EU CITIZENSHIP AND FEDERALISM

The Role of Rights

Edited by

DIMITRY KOCHENOV

University of Groningen

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
CONTENTS

List of Contributors page xvii
Preface xxi
Foreword xxv
Table of Cases xxix
Table of TEU, TFEU and CFR Provisions lii
Table of the Provisions of Regulations 1612/68 and 492/2011 and Directive 2004/38 lvii
List of Abbreviations lix

Introduction 1

1 On Tiles and Pillars: EU Citizenship as a Federal Denominator 3
DIMITRY KOCHENOV

I Decommodification of Personhood in the European Union? 3
II The 'Federal Association of States and Citizens' 16
III Market Citizenship: A Logical Impossibility 35
IV Reintroducing Dignity into the Structural Fabric of the Legal System 44
V Extending the Analysis: The Chapters That Follow 52
VI On Tiles and Pillars: Predicting the Future 78

PART I Citizenship within the EU Federal Context 83

2 The Origins and the Potential Federalising Effects of the Substance of Rights Test 85
MARTIJN VAN DEN BRINK

I Introduction 85
CONTENTS

II The Protection of the Substance of Rights in the Case Law of the ECJ 87

III The substance of EU Citizenship Rights 90

IV Reinforcing the Vertical Dimension of EU Citizenship 92

V The Substance of Which Rights? 95

VI Conclusion 106

3 Some Reflections on Member State Nationality: A Prerequisite of EU Citizenship and an Obstacle to Its Enjoyment 107
MACIEJ SZPUNAR AND MARÍA ESTHER BLAS LÓPEZ

I Introduction 107
II Globalisation, Europeanisation and Member State Nationality 108
III Some Reflections Concerning Nationality as an Obstacle to the Enjoyment of EU Citizenship 120
IV Conclusion 124

4 The European Federalisation Process and the Dynamics of Fundamental Rights 125
JOSÉ LUÍS DA CRUZ VILAÇA AND ALESSANDRA SILVEIRA

I Introduction 125
II Waiting for a Federal Big Bang? Revisiting the Federalising Process Theory 128
III Delimitation of Competences and Federative Balance 133
IV Fundamental Rights and Sense of Community 136
V Conflicts of Competence and System Survival 142
VI Conclusion 145

5 Recasting EU Citizenship as Federal Citizenship: What Are the Implications for the Citizen When the Polity Bargain Is Privileged? 147
NIAMH NIC SHUÍBHNE

I Introduction 147
II The EU as a Federal Polity 149
CONTENTS

III Recasting EU Citizenship Case Law as Federal Citizenship Case Law 160
IV EU Citizenship as Federal Citizenship: The Value Added – and the Value Lost 168
V Conclusion 176

6 Transfiguring European Citizenship: From Member State Territory to Union Territory 178
LOÏC AZOULAI

I From Metonymy to Metaphor 178
II From European Territory to Social Integration 182
III From Social Integration to the Territory of the Union 193
IV Conclusion 202

7 Earned Citizenship – Understanding Union Citizenship through Its Scope 204
ELEANOR SPAVENTA

I Introduction 204
II From the Market to the Market: The (Ir)Relevance of the Inactive Citizen 206
III Ruiz Zambrano and the Substance of the Rights Test – A Hasty Retreat and a Problematic Doctrine 209
IV Earned Citizenship 219
V Normative Justifications and Moral Imperatives 221
VI Conclusions 223

DANIEL SARMIENTO AND ELEANOR SHARPSTON

I Introduction 226
II Free Movement and Its Limits: When the Court Said ‘Enough’ 228
III Citizenship and Rights 231
IV Citizenship and Democracy 235
V Citizenship and the Rule of Law 238
VI Conclusion: From a Market-Based Citizenship to Constitutional Citizenship: A Task for Citizens, Not Only Courts 241
CONTENTS

9 Going Home? ‘European’ Citizenship Practice Twenty Years After 243
Antje Wiener
I Introduction 243
II Citizenship Practice Theory – A Heuristic Device 249
III Renegotiating Normativity: Who Has Access to Contestation? 259
IV Conclusion 267

PART II EU Citizenship Rights and the Vertical Division of Powers in the EU 269

10 The Political Side of EU Citizenship in the Context of EU Federalism 271
Federico Fabbrini
I Introduction 271
II EU Citizenship and Political Rights 273
III Extending EU Citizens’ Electoral Rights: Promises and Pitfalls 277
IV Federalism, Citizenship and Democracy 281
V The Case Law of the ECJ and the Development of EU Citizens’ Political Rights 285
VI Treaty Reform: Between States’ Consent and Popular Will 289
VII Conclusion 292

11 Reframing Public Health Governance: From Risk to Citizenship and Participation 294
Mark L. Flear
I Introduction 294
II Framing EU Public Health Governance as a Matter of Risk 297
III Reframing EU Public Health Governance as a Matter of EU Citizenship 308
IV Conclusion 315
CONTENTS

12 The Federal Implications of the Transformation of the Market Freedoms into Sources of Fundamental Rights for the Union Citizen 316
ALINA TRYFONIDOU

I Introduction 316
II Morality Issues 319
III Direct Taxation Cases 325
IV Right to Receive Healthcare Services and Goods in the Territory of Another Member State 329
V Immigration Control and Family Reunification Rights of Migrant Union Citizens 333
VI Analysis 337
VII Conclusion 340

13 Perspectives on Social Citizenship in the EU: From Status Positivus to Status Socialis Activus via Two Forms of Transnational Solidarity 341
DAGMAR SCHIEK

I Introduction 341
II Towards Transnational Social Citizenship 343
III The EU as a Case Study for Transnational Social Citizenship 354
IV Conclusion 368

14 A Citizenship Right to Stay? The Right Not to Move in a Union Based on Free Movement 371
SARA IGLESIAS SÁNCHEZ

I Introduction 371
II Territorial Rights: Right to Stay, Right to Remain, Right Not to be Displaced 373
III The Citizenship of the Union and the Transformation of the Right to Stay 377
IV The Right to Stay in One's Own Country: An EU Citizenship Right or a Fundamental Right? 387
V Concluding Remarks 392
CONTENTS

15 'Scelestus Europeus Sum': What Protection against Expulsion Does EU Citizenship Offer to European Offenders? 394
MICHAL MEDUNA

I EU Citizenship and Public Order – Introduction 394
II A Tale of Four Institutions 397
III Federalising Potential of EU Citizenship 407
IV Future of the public Policy / Security Derogation – Conclusion 413

16 EU Sexual Citizenship: Sex Beyond the Internal Market 417
ULADZISLAU BELAVUSAU

I Introduction 417
II Sexual Citizenship: Normative Investigation 419
III EU Sexual Rights: Three Bricks at the Foundation of Sex in the Union 427
IV Conclusions: Mobile Citizenship and Sex Mobilisation via EU Law 441

17 EU Citizenship and the European Federal Challenge through the Prism of Family Reunification 443
STANISLAS ADAM AND PETER VAN ELSUWEGE

I Introduction 443
II A Fragmented Legal Landscape 446
III The Undesirable Effects of Fragmented Legal Regimes 452
IV Tackling Reverse Discrimination? 456
V Rights’ Protection from the Perspective of Comparative Federalism 462
VI Conclusion 466

18 The Right to Stay at Home: A Basis for Expanding European Family Rights 468
GARETH DAVIES

I Introduction 468
II The Right to Stay at Home 469
III Life without Family 474
IV Difficult Family Members 481
V Conclusion 487
CONTENTS

19 EU Citizenship and the Right to Care 489
NATHAN CAMBIEN

I Introduction 489
II The Right to Care as a Trigger for More Extensive Protection in ECJ Case Law 490
III The Legal Foundations of the Right to Care in EU Law 491
IV Defining the Limits of the Right to Care 498
V Concluding remarks 506

20 Union Citizenship and Disability: Restricted Access to Equality Rights and the Attitudinal Model of Disability 509
CHARLOTTE O'BRIEN

I Introduction 509
II The EU as Driver for Member States' Attitudinal Model 512
III The EU as Cheerleader for Member States' Attitudinal Model 528
IV Altering the Federal Dynamic and the Functional Direction: The EU as Potential Protector 535
V Conclusion 536

21 Data Privacy Rights and Citizenship: Notes on Federalism All the Way Up 540
BILYANA PETKOVA

I Introduction 540
II The Importance of Privacy in the European Legal Order 542
III National Institutions' Impact on EU Data Privacy: Toward Privacy Federalism All the Way Up? 545
IV The Intersection of Data Privacy and Citizenship Rights 556
V Conclusion 559

HANNEKE VAN EIJKEN AND TONY P. MARGUERY

I Introduction 561
II The Need to Protect a Federal Citizenship beyond the Cross-Border Logic as a Rationale for the AFSJ 564
CONTENTS

III To What Extent Does EU Criminal Law Affect EU Citizens? 568

IV The Impact of EU Citizens' Rights on Criminal Law 573

V Conclusion 582

23 The Right of EU Citizens to Diplomatic and Consular Protection: A Step Towards Recognition of EU Citizenship in Third Countries? 584

P A T R I Z I A V I G N I

I Introduction 584

II The Right to Diplomatic and Consular Protection 586

III The EU as International Defender of EU Citizens 604

IV Conclusion 610

P A R T  III  B R O A D E R  I M P L I C A T I O N S  a n d L i m i t a t i o n s  613

24 Individual Rights, Interstate Equality, State Autonomy: European Horizontal Citizenship and Its (Lonely) Playground from a Trans-Atlantic Perspective 615

F R A N C E S C A S T R U M I A

I Introduction 615

II Federalism and the Discourse of Citizenship in the US and the EU – Act I 617

III Federalism and the Discourse of Citizenship in the US and the EU – Act II 625

IV EU Horizontal Citizenship 631

V Post-National Citizenship and Political Citizenship in the EU: A Horizontal Perspective 636

VI Conclusion 641

25 EU Citizenship and Fundamental Rights: Contradictory, Converging or Complementary? 642

D O M I N I K D Ü S T E R H A U S

I Introduction 642

II A Contradiction? Citizenship and Fundamental Rights 643

III Fundamental Rights and Member State Action 647

IV On the Protective Potential of Citizenship Rights 650

V Links to the Rights: Triggering Rules in the Field of Citizenship 656
CONTENTS

VI Protecting the Citizens: The Limits of Interpretation 661
VII Conclusion 664

26 Reverse Solange: Union Citizenship as a Detour on the Route to European Rights Protection against National Infringements 665
JOHANNA CROON-GESTEFELD

I Introduction 665
II EU Fundamental Rights Protection against Member State Violations – Current Proposals 667
III Union Citizenship as a Door-Opener for Rights Protection? 671
IV The Reversibility of the Solange Approach 676
V The Danger of Reverse Results 680
VI Conclusion 683

27 Union Citizenship Re-Imagined: The Scope of Intervention of EU Institutions 685
JOZÈ ŠTRUS

I Introduction 686
II Circumstances Establishing the Link with EU Law 687
III Negative Effect on the exercise of Union Citizenship Rights: A Central Connecting Factor with EU Law? 693
IV The Right Institutions for the Job: The Role of EU and National Institutions in Ensuring the Effectiveness of Union Citizenship Rights 700
V Conclusion 704

28 Frontiers of EU Citizenship: Three Trajectories and Their Methodological Limitations 705
DANIEL THYM

I Introduction 705
II Frontiers of Union Citizenship 706
III Methodological Background 707
IV Aspirational Citizenship 710
V Citizenship as a Legal Creation 717
VI Citizenship as a Social Fact 724
VII Conclusion 728
29 EU Citizenship and Its Relevance for EU Exit and Secession 731
PHOEBUS L. ATHANASSIOU AND STÉPHANIE LAULHÉ SHAELOU

I Introduction 731
II Withdrawal in Toto of a Member State from the EU – Concept and Consequences 733
III Secession of Part of the Territory of an EU Member State – Concept and Relevance of Public International Law in an EU Context 735
IV The Concept of EU Citizenship and Its Relevance in EU Exit or Secession scenarios 740
V EU Citizenship as a Non-Legal Consideration in EU Exit or Secession Scenarios 747
VI Concluding Remarks 749

30 Epilogue on EU Citizenship: Hopes and Fears 751
KOEN LENAErts AND JOSÉ A. GUTIÉRREz-FONs

I Introduction 751
II The Idea of ‘Democracy’ 753
III The Right to Move as an EU Citizen in the Light of Democracy 757
IV Ruiz Zambrano, Delvigne and the EU Constitutional Balance 762
V Concluding Remarks 779

Index 782