JOHN STUART MILL'S
SOCIAL AND
POLITICAL THOUGHT
Critical Assessments

Edited and with a new introduction by
G.W. Smith

VOLUME I
Social Ethics

London and New York
Contents

VOLUME I  Social Ethics

General Introduction xiii
Acknowledgements xxxiii
Appendix: Chronological Table of Reprinted Articles xxxv
Introduction to Volume I 1

Part One: Foundations of Morality

1. The Alleged Fallacies in Mill’s ‘Utilitarianism’  James Seth 11
2. The ‘Proof’ of Utility in Bentham and Mill  Everett W. Hall 26
3. Fallacies in and about Mill’s Utilitarianism  David D. Raphael 49
4. J. S. Mill’s ‘Proof’ of the Principle of Utility  R. F. Atkinson 63
5. Mill and the Naturalistic Fallacy  Alan Ryan 72
6. Mill’s ‘Proof’ of the Principle of Utility  Neil Cooper 76
7. Reconstructing Mill’s ‘Proof’ of the Principle of Utility  Henry R. West 79
8. The Psychology Behind J. S. Mill’s ‘Proof’  G. W. Spence 81

Part Two: Quantitative and Qualitative Hedonism

9. Mill on Pleasure and Self-development  R. S. Downie 95
10. A Defence of Mill’s Qualitative Hedonism  Rex Martin 99
11. Mill’s Qualitative Hedonism  Henry R. West 111
12. Mill’s Concept of Happiness  Fred R. Berger 117
14. Higher and Lower Pleasures  Benjamin Gibbs 161
### Contents

15. John Stuart Mill and Experiments in Living  
   *Elizabeth S. Anderson*  
   **188**

16. J.S. Mill's Language of Pleasures  
   *Robert W. Hoag*  
   **210**

**Part Three: Utility and Rules**

17. The Interpretation of the Moral Philosophy of J. S. Mill  
   *J. O. Urmson*  
   **243**

18. Interpretations of Mill's 'Utilitarianism'  
   *J. D. Mabbott*  
   **251**

19. A Defence of the Received Interpretation of J. S. Mill  
   *Brian Cripples*  
   **257**

20. Utilitarianism and 'Secondary Principles'  
   *John M. Baker*  
   **265**

21. Mill's Theory of Morality  
   *David Lyons*  
   **269**

22. Mill's Act-utilitarianism  
   *D. G. Brown*  
   **285**

23. Mill's Theory of Moral Rules  
   *Gerald F. Gaus*  
   **288**

**Part Four: Utility and Liberty**

24. Liberalism and Utilitarianism  
   *D. A. Lloyd Thomas*  
   **307**

25. Justice, Liberty and the Principle of Utility in Mill  
   *D. P. Dryer*  
   **323**

**VOLUME II  Freedom**

Introduction to Volume II  
**1**

**Part Five: On Liberty: the Principle of Liberty**

26. The Eloquence of John Stuart Mill  
   *Margaret Canovan*  
   **13**

27. A Re-reading of Mill on Liberty  
   *J. C. Rees*  
   **31**

28. Mill's Liberalism  
   *H. J. McCloskey*  
   **49**

29. Mr. McCloskey on Mill's Liberalism  
   *Alan Ryan*  
   **66**

30. John Stuart Mill and the Limits of State Action  
   *Richard Wollheim*  
   **75**

31. Mill on Liberty  
   *Ted Honderich*  
   **96**

32. Mill on Liberty and Morality  
   *D. G. Brown*  
   **102**

33. The Thesis of the Two Mills  
   *J. C. Rees*  
   **123**

34. John Stuart Mill on Liberty, Utility, and Rights  
   *John Gray*  
   **140**

35. 'One Very Simple Principle'  
   *Jonathan Riley*  
   **170**

**Part Six: Individuality and Anti-paternalism**

36. Mill and Millians on Liberty and Moral Character  
   *Harry M. Clor*  
   **207**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Mill on Liberty of Self-development</td>
<td>Wendy Donner</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Freedom and happiness in Mill's Defence of Liberty</td>
<td>James Bogen and Daniel M. Farrell</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Mill Versus Paternalism</td>
<td>Richard J. Arneson</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Utility, Paternalism, and Slavery</td>
<td>G. W. Smith</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part Seven: Toleration and Freedom of Speech**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>The 'Open Society' and its Fallacies</td>
<td>Willmoore Kendall</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Kendall's Criticisms of J. S. Mill</td>
<td>Gary J. Foulk</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Liberty of Expression: its Grounds and Limits (I)</td>
<td>H. J. McCloskey</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Liberty of Expression: its Grounds and Limits (II)</td>
<td>D. H. Monro</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Toleration and Mill's Liberty of Thought and Discussion</td>
<td>David Edwards</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Mill and the Value of Moral Distress</td>
<td>Jeremy Waldron</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part Eight: Liberty and Order**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>John Stuart Mill: On Liberty and History</td>
<td>Clark W. Bouton</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>J. S. Mill's Religion of Humanity and the Second Justification for the Writing of On Liberty</td>
<td>Allan D. Megill</td>
<td>388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Individuality and Moral Reform: the Rhetoric of Liberty and the Reality of Restraint in Mill's On Liberty</td>
<td>Joseph Hamburger</td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Mill's Place in Liberalism</td>
<td>C. L. Ten</td>
<td>446</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**VOLUME III Politics and Government**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>Review of Considerations on Representative Government by J. S. Mill</td>
<td>Anon.</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>J. S. Mill and Democracy, 1829–61 (I)</td>
<td>J. H. Burns</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>J. S. Mill and Democracy, 1829–61 (II)</td>
<td>J. H. Burns</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>John Stuart Mill and Democracy</td>
<td>Graeme Duncan</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>An Introduction to Mill's Theory of Authority</td>
<td>Richard B. Friedman</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>Mill and Tocqueville</td>
<td>H. O. Pappé</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>Two Concepts of Politics and Democracy: James and John Stuart Mill</td>
<td>Alan Ryan</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Part Ten: Political Institutions and Social Change

58. Universal Suffrage Without Democracy: Thomas Hare and John Stuart Mill  
   Paul B. Kern  
   165
59. J. S. Mill and the Secret Ballot  
   Bruce L. Kinzer  
   179
60. J. S. Mill and the Problem of Party  
   Bruce L. Kinzer  
   197
61. A Note on the Importance of Class in the Political Theory of John Stuart Mill  
   Eileen P. Sullivan  
   215
   Johannes T. Pederson  
   223
63. J. S. Mill and Political Violence  
   Geraint Williams  
   237

Part Eleven: Scope of Government, Property and Socialism

64. John Stuart Mill on the Theory of Property  
   John Gray  
   251
65. Mill's Doubts About Freedom Under Socialism  
   Richard J. Arneson  
   271
   Gregory Claeys  
   287
67. John Stuart Mill on Government Intervention  
   O. Kurer  
   313
68. John Stuart Mill and the Welfare State  
   O. Kurer  
   338
69. J. S. Mill's Liberal Utilitarian Assessment of Capitalism Versus Socialism  
   Jonathan Riley  
   355

Part Twelve: Colonies and Empire

70. Liberalism and Imperialism: J. S. Mill's Defense of the British Empire  
   Eileen P. Sullivan  
   389
71. J. S. Mill and India  
   Lynn Zastoupil  
   408

VOLUME IV  Method, Life, Feminism, Culture

Introduction to Volume IV  
   1

Part Thirteen: Methodology

72. John Stuart Mill's Theory of Progress  
   Abram L. Harris  
   13
73. John Stuart Mill's Idea of Politics  
   R. J. Halliday  
   36
74. Mill's Forgotten Science of Ethology  
   Nicholas Capaldi  
   52
75. The Light of Reason: Philosophical History in the Two Mills  
   J. H. Burns  
   62
76. The Tendencies of Things: John Stuart Mill and the Philosophic Method  
   S. Collini  
   80
77. Philosophical Forgetfulness: John Stuart Mill’s ‘Nature’  
   James Eli Adams  
   111
78. Enlightenment Psychology and Individuality: the Roots of J. S. Mill’s Conception of the Self  
   G. W. Smith  
   129

**Part Fourteen: Politics and Autobiography**

79. Mill’s History of his Ideas  
   Robert D. Gumming  
   149
80. John Stuart Mill and the Uses of Autobiography  
   William Thomas  
   171
81. Who Wrote J. S. Mill’s Autobiography?  
   Jack Stillinger  
   193
82. Mill’s Autobiography as Political Theory  
   Eldon J. Eisenach  
   209

**Part Fifteen: Feminism**

83. Mill and the Subjection of Women  
   Julia Annas  
   231
84. Marital Slavery and Friendship: John Stuart Mill’s The Subjection of Women  
   Mary Lyndon Shanley  
   247
85. On Shanley ‘Marital Slavery and Friendship’  
   Elaine Spitz  
   264
86. John Stuart Mill on Androgyny and Ideal Marriage  
   Nadia Urbinati  
   268
87. John Stuart Mill and the Harm of Pornography  
   David Dyzenhaus  
   289
88. Mill and Pornography  
   Robert Skipper  
   307
89. John Stuart Mill and Harriet Taylor on Women and Marriage  
   Susan Mendus  
   312

**Part Sixteen: Culture and Politics**

90. Mill’s Theory of Culture: the Wedding of Literature and Democracy  
   Edward Alexander  
   327
91. Liberty and Self-development: Goethe and John Stuart Mill  
   Antony Thorlby  
   340
92. Mill, Nietzsche, and the Identity of Postmodern Liberalism  
   Gerald M. Mara and Suzanne L. Dovi  
   354
93. From Sectarian Radical to National Possession: John Stuart Mill in English Culture, 1873–1945  
   S. Collini  
   380