Viewpoints

BEYOND THE CENTER:
DECENTRALIZING
THE STATE

Shahid Javed Burki
Guillermo E. Perry
William R. Dillinger
Contents

Acknowledgments .............................................. vii
Acronyms and Abbreviations ................................ x

Prologue: Matching Authority and Accountability .................. 1

Chapter 1: Decentralization: Politics in Command .................. 9

The Roots of Centralism ....................................... 9
The Wind Changes ........................................... 10
Eight Cases .................................................. 10
  Federal Countries Reverting to Type .......................... 11
  Civilian Regimes Unleashing Local Electoral Competition .... 11
  Two-tier States ........................................... 13

Chapter 2: Getting the Rules Right: A Framework for Subnational Government ............................................. 17

Dividing Up National Political Power ................................ 18
Assigning Functions, Structures, and Revenues .................... 21
  Functions .................................................. 21
  Structure .................................................. 24
  Revenues: Taxes and Transfers ................................ 26
  Controlling Subnational Debt ................................ 29
Local Politics .................................................. 31
Strategies .................................................... 32
  Synchronizing the Elements of Reform .......................... 33
  Demonstrating Early Commitment to the New Rules of the Game 33
Conclusion .................................................... 34

Chapter 3: Addressing the Macroeconomic Threat: The Quest for Hard Budget Constraints .................. 35

Evidence of Macroeconomic Problems: Econometric Results .......................... 37
Outcomes and Institutions in Major Decentralized States of Latin America .......................... 39
  Hard Budget Constraints for Subnational Governments .......................... 39
  Borrowing Constraints ........................................ 40
  Autonomy of Subnational Governments to Stay Within Budget Constraints .................. 40
  Revenue Autonomy .......................................... 41
  Political Ability to Enforce Hard Budget Constraints .................. 41
Outcomes and Institutions in Four Latin American Countries ............ 41
Summary of Cases ............................................ 47
Decentralization Institutions and Fiscal Management .................. 47
  Hard Budget Constraints for Transfers and Service Responsibilities .................. 47
  Borrowing Constraints ........................................ 49
Chapter 4: Empowering Municipalities or Schools? The Decentralization of Education

Rationale for Education Decentralization
The Educational Context of Decentralization
Typology
  Level of Decentralization
  Decisionmaking Powers
  Structure and Content
Typology Applied to Recent Latin American Experience
  Level of Decentralization
  Decisionmaking Powers
  Structure and Content
Evaluation Decentralization
  High-Performing Schools
  Characteristics of Effective Schools
The Consequences of School Decentralization
  Leadership
  Teaching Excellence
  Focus on Learning
  Responsibility
  Empirical Findings
Conclusion
Annex

Chapter 5: Empowering Mayors, Hospital Directors, or Patients? The Decentralization of Health Care

Three Kinds of Health Services
Many Modes of Service Delivery and Financing
What has been Decentralized in Latin America and How
  Argentina: From Central Monopoly to Provincial Monopoly
  Mexico: From Deconcentration to Decentralization
  Bolivia: Municipalizing the Physical but not the Human Assets
  Brazil: Public Financing with Private Production
  Chile: Municipalizing Production, Centralizing Financing
  Colombia: Conflicts Between Decentralization and Privatization
Major Issues in Decentralizing Health
  Labor Management
  Recurrent Financing
  Investment Decisions
The Political Economy of Reform
Conclusion

Chapter 6: Decentralizing Roads: Matching Accountability, Resources, and Technical Expertise

Decentralization in the Road Management Sector
In Search of a Model: The Latin American and Caribbean Experience
What is Decentralization in the Road Sector?
  Road Functions
  Management Tasks
  Financing Mechanisms
Road Decentralization in Latin America
  Where Political and Fiscal Decentralization is Well Established
  Dangers of Rapid Decentralization
  Benefits to National Networks of Devolving Non-National Roads
Contribution of Parallel Reforms
Delegation of National Roads .................................................. 97
Conclusion .............................................................................. 97

References .............................................................................. 99

Boxes

Box P1  What is Decentralization? ........................................... 3
Box 2.1  A Glossary of Political Terms .................................. 20
Box 2.2  How Far to Decentralize? ........................................ 22
Box 2.3  Are Local Governments Incompetent? ....................... 24
Box 2.4  Revenue Assignment in Federal Countries ............... 29
Box 2.5  The Impact of Transfers on Local Political Behavior .... 30
Box 3.1  Risks and Costs in the Source and Terms of Borrowing 50
Box 4.1  Chicago: An Initial Emphasis on Governance ............ 66
Box 4.2  Memphis: Decentralization Focused on Improving Learning 67
Box 4.4  What Has Been Learned from Effective Reform Strategies? 73
Box 5.1  Lack of Reliable Information .................................... 84
Box 6.1  The New Generation of Road Funds .......................... 92
Box 6.2  Key Features of the Contrato de Recuperación Mantenimiento (CREMA) ........................................... 96

Tables

Table P1  Summary of Decentralization Measures ................... 2
Table 1.1  Summary of Decentralization Measures in Selected Countries 14
Table 1.2  Indicators of Decentralization ................................. 15
Table 2.1  Electoral Rules, Selected Latin American Countries .... 19
Table 2.2  Electoral Rules, Selected OECD Countries ............... 20
Table 2.3  Structure of Subnational Governments: Selected OECD and Latin American Countries 26
Table 2.4  Principal Revenue Sources of Subnational Governments .......................................................... 27
Table 2.5  Sources of Revenues: Percent Distribution, Selected Countries ..................................................... 28
Table 3.1  Basic Model: Cross Section; Overall Sample Estimates 37
Table 3.2  Panel Data, Fiscal Variables in First Differences, 1980–94 38
Table 3.3  Institutional Arrangements to Set and Keep Hard Budget Constraints on States 39
Table 3.4  Summary of Conditions for Reduced Danger of Excess Deficits ...................................................... 48
Table 3.5  Channels for Control of Subnational Borrowing ......... 49
Table 4.1  Types of Decisions that may be Decentralized ............ 57
Table 4.2  The Locus of Key Educational Decisions and Responsibilities, Selected Latin American Countries 59
Table 4.3  Characteristics that can be Stimulated Through Decentralization .......................................................... 61
Table 4.4  Assessment of Education Decentralization ............... 63
Table 4.4.1  Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Argentina, Education Reforms 1976–1991 .................. 69
Table 4.4.2  Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Chicago, IL, Education Reforms 1988–1999 ............ 69
Table 4.4.3  Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Chile, Education Reforms 1981 .................................. 69
Table 4.4.4  Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System El Salvador, Community-Managed Schools (EDUCO) .... 70
Table 4.4.5  Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Memphis, TN, Education Reforms 1995–1999 ............ 70
Table 4.4.6  Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Mexico, Education Reforms 1992–1998 ..................... 70
Table 4.4.7  Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Minas Gerais, Brazil ............................................... 71
Table 4.4.8  Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Nicaragua, Education Reforms 1993–1998 .................. 71
Table 4.4.9  Summary of Characteristics of Decentralized Schools ................................................................. 72
Table 5.1  Suggested Financing and Provision for Different Types of Health Services ........................................... 76
Table 5.2  Authority to Manage Personnel by Different Levels of Government .................................................... 83
Table 5.3  Authority to Make Infrastructure Investments ............. 83
Table 6.1  Decentralization Options for the Road Sector .............. 91

Figures

Figure 4.1  Latin American Countries Implementing Education Reforms ................................................................. 54
Figure 4.2  Average Math Achievement Test Scores of Eighth Graders, Selected International Comparators .......... 55
Figure 4.3  Third-Grade Language Achievement, Latin American Countries ................................................................. 56
Figure 4.4  Level of Decisionmaking in Education Sector .......... 58