THE STRICT LIABILITY PRINCIPLE AND THE HUMAN RIGHTS OF THE ATHLETE IN DOPING CASES

Het "strict-liability"-beginsel en de mensenrechten van de atleet in dopingzaken

Proefschrift
ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Erasmus Universiteit Rotterdam
op gezag van de rector magnificus
Prof.dr. S.W.J. Lamberts
en volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties.

De openbare verdediging zal plaatsvinden op vrijdag 3 maart 2006 om 13.30 uur

door

JANWILLEM SOEK
geboren te Rotterdam
INTRODUCTION

PART I
SUBSTANTIVE LAW

CHAPTER 1
THE PURPOSE OF THE BAN ON DOPING (ARGUMENTS AGAINST THE USE OF DOPING)

1. Introduction
2. The use of doping endangers the athlete's health
3. The use of doping leads to an unfair advantage
   3.1. Doping enhances athletic performance
   3.2. Athletes using doping gain an unfair advantage
4. The use of doping is contrary to fairness
5. The use of doping is contrary to ethics
6. The use of doping is contrary to the rules of sport
7. The rationale of the WADC
8. Conclusion

CHAPTER 2
DEFINITION OF DOPING AND THE DESCRIPTION OF THE DOPING OFFENCE

1. Introduction
2. The evolution of the description of the offence of the use of doping
   2.1. Main categories of the use of doping
       2.1.1. Doping is the use of substances and methods for a specific purpose
       2.1.2. Doping is the use of certain, specified substances and methods
       2.1.3. Doping is the use of certain, specified substances and methods for a specific purpose
       2.1.4. Doping is the presence of a prohibited substance in the body of an athlete (strict liability)
       2.1.5. The description of the offence of the use of doping in the Olympic Movement Anti-Doping Code (OMADC)
       2.1.6. The description of the offence of the use of doping in the World Anti-Doping Code (WADC)
   2.2. The description of the ancillary doping infractions
       2.2.1. The failure to report to doping control and the refusal to submit to doping control
       2.2.2. No change of address
       2.2.3. The admission to having used a prohibited substance or method
       2.2.4. Masking agents and methods
       2.2.5. Possession of a prohibited substance
       2.2.6. Criminal conviction
       2.2.7. Elastic provisions
3. Offences relating to the use of doping
   3.1. Third-party assistance in the use of doping
   3.2. The doping of horses
   3.3. The illegal trade in prohibited doping substances
4. Doping substances and methods
   4.1. Doping substances
       4.1.1. Doping substances which are prohibited unconditionally
       4.1.2. Doping substances which are prohibited conditionally
   4.2. Doping methods
       4.2.1. Blood doping
       4.2.2. Gene doping
5. Conclusion

CHAPTER 3
THE PUNISHABILITY OF THE ACT OF DOPING

1. Introduction
2. Defects in the "chain of custody"
   2.1. Mistakes made during the doping control
   2.2. Mistakes made during the transport of the sample
2.3. Mistakes made during the analysis of the sample
5. Absence of formal illegality
   3.1. Use of conditionally prohibited substances
   3.2. Use of substances not appearing on the doping list
   3.3. Endogenous production of prohibited substances and the "grey area"
4. Conclusion

CHAPTER 4
THE LIABILITY OF THE PERPETRATOR FOR THE ACT OF DOPING

1. Introduction
2. The metamorphosis of the material rule
3. The prima facie liability rule
4. Interpretation by the CAS of the prima facie rule
   4.1. Between the old and the revised material rule
   4.2. The reasons for the CAS's preference for the strict liability rule
   4.3. Punishment without guilt? Strict or prima facie liability?
   4.4. Absence of guilt
      4.4.1. Mistake of law
      4.4.2. Mistake of fact
      4.4.3. Endogenous production of prohibited substances and the "grey area"
   4.5. Exceptional circumstances according to the WADC
   4.6. Manipulation by the athlete
   4.7. Manipulation by third parties
5. Liability in case of ancillary doping infractions
   5.1. Refusing or failing to undergo doping control
   5.2. Confession
6. Guilt in case of "non-use" offences
7. Metaphor or equivalent? Comments on the strict liability system
8. Conclusion

CHAPTER 5
SYSTEM OF SANCTIONS

1. Introduction
2. Sanctions for individual athletes in cases of "hard doping"
   2.1. The various types of sanctions
   2.2. Table of "hard" doping sanctions
   2.3. Sanctions according to the WADC
3. Sanctions for individual athletes in cases of "soft doping"
   3.1. The various types of sanctions
   3.2. Table of "soft" doping sanctions
   3.3. Sanctions according to the WADC
4. Sanctions for some ancillary doping infractions
5. Team sanctions
   5.1. Primary team sanctions
   5.2. Secondary team sanctions
      5.2.1. The match is declared lost
      5.2.2. Disqualification of the entire team
      5.2.3. Other sport sanctions for the entire team
      5.2.4. Lack of sanctions for the entire team
   5.3. Sanctions according to the WADC
6. Sanctions at the national level
   6.1. Extreme varieties
      6.1.1. First offence
      6.1.2. Second offence
      6.1.3. Third offence
   6.2. "Exotic" varieties
      6.2.1. Suspension from membership
      6.2.2. Ban from representation
6.2.3. Termination of funding
6.2.4. Suspension in specified areas
6.2.5. Sanctions according to category

6.3. Discretionary powers and flexible sanctions
6.3.1. Full discretionary powers
6.3.2. Table of flexible sanctions

7. Proportionality of sanctions and restraint of trade
7.1. Proportionality of sanctions
7.2. Restraint of trade
7.3. The approach of the WADC - exceptional circumstances

8. Reduction of sanction for cooperation in the investigation

9. Sport sanctions
9.1. Disqualification
9.2. Return of prizes, medals, etc.
9.3. Sport sanctions according to the WADC

10. Conclusion

INTERIM CHAPTER

PART II
PROCEDURAL LAW

CHAPTER 6
THE NATURE OF THE DOPING TRIAL AND THE DUE PROCESS PRINCIPLES

1. Introduction
2. The freedom of association
3. The position of disciplinary doping law within the legal framework
4. Requirements for disciplinary doping law - fair trial
5. Fair trial rights in sports law
   5.1. The right to appear in person / The right to be heard (cf. Article 6(1) ECHR)
   5.1.1. The right to be heard
   5.1.2. The right to submit evidence
   5.1.3. The right to conduct the doping trial in writing
   5.2. Open court (cf. Article 6(1) ECHR)
   5.3. Impartiality of the tribunal (cf. Article 6(1) ECHR)
   5.4. The in dubio pro reo principle (cf. Article 6(2) ECHR)
   5.5. The right to be informed of the charges (cf. Article 6(3)(a) ECHR)
   5.6. The right to inspection of the file (cf. Article 6(3)(b) ECHR)
   5.7. The right to representation (cf. Article 6(3)(c) ECHR)
   5.8. The right to call witnesses and/or experts (cf. Article 6(3)(d) ECHR)
   5.9. The right to be assisted by an interpreter (cf. Article 6(3)(e) ECHR)
   5.10. The granting of fair trial rights in practice
   5.11. The doctrine of estoppel
   5.12. The approach chosen in the WADC

6. Remedies at law
   6.1. Opposing a judgment
   6.2. Right of appeal
   6.3. Right of cassation
   6.4. Right of appeal to the Court of Arbitration for Sport (CAS)

7. Fundamental criminal law rights in practice
   7.1. The *nulla poena sine lege scripta* principle (the principle of legality)
   7.2. The *lex certa* principle (the principle of legal certainty)
   7.3. The *ne lex in idem* principle
   7.4. The *lex motiva* principle
   7.5. The proportionality principle

8. Conclusion

GENERAL SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

CAS DECISIONS