THE BRUSSELS I REGULATION RECAST

Edited by

Andrew Dickinson
Fellow of St Catherine's College and Professor of Law, University of Oxford;
Visiting Fellow, BIICL

Eva Lein
Herbert Smith Freehills Senior Research Fellow in Private International Law, BIICL

Assistant Editor

Andrew James
Researcher, BIICL

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
CONTENTS

Decisions of the Court of Justice of the European Union xvii
Decisions of the European Court of Human Rights xxv
Decisions of National Courts xxvi
List of Abbreviations xxxvi
List of Contributors xlii

1. Background and Introduction to the Regulation
   Andrew Dickinson
   I. The Recast Brussels I Regulation (Regulation 1215/2012) 1.01
   II. Ancestry 1.08
      1. Brussels Convention (as amended) 1.08
      2. Lugano Conventions 1.12
      3. The 2001 Regulation (Regulation 44/2001) 1.15
      4. EC—Denmark Agreement 1.20
   III. Review of the Original Brussels I Regulation 1.21
   IV. The Commission Proposal 1.23
   V. The Legislative Process 1.26
      1. European Parliament 1.26
      2. Council 1.30
      3. Other organs 1.34
   VI. Amendment of the Recast Regulation in Relation to the Common Courts 1.35
   VII. Treaty Base 1.36
   VIII. The Outcome of the Legislative Process—the 2001 and Recast Regulations Compared 1.39
   IX. Approach to Interpretation 1.43
      1. National courts and the Court of Justice 1.43
      2. General principles 1.44
      3. Recitals 1.56
      4. The relevance of travaux préparatoires 1.69
      5. Significance of the Brussels Convention, Lugano Conventions, and the 2001 Regulation 1.71
      6. Link to the Rome I and Rome II Regulations 1.75
   X. The Regulation’s Relationship with Other Instruments 1.80
      1. The 2001 Regulation 1.80
      2. The Brussels Convention 1.82
      3. The EC—Denmark Agreement 1.83
      4. The Lugano Convention 1.84
      5. Other EU legislative instruments applicable to civil and commercial matters 1.85
   XI. The Regulation’s Relationship with National Law and Procedure 1.108
## Contents

XII. Fundamental Rights and Freedoms 1.117
   1. Introduction 1.117
   2. The significance of the Charter in the interpretation and application of the Regulation 1.119

XIII. The Brussels I Regulation and Third States 1.131
   1. External competence (the Lugano Opinion) 1.131
   2. The position of third-State parties 1.132
   3. Relations with third-State courts 1.133

XIV. User Guide 1.141

### 2. Scope and Definitions

*Martin Illmer (Arts 1, 3), Arnaud Nuyts (Art 2(a)) and Jonathan Fitchen (Art 2(b)–(f))*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Scope</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction and legislative history</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Key features</td>
<td>2.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Commentary</td>
<td>2.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Application of the Recast Regulation to Denmark</td>
<td>2.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Definitions</td>
<td>2.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Judgment</td>
<td>2.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Court settlement</td>
<td>2.128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Authentic instrument</td>
<td>2.131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Member State of origin</td>
<td>2.135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Member State addressed</td>
<td>2.136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Court of origin</td>
<td>2.137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Extended meaning of the term ‘court’</td>
<td>2.139</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3. Jurisdiction—General Provisions

*Helène van Lith*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Jurisdiction Based on Domicile in a Member State</td>
<td>3.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction and legislative history</td>
<td>3.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Comment</td>
<td>3.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Suit Otherwise than in the Court's of the Defendant's Domicile</td>
<td>3.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction and legislative history</td>
<td>3.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Comment</td>
<td>3.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Article 6</td>
<td>3.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction and legislative history</td>
<td>3.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Comment</td>
<td>3.19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 4. Special Jurisdiction

*Matthias Lehmann (Art 7(1), (3), (5)–(7)), Eva Lein (Art 7(2)), Pippa Rogerson (Art 7(4)), and Marie-Elodie Ancel (Arts 8–9)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Special Jurisdiction for Particular Kinds of Claims (Art 7)</td>
<td>4.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction—Function of Art 7</td>
<td>4.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Rationale</td>
<td>4.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Legislative history</td>
<td>4.09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

II. Key Features of Art 7 4.12
1. Scope 4.12
2. Relation to other Articles of the Regulation 4.14
3. Relation between the different grounds of jurisdiction in Art 7 4.18

III. Guidelines to the Interpretation and Application of Art 7 4.20
1. Autonomous interpretation 4.20
2. Predictability and legal certainty 4.22
3. Principle of enumeration 4.23
5. Avoiding jurisdiction of the courts of the claimant’s domicile 4.26
6. Role of facts 4.28

IV. Jurisdiction for Contractual Matters 4.31
1. Background 4.31
2. Structure 4.32
3. ‘Matters relating to a contract’ 4.33
4. Distinction between different types of contract 4.42
5. Determination of the place of performance 4.52

V. Jurisdiction in Matters Relating to Tort, Delict, or Quasi-Delict (Art 7(2)) 4.69
1. Key features of Art 7(2) 4.69
2. ‘Matters relating to tort, delict or quasi-delict’ 4.75
3. ‘Place where the harmful event occurred’ 4.85

VI. Jurisdiction Linked to Criminal Proceedings (Art 7(3)) 4.122

VII. Jurisdiction for the Retrieval of Cultural Objects (Art 7(4)) 4.126
1. Introduction and legislative history 4.126
2. Comment 4.128

VIII. Jurisdiction over Establishments (Art 7(5)) 4.133
1. Rationale, scope, and function 4.133
2. Notion of branch, agency, or other establishment 4.134
3. Link to establishment’s operations 4.140
4. Situation of the branch 4.142

IX. Jurisdiction Relating to Trusts (Art 7(6)) 4.143

X. Jurisdiction Relating to Salvage (Art 7(7)) 4.147

XI. Derived Special Jurisdiction (Art 8) 4.151
1. Introduction and legislative history 4.151
2. Key features 4.155
3. Claims against co-defendants (Art 8(1)) 4.162
4. Third-party proceedings (Art 8(2)) 4.178
5. Art 8(3)—counterclaims arising from the same contract or facts 4.185
6. Art 8(4)—contractual claim and action on rights in rem on immovable property 4.188

XII. Special Jurisdiction in Shipping Cases—Limitation of Liability (Art 9) 4.189
1. Introduction and legislative history 4.189
2. Comment 4.190
2. Comment 7.04

II. Claims of Employees against Employers 7.25
1. Introduction and legislative history 7.25
2. Comment 7.28
3. Extension to non-EU-domiciled employers (Art 21(2)) 7.40

III. Claims of Employers against Employees 7.41
1. Introduction and legislative history 7.41
2. Comment 7.42

IV. Restrictions upon Choice-of-Court Agreements 7.45
1. Introduction and legislative history 7.45
2. Control of choice-of-court agreements 7.46

8. Exclusive Jurisdiction
Matthias Lehmann

I. General Remarks 8.01
1. Function 8.01
2. Scope of the provision 8.04
3. Relation to other provisions and to national law 8.06
4. Rationale 8.10
5. Legislative history 8.12
6. Guidelines to interpretation 8.15
7. Scope of the exclusive jurisdiction 8.16

II. Exclusive Jurisdiction Relating to Immovable Property (Art 24(1)) 8.17
1. Structure 8.17
2. Rights in rem 8.18
3. Tenancies 8.24
4. The competent court 8.30

III. Exclusive Jurisdiction Relating to Companies (Art 24(2)) 8.32
1. Structure 8.32
2. Disputes covered 8.33
3. The competent court 8.37

IV. Exclusive Jurisdiction concerning Entries in Public Registers (Art 24(3)) 8.39

V. Exclusive Jurisdiction Related to Intellectual Property Rights (Art 24(4)) 8.40
1. Overview 8.40
2. Types of intellectual property rights covered 8.41
3. Types of disputes covered 8.42
4. The competent court 8.43

VI. Exclusive Jurisdiction Relating to the Enforcement of Judgments (Art 24(5)) 8.47

9. Prorogation of Jurisdiction
Francisco Garcimartin

I. Choice-of-Court Agreements 9.01
1. Introduction and legislative history 9.01
2. Structure of the provision 9.09
3. The validity and effect of choice-of-court agreements under the Regulation (Art 25(1)–(2)) 9.10
4. Choice-of-court provisions in trust instruments (Art 25(3)) 9.89
5. Relationship with other provisions of the Regulation (Art 25(4)) 9.91
6. Severability of a choice-of-court agreement from the main contract 9.93

II. Submission by Appearance 9.96
   1. Introduction and legislative history 9.96
   2. Scope of application 9.99
   3. Submission by appearance 9.100
   4. Relationships with other provisions of the Regulation: protection of weaker parties (Art 26(2)) 9.108

10. Examination as to Jurisdiction and Admissibility
    Xandra Kramer
    I. Introduction and Legislative History 10.01
    II. The Role of National Procedural Law in Establishing Jurisdiction 10.04
    III. Obligation to Decline Jurisdiction where Another Member State Court has Exclusive Jurisdiction (Art 27) 10.06
        1. Comment 10.06
    IV. Review of Jurisdiction Prior to Granting a Judgment in Default of Appearance (Art 28) 10.10
        1. Introduction 10.10
        2. The obligation to investigate and decline jurisdiction (Art 28(1)) 10.11
        3. The obligation to stay proceedings absent effective service (Art 28(2)) 10.13
        4. Application of the Service Regulation or the Hague Service Convention (Art 28(3)–(4)) 10.16

11. Lis Pendens and Related Actions
    Pippa Rogerson (Arts 29–30, 32–34), Matthias Lehmann (Art 31(1)), and Francisco Garcimartin (Art 31(2)–(4))
    I. Introduction to Arts 29–34 11.01
    II. Lis Pendens and Related Actions in Another Member State 11.13
        1. Introduction and legislative history 11.13
        2. Comment 11.16
    III. Related Actions in Another Member State 11.30
        1. Introduction and legislative history 11.30
        2. Comment 11.31
    IV. Lis Pendens and Exclusive Jurisdiction 11.36
        1. Introduction and legislative history 11.36
        2. Situations of multiple exclusive jurisdiction (Art 31(1)) 11.39
        3. Lis pendens and exclusive choice-of-court agreements (Art 31(2)–(4)) 11.41
    V. Autonomous Determination of the Time at which the Court was Seised 11.61
        1. Introduction and legislative history 11.61
        2. Comment 11.62
    VI. Lis Pendens and Related Actions in Non-Member States 11.66
        1. Introduction and legislative history 11.66
        2. Lis pendens in a non-Member State (Art 33) 11.75
        3. Related proceedings in a non-Member State (Art 34) 11.89
12. Provisional Measures

Arnaud Nuyts

I. Introduction and Legislative History
   12.01
II. The Two-Track Jurisdictional System for Provisional Measures
   12.10
III. The Notion of Provisional and Protective Measures
   12.19
   1. The condition that the measures seek to preserve the situation
   12.21
   2. The condition of 'reversibility' of the effect of the measure
   12.28
   3. The specific case of evidential measures
   12.34
IV. The Territorial Restriction
   12.39

13. The Recognition and Enforcement of Member State Judgments

Pietro Franzina (Arts 36–38), Xandrin Kramer (Arts 39–44), and
Jonathan Fitchen (Arts 45–57)

I. Introduction
   13.01
II. The Recognition of Member State Judgments
   13.02
   1. Introduction and legislative history
   13.02
   2. The concept of 'recognition' (Art 36(1))
   13.07
   3. The scope of a judgment's authority and effectiveness
   13.20
   4. Self-standing declaratory proceedings (Art 36(2))
   13.57
   5. Recognition as an incidental question (Art 36(3))
   13.81
   6. Documentary requirements for recognition
   13.94
   7. Suspension of the proceedings in which recognition is invoked
   13.129
III. The Enforcement of Member State Judgments
   13.160
   1. Introduction
   13.160
   2. Automatic enforceability of Member State judgments
   13.167
   3. Provisional and protective measures of enforcement
   13.189
   4. The enforcement procedure
   13.198
   5. Documentation required for enforcement purposes
   13.221
   6. Formal notification of the judgment to the person against whom enforcement is sought
   13.234
   7. Suspension or limitation of enforcement proceedings
   13.243
IV. The Refusal of Recognition and Enforcement
   13.255
   1. Refusal of recognition
   13.255
   2. Refusal of enforcement
   13.399
   3. Procedural aspects of the application for refusal
   13.409
   4. The requirement for a prompt decision
   13.428
   5. Appeal against a decision on refusal
   13.435
   6. The possibility of a further appeal
   13.441
   7. Stay of the refusal proceedings
   13.449
V. Common Provisions
   13.464
   1. Introduction
   13.464
   2. Prohibition on review of the substance of a judgment (Art 52)
   13.465
   3. Certification of a judgment by the Member State of origin (Art 53)
   13.473
   4. The adaptation of measures not known in the Member State addressed (Art 54)
   13.482
   5. The enforcement of penalty provisions in Member State judgments (Art 55)
   13.502
   6. Prohibition on the requirement of security (Art 56)
   13.513
   7. The provision of translations or transliterations (Art 57)
   13.516
14. Authentic Instruments and Court Settlements
Jonathan Fitchen (Arts 58, 60) and Xandra Kramer (Art 59)

I. Authentic Instruments (Arts 58 and 60)
   1. Introduction and legislative history
   2. Authentic instruments in the legal systems of the Member States
   3. The autonomous concept of an 'authentic instrument' under the Recast Regulation
   4. Enforcement procedure (Art 58(1), second paragraph)
   5. Grounds for refusal of enforcement
   6. Manifest incompatibility with public policy of the enforcing Member State
   7. The recognition of authentic instruments

II. Court Settlements (Art 59)
   1. Introduction and legislative history
   2. Comment

III. The Certification of Authentic Instruments and Court Settlements by the Member State of Origin (Art 60)
   1. Introduction and legislative history
   2. Competent authority or court of the Member State of origin
   3. An 'interested party'
   4. The standard form certificate (Annex II)

15. General Provisions
Martin George (Art 61 (jointly), Arts 62–64), Jonathan Fitchen (Art 61 (jointly)), and Marie-Elodie Ancel (Art 65)

I. Abolition of Legalization Requirements
   1. Introduction and legislative history
   2. Comment

II. The Concept of Domicile
   1. The domicile of individuals
   2. Domicile under the national laws of the Member States
   3. The domicile of corporate and unincorporated bodies

III. Legal Representation before Criminal Courts
   1. Introduction and legislative history
   2. Comment

IV. Third-Party Notices
   1. Introduction and legislative history
   2. Comment

Andrew Dickinson

I. Introduction and Legislative History
   2. Comment

17. Relationship with Other Instruments
Pippa Rogerson (Arts 67–72, 73(3)), Andrea Bonomi (Art 73(1)), and Martin Illmer (Art 73(2))

I. Introduction and Brief Legislative History
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>II. Relationship with Other EU Instruments (Art 67)</td>
<td>17.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Relationship with the 1968 Brussels Convention (Art 68)</td>
<td>17.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Relationship with Pre-Existing Conventions as between the Member States (Arts 69 and 70)</td>
<td>17.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Relationship with International Conventions on Jurisdiction and the Recognition and Enforcement of Judgments in Particular Matters (Art 71)</td>
<td>17.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction and legislative history</td>
<td>17.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Comment</td>
<td>17.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Conventions with Third States for the Non-Recognition of Member State Judgments (Art 72)</td>
<td>17.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. The 2007 Lugano Convention, 1958 New York Convention, and Bilateral Conventions with Third States</td>
<td>17.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction and legislative history</td>
<td>17.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Relationship with the 2007 Lugano Convention (Art 73(1))</td>
<td>17.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Relationship with the New York Convention</td>
<td>17.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Bilateral conventions with third States</td>
<td>17.88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


*Andrew Dickinson*

I. Publication of information                                          18.01
   1. National rules and procedures                                     18.01
   2. Information required by the provisions on the enforcement of judgments 18.02
   3. Information concerning matters of jurisdiction                   18.03

II. The Adoption of Delegated Acts                                      18.05

III. Review of the Recast Regulation                                    18.06

IV. Repeal of the 2001 Regulation                                       18.08

V. Entry into Force of the Recast Regulation                             18.10

Appendix 1A Recast Regulation—English Language (with Annexes)          597
Appendix 1B Recast Regulation—French Language (Annexes omitted)         633
Appendix 1C Recast Regulation—German Language (Annexes omitted)         659
Appendix 2 Comparison of 2001 Regulation and Recast Regulation          687
Appendix 3 Commission Proposal (Annexes omitted)                        747
Appendix 4 Explanatory Statement within the Final Report of the EP Legal Affairs (JURI) Committee 797
Appendix 5 Information Published by the Commission Pursuant to Art 76  801

Select Bibliography                                                     813
Index                                                                  829