Non-State Actors in International Law

Edited by
Math Noortmann
August Reinisch
and
Cedric Ryngaert

HART-PUBLISHING
OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2015
Contents

List of Contributors ........................................................................................................... xiii

1. Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1
   Math Noortmann, Cedric Ryngaert, August Reinisch

Part I

2. Non-State Actors and the Social Practice of International Law .................................. 11
   Jean d’Aspremont
   2.1 Epistemological Considerations: Non-State Actors and the Argumentative Practice of International Law ........ 12
   2.2 Two Types of Social Practice and Two Types of Engagement by Non-State Actors ............................................ 14
   2.3 Social Practice of Non-State Actors for the Sake of Law-Ascertainment ............................................................... 16
   2.4 The Social Practice by Non-State Actors in General Legal Theory ................................................................. 18
   2.5 Which Non-State Actors for which Social Practice in International Law? ............................................................. 20
   2.6 Concluding Remarks: the Politics of Definition and the Definition of Politics ..................................................... 30

3. Non-State Actors in International Law in Policy Perspective ...................................... 33
   Eisuke Suzuki
   3.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 33
   3.2 Non-State Actors in Context: Multiple Affiliations and Complex Layers of Decision Processes ................. 35
   3.3 Non-State Actors and Specialised Agencies of the United Nations ................................................................. 37
   3.4 Non-State Actors and Civil Society ........................................................................ 39
   3.5 Non-State Actors’ Activities in the Major Value Processes................................................. 40
      Power .................................................................................................................. 40
      Wealth .............................................................................................................. 42
      Enlightenment ................................................................................................. 42
      Skills ............................................................................................................... 43
vi Contents

Affection ............................................................................43
Rectitude ...........................................................................43
Wellbeing .........................................................................44
Respect .............................................................................44

3.6 Policy for Non-State Actors’ Participation in
Decision-Making ..................................................................44

3.7 Recent Trends of Non-State Actors as Authoritative
Decision-Makers ................................................................46

3.7.1 General Framework for Participation .....................46
3.7.2 The Need for Functional Analysis .........................47
The Intelligence Function .............................................48
The Promotion Function ..............................................49
The Prescribing Function ..............................................50
The Invoking Function ..................................................51
The Application Function .............................................52
The Terminating Function .............................................53
The Appraising Function ..............................................53

3.8 For the Future ................................................................53
3.8.1 Bridging the Gap Between Vertical Internal
Processes of Decision with the Horizontal
International Process of Decision ....................................54
3.8.2 Civil Society’s Access to Official International
Decision-making Processes ...........................................55

4. Transnational Law: Philip Jessup’s Legacy and Beyond ......57
Math Noortmann

4.1 Introduction ..................................................................57
4.2 Jessup’s Understanding of Transnational Law
and the Non-State Actor in It ...........................................60
4.2.1 Jessup’s Conception of ‘International Law’ ...............60
4.2.2 Jessup and Non-State Actors ...................................63
4.3 ‘Transnationalized Legal Traditionalism’ .................64
4.4 The Transnational Legal Process Approach ................66
4.5 Transnational Law: What it is and How it Works .........68
4.5.1 Transnational Agreements ....................................70
4.5.2 Transnational Custom ..........................................71
4.5.3 Transnational Jurisprudence ...............................72
4.6 Concluding Reflections ..............................................73

Part II

5. Non-State Actors and the Use of Force ............................77
Christian Henderson

5.1 Introduction ..................................................................77
5.2 Non-State Actors and the Regulation of the Internal
Use of Force .................................................................78
5.3 The Regulation of the International Use of Force Against Non-State Actors
5.3.1 Action Taken or Authorised by the UN Security Council
5.3.2 Unilateral Action by States and Regional Organisations

Overcoming the Sovereignty Barrier: Attribution to the Host State
The Sovereignty Barrier and Self-defence Restricted to the Targeting of Non-State Actors Located Upon a Host State’s Territory

5.4 Conclusion

6. Non-State Actors Under International Humanitarian Law

Hans-Joachim Heintze and Charlotte Lülf

6.1 Introduction
6.2 The Red Cross and Red Crescent Movement
6.2.1 The International Committee of the Red Cross
   Status of the International Committee of the Red Cross
   General Role of the ICRC During Armed Conflicts
   Special Focus of the ICRC
6.2.2 The International Federation of the Red Cross
6.2.3 National Societies of the Red Cross and Red Crescent

6.3 Aid Outside of the Movement—Other Non-Governmental Organisations and their Status Under International Humanitarian Law
6.3.1 Humanitarian Aid Organisations
   Humanitarian Aid Organisations and Armed Conflicts
   Humanitarian Aid Organisations Under International Humanitarian Law
6.3.2 Human Rights Organisations

6.4 Conclusion

7. Non-State Actors and Human Rights

Manfred Nowak and Karolina Miriam Januszewski

7.1 Reassessing Some Myths about International Law and Human Rights
7.1.1 Dismantling Obstacle No 1—International Law is All About States—The Subject of International Law as a Haunting Phantom
7.1.2 Dismantling Obstacle No 2—The Axiomatic State-Centrisim in Human Rights Law
7.2 The Significance of Human Rights as a Reaction to Real Life Challenges .................................................. 125
  7.2.1 The Meaning of Human Rights—A Quest for Human Dignity, Equality and Justice .................. 125
  7.2.2 Human Rights as ‘All-round’ Protection .................... 129
7.3 The Public/Private Divide as a Bête Noire ...................... 132
7.4 David vs Goliath—The Issue of Power Imbalance and Human Rights .................................................. 135
7.5 The Reluctance to Enforce Human Rights Against Non-State Actors ................................................. 137
  7.5.1 International Law Addressing Threats to Human Rights from Non-State Actors .................. 137
  7.5.2 The State as the Primary Guardian of Human Rights; or How Locke’s Wish Came True .................. 140
  7.5.3 Enforcing Human Rights Against Non-State Actors on the National Level .............................. 147
7.6 The Rarity of Direct Horizontal Human Rights Obligations Under International Law ......................... 151
7.7 Human Rights in the Corporate World ......................... 154
7.8 Holding International Organisations Accountable for Human Rights Violations .................................. 156
7.9 Conclusion: How can Non-State Actors be Held Accountable for their Violation of International Human Rights? .................................................. 159

8. State Responsibility and Non-State Actors ............................................. 163
  Cedric Ryngaert

8.1 Introduction .................................................................................... 163
8.2 Attribution of Conduct on the Basis of the Exercise of Elements of Governmental Authority by Non-State Actors .................................................................................................................. 165
8.3 Attribution of Conduct on the Basis of Instructions or Control .................................................................. 168
8.4 Attribution of Conduct of an Insurrectional or Other Movement to the State ............................................. 174
8.5 Due Diligence/Failure to Prevent .................................................................................................................. 177
8.6 Concluding Observations ............................................................................................................................. 181

Part III

9. International Governmental Organisations as Non-State Actors ................................................................. 185
  Ramses A Wessel

9.1 Introduction .................................................................................... 185
9.3 International Decisions and Law-Making ........................................ 191
9.4 Autonomy of International Organisations:
   The Role of ‘Independent’ Organs .................................................... 195
9.5 Conclusion: From ‘State Actors’ to
   Non-State Actors? ............................................................................. 201

10. Non-Governmental Organisations: Recognition, Roles,
   Rights and Responsibilities............................................................... 205
    Math Noortmann
   10.1 Introduction .............................................................................. 205
   10.2 NGOs’ International Legal Personality:
       the Politics of Recognition .......................................................... 207
   10.3 NGO Roles: A Socio-Political-Legal Approach ...................... 212
   10.4 Institutional, Conventional and Human Rights .................... 216
   10.5 NGO Responsibility and Accountability ............................ 219
   10.6 Conclusion .............................................................................. 223

11. Multinational Corporations in International Law ............................. 225
    Jan Wouters and Anna-Luise Chané
   11.1 Introduction .............................................................................. 225
   11.2 Definition ................................................................................ 226
   11.3 International Legal Personality ............................................... 228
   11.4 Rights Under International Law ............................................. 230
      11.4.1 International Human Rights Law .................................... 230
      11.4.2 International Investment Law ........................................ 234
   11.5 Obligations Under International Law .................................... 236
      11.5.1 International Human Rights Law .................................... 236
          UN Draft Norms on the Responsibilities
          of Transnational Corporations and Other
          Business Enterprises With Regard to
          Human Rights ......................................................................... 239
          Guiding Principles on Business
          and Human Rights .................................................................. 240
          Human Rights Council Resolution 26/9 ................................ 242
          OECD Guidelines for Multinational
          Enterprises ............................................................................. 243
          ILO Tripartite Declaration of Principles
          Concerning Multinational Enterprises
          and Social Policy ..................................................................... 244
          Global Compact ...................................................................... 245
          Self-regulation ......................................................................... 245
          Enforcement ............................................................................ 246
      11.5.2 International Environmental Law ...................................... 248
      11.5.3 International Criminal Law ............................................. 249
   11.6 Conclusion .............................................................................. 250
12. Investors .......................................................... 253

August Reinisch

12.1 Introduction ........................................... 253
12.2 The Specific Nature of Investment Arbitration .......... 253
  12.2.1 Diplomatic Protection ..................... 254
  12.2.2 Investment Disputes Espoused by Home States .... 255
  12.2.3 The Evolution of Modern ISDS—From Contract to Treaty Arbitration .... 256
  12.2.4 Modern ISDS .................................. 258
12.3 The Impact of ISDS on the Position of the Investor in International Law ...... 259
12.4 The Contribution of Investors to the Development of General International Law and of International Investment Law in Particular ........ 262
  12.4.1 Investors as Driving Forces of the Shaping of Investment Law .... 264
  12.4.2 States Reshaping Investment Law ........ 268
12.5 Conclusion ............................................. 271

13. Armed Opposition Groups .................................. 273

Jordan J Paust

13.1 Introduction ........................................... 273
13.2 Non-State Armed Opposition Groups with Formal Status ........ 274
  13.2.1 Types of Status ..... 274
     Nation ............................................. 274
     Peoples ........................................ 275
     Tribe ........................................... 278
     Belligerent ................................. 279
     Insurgent .................................. 280
13.3 Types of Armed Conflict in which they Participate ........ 283
  13.3.1 Armed Conflicts of an International Character ........ 283
  13.3.2 Armed Conflicts not of an International Character ........ 284
     The Nature of Such an Armed Conflict .... 284
     War Against al Qaeda as Such is not Legally Possible .... 285
13.4 Non-State Armed Opposition Groups Lacking Formal Acceptable Status ........ 286
  13.4.1 Terrorist Groups ............................. 286
  13.4.2 Mercenaries ................................. 287
13.4.3 Pirates ................................................................. 288
13.4.4 Brigands and Banditti .............................................. 288
13.4.5 Organised Criminal Groups ................................. 289
13.4.6 Self-Defence and Organised Armed Groups ... 291
Defense Against Non-State Actor Armed Attacks .......... 291
Defense Against State Complicitors in Non-State Actor Armed Attacks ................................. 292
13.5 Conclusion ............................................................... 292

Part IV

14. Non-State Actors in International Relations: Actors, Processes, and an Agenda for Multifaceted Dialogue .................................................. 295
Markus Kornprobst
14.1 Introduction ........................................................... 295
14.2 Intra-State War ......................................................... 297
14.3 International Terrorism ............................................. 301
14.4 Arms Control ........................................................... 303
14.5 Global Economy ....................................................... 306
14.6 Human Rights .......................................................... 311
14.7 Global Environment ................................................ 314
14.8 Global Polity .............................................................. 317
14.9 Conclusion ............................................................... 320

15. Non-State Actors and Soft Power .......................................................... 323
Alan Chong
15.1 Introduction ........................................................... 323
15.2 Non-State Actors Vis-à-Vis the Nation-State ............... 324
15.3 Non-State Actors Lean Towards Soft Power ............... 327
15.4 Non-State Actors Operate within Global Information Space .................................................. 330
15.5 The Soft Power of Publicising Unethical Practices ....... 331
15.6 The Soft Power of Legal Manoeuvres ......................... 336
15.7 The Soft Power of Developmental and Grassroots Disaster Relief .................................................. 339
15.8 Conclusion: Non-State Actor Soft Power, Its Foibles, and Acting in Spite of the Nation-State ....... 342

Barrie Axford
16.1 Introduction ........................................................... 345
16.2 Exemplifying 'New' Geographies of Governance ........ 346
16.3 Globalisation as a Transformative Motif .................... 350
Contents

16.4 NSAs in the Vertebrate Global System .............................................. 354
16.5 NSAs in the Mixed Global System:
   A Pause for Breath ......................................................................... 361
16.6 NSAs in the Cellular Global System .............................................. 363
16.7 Conclusion .................................................................................. 366

17. Concluding Observations ................................................................. 369

Cedric Ryngaert, Math Noortmann and August Reinisch

Select Bibliography ............................................................................. 377
Index .................................................................................................. 399