Public Purpose in International Law

RETHINKING REGULATORY SOVEREIGNTY IN THE GLOBAL ERA

PEDRO J. MARTINEZ-FRAGA
C. RYAN REETZ

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
## Contents

**Foreword by David D. Caron**  
*page xiii*

**Acknowledgments**  
*xv*

**Introduction and Sketch of Historical Origins**  
*1*

### Public Purpose in NAFTA

- **A. Public Purpose in the Context of Reservations**  
  *24*

- **B. Chapter Eleven of the NAFTA Does Not Develop an Objective Test**  
  *32*

- **C. Public Purpose in the NAFTA Lacks Hierarchical Structure**  
  *34*

- **D. The Chapter Eleven Framework Indiscriminately Incorporates and Commingles Terms of Art from the GATT: An Unwanted Cross-Pollenization**  
  *34*

- **E. The NAFTA Standard Public Purpose Exceptions and the Treaty Reservation Public Purpose Category: Harmonizing a Dichotomy**  
  *39*

- **F. Beyond the NAFTA Chapter Eleven Framework: The NAFTA's Anatomy Provides for an Expansive Construction of the Public Purpose Doctrine and the "Legitimate Objective" Standard**  
  *44*

- **G. Conclusions and Observations**  
  *53*

### The Jurisprudence of Public Purpose in the NAFTA

1. **The Metalclad Legacy: One Extreme**  
   *59*

2. **An "Effects Test" Beyond the Purview of Public Purpose**  
   *65*

3. **Revisiting Methanex through the Prism of the Public Purpose Doctrine**  
   *70*
I. The Methanex Approach and a Swing of the Pendulum

J. Beyond Metalclad and Methanex: The NAFTA Jurisprudence
   1. The Public Purpose Legacy of Metalclad and Methanex
   2. A Broader Examination of the NAFTA’s Jurisprudence and Other Investor-State Decisional Law: In Search of a Viable Public Purpose Framework
   3. The Temed Contribution
   4. The Police Power Dichotomy and Feldman v. Mexico
   5. Reflections on Conventional International Law’s Use of Public Purpose

2. Identifying Public Purpose in Customary International Law: Select International Instruments
   A. The Place of the Public Purpose Doctrine in Customary International Law
      1. Revisiting Fundamentals of Customary International Law
   B. Foundational Concerns Endemic to Customary International Law Challenging the Development of a Public Purpose Doctrine
   C. Discovering and Reviving the Public Purpose Doctrine in International Instruments
   D. The Many Names of the Public Purpose Doctrine: Exploring Uniformity and Multifarious Nomenclature
   E. Evidence of Scope and Substance of the Public Purpose Doctrine in Select International Instruments
      1. Identification, Scope, and Content of the Public Purpose Doctrine within International Instruments Concerning Transnational Trade and Investment: A Doctrine That Expands Sovereignty within Instruments That Limit State Authority
      2. Public Purpose in UN Conference on Trade and Development and World Trade Organization Instruments
3. Public Purpose and the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development 131
4. UNCTAD World Investment Report 2012 139
5. The Public Purpose Doctrine and Sustainable Development 145
6. The Public Purpose Doctrine and Lessons from UNCTAD 158

F. What Does It All Mean? 160

1. The South African Development Community Model Bilateral Treaty Template 161
2. The Sustainable Development Expression of the Public Purpose Doctrine in BITs 177
   a. The Canada-China BIT 178
   b. The Colombia-Japan BIT 185
   c. The Croatia-Azerbaijan BIT 190
   d. The Japan-Independent State of Papua New Guinea BIT 193

G. The Public Purpose Doctrine in WTO International Instruments 195

1. WTO Doha Ministerial Declaration: November 14, 2001 196
3. The Public Purpose Doctrine in the WTO General Agreement on Trade in Services (1994) 202

3. Defining the Profile of the Public Purpose Doctrine in Human Rights Conventions 206
   A. Public Purpose Doctrine as a Fulcrum for a Hierarchy of Human Rights 227
      1. The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights 228
      2. The Findings and Effects of the European and American Human Rights Conventions and the African Charter on the Customary International Law Development of the Public Purpose Doctrine 233
      3. The Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights and Public Purpose Constraints on Regulatory Sovereignty 235
4 The Complex Interaction between the Public Purpose Doctrine and BITs: Discerning Order and Structure

A. An Analysis of the Relationship between Structure and Content: A Fragmented Framework within a Decentralized Body of International Law and a Legacy Public Purpose Doctrine
   1. Unsettled Structural Issues in the Framework of Bilateral Investment Treaties
   2. The Findings of Empirical Analysis of Public Purpose in BIT Clauses

B. Public Purpose in the Form of Sustainable Development Language in BITs and Combinations of Sustainable Development; Health, Safety, and Environment; and Labor
   1. A Rich Preamble: Sustainable Development, Health, Safety, and Environment; and Labor
   2. The GATT Article XX Exceptions in BITs

C. Comprehensive Conclusions

5 Permanent Sovereignty over Natural Resources

A. PSNR: The Structural Foundations of a Doctrine
   1. General Assembly Resolutions 523 and 626

B. The Development of the Nomenclature “Permanent Sovereignty over Natural Resources” and the Creation of a Commission

C. Seminal Decisional Law on PSNR

6 The Role of Public Purpose in Foreign Investment Protection Statutes: Can FIPS Rehabilitate the Doctrine?

A. The Public Purpose of FIPS Investor Protection

B. FIPS Carve-outs and Public Purpose

C. Dispute Resolution Clauses in FIPS and Public Purpose

D. The Teachings of FIPS Public Purpose Analysis and the Use of FIPS as Remedial Doctrinal Instruments

Conclusion
APPENDIX I  A Comparison between the Performance Requirements Articles of the Canada-Jordan and the Colombia-Japan Bilateral Investment Treaties 355

APPENDIX II  An Empirical Review of the Preeminence of the Public Purpose Doctrine throughout the Ever-Expanding Universe of Bilateral Investment Treaties 359

APPENDIX III  A Spatial Comparison of Provisions Relating to Investment Protection, Incentives, and Dispute Resolution in Foreign Investment Promotion Statutes and Bilateral Investment Treaties 388

APPENDIX IV  Table of Citations 424

Index 437