Rights-Based Constitutional Review
Constitutional Courts in a Changing Landscape

Edited by
John Bell
Professor of Law, University of Cambridge, UK

Marie-Luce Paris
Lecturer in Law, University College Dublin, Ireland

STUDIES IN COMPARATIVE LAW AND LEGAL CULTURE

Edward Elgar
Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA
Contents

List of contributors vii
Preface and acknowledgements xiii
List of journal abbreviations xvi

Setting the scene: elements of constitutional theory and methodology of the research 1
Marie-Luce Paris

PART I  BILL OF RIGHTS AND ACTS OF INCORPORATION: US EXCEPTIONALISM AND ADAPTATION OF THE PARLIAMENTARY MODEL

1. The United States of America
   A comparativist critique of US judicial review of fundamental rights cases: exceptionalisms, paradoxes and contradictions 29
   Michel Rosenfeld

2. The United Kingdom
   Rights-based constitutional review in the UK: from form to function 63
   Chintan Chandrachud and Aileen Kavanagh

3. Ireland
   3.1 Leaving behind the Commonwealth model of rights review: Ireland as an example of collaborative constitutionalism 94
       Eoin Carolan
   3.2 A tale of two rights-based reviews or how the European Convention on Human Rights Act 2003 has impacted on the Irish model of review 120
       Cliona Kelly

4. Australia
   4.1 Australian constitutionalism and the UK-style dialogue model of human rights protection 148
       James Stellios
4.2 Adventures in the grey zone: constitutionalism, rights and the review of executive power in the migration context  
Matthew Zagor  

5. Finland  
Intermediate constitutional review in Finland: promising in theory, problematic in practice  
Juha Lavapuro, Tuomas Ojanen and Martin Scheinin  

PART II CONSTITUTIONAL COURTS AND CONSTITUTIONAL REFORMS: SPECIFIC EUROPEAN EXPERIENCES TOWARDS AN EVOLUTION OF THE KELSENIAN MODEL  

6. Italy  
The Italian system of constitutional review: a Kelsenian model moving towards a decentralized model?  
Paolo Passaglia  

7. Spain  
The Spanish experience of rights-based review or how constitutional case law has been more principled than legislation in defence of fundamental rights  
Agustín Ruiz Robledo  

8. France  
The French system of rights-based review: from exceptionalism to parochial constitutionalism  
Marie-Luce Paris  

9. Belgium  
The Belgian experience of rights-based review: has the Constitutional Court become a body subordinated to the European Court of Human Rights?  
Marc Verdussen  

10. Hungary  
The illusion of a constitution in Europe: the Hungarian Constitutional Court after the Fifth Amendment of the Fundamental Law  
Renáta Uitz  

PART III CONCLUSION  

11. Comparative law and fundamental rights  
John Bell  

Index