EU Citizenship & the Constitutionalisation of the European Union

Hanneke van Eijken
## CONTENTS

**Abbreviations**

### CHAPTER 1
Introduction: The role of European citizenship in the constitutionalisation of the European Union

1.1 Context of the research

1.2 Research question

### CHAPTER 2
Analytical framework and structure

2.1 Introduction to the analytical framework

2.1.1 Context of research and main research question

2.1.2 Structure of the present chapter

2.1.3 Historical background and development of European citizenship in the Union

2.1.4 European citizenship: a constitutional concept or market citizenship?

2.1.5 Constitutionalisation and constitutionalism: What's in a name?

2.1.6 Constitutions

2.1.7 The rule of law in relation to constitutionalism

2.2 The constitutionalisation of the Treaties of the European Union

2.2.1 Constitutional developments in Community and Union law

2.2.2 Arguments against the constitutional nature of the European Union

2.2.2.1 The no-demos thesis

2.2.2.2 Citizenship, identity and alliance

2.2.2.3 Just an international organisation?

2.3 Constitutionalisation of the European Union in this thesis

2.3.1 Multi-level and composite constitutionalism in the European context

2.4 Structure, analytical framework and methodology of the thesis

2.4.1 Constitutionalisation in four constitutional elements

2.4.1.1 The division of powers

2.4.1.2 Common ideology

2.4.1.2.1 Fundamental rights

2.4.1.2.2 Democracy

2.4.1.3 Justiciability and hierarchy of norms

2.4.1.3.1 Judicial review in connection with European constitutionalisation

2.4.1.3.2 Constitutional primacy of Union law as constitutional element

2.4.2 Methodology and structure of the thesis
CHAPTER 3
The effect of European citizenship on the vertical division of powers

3.1 Introduction: The division of powers and European citizenship

3.1.1 The vertical division of powers as constitutional feature

3.1.2 Aim and structure of the present chapter

3.2 The competences of the European Union and the scope of Union law

3.2.1 The principles of conferral, subsidiarity, proportionality and pre-emption

3.2.2 Complementary and negative competences

3.2.3 Beyond legislative competences of the Union

3.3 The scope of application of EU law in relation to the vertical division of competences

3.3.1 The relation between the competences and the scope of Union law

3.3.2 The scope of application of Union law

3.3.3 The scope of application of Union law in the case law of the Court on general principles of Union law

3.3.4 The scope of Union law with regard to the Charter of Fundamental Rights

3.3.5 Different legal consequences of ‘the scope’ and the ‘competences’ of the Union

3.3.6 The scope and nature of Article 18 TFEU

3.3.7 Early case law on Article 18 TFEU

3.3.8 A citizenship interpretation of Article 18 TFEU

3.3.9 Personal scope of Article 18 TFEU

3.3.10 Migration as a precondition for the ratione personae?

3.3.11 ‘Lawful’ residence and the scope of Union law

3.3.12 The trigger of the material scope of Union law by European citizenship

3.3.13 Towards a restriction approach in citizenship cases

3.3.14 Indirect substantive rights for third-country nationals

3.3.15 Article 20 TFEU as a new route into the ‘Promised Land’

3.3.16 The influence of Union citizenship on the application of economic freedoms

3.5 A spill-over effect: From negative to positive integration

3.6 Conclusion: How does Union citizenship affect the vertical division of powers in the European Union?
### Chapter 4: The effect of European citizenship on common ideology: the protection of fundamental rights linked to European citizenship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.1</strong> Introduction: fundamental rights and European citizenship</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.1.1</strong> Constitutionalisation and fundamental rights</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.1.2</strong> Universality of fundamental rights and European citizenship</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.1.3</strong> Aim and structure of the present chapter</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.2</strong> Equality linked to European citizenship</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.2.1</strong> Equal treatment as a key element of citizenship</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.2.2</strong> Equality in different sources of law</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.2.3</strong> Equal treatment and European citizenship</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.2.3.1</strong> Court-driven equality</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.2.3.2</strong> Equal treatment and reverse discrimination</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3</strong> Linking European citizenship and fundamental civil rights</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.1</strong> What are civil rights?</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.2</strong> Civil rights and Union citizenship</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.2.1</strong> The right to move within the European Union</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.2.2</strong> The right to reside in the European Union</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.2.3</strong> The right to family life and family reunification and</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European citizenship</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.2.4</strong> European citizenship and the application of the Charter</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.2.5</strong> Protective civil rights</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.2.5.1</strong> Security and safety as rights for Union citizens in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.2.5.2</strong> An Area of Freedom, Security and Justice ‘offered’ to Union citizens: concrete rights?</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.2.5.3</strong> Where European citizenship and the AFSJ come together: tensions and challenges</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.3.3</strong> Safety and security in third countries: Diplomatic protection of Union citizens</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.4</strong> Social rights linked to European citizenship</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.4.1</strong> European citizenship and social rights</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.4.1.1</strong> The broader European socio-economic context</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.4.2</strong> Social rights for Union citizens based on free movement and equal treatment</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.4.2.1</strong> Solidarity and reasonable burden</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.4.2.2</strong> ‘Real link’ as a tool to balance solidarity between migrants and nationals</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.4.3</strong> Social rights for non-migrants: services of general economic interest</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.5</strong> Conclusion: European citizenship linked to fundamental rights protection in the European Union</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 5

The effect of European citizenship on the common ideology in the European Union: democracy and political rights

5.1 Introduction: citizenship, political rights and democracy in the European Union

5.1.1 Aim and structure of the present chapter

5.2 Political rights and democracy as part of the common constitutional ideology

5.2.1 Political participation as part of citizens' rights

5.2.2 Democracy as part of the constitutional common ideology of the European Union

5.2.3 Connection between political rights and democracy

5.3 Democracy in the European Union

5.3.1 Criticism of democracy in the European Union

5.3.1.1 The relationship between democracy, legitimacy and accountability

5.3.1.2 The democratic deficit: criticism of the Union's model of democracy

5.3.1.3 Views on European democracy from a national constitutional perspective

5.3.1.4 No demos, no democracy?

5.3.2 Specific political rights for European citizens

5.4 The connection between European citizenship, democracy and political rights

5.4.1 Electoral rights regarding the European Parliament

5.4.1.1 On the personal scope of electoral rights regarding the European Parliament

5.4.2 Electoral rights regarding the national elections of Member States

5.4.3 Electoral rights regarding municipal elections

5.4.4 The right to submit complaints to the European Ombudsman

5.4.5 The right to petition to the European Parliament

5.4.6 The citizens' initiative

5.4.7 Good governance and the role of civil society

5.5 Conclusion: the connection of European citizenship with democracy and political rights

CHAPTER 6

The effect of European citizenship on the justiciability and constitutional primacy of Union law

6.1 European citizenship in the European judicial context

6.1.1 Constitutionalisation of the Union: primacy and justiciability of Union law

6.1.2 Aim and structure of the present chapter
## CONTENTS

6.2 Judicial review in the European landscape  
6.2.1 Cooperation between courts: the Court of Justice and national courts in a multilevel context  
6.2.2 Direct effect and primacy of Union law: obligations for national courts  
6.2.3 The preliminary reference procedure as a cornerstone of judicial cooperation  
6.2.4 Dialogues between the Court of Justice and national constitutional courts  
6.3 European citizenship and justiciability in the European Union  
6.3.1 Direct effect of Union citizenship provisions  
6.3.2 Effects of direct effect of Articles 20 and 21(1) TFEU on justiciability  
6.3.2.1 Illustration from national court practice: the effect of *Ruiz Zambrano* in Dutch case law  
6.3.3 Shift in judicial review due to 'personal circumstances test' of citizens of the European Union  
6.3.4 Constitutional impact of the 'personalised' proportionality test  
6.4 The effect of European citizenship on the 'constitutional primacy' of Union law  
6.4.1 Hierarchy and constitutional primacy within the European Union  
6.4.2 The impact of European citizenship on the constitutional hierarchy of norms in the European Union  
6.4.2.1 Tensions between primary Union law and secondary Union law  
6.5 Conclusion: the impact of European citizenship on justiciability and constitutional primacy

### CHAPTER 7

**Conclusions: the effect of European citizenship on the constitutionalisation of the European Union**

7.1 The concept of European citizenship in the constitutional context of the European Union  
7.1.1 An open field...  
7.1.2 European citizenship and constitutionalisation  
7.1.3 Citizenship in a multi-layered European legal order  
7.1.4 European citizenship: constitutional concept or market-based concept?  
7.2 The contribution of European citizenship to the constitutionalisation of the European Union  
7.2.1 Vertical division of powers  
7.2.2 Fundamental rights protection