Interpretation in International Law

Edited by
ANDREA BIANCHI
DANIEL PEAT
MATTHEW WINDSOR

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

Table of Cases xvii
List of Abbreviations xxiii
List of Contributors xxix

I. INTRODUCTION

1. Playing the Game of Interpretation: On Meaning and Metaphor in International Law 3
   Daniel Peat and Matthew Windsor
   Introduction 3
   I. Interpretation in International Law—The State of Play 4
   II. In Search of Meaning 9
   III. What’s in a Game? 16
   IV. The Game Plan 28
   Conclusion 33

2. The Game of Interpretation in International Law: The Players, the Cards, and Why the Game is Worth the Candle 34
   Andrea Bianchi
   I. The Game 34
   II. The Object 36
   III. The Players 39
   IV. The Cards 43
   V. Strategies 49
   VI. Playing the Game of Game Playing 52
   VII. Why is the Game Worth the Candle? 54
   VIII. Conclusion 57

II. THE OBJECT

3. Rhetoric, Persuasion, and Interpretation in International Law 61
   Iain Scobbie
   I. The Art of Rhetoric 61
   II. Rhetoric—Legal Argumentation as an Interpretative Mechanism 62
   III. Blame it all on the Ancient Greeks 65
Contents

IV. Rediscovering the Past—The Resurgence of Rhetoric in the Twentieth Century 66
V. The Elements of Effective Rhetoric—Audience, Topics, Choice 68
VI. Rhetoric, Interpretation, and Law 73
VII. The Value of Rhetoric 77

4. The Existential Function of Interpretation in International Law 78
Duncan B Hollis

Introduction 78
I. The Expository Function of (Treaty) Interpretation in International Law 80
II. The Existential Function of Interpretation in International Law 84
III. The Consequences of Interpretation's Existential Function 101
Conclusion 108

5. The Multidimensional Process of Interpretation: Content-Determination and Law-Ascertainment Distinguished 111
Jean d'Aspremont

Introduction 111
I. Committed Interpretation and the Necessary Feeling of 'Out-There-Ness' 113
II. A Dichotomic View on the Game of Interpretation 116
III. Conclusion: Salvaging the Game of Interpretation? 128

III. THE PLAYERS

6. Interpretation and the International Legal Profession: Between Duty and Aspiration 133
Andraz Zidar

Introduction 133
I. Interpretation of International Law as a Complex Process 134
II. International Legal Professions and the Interpretive Process 135
Conclusion: The Duty and Aspiration of Interpretation 144

7. Interpretive Communities in International Law 147
Michael Waibel

Introduction 147
I. The Role of Interpretive Communities in Interpretation 148
II. Diverse Interpretive Communities and Fragmentation 154
III. Interpretive Communities as Advocates of Distinct Normative Visions of International Law 160
Conclusion 164
# Contents

8. Interpretative Authority and the International Judiciary  
*Gleider Hernández*  
Introduction  
I. Interpretative Theory  
II. The Fallacy in the Interpretation and Application Distinction  
Conclusion: Judicial Interpretation and the Claim to Normative Authority

## IV. THE RULES

9. The Vienna Rules, Evolutionary Interpretation and the Intentions of the Parties  
*Eirik Bjørge*  
Introduction  
I. Vienna Rules and the Search for Intention  
II. A Re-reading of the Vienna Rules  
Conclusion

10. Accounting for Difference in Treaty Interpretation Over Time  
*Julian Arato*  
Introduction  
I. Old and New Explanations of Difference  
II. The Nature of the Obligation  
Conclusion

11. Interpreting Transplanted Treaty Rules  
*Anne-Marie Carstens*  
Introduction  
I. An Overview of Transplanted Treaty Rules  
II. The Framework for Interpreting Transplanted Treaty Rules  
Conclusion

## V. THE STRATEGIES

12. A Genealogy of Textualism in Treaty Interpretation  
*Fuad Zarbiyev*  
Introduction: Taking Historicity Seriously  
I. Textualism: The Dominant Interpretive Paradigm in Modern International Law  
II. The Official Victory of Textualism: Situating a Success Story  
Conclusion
Contents

13. Theorizing Precedent in International Law 268
   *Harlan Grant Cohen*
   Introduction 268
   I. Precedent's Purpose 271
   II. Precedent as Practice 275
   III. Telling Precedent's Story 281
   Conclusion 288

14. Interpretation in International Law as a Transcultural Project 290
   *René Provost*
   Introduction 290
   I. Interpretation in International Law 292
   II. The Transcultural Nature of Interpretation in International Law 303
   Conclusion 308

VI. PLAYING THE GAME OF GAME-PLAYING

15. Towards a Politics of Hermeneutics 311
    *Jens Olesen*
    Introduction 311
    I. Against a Politics of Interpretation 313
    II. Nietzsche and the Interpretive 'Will to Power' 315
    III. Enter Language Conventions 322
    Conclusion: On Decoding Ideology 327

16. Cognitive Frames of Interpretation in International Law 331
    *Martin Wahlisch*
    Introduction 331
    I. Cognitive Frame Theory and the Sociology of Law 332
    II. Case Studies and Examples 339
    Conclusion 347

17. Is Interpretation in International Law a Game? 352
    *Ingo Venzke*
    Introduction 352
    I. Like a Game of Chess 354
    II. The Grammar of the Game 356
    III. The Nature of the Game Reconsidered 359
    IV. International Law as a Practice 365
    V. And if There Was No Language to Play With? 367
18. Interpretation—An Exact Art

Philip Allott

Introduction 373
I. What is Interpretation? 373
II. The Illusion of Meaning 375
III. Legal Interpretation 376
IV. The Moments of Interpretation 380
V. Deontology of Interpretation 382
Summary 392