
The American Convention on Human Rights

ESSENTIAL RIGHTS

Thomas M. Antkowiak

Alejandra Gonza

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

The American Convention on Human Rights. Thomas M. Antkowiak and Alejandra Gonza.
© Oxford University Press 2017. Published 2017 by Oxford University Press.

Contents

<i>I. Introduction</i>	1
I. Overview of Book	1
II. The Inter-American Human Rights System's Impact, Major Institutions, and Legal Instruments	2
A. Impact and Importance of the Inter-American System	2
B. The Organization of American States, the American Convention, and Other Critical Human Rights Instruments	5
C. The Inter-American Commission on Human Rights	8
D. The Inter-American Court of Human Rights	11
1. Introduction	11
2. The Court in Relation to the Commission	13
3. The Court's <i>Ratione Materiae</i> , <i>Ratione Temporis</i> , <i>Ratione Personae</i> , and <i>Ratione Loci</i> Jurisdiction	14
4. Note on the Court's Assessment of Evidence and Burden of Proof	17
III. Key Developments and Critiques of the Inter-American Jurisprudence	18
A. Introduction	18
B. Extensive State Obligations to Respect and Ensure Rights	18
C. Article 63: Reparations	19
D. Article 24: Right to Equality	20
E. Article 4: Right to Life	21
F. Article 5: Right to Humane Treatment	22
G. Article 7: Right to Personal Liberty	23
H. Rights to Due Process and Judicial Protection	24
1. Article 8: Right to a Fair Trial	24
2. Article 25: Right to Judicial Protection	25

I. Article 13: Freedom of Expression	25
J. Article 21: Right to Property	26
IV. The Book's Structure and Methodology	27
2. <i>Equality</i>	31
<i>Article 24: Right to Equal Protection</i>	31
I. Introduction	32
II. Background	35
III. Scope of Protection	36
A. The Relationship of Article 24 and Article 1	36
B. The Assessment of Discrimination	40
1. Definitions and State Obligations	40
2. The Progression of the Court's Case Law: Discrimination in Law and in Fact	43
a. Introduction	43
b. Perceived Political Opponents	44
c. Disadvantaged Groups	45
d. Synthesis	48
3. <i>Atala Riffo</i> and the Court's Current Approach to Discrimination	49
3. <i>Life</i>	55
<i>Article 4: Right to Life</i>	55
I. Introduction	57
II. Background	59
III. Extensive State Obligations to Respect and Ensure the Right to Life	61
A. Introduction	61
B. Duty to Respect	62
C. Duty to Ensure (or "Protect")	65
1. Overview	65
2. Duty to Prevent through Legal Regulation	66
3. Duty to Adopt "Prevention and Protection Measures" in Threatening Circumstances	67
4. Duty to Investigate and Punish	68
IV. Scope of Protection	72
A. Meaning of "Every Person" and "In General, From the Moment of Conception"	72
B. Meaning of "No One Shall Be Arbitrarily Deprived" of Life	75
1. The Death Penalty	76
a. Introduction	76
b. "Only For The Most Serious Crimes"	77
c. The "Mandatory" Death Penalty	77

d. Due Process Requirements	78
e. Right to Apply for Pardon, Amnesty, or Commutation	81
2. Use of Lethal Force in Law Enforcement Scenarios	82
a. Introduction	82
b. The Principles of Legality, Necessity, and Proportionality	83
c. The Burden of Proof	85
d. State Duties after the Use of Force	85
3. Use of Lethal Force in Armed Conflicts	86
4. Arbitrary Deprivation of Life of Imprisoned Individuals	89
a. Introduction	89
b. Detention Conditions and Healthcare	90
c. Security Operations in Prisons	91
5. Forced Disappearances of Persons	92
a. Introduction and Definition	92
b. The Right to Life and <i>Ratione Temporis</i> Jurisdiction	94
C. The Concept of <i>Vida Digna</i>	97
4. <i>Humane Treatment</i>	101
<i>Article 5: Right to Humane Treatment</i>	101
I. Introduction	103
II. Background	105
III. Scope of Protection	106
A. A Broad Right with Uncertain Parameters	106
B. Definitions of Torture and the Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture	108
C. The Inter-American Court's Three-Part Test for Torture	110
D. Involvement of State Actors: A Fourth Requirement?	114
E. Considerations of Evidence and Proof	116
F. Cruel, Inhuman, or Degrading Punishment or Treatment	117
1. Introduction	117
2. Sexual Violence and Violence against Women	118
3. State-Sanctioned Punishment	120
a. Corporal Punishment	120
b. The Death Penalty	120
c. Life Imprisonment: Children	121
4. Detention Conditions and Practices	122
5. Forced Disappearance	125
6. Threats of "Severe Physical Injuries"	126
7. Treatment of Children	127
G. Violations to Personal Integrity below the Threshold of Article 5(2)	127

- H. Investigation and Prevention: State Obligations to Ensure the Rights of Article 5 130
- I. Article 5(3): No Extension of Punishment beyond the Convicted Individual 132
- J. Article 5(4): Separate Location and Treatment for Unconvicted Persons in Detention 132
- K. Article 5(5): Separate Proceedings and Facilities for Children in the Criminal Justice System 134
- L. Article 5(6): “Reform and Social Readaptation” of Prisoners 135

5. *Personal Liberty* 139

Article 7: Right to Personal Liberty 139

- I. Introduction 141
- II. Background 142
- III. Scope of Protection 143
 - A. Overview 143
 - 1. Right to Physical Liberty 143
 - 2. Right to Personal Security 146
 - B. General Requirements to Deprive Liberty: The Principles of Legality and Arbitrariness 148
 - 1. The Legality Principle 148
 - a. Restriction of Liberty Always the Exception 148
 - b. Ordered by a Competent Judicial Authority 150
 - i. Synthesis 150
 - ii. Detentions without Judicial Warrants: Exceptional Cases 151
 - c. State Obligation to Register Detentions 153
 - d. Detention Time Limits and Orders for Release 154
 - e. Pretrial Detention as Illegal Detention 154
 - f. Court’s Increasing Reluctance to Find Violations of Article 7(2) 154
 - 2. The Arbitrariness Principle 156
 - a. Synthesis 156
 - b. Forced Disappearances 156
 - c. Pretrial Detention as Arbitrary Detention 157
 - i. Sufficient Evidence of Criminal Responsibility 158
 - ii. Risks to the Criminal Proceeding 158
 - iii. Detention in Immigration Proceedings 159
 - iv. Pretrial Detention of Special Sectors of the Population 159
 - v. Time Limits for Pretrial Detention 160
 - 3. Methodological Problems: Legality and Arbitrariness 160
 - C. The Specific Requirements of Paragraphs 4, 5, and 6 of Article 7 162
 - 1. Article 7(4): Reasons for Detention and Notification of Charges 162
 - a. Reasons for Detention 162

- b. Notification of Charges 163
- 2. Article 7(5): Judicial Supervision 164
 - a. Brought “Before a Judge or Other Officer Authorized by Law” 164
 - b. Right to Trial “Within a Reasonable Time” 166
- 3. Article 7(6): The Right to Habeas Corpus 167
- 4. Article 7(7): “No One Shall Be Detained for Debt” 169

6. *Due Process and Judicial Protection* 171

Article 8: Right to a Fair Trial 171

- I. Introduction 174
 - A. Many Similarities among the Major Human Rights Treaties 174
 - B. Variances among the Human Rights Systems 176
 - C. Background 177
- II. Article 8(1) 178
 - A. Introduction and Meaning of “Right to a Hearing” 178
 - B. Meaning of “With Due Guarantees” 181
 - C. Meaning of “Within a Reasonable Time” 183
 - D. Meaning of “Competent, Independent, and Impartial Tribunal, Previously Established by Law” 188
 - 1. “Tribunal” 188
 - 2. “Competent” 188
 - 3. “Independent” 190
 - 4. “Impartial” 191
 - 5. “Previously Established by Law” 193
- III. Article 8(2) and the Right to Be Presumed Innocent 194
 - A. Article 8(2)(a): The Right to be Assisted by a Translator or Interpreter 196
 - B. Article 8(2)(b): Prior Notification in Detail of Charges 197
 - C. Article 8(2)(c): Adequate Time and Means for Preparation of Defense 199
 - D. Article 8(2)(d): The Right to Defend Oneself Personally or to Be Assisted by Legal Counsel, and to Communicate Freely and Privately with Counsel 200
 - E. Article 8(2)(e): The Right to be Assisted by Counsel Provided by the State 202
 - F. Article 8(2)(f): The Right of the Defense to Present and Examine Witnesses 204
 - G. Article 8(2)(g) and Article 8(3): The Right Not to Be Compelled to Be a Witness against Oneself; Coercion and Confessions 206
 - H. Article 8(2)(h): The Right to Appeal a Judgment to a Higher Court 208
 - I. The Right to Effective Access to Consular Assistance 210
- IV. Article 8(4): An Acquitted Person Shall Not Be Subjected to a New Trial for the Same Cause 211
- V. Article 8(5): Public Criminal Proceedings 213

Article 25: Right to Judicial Protection 215

- I. Introduction and Background 216
- II. Article 25(1): “Simple, Prompt and Effective” Remedies 218
 - A. “Simple” and “Prompt” Remedies 218
 - B. “Effective” Remedies 220
- III. Article 25(2): Enforcement of National Judgments 223
- IV. The Boundaries of “Judicial Protection” 224
 - A. The Right of Access to Justice 224
 - B. Combining Articles 8 and 25: A Critique 225
 - C. The Court’s Current, Broader View of Article 25 227

7. *Freedom of Expression* 229

Article 13: Freedom of Thought and Expression 229

- I. Introduction 231
- II. Background 234
- III. Scope of Protection 235
 - A. Meaning of “Everyone” 235
 - B. Protected Expression 237
 - C. Safeguards for Journalists 239
 - D. Right of Access to State-Held Information 241
- IV. Limitations to Article 13 243
 - A. Introduction 243
 - B. Prior Censorship 244
 - 1. Overview 244
 - 2. Prohibitions against Offensive Content 245
 - C. Subsequent Imposition of Liability 247
 - 1. Overview and General Requirements 247
 - 2. Subsequent Criminal Liability 249
 - a. Introduction 249
 - b. The Honor and Reputation of the Armed Forces 252
 - c. The Honor and Reputation of Public Officials 253
 - 3. Subsequent Civil Liability 256
 - D. “Indirect” Restrictions 257
 - E. Cases of Persecution Leading to Generic Violations of Article 13(1) 259
 - F. Incitements to Violence: Article 13(5) 260

8. *Property* 263

Article 21: Right to Property 263

- I. Introduction 265
- II. Background 267

III. Scope of Protection	268
A. Many Forms of Property Recognized	268
B. Rights to Communal Property	271
IV. Limitations to the Right to Property	273
A. Right to Property Not Absolute	273
B. Meaning of “Just Compensation”	275
C. Meaning of “Reasons of Public Utility or Social Interest”	276
D. Meaning of “In the Cases and According to the Forms Established by Law”	278
E. Specific Approaches to Limitations	278
1. Restrictions during Criminal Investigations and Police Action	278
2. Protective Framework for Traditional Territories	279
<i>g. Reparations</i>	285
<i>Article 63</i>	285
I. Introduction	287
II. Background	289
III. The “Injured Party” of Article 63(1) and Related Topics	290
IV. Monetary Remedies	292
A. Pecuniary Damages	292
B. Moral Damages	296
1. In General	296
2. Community Development Programs	299
V. Non-Monetary Remedies	300
A. Background	300
B. Restitution	301
C. Rehabilitation	303
D. Recognition of Responsibility and Apologies	304
E. Memorials and Commemorations	304
F. Reform of Legislation and Policy, Training Programs	305
VI. Legal Fees and Expenses	307
VII. Supervision and Compliance with the Court’s Judgments	308
A. Binding and Final Nature of Judgments	308
B. Introduction to Supervision	310
C. Cases of Noncompliance	311
D. Compliance Rates	313
VIII. Provisional Measures of Article 63(2)	314

APPENDIX: LIST OF INTER-AMERICAN COURT JUDGMENTS BY AMERICAN CONVENTION ARTICLE: ARTICLES 2–26	317
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

INDEX	405
-------	-----