Procedure at International Conferences

A study of the rules of procedure of conferences and assemblies of international inter-governmental organisations

ROBBIE SABEL

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

Acknowledgments

List of abbreviations and conference references

Introduction

1 Historical development of rules of procedure of conferences and attempts to establish model rules
   1.0 Development of conference rules of procedure
   1.1 Proposals for drafting model codes of conference rules of procedure

2 Adoption of rules of procedure
   2.0 The adoption of conference rules of procedure
   2.1 The independence of an international conference
   2.2 Independent right of conferences to adopt their own rules of procedure
   2.3 The majority required to approve rules of procedure

3 The obligation of States attending a conference to comply with the rules of procedure of that conference
   3.1 Obligation of States to comply with the rules of procedure of an assembly of an international organisation
   3.2 Obligation of States at an international conference to comply with the rules of procedure adopted at the conference
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Do rules of procedure at a conference constitute a</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>multilateral treaty?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 Can voting for a resolution be considered as a legal</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>commitment to comply with the resolution?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 Does tacit consent constitute the basis of the obligation to</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>comply with rules of procedure?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4 Customary international law as the source of authority</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for the obligation of States to comply with rules of procedure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Ascertaining the existence of a rule of customary international</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>law obliging States to comply with rules of procedure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1 State practice</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2 Opinio juris</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Conclusion as to custom being the source of obligation to</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>comply with rules of procedure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Invitations, participation and credentials</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Invitation and participation</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Credentials</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Submission of credentials</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Invalid credentials</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Credentials committee</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 Which body should decide disputes as to credentials?</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5 Provisional admission</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6 Credentials of observer organisations</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Presiding officer and other officers of the conference</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Presiding officer</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1 Appointment of presiding officer</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.2 The obligation of impartiality of the presiding officer</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.3 Functions of the presiding officer</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.4 Right of presiding officer to change his decisions</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Rapporteur</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Secretariat</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Vice-presidents of a conference or assembly</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Meetings</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Quorum</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.1 Quorum for a motion to adjourn a meeting</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.2 Is it sufficient that there be a quorum at the opening of a</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>meeting?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.3 Calculating a quorum</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.4 Voting again in the absence of a quorum</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Suspension or adjournment of meetings</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.2.1 Suspension or adjournment of a meeting 'during the discussion of any matter' 85
6.2.2 Time limit for speaker moving suspension or adjournment 85

6.3 Adjournment of a meeting 86
6.3.1 When can a motion for adjournment be proposed? 86
6.3.2 Adjournment of a meeting to a particular date 86
6.3.3 Adjournment of a meeting 'during the discussion of any matter' 87
6.3.4 Interrupting a speaker to move adjournment of a meeting 87
6.3.5 A representative who had requested the floor prior to the motion for adjournment of the meeting 88

6.4 Suspension of a meeting 88
6.4.1 Suspension or adjournment of a meeting during voting 89

6.5 Closed meetings 90

7 Statements by delegations 91
7.1 The right of representatives to speak 91
7.1.1 Limiting the number of times a representative may speak 92
7.1.2 Length of statements 93
7.1.3 Limiting the number of speakers 94
7.1.4 Statements by observers 95
7.1.5 List of speakers 95
7.1.6 Closing the list of speakers 97

7.2 Right of reply 100
7.2.1 Discretion of president to grant right of reply 101
7.2.2 Right of reply and closure of debate 103
7.2.3 At what stage of a debate can the right of reply be exercised? 103
7.2.4 Right of reply by observers 105
7.2.5 Right of reply to statements made by heads of State and non-delegates 105
7.2.6 Relevance of right of reply 106
7.2.7 Time limit on right of reply 107
7.2.8 Under what circumstances does a right of reply arise? 108
7.2.9 Limit on number of interventions in exercise of right of reply 109
7.2.10 Right of reply to explanation of vote 109
7.2.11 Right of reply to a statement made in right of reply 110
7.2.12 Closure of debate on right of reply 110

7.3 Explanation of vote 110
7.3.1 Discretion of president to allow explanation of vote 111
7.3.2 Explanation of votes on procedural motions 112
7.3.3 Explanation of vote on motions to adjourn the debate or close the debate 112
7.3.4 Explanation of vote on motions to adjourn or suspend a meeting 113
7.3.5 Length of explanations of vote 114
7.3.6 Explanation of vote by proposer 114
7.3.7 Discretion of conference or assembly to allow proposer to explain a vote 115
7.3.8 Explanation of vote by proposer voting against the resolution 116
7.3.9 Explanation of vote on a resolution proposed by a committee 116
7.3.10 Explanation of vote by co-sponsor 116
7.3.11 Explanation of vote on a consensus 116
7.3.12 Explanation of vote on a secret ballot 117
7.3.13 Explanation of vote should not include comments on other delegations 117
7.3.14 Explanation of vote on voting taken paragraph by paragraph 118
7.3.15 Explanation of vote by a representative of an intergovernmental organisation 118
7.3.16 When to explain a vote? 118
7.3.17 Explanation of vote after the list of speakers has been closed 119

7.4 Offensive or irrelevant statements 119
7.5 Clarity of speech 120
7.6 Personal attacks 121
7.7 Speaking to substance on procedural motions 121

8 Submission of proposals 122
8.1 The difference between proposals and motions 122
8.2 Order of discussion of proposals 123
8.3 Sponsors 123
8.3.1 Limitation on number of sponsors 123
8.3.2 Agreement to join list of sponsors 124
8.3.3 Withdrawal of sponsorship 125
8.3.4 Seconding of motions 125
8.4 Notice of proposals 126
8.4.1 Notice of submission of written proposals 127
8.4.2 Notice of procedural motions 128
8.4.3 Notice of substantive proposals 130
8.4.4 Discretion of presiding officer to allow discussion of amendments submitted without due notice 130
8.4.5 Discretion of presiding officer to allow voting on amendments submitted without due notice 130
8.4.6 Substantive proposals submitted without due notice 132
8.4.7 Practice in international conferences regarding discussion and voting on substantive proposals and amendments submitted without due notice 132
8.4.8 Practice in UN bodies regarding dispensing with the need for due notice of submission of substantive amendments 137
8.4.9 Summary as to requirement that motions be in writing and due notice be given of their submission 139
8.4.10 Procedural motions to enforce the rule on due notice 140
8.5 Time limits for submission of amendments and proposals 140
8.6 Time limit for submission of sub-amendments 141
8.7 Revision of proposals by the sponsors 141
8.8 Can the Secretariat submit proposals? 142
8.9 Submission of proposals by non-governmental organisations 141
8.10 Decisions on competence of a conference to deal with an issue 143
8.10.1 Can legal counsel give an opinion on competence? 145
8.10.2 Voting procedure on a question of competence 145
8.10.3 A vote on competence regarding part of a proposal 146
8.10.4 Priority as between a motion on competence and a motion for inclusion in the agenda 146
8.10.5 Debating a motion on competence in the UN General Assembly 146
8.10.6 Competence of conferences to discuss an issue as opposed to competence to vote on an issue 147
8.10.7 Summary as to voting on competence 149
8.11 Basic texts 149
9 Adjournment and closure of debate 151
9.1 Adjournment of debate 151
9.1.1 Effect of adjourning the debate 151
9.1.2 A motion not to take a vote on a proposal as a motion for adjournment of debate 152
9.1.3 Difference between a motion not to vote and a motion to adjourn the debate 153
9.1.4 A motion to 'refrain from making a decision' as a motion for adjournment of debate 154
9.1.5 A motion for 'postponement of consideration' as a motion for adjournment of debate 154
9.1.6 Is a motion for postponement synonymous with a motion for adjournment of debate? 154
9.1.7 A motion to adjourn a vote as a motion for adjournment of debate 156
9.1.8 A motion for referral as a motion for adjournment of debate 156
9.1.9 A motion to adjourn the debate after the debate is completed and before voting 156
9.1.10 A motion to adjourn the debate on a resolution until completion of discussion on another resolution 157
9.1.11 A motion to adjourn the debate on a procedural motion 157
9.1.12 A single motion to adjourn the debate on two separate resolutions 157
9.1.13 What is ‘an item under discussion’ for purposes of adjournment of debate? 158
9.1.14 Adjournment of debate on specific proposals or amendments 158
9.1.15 Limits on number of speakers on a motion to adjourn the debate 161

9.2 Closure of debate 161
9.2.1 Closure of debate and protection of minority 162
9.2.2 Motion for immediate vote as motion for closure 164
9.2.3 What is an item under discussion for purposes of closure of debate? 164
9.2.4 Process of voting on a motion for closure 165
9.2.5 Voting on proposals after adoption of a motion for closure 165
9.2.6 Right of reply after closure of debate 166
9.2.7 Explanation of vote after closure of debate 166
9.2.8 Right to complete a statement after closure of debate 167
9.2.9 Speakers who had requested the floor before the closure of debate 168
9.2.10 Right of proposer, after closure of debate, to introduce a previously submitted proposal 170
9.2.11 Right of proposer to reply to questions after closure of debate 170
9.2.12 Right to propose procedural motions after closure of debate 171
9.2.13 Submission of amendments after closure of debate 171
9.2.14 Submission of sub-amendments after closure of debate 172
9.2.15 Closure of debate and revision of amendments 173
9.2.16 Closure of debate before its commencement 173
9.2.17 Closure of debate on points of order 174

10 Amendments 175
10.1 Distinguishing between separate proposals and amendments 175
10.1.1 Definition by the Legal Counsel of the UN as to the difference between amendments and separate proposals 177
10.1.2 Practice regarding distinguishing between amendments and separate proposals 178
10.1.3 Can an amendment call for the removal of the substance of a proposal? 181
10.1.4 Can an amendment call for deferment of discussion? 182
10.1.5 Can an amendment call for taking no decision on a committee report? 183
10.1.6 Can an amendment call for referring an issue to a different committee? 184
10.1.7 Can an amendment call for deleting some existing paragraphs, revising others and adding a new paragraph? 184
10.1.8 Can a separate proposal be transformed into an amendment? 185
10.1.9 How are decisions made whether a proposal is an amendment to another proposal? 185
10.2 An inadvertent oral amendment 186
10.3 Amendments to procedural motions 186
10.4 Revising amendments by proposer 187
10.5 Prohibition of amendments 188
10.6 Sub-amendments 188
10.6.1 Adoption of a sub-amendment and subsequent rejection of the amendment itself 191
10.6.2 Adoption of a sub-amendment implying rejection of another sub-amendment that had been accepted by the sponsors of the original amendment 191

11 Withdrawal and reconsideration of motions and proposals 193
11.1 Withdrawal of motions 193
11.1.1 Withdrawal of part of a motion 194
11.1.2 Resubmitting a proposal previously withdrawn 194
11.1.3 Time limits for withdrawal 195
11.1.4 Agreement by all sponsors for withdrawal 195
11.1.5 Meaning of the qualification that the motion 'has not been amended' 195
11.1.6 A motion not to vote on a proposal as an alternative to withdrawal 197
11.2 Reconsideration of proposals 198
11.2.1 Reconsideration in committees 199
11.2.2 Reconsideration in regard to proposals in different committees 201
11.2.3 Reconsideration in plenary of decisions of committees 201
11.2.4 Is it a reconsideration when there is a request for a separate vote on part of a text on which there had been a previous request for a separate vote? 201
11.2.5 Is it reconsideration to request a separate vote on a text when an amendment for deletion of the text has been defeated? 202
11.2.6 Is a request to vote again, due to misunderstandings during the vote, a request for reconsideration? 203
11.2.7 Is voting again due to discrepancy in language versions to be considered a reconsideration? 204
11.2.8 Is a motion to vote on an amendment inadvertently not voted on to be considered a motion to reconsider? 205
11.2.9 Recounting the vote as reconsideration 206
11.2.10 Is a motion not to discuss an item inscribed on the agenda a motion for reconsideration? 206
11.2.11 Where a decision has been taken not to inscribe an item on the agenda, is a draft resolution on that item a motion for reconsideration? 206
11.2.12 Is a motion to change the order of items in an agenda a reconsideration of the adoption of the agenda? 207
11.2.13 Is a motion for adjournment of debate a motion for reconsideration of the decision to hold the debate? 207
11.2.14 Reconsideration of invitations to multi-session conferences 208
11.2.15 Can a conference decide to reserve the right to reconsider an item in the future? 209
11.2.16 Is resubmission to a plenary meeting of a decision adopted by a committee a reconsideration? 210
11.2.17 Where there has been a vote on a proposal, is it reconsideration to then convene a discussion group? 210
11.2.18 Relocation of part of a paragraph as reconsideration 211
11.2.19 An interpretive vote as reconsideration 211
11.2.20 After a motion not to vote on a resolution has been defeated, is it reconsideration to move that the conference is not competent to discuss the issue? 211

11.3 Reconsideration of amendments 212
11.3.1 Where an amended basic text is defeated, is it reconsideration to revert to the original basic text? 214

11.4 Reconsideration of procedural decisions 214
11.4.1 Does the rule on reconsideration apply to motions for adjournment or suspension? 215
11.4.2 Does the rule on reconsideration apply to motions to
suspend the rules of procedure? 216
11.4.3 Summary as to practice regarding reconsideration of procedural motions 217

12 Procedural motions and points of order 218
12.1 Procedural motions 218
12.1.1 Definition of a procedural motion 218
12.1.2 Examples of decisions as to what is a procedural motion 219
12.2 Points of order 220
12.2.1 Distinction between a point of order and a procedural motion 222
12.3 Categories of points of order 223
12.3.1 A point of order requesting a decision by the presiding officer 223
12.3.2 A point of order raised in order to submit a procedural motion 224
12.3.3 A point of order requiring neither a vote nor a presidential decision 225
12.3.4 A point of order on a matter of clarification 226
12.3.5 A point of order on technical arrangements 226
12.4 Decisions by presiding officers on points of order 226
12.5 Discretion of presiding officer to allow a delegation to raise a point of order 227
12.6 Can a conference or assembly decide a point of order? 227
12.7 Raising a point of order while a representative is speaking on an earlier point of order 229
12.8 Limiting the duration of statements on points of order 230
12.9 Limiting the number of points of orders 230
12.10 Challenging a decision of a presiding officer 231
12.10.1 The process of voting on a challenge to a decision by a presiding officer 231
12.10.2 Can a challenge to a ruling be debated? 233
12.10.3 Can there be separate votes on parts of a challenge to a ruling by the presiding officer? 234
12.11 Speaking to the substance during a statement on a point of order 234

13 Priorities between different proposals 235
13.1 Order of voting on proposals 235
13.1.1 When is a proposal considered to have been submitted? 239
13.1.2 Decision not to vote on subsequent proposals 239
13.1.3 How is a decision made about whether to vote on a subsequent proposal? 240
13.1.4 Is a decision granting priority to a proposal affected by a subsequent revision of the proposal? 241
13.1.5 Do subsequent revisions of proposals affect the rule as to voting on proposals in the order in which they were submitted? 241
13.1.6 Order of priority of reintroduced proposals 242
13.2 Priority of procedural motions over substantive motions 242
13.2.1 Does a motion not to take a vote on a proposal have priority over the substantive proposal? 243
13.3 Priority between procedural motions 243
13.3.1 Priority of motion for suspension of meeting 244
13.3.2 Priority of motion for adjournment of meeting 245
13.3.3 Priority of motion for adjournment of debate 245
13.3.4 Priority of a motion for adjournment of debate coupled with a substantive motion 246
13.3.5 Priority as between different motions for adjournment of debate 247
13.3.6 Order of priority between different procedural motions not entitled to special priority under the rules of procedure 247
13.3.7 Order of priority between different motions to grant priority 248
13.4 Voting on amendments prior to voting on the proposal itself 248
13.5 Voting on the main proposal when the voting on an amendment is tied 251
13.6 Priority between amendments 251
13.6.1 Decisions as to which amendment is 'furthest removed in substance from the original proposal' 255
13.7 Can a conference decide not to vote on an amendment? 256
13.8 Order of voting on sub-amendments 256
13.8.1 Voting first on the sub-amendment furthest removed from the amendment 257

14 Method of voting 258
14.1 Reading out proposals or amendments prior to the vote 258
14.2 Method of voting 258
14.2.1 Voting by show of hands 259
14.2.2 The right to call for a roll-call vote 260
14.2.3 When can a roll-call vote be requested? 262
14.2.4 Recording delegations present and not voting 263
14.2.5 Recording abstentions 264
14.2.6 Order of voting in a roll-call vote 265
14.2.7 Voting by mechanical or electronic means 265
14.3 Secret ballot 265
a proposal also imply holding separate votes? 333

17.24 A separate vote on parts of a procedural motion 334

18 Conduct of voting – interruption of voting and correction of vote 335

18.1 Interruption of voting 335

18.2 Definition of ‘voting’ within the context of the rule of non-interruption of voting 335

18.3 When does voting commence?

18.3.1 When does voting commence during a connected series of voting? 339

18.3.2 When does voting commence in elections? 340

18.3.3 When does voting commence in a vote paragraph by paragraph? 340

18.4 Interruption of voting 340

18.4.1 Is an adjournment of a meeting an interruption of the voting procedure? 341

18.4.2 Interruption of voting between votes on a series of amendments 342

18.4.3 Interruption of voting for points of order 343

18.4.4 Interruption of voting for proposal not to vote 343

18.4.5 Interruption of voting for proposal to defer the vote 345

18.4.6 Interruption of voting for proposal to adjourn the meeting 345

18.4.7 Interruption of voting for motion to suspend the meeting 345

18.4.8 Interruption of voting to make comments 346

18.4.9 Interruption of voting with a request for explanation 346

18.4.10 Interruption of voting due to discrepancy in language versions 347

18.4.11 Interruption of voting in order to submit an amendment 347

18.4.12 Interruption of voting to submit an oral amendment 348

18.4.13 Interruption of voting to submit an amendment where the right to do so had been previously reserved 349

18.4.14 Interruption of voting to submit sub-amendments 349

18.4.15 Interruption of voting to ascertain what majority is required 349

18.4.16 Interruption of voting to withdraw sponsorship of a resolution 350

18.4.17 Interruption of voting to allow explanation of vote on a separate paragraph 350

18.4.18 Interruption of voting to revise a proposal 350

18.4.19 Interruption of voting to request reconsideration 351
18.5 Correction of vote
18.5.1 The report of the UN Secretary-General on correction of vote 351
18.5.2 Practice as to correction of votes before announcement of results 352
18.5.3 Correction of votes after announcement of results 353
18.5.4 Correction of votes – indication in the records 356

19 Languages and records 358
19.1 Languages of the conference 358
19.1.1 Voting on one language version of a text 359
19.1.2 Authentic language 360
19.1.3 Voting again because of a discrepancy between different language versions 360
19.2 Records of the conference 361
19.2.1 Documentation 361
19.2.2 Distribution of unofficial documentation 361
19.2.3 Verbatim records 362
19.2.4 Adding written statements to the record 362
19.2.5 Correcting the record 364
19.2.6 Adding to the record 364
19.2.7 Deleting from the records 365
19.2.8 Final Act 367

20 Committees 368
20.1 Committees 368
20.2 Procedure of committees 368
20.3 Relations between committees and plenary 369
20.4 The different committees 369
20.4.1 General committee 369
20.4.2 Main committees 371
20.4.3 Drafting committee 372

21 Suspension and amendment of rules of procedure 384
21.1 Suspension of the rules of procedure 384
21.1.1 Practice in international conferences as to suspension 385
21.1.2 Practice in the UN General Assembly as to suspension 387
21.1.3 Practice in international organisations as to suspension 388
21.1.4 Comment on suspension of rules of procedure 390
21.2 Amendment of rules of procedure 391

22 Are certain rules of procedure customary international law? 393
22.0 ‘Precedent’ in international law 393
CONTENTS

22.0.1 The difference between usage and State practice 394
22.1 Precedents regarding procedure 396
22.2 Disclaimers as to setting a precedent 398
22.3 If rules of procedure are treaties, does their repetition create customary international law? 400
22.4 Are procedural precedents customary international law? 401
22.5 Can international organisations themselves create customary law? 401
   22.5.1 Authority of international organisations to interpret a constitution as regards internal functions 405
22.6 Can customary international law be created by States at an international assembly or conference? 406
   22.6.1 State practice at a conference or assembly where a rule is to be implemented outside the conference 407
   22.6.2 State practice at a conference or assembly where a rule is to be implemented at the conference itself 408
   22.6.3 Opinio juris at an international conference or assembly 409
22.7 Conclusion as to specific rules of procedure attaining the status of customary international law 411

23 Rules of procedure and general principles of law 413
23.0 Are certain rules of procedure general principles of law? 413

Conclusions 417

Bibliography 423
Index 434