UK Merger Control: Law and Practice

Third Edition

A. Nigel Parr, LL.B., LL.M., PhD
Solicitor

Roger J. Finbow, M.A. (Oxon)
Solicitor

Matthew J. Hughes, B.A., MSc
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface and Acknowledgments</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td>xxvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Statutes</td>
<td>xxxv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Statutory Instruments</td>
<td>xli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of European Decisions and Cases</td>
<td>xlii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decisions, Reports, and Notices of the Monopolies and Mergers Commission, Competition Commission and Competition Markets Authority</td>
<td>xlv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Decisions of the Office of Fair Trading, Advices of the DTI and DGFT, Notices, Undertakings and Press Releases</td>
<td>lv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## PARA

1. **An Overview of the new Competition and Markets Authority and the Reformed Enterprise Act Regime**
   *Nigel Parr and Catherine Hammon*

   **Introduction:** An updated and fine-tuned regime ........................................1–001

   **Institutions responsible for the enforcement of UK merger control**
   - The Competition and Markets Authority (CMA) ........................................1–003
   - The CMA Board .........................................................................................1–004
   - The CMA Panel .........................................................................................1–005
   - CMA staff ...............................................................................................1–006
   - The Secretary of State ............................................................................1–007
   - The Competition Appeal Tribunal .........................................................1–008

   **Overview of the merger control process**
   - General principles ..................................................................................1–009
   - The statutory framework ........................................................................1–010
   - Notification and timeframe for Phase 1 ................................................1–011
   - Informal advice ......................................................................................1–012
   - The CMA's Phase 1 evaluation ................................................................1–013
   - Undertakings in lieu ...............................................................................1–014
   - Implications of a Phase 2 reference ......................................................1–015
   - The Phase 2 investigation ......................................................................1–016
   - Review by the Competition Appeal Tribunal .........................................1–017

   **The main changes effected by the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013** ..................................................1–018

   **Brexit** ..................................................................................................1–019
CONTENTS

2. Jurisdiction
Nigel Parr and Ruth Allen

Introduction...........................................................................................................2–001
Has a merger situation arisen?...........................................................................2–003
   “Enterprise”.........................................................................................................2–004
   “Ceased to be distinct enterprises”.....................................................................2–015
      Common ownership or common control..........................................................2–016
Associated persons ..............................................................................................2–030
Does the merger situation qualify for investigation?.........................................2–031
   The turnover test..................................................................................................2–032
      Identifying the relevant turnover .....................................................................2–033
      Calculation of the relevant turnover ...............................................................2–035
   The share of supply test ......................................................................................2–036
   Time limits for commencement of investigation .............................................2–043
Applicable merger control rules in particular sectors..........................................2–047
   Media ownership rules: Television and radio licences.....................................2–048
   Water and sewerage .........................................................................................2–050
   Other utilities and regulated industries .............................................................2–054
      Electricity ...........................................................................................................2–055
      Gas ....................................................................................................................2–056
      Telecoms and communications .......................................................................2–057
      Rail ....................................................................................................................2–058
      Aviation .............................................................................................................2–059
      Financial services ............................................................................................2–060
   Healthcare..........................................................................................................2–061
Public interest cases ............................................................................................2–062
Relationship between the merger control regime and the
   Competition Act 1998 .........................................................................................2–063
   Ancillary restraints ............................................................................................2–064
   Withdrawal of the exclusion from the Ch.I prohibition.....................................2–067

3. The Relationship Between the UK and EU Merger Control
   Regimes
Nigel Parr and Ruth Allen

Brexit......................................................................................................................3–001
Introduction ..........................................................................................................3–002
Does the European Commission have jurisdiction?.............................................3–003
   Is there a “concentration” for the purposes of the EUMR?..............................3–004
      Sole control .......................................................................................................3–005
      Joint control ....................................................................................................3–006
      “Full function” joint ventures ........................................................................3–007
   Does the concentration have a “Community dimension”?...............................3–008
Will the United Kingdom authorities have jurisdiction under the
   “referral-back” provisions?..................................................................................3–009
   Referral back prior to notification under art.4(4) of the EUMR ......................3–010
   Referral back following notification under art.9 of the EUMR .........................3–013
CONTENTS

Procedure at the national level following a reference back ............3-017
Referral to the European Commission under art.4(5) and art.22 of
the EUMR.................................................................3-018
Referral up prior to notification under art.4(5) of the
EUMR ........................................................................3-019
Referral up following notification under art.22 of the
EUMR ........................................................................3-021
Will the UK be able to protect its “legitimate interests”? .............3-026
Does jurisdiction over mergers remain vested in the European
Commission and the national courts under arts 101 and 102 of
TFEU? ........................................................................3-027

4. Phase 1 Procedure
Nigel Parr and Charles Hammon

Introduction .....................................................................4-001
Deciding whether to notify a transaction to the CMA..............4-002
Deciding not to seek clearance ..........................................4-003
Electing to run the risk of a reference ................................4-004
The CMA’s approach in the absence of notification ..........4-009
Initial information request and enquiry letter ..........4-010
Third party complaints ..................................................4-014
When to seek clearance ....................................................4-015
The relevance of the Takeover Code on the decision to seek
clearance
Merger situations to which the Takeover Code applies ..........4-016
The special merger regime for water mergers ..................4-019
Informal advice .................................................................4-020
The pros and cons of informal advice ..............................4-021
Principles of informal advice ...........................................4-023
Procedure for seeking informal advice ..........................4-024
The need for confidentiality ............................................4-025
Notification process
Pre-notification discussions ............................................4-026
Submitting a Merger Notice ............................................4-027
The CMA’s investigation timetable ...................................4-028
Information required by the Merger Notice ..................4-030
Rejection of a Merger Notice ...........................................4-033
Requests for additional information ............................4-034
Withdrawal of a Merger Notice ......................................4-037
Triggering the public interest regime and its impact on
notification .................................................................4-038
The CMA’s assessment procedure
Appointment of a case team and information gathering ......4-039
Third party comments .....................................................4-041
Competing bids and contemporaneous mergers ............4-044
Competing bids ..............................................................4-045
Contemporaneous mergers ............................................4-046
Tactical considerations ....................................................4-048
Enforcement powers during the investigation
  Information gathering.................................................................4–049
  Offences and penalties related to the CMA’s investigating
  powers ..........................................................................................4–050
  “Initial enforcement” or “interim” orders ........................................4–051
  Other interim measures ...................................................................4–058
  Derogation .....................................................................................4–059
  Monitoring trustees/“hold separate” managers ...............................4–061
The CMA’s decision-making process ..................................................4–064
  Cases that do not raise substantive competition concerns .............4–065
  Cases that raise substantive competition concerns .......................4–066
    State of play discussion ...............................................................4–067
    Issues meeting ............................................................................4–068
    Case Review Meeting .................................................................4–071
    SLC decision meeting ................................................................4–072
The “fast track” reference procedure ..................................................4–074
Ancillary restrictions ..........................................................................4–076
The CMA’s decision on a reference
  The CMA’s decision .......................................................................4–077
Undertakings in lieu of a reference ......................................................4–078
Undertakings in lieu under the public interest regime .......................4–079
When a reference remains possible notwithstanding a clearance
  decision ..........................................................................................4–080
Confidentiality in dealing with the CMA
  Confidentiality under the Act—Part 9 ............................................4–081
    Dealing with confidentiality in practice .........................................4–084
Fees for merger clearance ..................................................................4–086

5. Phase 1 Outcomes and Remedies

Nigel Parr and Catherine Hammon

Introduction—the range of possible Phase 1 outcomes .......................5–001
The meaning of the CMA’s duty to refer
  Introduction ....................................................................................5–002
  The revised statutory wording of the duty to refer .........................5–003
The IBA Health judgments: Establishing the “realistic prospect”
  test ...............................................................................................5–004
  Guidance on the “realistic prospect” test, post-IBA Health ..............5–007
  “Realistic” versus “substantial”? .....................................................5–009
Fast track references and the “realistic prospect” test .........................5–010
Broader application of the realistic prospect test: identifying the
  appropriate counterfactual ................................................................5–011
Adequacy of reasoning in the Phase 1 decision ..................................5–012
Split references: Can the CMA refer only part of a
  merger? .........................................................................................5–015
Does the Phase 1 reference decision need to make a finding on
  all theories of harm? .....................................................................5–017
Statutory “exceptions” to the duty to refer: Introduction ....................5–018
The markets concerned do not warrant reference—the “de minimis” discretion

De minimis or undertakings in lieu?

Emergence of the policy

CMA’s approach to assessing the availability of undertakings in lieu

Estimate of the “cost of a reference” versus the estimated consumer harm

Review of the competitive impact of the merger

The market size thresholds for exercise of the de minimis discretion

The strength of the competition concerns

The magnitude of competition that would be lost

The duration of any competitive harm

The wider implications of a de minimis decision in the case in question

Procedure in relation to the de minimis exception

The substantial lessening of competition is outweighed by relevant customer benefits

Customer benefits versus rivalry-enhancing efficiencies

Relationship between the customer benefits discretion and undertakings in lieu

Meaning of relevant customer benefits

The market where the relevant customer benefits arise

The relevant customer benefits must accrue within a reasonable period

The relevant customer benefits must be merger-specific or unlikely to accrue in the absence of a similar lessening of competition

The benefit can be to any customer in the chain

The evidential hurdle

Deciding whether to exercise the relevant customer benefits discretion

Balancing the harm against the benefits

Proportionality and the relevant customer benefits discretion

The assessment of relevant customer benefits in connection with NHS mergers

The merger is not sufficiently advanced or sufficiently likely to proceed

Circumstances where a reference may not be made

Avoiding a reference by undertakings in lieu

Introduction

The statutory framework for accepting undertakings in lieu under the Act

Requirement that the duty to refer must have been engaged
Requirement that the purpose of undertakings in lieu is to remedy, mitigate or prevent .................................................. 5-059
A wide discretion for the CMA ........................................... 5-061
Requirement to achieve as comprehensive a solution as is reasonable and practicable .................................................. 5-062
Requirement of proportionality of any undertakings in lieu ................................................................. 5-064
Consideration of relevant customer benefits in designing undertakings in lieu .................................................. 5-066
An obligation to consult .................................................. 5-067
The CMA’s “clear-cut” standard ............................................................. 5-068
Structural and behavioural undertakings in lieu ............................................................. 5-069
Structural remedies—identifying the business to be sold ............................................................. 5-070
Structural remedies—approval of the buyer ............................................................. 5-073
Structural remedies—requiring an up-front buyer ............................................................. 5-074
Behavioural remedies ............................................................. 5-077
Procedure for offering and accepting undertakings in lieu ............................................................. 5-079
The decision whether to offer undertakings in lieu ............................................................. 5-080
Discussions about undertakings in lieu made before the reference decision is published ............................................................. 5-081
Making an formal offer of undertakings in lieu—the Remedies Form and draft undertakings ............................................................. 5-082
The statutory timetable for offering, negotiating and accepting undertakings in lieu ............................................................. 5-084
Procedure for consulting on and finalising undertakings in lieu ............................................................. 5-089
Additional procedural requirements where an “up-front” buyer is required ............................................................. 5-091
Requirement for a monitoring trustee to be provided for in the undertakings in lieu ............................................................. 5-093
Procedure following acceptance of undertakings ............................................................. 5-094
Enforcement of undertakings in lieu ............................................................. 5-095

6. Assessing the Risk of a Reference
Ben Forbes and Matthew Hughes
Introduction ................................................................................. 6-001
Theories of harm and evidence gathering
An overview of the Merger Assessment Guidelines ............................................................. 6-002
The distinctions between Phase 1 and 2, and evidence gathering ............................................................. 6-004
The theories of harm that lead to SLC findings
Introduction ................................................................................. 6-007
The Merger Assessment Guidelines on the application of market share thresholds ............................................................. 6-008
The prevalence of SLC findings by theory of harm, and the relevance of market shares ............................................................. 6-009
Small market share increments ................................................................................. 6-010
CONTENTS

Competition concerns other than unilateral effects where a merger creates or enhances high market shares........................................ 6–013
Mergers that reduce the number of competitors from four to three or fewer
Mergers between local retailers, wholesalers, and service providers ................................................................. 6–014
Other mergers that reduce the number of competitors to three or fewer........................................................................ 6–015
Other mergers in differentiated markets .................................................. 6–017
The counterfactual............................................................................. 6–019
Frames of reference, market definition and the significance of previous decisions
Introduction.................................................................................... 6–020
Product market definitions ............................................................... 6–023
Geographic market definition............................................................ 6–024
Unconditionally cleared cases
Introduction.................................................................................... 6–027
Differentiated and bidding markets
Introduction .................................................................................... 6–029
Differentiated product markets ......................................................... 6–030
Bidding markets ............................................................................. 6–035
Mergers between local retailers, wholesaler and service providers .......................................................... 6–037
Undifferentiated markets .................................................................. 6–039
Other competitive constraints—countervailing buyer power........................................................................ 6–041
Other competitive constraints—entry and expansion........................ 6–044
The counterfactual—the exiting firm defence..................................... 6–048
Success of the “exiting firm” defence.................................................. 6–049
Conclusions on the “exiting firm” scenario........................................... 6–051
Conclusions....................................................................................... 6–053

7. Phase 2 Procedure
Ross Mackenzie and Alexi Dimitriou
Introduction.................................................................................... 7–001
The purpose of the Phase 2 investigation ........................................... 7–002
The statutory timeframe for a Phase 2 investigation .......................... 7–003
General principles............................................................................ 7–006
Standard of proof............................................................................. 7–007
Confidentiality.................................................................................. 7–008
Initial preparatory work by the CMA for the Phase 2 inquiry
Terms of reference........................................................................... 7–009
The appointment of the Inquiry Group and Phase 2 case team ........... 7–010
Continuity between Phase 1 and Phase 2 ........................................... 7–012
Administrative timetable................................................................. 7–013
Potential suspension or cancellation of the reference......................... 7–014
CONTENTS

The immediate consequences of the announcement of a reference .......................................................... 7-016
Interim undertakings and orders .......................................................... 7-017
Use of a hold-separate manager or monitoring trustee .......................................................... 7-019
Enforcement of interim measures .......................................................... 7-020
CMA’s Register of Orders and Undertakings .......................................................... 7-021
Statutory restrictions in relation to completed mergers .......................................................... 7-022
Statutory restrictions in relation to anticipated mergers .......................................................... 7-023
Lapse of the offer under the Code .......................................................... 7-024
The first few days .................................................................................. 7-025
The initial “first day” letter
Introduction .................................................................................. 7-026
The initial request for information .................................................................................. 7-027
Request for main submission .................................................................................. 7-028
Off-the-shelf material .................................................................................. 7-030
The case management meeting and data meeting .................................................................. 7-031
Administrative timetable .................................................................................. 7-032
Market Information Request .................................................................................. 7-033
Financial Information Request .................................................................................. 7-034
Further information requests .................................................................................. 7-035
Customer surveys .................................................................................. 7-037
Site visits .................................................................................. 7-038
Evidence from third parties .................................................................................. 7-039
The issues statement .................................................................................. 7-040
CMA working papers .................................................................................. 7-041
The “put-back” process .................................................................................. 7-042
Sharing of technical analysis and use of data rooms .......................................................... 7-043
Third party hearings .................................................................................. 7-044
Open and joint hearings .................................................................................. 7-046
Main party hearings .................................................................................. 7-047
Preparation for the hearing .................................................................................. 7-048
Conduct of the hearing .................................................................................. 7-049
The transcript .................................................................................. 7-052
Additional case team meetings .................................................................................. 7-053
Publication of provisional findings .................................................................................. 7-054
Notice of Possible Remedies .................................................................................. 7-056
Consultation on the provisional findings and Notice of Possible Remedies
Response hearings .................................................................................. 7-058
Remedies working paper .................................................................................. 7-059
Opportunity to comment on information received at a late stage .................................................................................. 7-060
The CMA’s final report .................................................................................. 7-061
Statutory requirements .................................................................................. 7-062
Further consultation with the parties prior to publication .................................................................................. 7-063
Fairness and consistency .................................................................................. 7-064
Publication .................................................................................. 7-065
Implementation of remedies .................................................................................. 7-066
8. Phase 2 Outcomes and Remedies

Steven Vaz and Emily Clark

Introduction and context

Requirements of the Enterprise Act 2002 ................................................. 8–001
Release of hold separate obligations ......................................................... 8–002
Unconditional clearance of a merger ......................................................... 8–003
Statutory timeframe for the negotiation and implementation of remedies ......... 8–004
Material change of circumstances following the final report ...................... 8–005
The legal principles underlying the selection of remedies ......................... 8–006
The choice between action by way of undertakings or an order .................. 8–007
Scope of the CMA's remedial powers ......................................................... 8–008
The choice of remedies in practice ............................................................ 8–009
Types of remedies available ...................................................................... 8–010
Effectiveness ............................................................................................ 8–011
Dimensions of effectiveness ...................................................................... 8–012
International mergers ................................................................................ 8–013
Proportionality and cost ........................................................................... 8–014
Costs to the merging parties ...................................................................... 8–015
Costs to third parties ................................................................................ 8–016
Monitoring and compliance costs .............................................................. 8–017
The interaction between proportionality and effectiveness ....................... 8–018
Relevant customer benefits ...................................................................... 8–021
Convincing evidence of relevant customer benefits is required ................. 8–022
Unsuccessful claims of relevant customer benefits ................................... 8–023
A preference for structural remedies ......................................................... 8–026
Prohibition ............................................................................................... 8–027
Divestment remedies ............................................................................... 8–029
Measures to protect the divestment process .............................................. 8–031
The scope of the divestment package ....................................................... 8–032
Preference for divestment of the acquired business ................................... 8–033
Preference for divestment of the whole of an existing business ................. 8–034
Alternative divestment packages ............................................................... 8–036
Virtual divestment .................................................................................... 8–037
The need for a suitable purchaser ............................................................. 8–038
Upfront buyer .......................................................................................... 8–039
Protection of the business to be divested in the interim ........................... 8–040
Implementation of divestment remedies .................................................... 8–042
Remedies relating to intellectual property rights ....................................... 8–044
Behavioural remedies .............................................................................. 8–047
Design, monitoring and enforcement ......................................................... 8–048
9. Substantial Lessening of Competition

*Ben Forbes, Matthew Hughes, and Rameet Sangha*

Introduction ........................................................................................................... 9–001

What is meant by “substantial lessening of competition”? ........................................ 9–002

Why does an SLC arise? .......................................................................................... 9–002

The role of the Merger Assessment Guidelines, and the focus of evidence gathering ........................................ 9–007

The counterfactual to the merger

Overview ................................................................................................................. 9–009

The exiting firm scenario ....................................................................................... 9–012

Whether the firm would have exited ...................................................................... 9–014

The existence of less anti-competitive alternative purchasers ................................ 9–021

The firm’s sales in event of exit ............................................................................ 9–024

The loss of a potential entrant scenario ................................................................. 9–029

Competing bids and parallel transactions ............................................................. 9–036

Market definition

Introduction ................................................................................................................. 9–039

Is market definition useful? .................................................................................. 9–040

Product market definition

Demand side substitutability: Sources of evidence ............................................... 9–044

Pricing correlations .............................................................................................. 9–047

Natural experiments .............................................................................................. 9–052

Defining the relevant product market—supply-side substitutability ..................... 9–053

Geographic market definition .............................................................................. 9–058

Assessing the unilateral effects of mergers

Introduction.............................................................................................................. 9–077

Unilateral effects in differentiated markets

Introduction .............................................................................................................. 9–079
CONTENTS

Assessments of the closeness of competition, pricing pressure
tests and merger simulation ........................................... 9–081
The measurement of diversion ratios and gross margins .......... 9–091
The assessment of unilateral effects in relation to mergers
between local retailers, wholesalers and other local service
providers ........................................................................... 9–098
Unilateral effects in undifferentiated markets and bidding and
bargaining markets
Bidding and bargaining markets ........................................ 9–114
Undifferentiated product and geographic markets .................. 9–125
Minority shareholdings ..................................................... 9–127
Increased buyer power ...................................................... 9–134
Conclusions ....................................................................... 9–137
Assessing the coordinated effects of mergers
Introduction—what are coordinated effects? ........................ 9–138
An introduction to the economics of coordination .................. 9–140
Reaching and monitoring terms of coordination .................... 9–151
Internal sustainability of coordination (punishment) ............... 9–160
External stability of coordination ......................................... 9–168
Conclusions ....................................................................... 9–170
Non-horizontal mergers
Introduction ....................................................................... 9–171
Assessing the risk of foreclosure due to vertical mergers
Overview .......................................................................... 9–173
Ability to foreclose ............................................................ 9–178
Incentives to foreclose ....................................................... 9–181
The effects of input and customer foreclosure ......................... 9–183
Case study: BT/EE (2016) .................................................... 9–184
Assessing the risk of foreclosure from conglomerate mergers
Overview .......................................................................... 9–187
Ability to foreclose ............................................................ 9–188
Incentives to foreclose ....................................................... 9–189
The effects of foreclosure .................................................... 9–190
Case study: Information Resources/Aztec (2014) .................... 9–191
Other anti-competitive effects
Bundling to engage in price discrimination and softening of
competition ................................................................. 9–196
Access to confidential information in connection with vertical
mergers ............................................................................ 9–197
The risk of coordinated effects ............................................. 9–198
Conclusions ....................................................................... 9–200
Barriers to entry and expansion
Overview: Entry and expansion needs to be timely, likely and
sufficient ................................................................. 9–201
Absolute advantages .......................................................... 9–205
Regulatory and legal barriers ............................................... 9–206
Technical advantages .......................................................... 9–208
Intrinsic/structural advantages .............................................. 9–210
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economies of scale</td>
<td>9–212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic advantages</td>
<td>9–215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferential access to inputs</td>
<td>9–216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reputation and brand loyalty</td>
<td>9–217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aggressive and anti-competitive behaviour</td>
<td>9–220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Markets with network effects</td>
<td>9–221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Countervailing buyer power</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction and an overview of the sources of buyer power</td>
<td>9–223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-merger behaviour and switching to alternative suppliers</td>
<td>9–226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-supply/in-house production</td>
<td>9–231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buyers encouraging market entry/expansion</td>
<td>9–232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threat and “punishment” strategies</td>
<td>9–235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not all customers may possess buyer power</td>
<td>9–238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The assessment of efficiencies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>9–240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are rivalry enhancing efficiencies?</td>
<td>9–241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When do efficiencies benefit customers?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An overview</td>
<td>9–244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost savings</td>
<td>9–245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vertical effects (1)—Removal of double marginalisation</td>
<td>9–252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vertical effects (2)—Solving the “investment hold-up” problem or achieving transactional efficiencies</td>
<td>9–253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product repositioning</td>
<td>9–254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demand side efficiencies</td>
<td>9–256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is there an efficiency offence?</td>
<td>9–260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementing an efficiency defence</td>
<td>9–267</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 10. The Public Interest Merger Regime

**Duncan Liddell and Ruth Allen**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>10–001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specified public interest considerations: Overview</td>
<td>10–002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interests of national security</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The meaning of “interests of national security”</td>
<td>10–003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broadening of the concept to include “public security”</td>
<td>10–004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>10–006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intervention by the Secretary of State on national security grounds in practice</td>
<td>10–007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need for media plurality and accurate presentation of news</td>
<td>10–010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspaper public interest considerations (ss.58(2A) and (2B) of the Enterprise Act)</td>
<td>10–011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need for accurate presentation of news and free expression of opinion in newspapers</td>
<td>10–012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sufficient plurality of views in newspapers</td>
<td>10–013</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Secretary of State’s policy on intervention on the basis of newspaper public interest considerations ........................................10–015
Broadcasting and cross-media public interest considerations (s.58(2C) of the Enterprise Act) ..........................................................10–016
Sufficient plurality of persons with control of media enterprises .........................................................................................10–017
Need for a wide range of high-quality broadcasting .......................10–019
Commitments to broadcasting standards objectives .......................10–020
Intervention by the Secretary of State on media plurality grounds in practice .................................................................10–021
The need to maintain the stability of the UK financial system .........................................................................................10–028
The possibility of adding new public interest considerations to s.58 .........................................................................................10–029
Public interest concerns in the context of transfers of UK companies into foreign ownership .........................................................10–030
Identification of public interest considerations .................................10–032
Public interest intervention notices under s.42 of the Enterprise Act
Overview .........................................................................................10–033
Conditions for issuing a public interest intervention notice ..........10–034
Timeframe for issuing a public interest intervention notice ..........10–035
Consultation on whether an intervention notice should be issued .........................................................................................10–036
Making submissions on public interest considerations ..................10–037
Seeking informal advice ................................................................10–038
Phase 1 report by the CMA to the Secretary of State ......................10–039
Additional advice on public interest issues provided to Secretary of State .....................................................................................10–040
Report by Ofcom pursuant to s.44A of the Enterprise Act (media public interest) .................................................................10–041
Secretary of State’s decision whether to refer the merger to Phase 2 .........................................................................................10–042
Possibility of undertakings in lieu in public interest cases .................10–043
Phase 2 report by the CMA to the Secretary of State ......................10–044
Secretary of State’s final Phase 2 decision .........................................10–045
Special public interest intervention notices under s.59 of the Enterprise Act
Overview .........................................................................................10–046
Conditions for issuing a special public interest intervention notice .........................................................................................10–047
Timeframe for issuing a special public interest intervention notice .........................................................................................10–048
Consultation on whether a special public interest intervention notice should be issued .........................................................10–049
Making submissions on public interest considerations ..................10–050
Seeking informal advice ................................................................10–051
Phase 1 report by the CMA to the Secretary of State ......................10–052
CONTENTS

Additional advice on public interest issues provided to the Secretary of State .......................................................... 10–053
Secretary of State’s decision whether to refer the merger to Phase 2 ........................................................................... 10–054
Possibility of undertakings in lieu ......................................................................................................................... 10–055
Phase 2 report by the CMA to the Secretary of State ......................................................................................... 10–056
Secretary of State’s final Phase 2 decision ............................................................................................................. 10–057

European intervention notices under s.67 of the Enterprise Act ........................................................................... 10–058
Conditions for issuing a European intervention notice ..................................................................................... 10–059
Protection of the legitimate interests of the UK ................................................................................................. 10–060
Timeframe for issuing a European intervention notice ..................................................................................... 10–062
Consultation on whether a European intervention notice should be issued .................................................. 10–063

Making submissions on public interest considerations when a European intervention notice has been issued ................................................................................................................................. 10–064
Seeking informal advice ....................................................................................................................................... 10–065
Phase 1 report by the CMA to the Secretary of State ......................................................................................... 10–066
Additional advice on public interest issues provided to the Secretary of State .................................................. 10–067
Secretary of State’s decision whether to refer the merger to Phase 2 ........................................................................... 10–068
Possibility of undertakings in lieu ......................................................................................................................... 10–069
Phase 2 report by the CMA to the Secretary of State ......................................................................................... 10–070
Secretary of State’s final Phase 2 decision ............................................................................................................. 10–071

Judicial review of the Secretary of State’s decisions where an intervention notice is issued .................................................. 10–072
Lobbying ............................................................................................................................................................. 10–073

11. Review by the Competition Appeal Tribunal
Nigel Parr and Laura Carter

Introduction ................................................................................................................................................. 11–001
The statutory review procedure .......................................................................................................................... 11–002
Persons aggrieved ............................................................................................................................................... 11–003
Time limits ......................................................................................................................................................... 11–004
Expedited procedure ........................................................................................................................................... 11–005
Exceptional circumstances ................................................................................................................................. 11–006
Interim measures .............................................................................................................................................. 11–008
Third party intervention ....................................................................................................................................... 11–010
Admissibility of new evidence ........................................................................................................................ 11–012
Expert evidence ................................................................................................................................................. 11–014
Requirement to identify new evidence ........................................................................................................... 11–015
Decisions that are subject to review .................................................................................................................. 11–016
Procedural decisions ......................................................................................................................................... 11–017
Legal basis of judicial review
Forum of the case ............................................................................................................................................... 11–019
Standard and intensity of review ....................................................................................................................... 11–020
Grounds for review ............................................................................................................................................ 11–021
CONTENTS

Illegality ................................................................. 11–022
Procedural unfairness .................................................. 11–024
  Right to a fair hearing .............................................. 11–026
  The right for a party to know the case against it .......... 11–028
  The right to an opportunity to respond ..................... 11–033
Bias .............................................................................. 11–035
Legitimate Expectation ................................................. 11–037
Irrationality ................................................................. 11–038
Error of fact ................................................................. 11–043
Adequacy of reasons .................................................... 11–048
Proportionality ............................................................. 11–051
  Human Rights ............................................................ 11–052
  The right to peaceful enjoyment of possessions .......... 11–053
  The right to a fair trial ................................................. 11–055
General principles of EU law ........................................ 11–056
Available remedies ...................................................... 11–057
Further appeal ............................................................. 11–059
Costs ............................................................................ 11–060
Successful applications ............................................... 11–062
Unsuccessful applications ........................................... 11–063
Conclusion .................................................................... 11–064

12. Conclusions
Nigel Parr and Catherine Hammon
  Looking back—Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013 reforms ......................................................... 12–001
  Looking back—development of the role of the Competition Appeal Tribunal .................................................. 12–002
  Looking forward—changes to CMA decision-making processes .................................................................. 12–003
  Looking forward—Brexit ............................................... 12–004
  Looking forward—EEA/EU harmonisation ................................................. 12–005
  Looking forward—Development of foreign investment controls Conclusion ..................................................... 12–006

Appendix 1. Statistics for Merger Control Outcomes (1 April 2004–31 March 2016) ........................................ 835

Appendix 2. Overview of Phase 2 Merger Reference Investigations by the MMC, CC and CMA (1986–2015) ........ 843

Index ........................................................................... 1013