions on Iraq from an economic and social rights perspective	19
2. The food-for-oil deal	20
3. The legal framework	23
3.1 The Security Council after the Cold War	23
3.2 Defining the legal limits	24
4. Violations of the UN Charter and international law	26
4.1 Procedural violations	26
4.2 Substantive violations	28
4.2.1 Human rights law	28
4.2.2 Humanitarian law	30
5. Conclusion	32

CHAPTER 3 - *Petar Butchkov, Nadejda Kovatcheva and Rossitza Raytcheva*

THE ECONOMIC AND POLITICAL EFFECTS OF THE 'YUGO-SANCTIONS' ON NEIGHBOURING BULGARIA

35

1. Introduction	35
2. Economic consequences of the 'Yugo-sanctions' for the Bulgarian economy	35
3. Social and political consequences of the sanctions	37
4. Eluding the sanctions regime: some examples	40
4.1 The inefficiency of the sanctions	40
4.2 The inefficiency of institutions	42
4.3 Violation of human rights caused by the non-differentiated implementation of the sanctions	43
5. The consequences of the sanctions: some conclusions	44
6. Epilogue	46
Appendix	47

CHAPTER 4 - *Kunja Medhi*

ECONOMIC SANCTIONS: A NEGATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS

49

1. Introduction	49
2. Some country situations	50
2.1 Cuba	50
2.2 China	50
2.3 Lybia	51
2.4 Other countries	51
3. Development and human rights	52

4. Imposition of economic sanctions in relation to human rights	57
5. Final remarks	60
Appendix I, part 1	61
Appendix I, part 2	62
Appendix II, part 1	65
Appendix II, part 2	69

CHAPTER 5 - *Hadewych Hazelzet*

ASSESSING THE SUFFERING FROM 'SUCCESSFUL' SANCTIONS: AN ETHICAL APPROACH	71
1. Introduction: humanitarian effects of sanctions neglected	71
2. An ethical perspective: bringing the human dimension back in	74
3. Towards a just sanctions doctrine	77
3.1 Jus ad sanctionem	80
3.2 Jus in sanctione	89
3.3 Jus in commercio	93
4. Conclusion	95

CHAPTER 6 - *Peter A.G. van Bergeijk*

ECONOMIC SANCTIONS: WHY DO THEY SUCCEED; WHY DO THEY FAIL?	97
1. Introduction	97
1.1 The case of Indonesia versus The Netherlands	98
1.2 Political elements in economic analysis of sanctions	99
2. Democracy, autocracy and sanctions: a public choice approach	100
3. The model and the data	102
3.1 Explaining success	103
3.2 Economic explanatory variables	104
3.3 Political explanatory variables	105
4. Empirical results	105
5. Discussion	106
Table 1 The construction of the success score of economic sanctions . . .	108
Table 2 The construction of democracy and autocracy indicators in the Polity III data set	109
Table 3 Logit estimates of success factors of 93 sanctions (1946-1989) .	110
Table 4 Elastisaties	111

CHAPTER 7 - Fred Grünfeld

**THE EFFECTIVENESS OF UNITED NATIONS ECONOMIC
SANCTIONS**

113

1. Introduction	113
2. Legal approach to sanctions	115 ✓
3. The significance of sanctions	117
4. The effectiveness of economic sanctions	120 ✓
5. Sanctions: boycott or embargo?	125
6. The boycott against Serbia and Montenegro, from a Dutch perspective	129
7. Conclusions	130

Willem van Genugten, Gerard de Groot and Saskia Lavrijssen

**GUIDELINES ON THE FUTURE OF SANCTIONS; AN
EVALUATION**

135

1. Introductory remarks	135'
2. Sanctions: a blunt instrument	136 ✓
3. Measuring effects and effectiveness	139 ✓
4. Guidelines on the future use of sanctions	141 ✓
4.1 Specificity of objectives	142
4.2 Proportionality between objective and instrument	143 ✓
4.3 Directly influencing the position of the rulers	144
4.4 Linking external and internal pressure	145
4.5 Minimising and monitoring humanitarian damage	146
4.6 Limiting the duration of sanctions	148
4.7 Preference for multilateral sanctions	149
5. Concluding observations	150

CUMULATIVE BIBLIOGRAPHY

153