The U.N. Convention on Torture and the Prospects for Enforcement

by

AHCENE BOULESBAA
Adjunct Professor of International Law
at the U.A.E. University

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
THE HAGUE / BOSTON / LONDON
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE ................................................................................................................. xiii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ....................................................................................... xv

ABBREVIATIONS .................................................................................................... xvii

CHAPTER ONE: The Scope of the Torture Convention ............................................ 1
   Introduction ........................................................................................................... 1
   I. The Scope of the Prohibited Conduct .............................................................. 4
      A. Article 1: Definition of Torture .................................................................... 4
      B. The Origins and Evolution of Article 1 ....................................................... 4
   II. Comment: General Description .................................................................... 9
      A. The Nature of the Conduct ....................................................................... 9
      B. The Intention and Purpose of the Conduct .............................................. 20
      C. The Identity of the Offender ..................................................................... 23
      D. The Exclusion of Conduct Inherent in or Incidental to Lawful Sanctions From the Definition of the Article ...................................................... 28
   III. The Overbreadth of the Definition of Torture ............................................. 36
   IV. The Saving Clause Against the Weakening of Other Conventions and National Laws of States .............................................................. 37
   V. Conclusion .................................................................................................... 39

CHAPTER TWO: The Nature of the Obligations Incurred by States Under Article 2 of the Torture Convention ................................................................. 41
   Introduction ........................................................................................................ 41
   I. The Scope of Article 2 .................................................................................... 43
   II. General Comments ....................................................................................... 43
      A. Problems Associated with Obligations of States ....................................... 43
      B. The Need for the Identification of the Nature of the Obligations of States Under this Convention ......................................................... 45
   III. The Nature of the Obligations of the States Parties .................................... 46
      A. The Question of Timing ........................................................................... 46
         1. The Practice of States .......................................................................... 47
         2. The General Rules of International Law .............................................. 49
      B. The Question of the Precise Duty of the Parties ..................................... 50
C. The Question of the Appraisal of the Effectiveness of the
Measures to Prevent the Prohibited Conduct
1. Third Party
2. Supervisory Bodies
3. Collective Judgement
D. The Question of the Implementation of the Measures taken by
States
IV. The Territorial Application of the Convention
V. The Prohibition of Torture in All Circumstances
A. General Comment
1. The Question of Whether the Inclusion of These Words in
This Convention Was Necessary
2. The Question of Whether the Exceptional Circumstances
Enumerated Herein Are Exhaustive or Merely an Example
VI. Due Obedience to Orders in Mitigation of Punishment
A. The Travaux Préparatoires of the Convention and the Work of
the International Law Commission
B. The General Principles of International Law
VII. Conclusions

CHAPTER THREE: The Problems of Enforcement of Human
Rights

Introduction

I. The Core of the Problem of Enforcement of Human Rights
A. U.N. Enforcement of Human Rights under the Charter
1. The Lengthy Review Procedures
2. The Ambiguity of the Review Test
3. The Requirement of Consent
B. Enforcement of Human Rights Under the Covenant on Civil
and Political Rights
1. The Reporting System
2. Inter-State Communications on the Non-Fulfilment of
Obligations Incurred under the Covenant on Civil and
Political Rights
3. Communications of Individuals
C. Enforcement of Human Rights under the European
Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
1. The European Commission of Human Rights
2. The European Court of Human Rights
3. The Committee of Ministers
D. State Enforcement: State A Intervenes in the Territory of State B
Justifying Action as Necessary
1. International Case Law
2. The Practice of States
II. U.N. Action by Way of Enforcement
A. Article 2 (7) of the U.N. Charter .............................................138
B. Meaning of Intervention .........................................................139
   1. The U.N. Practice ..............................................................141
   2. The Legislative History of the U.N. Charter .........................142
C. The Impact of a Finding of a Threat to, or Breach of
   International Peace ..................................................................143
D. The Relativity of the Concept of Domestic Jurisdiction ..........148
   1. Can It Be Defined ..............................................................152
   2. Who Has the Power to Define ..............................................158
   3. By What Criteria ..............................................................161
E. The Spectrum of Intervention ................................................163
   1. Sanctions ........................................................................163
   2. Decisions ..........................................................................168
   3. The Establishment of the Protection Zones for the Kurds
      in Northern Iraq ..............................................................168
III. The Effect of Article 2 (7) of the U.N. Charter and the Declaration
      of Competence in the Conventions on Human Rights on the Ability
      of International Law to Protect Human Rights World-Wide ..........170
IV. Conclusions ......................................................................173

CHAPTER FOUR: A Commentary on the Enforcement
Mechanisms by the States Parties of the Torture Convention ....175
   Introduction ........................................................................175
I. The Multi-State Jurisdiction Under Article 5 of the Torture
   Convention ........................................................................177
   A. General Description ..........................................................177
   B. General Comment .............................................................177
II. The Scope and Nature of the Jurisdiction Provided for in Article 5
   of the Torture Convention ....................................................181
   A. The Question of Whether the Jurisdiction of the State of
      Registration of the Aircraft or of the Ship Under Article 5 (1) (a)
      of the Torture Convention is Exclusive ..............................181
      1. The Conventions From Which the Provisions of Article 5
         (1) (a) of the Torture Convention Were Borrowed ............182
      2. The General Principles of International Law Regarding the
         Jurisdiction of the Flag State Over the Crimes of Torture
         Committed on Board Ship Under Article 5 (1) (a) of the
         Torture Convention .........................................................186
   B. The Question of the Priority of the Jurisdiction of the State
      Where the Alleged Offender is Present in Any Territory Under
      its Jurisdiction According to Article 5 (2) as Against Other
      States Under Paragraph 1 (a) (b) and (c) of the Same Article of
      the Torture Convention .......................................................189
      1. The Travaux Préparatoires of Article 5 of the Torture
         Convention ....................................................................189
2. The General Principles of International Law Concerning the Priority of the Jurisdiction of the State Where the Alleged Offender of Torture is Present Under Article 5 (2) of the Torture Convention................. 199

C. The Question of Whether the Multi-State Jurisdiction Provided for in Article 5 of the Torture Convention is Similar to that of Universal Jurisdiction Over Piracy................. 204

III. The * Aut Dedere Aut Judicare * Formula Under Article 7 of the Torture Convention................. 206

A. General Description .......................................................... 206

B. General Comment ............................................................ 206

1. The Question of the Nature of the Obligation of the State Where the Alleged Offender of Torture is Found Under Article 7 (1) of the Torture Convention......................... 208

2. The Question of Conflicting Requests for the Extradition of the Alleged Offender of Torture...................................................... 229

3. The Question of Whether Paragraph 2 of Article 7 of the Torture Convention is Capable of Preventing the Intrusion of Political Considerations in the Decision-Making Process to Prosecute or Not to Prosecute the Alleged Offender of Torture...................................................... 230

IV. The Question of the Effectiveness of the Provisions of Articles 5 and 7 of the Torture Convention in the Enforcement of the Right to be Free From Torture and Their Potential For Solving the Problem of Non-Intervention in the Domestic Affairs of States .............. 232

V. Conclusions ................................................................. 234

CHAPTER FIVE: Commentary on the International Machinery for the Supervision of the Implementation of the Torture Convention ...... 237

Introduction ................................................................. 237


A. General Description .......................................................... 238

B. General Comment ............................................................ 240

II. The Establishment of the Committee Against Torture Under Article 17 of the Convention ................................................................. 240

A. The Question of the Acceptability of the Committee Against Torture to States and its Independence from their Influence.............. 241

B. The Susceptibility of the Committee Against Torture to the Political Influence of States Parties to the Convention. .............. 251

III. The Functions of the Committee Against Torture ................................................................. 252

A. The Reporting System .......................................................... 252

1. General Description .......................................................... 252

2. General Comment ............................................................ 253
# Table of Contents

3. The Precise Powers of the Committee Against Torture When Considering the Reports of States ........................................... 254  
B. The Investigatory Procedure ............................................... 264  
   1. General Description ..................................................... 264  
   2. General Comment ....................................................... 265  
   3. The Extent to Which the Investigatory Procedure May Produce Its Intended Results ............................................... 265  
C. Inter-State Communications ............................................... 277  
   1. General Description ..................................................... 277  
   2. General Comment ....................................................... 279  
   3. The Nature of the System of Inter-State Communications and the Powers Given to the Committee Against Torture in its Administration ............................................... 280  
D. Individual Petitions ......................................................... 286  
   1. General Description ..................................................... 286  
   2. General Comment ....................................................... 287  
   3. The Ability of the System of Individual Petitions to Provide Effective Remedies to the Victims of Torture ............................................... 288  
IV. The Potential of the Committee Against Torture ......................... 293  
V. Conclusions ........................................................................ 294  

CHAPTER SIX: General Conclusions ........................................... 295  

BIBLIOGRAPHY ........................................................................ 305  
Articles ..................................................................................... 305  
Books ....................................................................................... 310  
Awards, Decisions and Judgements of International and National Courts ........................................................................ 313  
Sources ..................................................................................... 315  
Official Publications .................................................................. 325  
International Treaties, Conventions and Other Instruments ................. 338  

APPENDIX I ............................................................................... 341  

INDEX ....................................................................................... 357