The Weaknesses in the International Protection of Minority Rights

JAVAID REHMAN
Lecturer in Public Law and Human Rights
University of Leeds, England
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements xi  
Table of Abbreviations xiii  

## PART I: INTRODUCTION

### CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

Problem of the protection of minorities in international law 3  
Scope and objectives of the study 4  
International law, minority rights and the case of Pakistan 5  

### CHAPTER TWO: CONCEPTUAL ANALYSIS OF THE RIGHTS OF ETHNIC, LINGUISTIC AND RELIGIOUS MINORITIES

Introduction 10  
Meaning and nature of rights 11  
*The Hohfeldian paradigm of rights* 11  
*Hohfeldian analysis and international human rights law* 12  
Attempts at defining the term ‘minority’ in international law 14  
Meaning of ‘ethnicity’, ‘religion’ and ‘language’ in the context of minority rights 19  
Conclusions 23  

## PART II: MINORITIES AND INTERNATIONAL LAW – FROM PAST TO PRESENT

### CHAPTER THREE: HISTORICAL EVOLUTION OF THE CONCEPT OF PROTECTION OF MINORITIES IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

Introduction 31  
The protection of minorities in international law – the evolutionary phase 32  
*Europe and the Christian West* 32  
*The rights of minorities and the Islamic tradition* 34  
The protection of minorities and international law – the modern phase 37  
*The minorities treaties after the First World War* 37
Table of Contents

Post Second World War developments and a shift away from minority protection 42
Conclusions 45

PART III: Established rights under international law

CHAPTER FOUR: MINORITIES AND THE RIGHT TO PHYSICAL EXISTENCE IN INTERNATIONAL LAW
Introduction 51
The right to physical existence and the emergence of the term ‘genocide’ 52
The establishment of the right of physical existence for minorities in international law 54
Features of the Convention 55
International customary law and the scope of the prohibition of genocide 60
Weaknesses in the implementation of the right to physical existence 65
Conclusions 75

CHAPTER FIVE: THE RIGHT TO PHYSICAL EXISTENCE AND THE MINORITIES OF PAKISTAN
Introduction 82
International legal obligations 82
Applicability of the international norms relating to physical extermination of minorities 84
The physical extermination of religious minorities committed after the partition of India 84
Genocide in the former East Pakistan 88
The role of the United Nations organs 91
Issue of the punishment of individuals involved in genocide 95
Conclusions 98

CHAPTER SIX: MINORITIES AND THE RIGHT TO EQUALITY AND NON-DISCRIMINATION IN INTERNATIONAL LAW
Introduction 104
The right to equal treatment and non-discrimination in international law 105
Religious discrimination and international law 108
## Table of Contents

The crystallisation of the right to racial equality and non-discrimination in international law 113  
*International conventions* 113  
The international covenants 113  
*International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (The Race Convention)* 115  
Complications in the definition of 'discrimination' and the scope of the convention 115  
*Jus cogens* 120  
Weaknesses in implementation of the right to racial equality and non-discrimination 122  
Conclusions 127

### CHAPTER SEVEN: THE RIGHT TO EQUALITY AND NON-DISCRIMINATION AND MINORITIES OF PAKISTAN

Introduction 133  
International legal obligations 134  
Applicability of the international norms relating to equality and non-discrimination 136  
*Exploitation of the gaps in existing norms through non-recognition of ethnic and linguistic minorities* 136  
Discrimination based on language and ethnic origin 140  
Political and ideological concerns and the issue of religious discrimination 142  
Ambiguity in the means of acquiring *de facto* equality 153  
Conclusions 158

### PART IV: EMERGING RIGHTS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

### CHAPTER EIGHT: MINORITIES AND THE RIGHT TO AUTONOMY IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

Introduction 165  
Elaboration of the concept of 'autonomy' in international law 166  
Minorities and the issue of autonomy in international law 167  
The *International Bill of Rights* 169  
Recent developments in international law and the movement towards autonomy 173  
Problems associated with the recognition and implementation of autonomy in state practice 185  
Conclusions 193
# Table of Contents

CHAPTER NINE: MINORITIES OF PAKISTAN AND THE ISSUE OF AUTONOMY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dilemmas of the recognition of a right to autonomy and the artificial nature of Pakistan</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues of distinct identity and the minorities of Pakistan</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Bengalis</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Baluchis</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Pakhtuns</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sindhis and the Muhajirs</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PART V: CONCLUSION

CHAPTER TEN: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rights and subjects of international law</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International law and the limits of minority rights</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The future of minority rights and international legal order</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

MAPS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Map</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indian Subcontinent (after 1947)</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan (since 1971)</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A: Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious or Linguistic Minorities</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B: Agreement Between India and Pakistan 1950 Concerning Minorities (extract)</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C: The Proclamation of Independence (Bangladesh)</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix D: International Crimes (Tribunal) Act, 1973 (Bangladesh)</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix E: Bangladesh-India-Pakistan: Agreement on the Repatriation of Prisoners of War and Civilian Internees</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix F: On Bangladesh War Crimes and the War Crimes Trial</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

INDEX                                                                 | 263  |