Mediation in Contemporary Chinese Civil Justice

A Proceduralist Diachronic Perspective

By

Peter C.H. Chan

BRILL
NIJHOFF
LEIDEN | BOSTON
Contents

Acknowledgements xi

1 Introduction 1
  1.1 The Research Question and the Scope of this Book 1
  1.2 The Concept of Mediation in Chinese Legal Tradition 5
  1.3 Fundamental Concepts in Contemporary Chinese Civil Justice 6
  1.4 The ‘modern’ Definition of ‘mediation’ 10
  1.5 Fundamental Conceptual Differences between Contemporary Chinese Mediation and Modern Mediation 12
  1.6 The Chinese Court System 15
  1.7 Methodology: A Proceduralist Diachronie Perspective Supplemented by an Empirical Enquiry 17
  1.8 Synthesizing Thoughts in Previously Published Articles 19

2 Legal History of Civil Mediation in China 20
  2.1 Chinese Legal Culture of wu Song 20
  2.2 Mediation as a Communal Dispute Resolution Mechanism 21
  2.3 Magisterial Adjudication: The Role of Mediation in Civil Dispute Resolution in Imperial China 26
  2.4 Court-referred Pre-action Mediation in the Republican Era (1911–1949) 44
  2.5 The Shadow of the Legendary Ma Xiwu: The Legal History of the ‘people’s judge’ and the Impact of His Adjudicatory Approach in Contemporary China 46
  2.6 Early Civil Procedural Designs on Court Mediation and Regulation of Out-of-court Mediation in the People’s Republic 51
  2.7 Xiao Yang and the Rise of Formalism in Chinese Civil Procedure 53
  2.8 Wang Shengjun’s Judicial Philosophy 54
  2.9 Chapter Conclusion 55

3 Fundamental Tenets of Contemporary Chinese Civil Justice: Substantive Justice, Material Truth and the Chinese Judicial Mindset 56
  3.1 Chapter Introduction: The Underlying Philosophy of Contemporary Chinese Civil Adjudication 56
  3.2 The Pre-eminence of Substantive Justice in Chinese Civil Adjudication: Using Civil Appeals in China as Illustration 57
  3.3 The Pre-eminence of Substantive Justice in Chinese Civil Adjudication: Using the Adjudication Supervision Procedure as Illustration 70
3.4 Civil Fact-finding in China – The Search for Material Truth 98
3.5 Chapter Conclusion 112

4 Connecting China's Private and Public Spheres of Civil Dispute Resolution: Grand Mediation, People's Mediation and Social Engineering 113
4.1 The 'Da Tiaojie' (Grand Mediation) System and the Ideological Basis for the Rise of Mediation: A Bird's Eye View of the Chinese Mediation Regime under Da Tiaojie 113
4.2 People's Mediation 122
4.3 Origins and Ideological Underpinnings of People's Mediation 127
4.4 Nexus between Private and Public Spheres of Civil Dispute Resolution 137
4.5 Chapter Conclusion 141

5 Court Mediation in the 'Wang Courts' and the Impact of Wang Shengjun's Policies on Future Developments 143
5.1 Introduction – The Relevance of a Study on the Wang Courts 143
5.2 Introducing Mediation in the Wang Courts: The Judicial Responsibility System, Case Management and Social Harmony 145
5.3 The Position of the Individual Judge within the Chinese Judiciary 158
5.4 Critical Examination of Court Mediation in the Wang Courts and beyond: Procedural Problems and Solutions 161
5.5 Settlement Rate in Appellate Review and Re-adjudication 179
5.6 Chapter Conclusion: Reforming Court Mediation in China by Separating Conciliation from Adjudication 179

6 An Empirical Analysis of Judicial Conciliation in China 182
6.1 Judicial Perception is Reality: The Value of Qualitative Empirical Research on Chinese Law and Procedure 182
6.2 Methodology 183
6.4 Is the Policy of 'prioritizing conciliation' Still in Effect? What is Its Impact on Adjudication? 191
6.5 Coerced Conciliation and Undue Influence from the Judge 193
6.6 Effect of Judicial Conciliation on Ultimate Judgment Should There be No Settlement 194
6.7 The Position of Substantive Law in Judicial Conciliation 196
6.8 Trial Management, Case Quality Evaluation and Settlement Rate 197
6.9 Practical Aspects of Judicial Conciliation as Revealed in the Surveys 198
6.10 Chapter Conclusion: The Position on Judicial Conciliation since March 2013 as Revealed in the Last Round of Interviews 201

7 Trial Management in China: The Institutionalization of Judicial Preference for Court Mediation in Civil Litigation – Overview of Principles and Practice 203
7.1 Trial Management and Civil Justice: Bureaucratic Justice or Managerial Excellence? 203
7.2 An Overview of the 2011 SPC Case Quality Opinion 205
7.3 Operational Aspects of Civil Trial Management in China 210
7.4 Effect of the Trial Management System on Court Mediation in China: An Institutionalized Distortion of (What is Supposed to be) an ADR Mechanism 214
7.5 A Critical Examination of Case Quality Evaluation System from the Perspective of Procedural Justice 215
7.6 Chapter Conclusion 217

8 Conclusion: Seven Areas of Tension in Chinese Dispute Resolution – The Impact on In-court and Out-of-court Mediation 219
8.1 ‘Chinese exceptionalism’ and Civil Justice 219
8.2 First Area of Tension in Chinese Dispute Resolution: Black-Letter Law vs. Judicial Practice 220
8.3 Second Area of Tension in Chinese Dispute Resolution: Official Representation of Justice vs. the Reality of Mass Case-Processing Needs 221
8.4 Third Area of Tension in Chinese Dispute Resolution: SPC Policy vs. Local Implementation 222
8.5 Fourth Area of Tension in Chinese Dispute Resolution: Procedural Justice vs. Substantive Justice 223
8.6 Fifth Area of Tension in Chinese Dispute Resolution: Bureaucratic Supervision vs. Adjudicatory Autonomy 224
8.7 Sixth Area of Tension in Chinese Dispute Resolution: International Norms of Practice vs. Chinese Exceptionalism 225
8.8 Seventh Area of Tension in Chinese Dispute Resolution: Regulatory State vs. ‘autonomy’ of the Judiciary 226
8.9 Final Remarks 227
8.10 Legal Culture and Civil Mediation in China 231
8.11 Political Culture and Civil Mediation in China 232
8.12 A Final Word 233
Afterword: The Recent Judicial Reforms in China: Its Impact on Civil Justice and Mediation 235

9.1 Pre-reform Indicators 235
9.2 Pilot Programmes and SPC Circuit Courts 236
9.3 The Latest SPC Reform Package (2015) 237
9.4 Redefining the Power Structure: Re-distributing Powers of the Chinese Communist Party to Procurators and Courts 243
9.5 Concluding Remarks: Reform’s Impact on Mediation: Superficial Change or Real Overhaul? 244

Appendices

APPENDIX I: Table of Key Statutes, Statutory Instruments, Judicial Interpretations, Rules and Regulations of the Supreme People’s Court and Abbreviations 249
APPENDIX II: Interview Log 252
APPENDIX III: Survey Questionnaires and Master List of Interview Questions 259
APPENDIX IV: List of Published Articles by the Author: The Contents of Which Were Cited and/or Repeated in This Book 287
APPENDIX V: Commercial Mediation in China: A Guide for Foreign Enterprises 289

1 Introduction 289
2 Institutional Commercial Mediation – The Mediation Centre of the China Council for the Promotion of International Trade/China Chamber of International Commerce 295
3 Court Mediation and Its Impact on Commercial Dispute Resolution Involving Foreign Enterprises 300
4 Med-Arb: Mediation in CIETAC Arbitration 303
5 Conclusion 304

Bibliography 305
Articles Cited 322
Index 325