The Myth of Dialectics
Reinterpreting the Marx–Hegel Relation

John Rosenthal
Assistant Professor of Philosophy
Colorado College
Colorado, USA
## Contents

*Preface*  
*Acknowledgements*  
*Key to Abbreviations and Bibliographical Note*  

### Part I  Marx’s *Capital* and the Myth of ‘Dialectics’  

1 ‘Rigmarole’ or ‘Method’?  
2 Marx on the ‘Marx–Hegel Relation’  
2.1 The ‘Famous Quotations’  
2.2 ‘Dialectics’ and the Concept of Historical Change  
2.3 The Third Founder – or I.I. Kaufman’s ‘Marxism’  
3 ‘Dialectics’, Historicity and the Logic of *Capital*  
3.1 The Historicist Discourse  
3.2 The Varieties of Historicism  
3.3 The ‘Method of *Capital*’ as Dynamic Historicism  
3.4 The Poverty of the Historicist Interpretation  
3.5 The Historicist Model and Hegel  
3.6 The Historicity of Capitalist Production and the Critique of Political Economy  

### Part II  Reification and Exchange  

4 Concepts and Objects  
4.1 The Categories of Political Economy  
4.2 The Division of Labour and the Concept of Society  
4.3 The Dual Objectivity of Money and Commodities  
4.4 The ‘Practical Concepts’ of Exchange  
5 Property and Person (or the Birth of the Juridical Subject)  
6 The Objectification of Social Relations  
6.1 Money as a Social Relation  
6.2 Capital as a Social Relation  
6.3 A Brief Digression on Rent  
6.4 Capital as a Social Relation (continued)
Contents

7 An ‘Idealism of Matter’ 86

Part III ‘Dialectical’ Contradiction and the Logicization of the Empirical 91

8 Two Principles of Contradiction 93

9 The Word Made Flesh or Hegel’s Incarnation of Logic 98
  9.1 ‘Logic’ as Pars Totalis of the Hegelian System 98
  9.2 The Universal and the Particular in ‘Geist’ 103
  9.3 The Universal and the Particular in Nature 106

10 The ‘Reality’ of Contradiction 111
  10.1 Truth and Falsity in an Extra-Logical Sense 111
  10.2 Hegel on Judgement 113
  10.3 The Hegelian ‘Syllogism’ and the Syllogism 115
  10.4 ‘Real’ Syllogisms and ‘Living’ Judgements 118
  10.5 The Basic Principle of Materialism 121
  10.6 Wilt and Diego: On the ‘Identity of Opposites’ 123
  10.7 The Paralogical Hinge of Hegel’s Exposition 125
  10.8 The Opposite of Limitation 129
  10.9 ‘Contradiction’ before Judgement 132
  10.10 The ‘Reality’ of Contradiction 133
Appendix Hegel’s ‘Transition’ of Identity into Difference 134

Part IV The Objectivity of the Economic 137

11 A Fortuitous Theoretical Isomorphism 139

12 The ‘Subject-Predicate Reversal’: an Excursus on Marx’s Critique of Hegel’s Doctrine of the State 149
  12.1 ‘The Illusion of Real Knowledge’ 149
  12.2 An Example: The Hegelian ‘Derivation’ of the Monarch 152

13 Some Passing Remarks on the ‘New’ Hegelian Marxism 157

14 The Universal and the Particular in the Constitution of Value 163
  14.1 Value-Relation and Value-Form 163
  14.2 The Extrinsic and Intrinsic Measures of Value 166

15 Money, or the Real Universality of Commodities 172
  15.1 The Principle of Contradiction and the Necessity of Money 172
  15.2 From Medium of Exchange to Measure of Value 177