Expert Advice for Policy Choice: Analysis and Discourse

Duncan MacRae, Jr.
Dale Whittington
Contents

Preface xi
Acknowledgments xv

Introduction 1
EXPERT COMMUNITIES AND AID FOR POLICY DECISIONS 1, PUBLIC POLICY ANALYSIS 4, RECOMMENDATIONS FOR POLICY CHOICE: A CENTRAL CONCERN OF PPA 5, EXPERT ADVICE FOR POLICY CHOICE: A BROADER DEFINITION OF THE FIELD 8, PLAN FOR THIS BOOK 12, PREPARATORY ADVICE 13, THE GENERAL MATRIX APPROACH 15, SELECTING CRITERIA 17, LISTING ALTERNATIVES 18, AIDING CHOICES WITH THE CRITERIA/ALTERNATIVES MATRIX 19, CONSIDERING MULTIPLE PARTIES 20, ASSESSING POLICIES WHOSE EFFECTS ARE DISTRIBUTED OVER TIME 22, COMPARING AND COMBINING DIMENSIONS OF DECISION MATRICES 22, EXPERT COMMUNITIES, QUALITY CONTROL, AND TYPES OF USE 23, NOTES 24

1 Preparatory Advice 27
TYPES OF PREPARATORY ADVICE 27, DIFFERENCES BETWEEN PREPARATORY ADVICE AND SHORT-TERM POLICY ANALYSIS 28, DESCRIBING PROBLEM CONDITIONS 29, CAUSAL EXPLORATION 34, CAUSAL INFORMATION FOR PROBLEM SELECTION 36, NOTES 42 CASE STUDY 1A: PREPARATORY ADVICE ON THE HIV EPIDEMIC IN THE UNITED STATES 45, NOTES 63

2 Selecting Criteria 66
THE PRIMACY OF CRITERIA IN POLICY ANALYSIS 66, SOURCES AND JUSTIFICATION OF CRITERIA 67, ETHICAL CRITERIA AND PUBLIC DEBATE 71, STRUCTURES OF CRITERIA 77, GUIDELINES FOR SELECTING A SET OF CRITERIA 81, THE ECONOMIC CRITERION FOR POLICY CHOICE 88, CRITICISMS OF THE ECONOMIC CRITERION 93, USE AND NONUSE VALUES:
3 Listing Alternatives 112

CHOICE AMONG POLICY ALTERNATIVES 112, CREATIVITY IN DEFINING AND LISTING ALTERNATIVES 118, COMMON SOURCES OF ALTERNATIVES 119, ECONOMIC ALTERNATIVES BASED ON THE NOTION OF MARKET FAILURE 121, POLICY DESIGN 124, SKILLS REQUIRED FOR LISTING ALTERNATIVES 126, NOTES 127

SUPPLEMENT 3S: DEPARTURES FROM PERFECT MARKETS: A GRAPHICAL APPROACH 128, NOTES 135
CASE STUDY 3A: ALTERNATIVES FOR AIDS/HIV POLICY 136

4 Policy Models 145

JUDGMENTS NEEDED IN POLICY MODELS: FILLING THE CRITERIA/ALTERNATIVES MATRIX 145, THE NATURE OF POLICY MODELS 146, INTERVENTION AND EXPERIMENTATION 150, STANDARDS OF QUALITY FOR DECISION-STAGE MODELS 166, TECHNICAL FEASIBILITY IN POLICY MODELS 167, NOTES 168
CASE STUDY 4A: POLICY MODELS FOR AIDS/HIV 171, NOTES 191

5 Aiding Choices with the Criteria/Alternatives Matrix 193

THE CRITERIA/ALTERNATIVES MATRIX AS AN AID TO POLICY DISCOURSE 194, WAYS OF USING THE MATRIX TO MAKE CHOICES 195, A TWO-CRITERION EXAMPLE: REGULATION OF CARCINOGENS IN THE WORKPLACE 196, PRECISION VERSUS APPROXIMATION IN THE MATRIX 209, USERS' RECONCILIATION OF CRITERIA 216, INCOMPLETE CRITERIA/ALTERNATIVES MATRICES 224, NOTES 229
CASE STUDY 5A: AIDING HIV/AIDS POLICY CHOICES WITH A CRITERIA/ ALTERNATIVES MATRIX 231, NOTES 236

6 Considering Multiple Parties 237

ETHICAL CHOICE WITH THE PARTIES/ALTERNATIVES MATRIX 237, ADVISING ABOUT POLITICAL INTERACTIONS 247, ADVISING ABOUT POLITICAL FEASIBILITY 251, THE PRIVATENESS OF PERSONAL INTERESTS 253, POLITICAL MAPPING AND SCENARIOS 256, EXAMPLES OF POLITICAL FEASIBILITY 263, ADVISING MULTIPLE INTERACTING USERS 267, NOTES 268
CASE STUDY 6A: MULTIPLE PARTIES IN HIV/AIDS POLICY 271, NOTES 279
Contents

7 Assessing Policies Whose Effects Are Distributed Over Time 280

CASE STUDY 7A: TIME CONSIDERATIONS IN AIDS/HIV POLICY 294

8 Comparing and Combining Dimensions of Decision Matrices 297

GENERAL APPROACHES TO SIMPLIFYING NONPOLICY DIMENSIONS 298, THE FOUR-DIMENSIONAL MATRIX 301, MATRIX 307, FIVE PROBLEM TYPES FROM THE THREE-DIMENSIONAL MATRIX 312, CONCLUDING REMARKS 319, NOTES 320
CASE STUDY 8A: THE CRITERIA/PARTIES MATRIX IN ANALYSIS OF AIDS/HIV POLICY 323, NOTES 326

9 Expert Communities, Quality Control, and Types of Use 327

EXPERT COMMUNITIES’ CONTRIBUTIONS TO ADVICE 328, QUALITY CONTROL IN POLICY ANALYSIS 336, ADVISING: CHANNELS, CONTENT, AND USE 351, NOTES 358
CASE STUDY 9A: QUALITY CONTROL FOR AN HIV/AIDS POLICY PROPOSAL 361, NOTES 381

Glossary 383
References 395
Index 417