The International Seabed Authority and the Precautionary Principle

Balancing Deep Seabed Mineral Mining and Marine Environmental Protection

By

Aline L. Jaeckel
PART 1

Context—Deep Seabed Mining, the Marine Environment, and Precaution

1 Deep Seabed Mining and the Marine Environment
   1.1 Setting the Scene: The Onset of Deep Seabed Mining
   1.2 Exploring the Problem
      1.2.1 The Marine Environment of the Deep Seabed and its Mineral Resources
      1.2.2 The Environmental Risks and Uncertainties of Deep Seabed Mineral Mining
      1.2.3 The Need for a Precautionary Approach to Seabed Mining
   1.3 Objectives of the Study
   1.4 Terminology
   1.5 Methodology and Limits of the Study
   1.6 Structure of the Study

2 The Precautionary Principle in International Law
   2.1 Introduction
   2.2 The Precautionary Principle in International Law
      2.2.1 From Reactive to Proactive Thinking: The Rationale of Precaution
      2.2.2 History of the Precautionary Principle
      2.2.3 Status of the Precautionary Principle in International Law
      2.2.4 Overlapping Principles: Precaution and Prevention
   2.3 Defining the Precautionary Principle: Three Elements
      2.3.1 Threat of Environmental Harm
      2.3.2 Uncertainty
2.3.3 Remedial Action 39
2.3.3.1 Effectiveness 39
2.3.3.2 Proportionality 41
2.3.4 The Role of Thresholds 43

2.4 Implementing the Precautionary Principle 43
2.4.1 The Three Dimensions of Implementing Precaution 43
2.4.1.1 Institutional Dimension 44
2.4.1.2 Procedural Dimension 44
2.4.1.3 Protective Measures 47
2.4.1.4 A Three-dimensional Assessment of the Implementation of Precaution 48
2.4.2 The Role of Values 48
2.4.2.1 Making Uncertainties Explicit 49
2.4.2.2 Participation 50
2.4.2.3 Transparency 51
2.4.2.4 A Normative Framework 52
2.4.3 The Burden of Proof 54
2.4.3.1 Considerations for a General Allocation of the Burden of Proof 55
2.4.3.2 Reversing the Burden of Proof as an Implementation Measure 56
2.4.4 The Nature of Uncertainties 57
2.4.5 Dealing with Uncertainty in Complex Systems: Adaptive Management 58
2.4.6 Examining Counter-Effects: the Aim of Net Environmental Protection 61
2.4.7 Socio-Economic Considerations 63

2.5 Framework for Analysing the Implementation of Precaution: Assessment Criteria 66

PART 2
The International Seabed Authority

3 The International Seabed Authority and the Seabed Mining Regime 73
3.1 Introduction 73
3.2 Historical Development of the Deep Seabed Mining Regime 74
3.2.1 The Legal Status of the International Seabed and its Resources 74
3.2.2 The LOSC and Continuing Uncertainty as to the Legal Status of the Seabed and its Resources 81
CONTENTS

3.2.3  The 1994 Implementing Agreement and the Revision of the Common Heritage Concept 84

3.3 Mandate of the ISA 88

3.4 Institutional Organisation of the ISA 90
  3.4.1 The Assembly 92
  3.4.2 The Council 93
  3.4.3 The Secretariat 95
  3.4.4 The Legal and Technical Commission 96
  3.4.5 The Economic Planning Commission 98
  3.4.6 The Finance Committee 98
  3.4.7 The Enterprise 99

3.5 Decision-making Processes of the ISA 100
  3.5.1 Adopting Mining Regulations 101
  3.5.2 Assessing Applications for Plans of Work 103

3.6 Enforcement Powers 106
  3.6.1 Monitoring Compliance 106
  3.6.2 Responsibilities and Liability 108

3.7 Financing the ISA 110

3.8 Dispute Settlement in the ISA Regime: The Seabed Disputes Chamber 111

3.9 Conclusion 113

4 The Environmental Mandate of the ISA 116
  4.1 Introduction 116
  4.2 Environmental Considerations During the Negotiations of Part XI and the Implementing Agreement 117
  4.3 The General Obligation Under the Convention and the Implementing Agreement to Protect and Preserve the Marine Environment 121
    4.3.1 The Obligation to Protect and Preserve the Marine Environment 121
    4.3.2 The Environmental Mandate of the ISA 123
    4.3.3 General Environmental Obligations of States 127
  4.4 Gradual Integration of Precaution into the LOSC 131
  4.5 The Debate about Bioprospecting and Marine Scientific Research in the Context of the ISA's Mandate 136
  4.6 Conclusion 141

5 Developing the ISA's Environmental Mandate Through the Mining Code 142
  5.1 Introduction 142
  5.2 Law-making Powers of the ISA 143
5.3 The Mining Code 148
  5.3.1 *Exploration Regulations* 149
  5.3.2 *LTC Recommendations* 150
  5.3.3 *Future Exploitation Regulations* 152
5.4 The ISA's Environmental Obligations as Developed by the Mining Code 154
  5.4.1 *Assess and Monitor Environmental Impacts* 157
    5.4.1.1 Environmental Baselines 157
    5.4.1.2 Environmental Impact Assessments 159
    5.4.1.3 Monitoring Effects on the Marine Environment 164
  5.4.2 *Marine Protected Areas* 166
    5.4.2.1 Marine Protected Areas in Areas Beyond National Jurisdiction 167
    5.4.2.2 Mandate of the ISA to Declare Marine Protected Areas 169
  5.4.3 *Best Environmental Practices* 173
  5.4.4 *Emergency Orders* 174
  5.4.5 *Enforcement and Liability* 175
  5.4.6 *Applying a Precautionary Approach* 176
    5.4.6.1 Precautionary Thresholds in the ISA Context 179
5.5 Conclusion 187

PART 3
*Implementing Precaution by the International Seabed Authority*

6 Implementing the Precautionary Principle: Protective Measures 193
  6.1 Introduction 193
  6.2 Marine Scientific Research 195
    6.2.1 *Research Regarding Faunal Diversity Associated with Polymetallic Nodules* 195
    6.2.2 *Research Regarding Ecosystems Associated with Polymetallic Sulphides and Ferromanganese Crusts* 196
    6.2.3 *Discussion About the ISA's Engagement in Marine Scientific Research* 199
  6.3 Marine Protected Areas 201
    6.3.1 *The Environmental Management Plan for the Clarion-Clipperton Zone* 202
    6.3.2 *Environmental Management Plans for Other Areas?* 209
6.3.3 Multi-Purpose Marine Protected Areas 210
6.3.4 Preservation Reference Zones 211
6.3.5 Safety Margins 214
6.4 Measures Pertaining to Particularly Vulnerable Ecosystems 215
6.5 Listing of Particular Activities 219
6.6 Emergency Orders 220
6.7 Environmental Restoration 221
6.8 Conclusion 224

7 Implementing the Precautionary Principle: Procedural Elements 228
7.1 Introduction 228
7.2 Assessing Risks and Uncertainties ... 230
  7.2.1 ... through Strategic Environmental Assessment 231
  7.2.2 ... in the Context of Assessing New Applications for Exploration Contracts 236
  7.2.3 ... through Environmental Impact Assessments During Exploration Work 240
    7.2.3.1 The Lack of Environmental Baselines 243
    7.2.3.2 Procedural Consequences of Environmental Impact Assessments 247
  7.2.4 Bringing Environmental Impact Assessments in Line with the Precautionary Approach—Some Suggestions 249
7.3 Amending Environmental Standards 251
  7.3.1 Amending Regulations 253
  7.3.2 Amending Recommendations 254
  7.3.3 Reviewing a Programme of Activities 255
  7.3.4 Updating Regional Environmental Management Plans 256
  7.3.5 Some Suggestions for Changes to the Procedural Framework 257
7.4 Ensuring Transparency and Participation 260
  7.4.1 Transparency 260
  7.4.2 Public Participation 263
  7.4.3 Some Suggestions for Ensuring Transparency and Public Participation 266
7.5 The Burden of Proof 269
  7.5.1 The Status Quo in the ISA's Legal Framework 270
  7.5.2 The Reversal of the Burden of Proof in Specific Cases 272
7.6 Monitoring of Environmental Effects 272
  7.6.1 Monitoring Programme for Contractors 273
CONTENTS

7.6.2 Monitoring the Environmental Effects of Protective Measures 276
7.6.3 Monitoring Environmental Effects on a Regional Scale 277
7.7 Conclusion 277

8 Implementing the Precautionary Principle: Institutional Aspects 281
8.1 Introduction 281
8.2 Institutional Mechanisms for Implementing Precaution 283
  8.2.1 Mechanisms for the Assessment of Environmental Risks and Protective Measures 283
  8.2.2 Mechanisms for Ensuring Compliance 286
8.3 Current Institutional Limitations 289
  8.3.1 Capacity and Limitations of the Legal and Technical Commission 289
  8.3.2 Capacity and Limitations of the ISA Secretariat 292
8.4 Options for Institutional Innovation for the ISA 294
  8.4.1 An Environmental Commission 294
  8.4.2 A Mining Inspectorate 297
8.5 Conclusion 300

9 Conclusion 303
9.1 The Complexities of Implementing the Precautionary Principle 303
9.2 The Strengths and Weaknesses of the ISA's Current Approach to Precaution 305
  9.2.1 Absence of a Conservation Objective 305
  9.2.2 Lack of Obligation to Identify Uncertainties 305
  9.2.3 Strength Derived from Affording Scientific Information a Central Role 306
  9.2.4 Procedural Challenges Associated with Environmental Impact Assessments and Adaptive Management 307
  9.2.5 Lack of Strategic Vision 308
  9.2.6 Successes and Challenges with Respect to Timely Action 308
  9.2.7 Successes and Challenges with Respect to the Role of the ISA in Marine Scientific Research 309
  9.2.8 Conclusion 309
9.3 Strengthening the Implementation of the Precautionary Principle by the ISA: Suggestions for a Way Forward 310

Bibliography 315
Index 348