Blackshield and Williams

Australian Constitutional Law and Theory

Commentary and Materials

6th edition

George Williams AO
Anthony Mason Professor and Scientia Professor
Australian Research Council Laureate Fellow
Foundation Director, Gilbert + Tobin Centre of Public Law
University of New South Wales
Barrister of the Supreme Court of New South Wales and of the High Court

Sean Brennan
Associate Professor
Director, Gilbert + Tobin Centre of Public Law
University of New South Wales

Andrew Lynch
Professor of Law
Gilbert + Tobin Centre of Public Law
University of New South Wales

THE FEDERATION PRESS
2014
# Table of Contents

Preface to the Sixth Edition v
Acknowledgments xv
Table of Extracts xviii
Table of Cases xxiii
Table of Statutes xlii

## Part I
Australian Constitutionalism

### Chapter 1  Foundations
1. Australia: A Constitutional Hybrid 2
2. Political and Legal Constitutionalism 4
3. Liberalism 7
4. Economic Liberalism 14
5. Rule of Law 16
6. Separation of Powers 25
7. Grundnorm and Coup d'État 29
   (a) The Basic Norm 29
   (b) Coup d'État 32
8. Further References 38

### Chapter 2  Origins and Influences
1. Introduction 40
2. The Evolution of the Westminster Constitution 40
   (a) Magna Carta 40
   (b) Parliament 45
   (c) Star Chamber and Common Law Courts 49
   (d) The Bloodless Revolution 58
3. Westminster Government 60
   (a) Responsible and Representative Government 60
   (b) Parliamentary Sovereignty 63
   (c) Constitutional Conventions 70
   (d) Courts and Private Law 75
4. The Constitution of the United States 77
   (a) Separations of Power - Horizontal and Vertical 80
   (b) Judicial Review 82
5. Further References 88

### Chapter 3  Path to Independence
1. Colonisation 90
2. The Colonial Legislatures 98
3. Federation 102
4. The Colonial Legacy 107
5. The Statute of Westminster
   (a) Extraterritoriality 112
   (b) Repugnancy 113
6. Appeals to the Privy Council 118
CONTENTS

7. The Australia Act 121
8. Popular Sovereignty 125
9. Further References 131

Chapter 4 Indigenous Peoples 133
1. Introduction 133
2. Aboriginal Peoples and the Constitution 135
3. Native Title 136
4. Indigenous Sovereignty 146
   (a) Perspectives on Sovereignty 146
   (b) The United States 148
   (c) The Australian Situation 153
5. Self-Determination 161
6. Further References 166

Part 2 Constitutional Interpretation 170

Chapter 5 Constitutional Interpretation 170
1. Literalism, Legalism and Judicial Choice 170
2. The Jumbunna Principle 182
3. The Dead Hand and the Living Tree 186
   (a) Use of Historical Materials 186
   (b) The Intention of the Framers 188
   (c) Textualism 192
   (d) Incremental Accommodation 196
   (e) Purposive Interpretation 199
   (f) Strategic Compromise? 207
4. Coherence, Integrity and Postmodernity 213
5. Legal Culture, Gender and 'Different Voices' 221
6. Further References 228

Part 3 The Federal System 232

Chapter 6 Federalism and the Engineers Case 232
1. Federalism 232
2. Australian Federalism 238
3. The Division of Legislative Power 242
4. Implied Immunity of Instrumentalities 243
5. Reserved State Powers 248
6. The Engineers Case 253
7. Further References 261

Chapter 7 Australian Federalism in Practice 262
1. Intergovernmental Relations 262
2. Co-operative Legislative Schemes 265
3. Referrals of Power 274
4. Powers of the United Kingdom Parliament 277
5. Federal Financial Relations 279
CONTENTS

6. Equal Treatment of States 284
7. Further References 296

Chapter 8 Inconsistency between Commonwealth and State Laws 297
1. Meaning of 'Invalid' and 'Prevail' 297
2. The Tests of Inconsistency 298
4. Manufacturing Inconsistency 311
5. Manufacturing Consistency 321
6. Further References 331

Chapter 9 The Territories 332
1. The Territories 332
2. Scope of the Territories Power 334
3. Limits on the Territories Power 336
4. Further References 350

Part 4
The Executive and Executive Power

Chapter 10 The Executive 352
1. The Crown 352
2. The Governor-General 356
3. Executive Power 365
   (a) Prerogative Power 366
   (b) Nationhood Power 379
   (c) Power Conferred by Statute 397
   (d) Contracting and Spending 406
4. Control of the Executive 414
   (a) Responsible Government 414
   (b) Constitutional Writs 420
5. Further References 427

Part 5
The Judiciary and Judicial Power

Chapter 11 The High Court 430
1. The Platonic High Court 430
2. Appointment and Removal of Judges 432
   (a) Appointment 432
   (b) Removal 434
3. Jurisdiction 437
   (a) Appellate Jurisdiction 437
   (b) Original Jurisdiction 439
   (c) ‘Matters’ 441
   (d) Standing 455
   (e) Justiciability 464
4. Remedies 470
   (a) Invalidity 470
   (b) Reading Down and Severance 473
5. Deciding Constitutional Cases 476
   (a) Judicial Parsimony 476
   (b) Precedent and Overruling 480
6. Further References 489

Chapter 12 Separation of Judicial Power 490
1. The Separation of Federal Judicial Power 490
2. The Separation of State Judicial Power 500
3. Defining Judicial Power 502
4. Judicial Power and Administrative Tribunals 509
5. Exceptions to the Boilermakers Case 517
   (a) Military Tribunals 518
   (b) Delegation of Judicial Power 521
   (c) Persona Designata Rule 523
6. The Incompatibility Doctrine 531
7. Legislative Usurpation and Interference 535
8. Further References 539

Chapter 13 Judicial and Non-Judicial Detention 541
1. Introduction 541
2. The Incompatibility Doctrine 543
3. Protective Detention 554
4. Immigration Detention 557
5. Preventive Detention 574
6. Control Orders 589
7. Further References 602

Chapter 14 The Judicial Process 603
1. Introduction 603
2. Retrospectivity 607
3. Fair Trial 616
4. Equal Justice 619
5. Impartiality, Independence and Integrity 627
   (a) Judges - Appointment and Conditions 627
   (b) Secrecy and Non-Disclosure 632
   (c) Decisional Independence 642
   (d) Supervisory Jurisdiction 649
6. Further References 652

Part 6
The Parliament and Legislative Power

Chapter 15 Federal Parliament 654
1. Introduction 654
2. Parliamentary Privilege 654
3. Voting and Elections 656
   (a) Voting 656
   (b) Express Right to Vote 660
   (c) Implied Right to Vote 664
   (d) Voter Equality 677
   (e) A Level Playing Field? 688
   (f) Territory Senators 693
CONTENTS

4. Eligibility for Election 698
5. Resolving Deadlocks 706
6. Further References 720

Chapter 16 State Legislative Power 722
1. Introduction 722
2. State Legislative Power 724
   (a) Peace, Welfare and Good Government 724
   (b) Constitutional Amendment 732
3. Manner and Form Requirements 737
4. Alternative Procedures 748
5. The Ranasinghe Principle 753
6. Further References 759

Chapter 17 Characterisation 760
1. Characterisation 760
2. Dual Characterisation 764
3. Interaction between Heads of Power 773
4. Subject Matter and Purpose Powers 778
5. Subject Matter Powers 779
   (a) Sufficient Connection 779
   (b) The Role of Purpose 785
   (c) Incidental Powers 786
6. Proportionality – Purpose Powers and Limitations 788
   (a) Purpose Powers 788
   (b) Beyond Purpose Powers? 790
   (c) Constitutional Limitations 799
7. Further References 801

Chapter 18 Economic Powers 802
1. The Trade and Commerce Power 802
   (a) Scope 802
   (b) Incidental Aspect 806
2. The Corporations Power 815
   (a) Huddart Parker Overthrown 815
   (b) Which Corporations? 818
   (c) Reach of the Power 828
3. Further References 844

Chapter 19 Defence Power 845
1. Nature of the Power 845
2. War 847
3. Post-War 854
4. Peace 856
5. Military Justice 857
6. Cold War: The Communist Party Case 863
7. Terrorism and National Security 876
8. Further References 884

Chapter 20 International Law and the External Affairs Power 885
1. Reception of International Law 885
2. International Law and Constitutional Interpretation 891
### 3. External Affairs
- (a) Relations with Other Countries 896
- (b) Matters External to Australia 898
- (c) International Law Other than Treaties 902

### 4. Implementing Treaties
- (a) Entering into Treaties 903
- (b) First Approaches 904
- (c) The Expanding Power 908
- (d) The Power Confirmed 919
- (e) International Recommendations 926

### 5. Further References 929

---

### Chapter 21 Immigration and Aliens Powers
1. The White Australia Policy 930
2. ‘Once an immigrant always an immigrant’ 932
3. Naturalisation and Aliens
   - (a) Citizenship 945
   - (b) Persons Born in Britain 954
   - (c) Persons Born in Australia 972

### Further References 985

---

### Chapter 22 Races Power
1. Introduction 986
2. A Commonwealth Power in Relation to Aboriginal People 987
3. Special Laws Deemed Necessary for People of Any Race 989
4. For the Benefit of a Race? 997
5. Further References 1008

---

### Chapter 23 Taxation and Excise
1. The Taxation Power
   - (a) What is a Tax? 1010
   - (b) Fees for Services 1018
   - (c) Arbitrary Exactions 1023
   - (d) Incidental Aspect 1025
2. Excise Duties
   - (a) First Approaches 1027
   - (b) Widening Views of Excise 1030
   - (c) The Tangled Web of Dennis Hotels 1032
   - (d) Alcohol, Tobacco and Petrol 1035
   - (e) The Grip of Precedent 1042
   - (f) The States Lose $5 Billion 1045
3. Further References 1050

---

### Chapter 24 Appropriations and Grants
1. The Appropriation Power
   - (a) ‘Purposes of the Commonwealth’ 1051
   - (b) The AAP Case 1054
   - (c) Section 81 Resolved 1061
   - (d) Controls on Government Expenditure 1065
2. The Grants Power
   - (a) The Early Cases 1067
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Intergovernmental Immunities</td>
<td>1082-1091</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Human Rights</td>
<td>1131-1183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Economic Freedoms</td>
<td>1195-1257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Freedom of Political Communication</td>
<td>1259-1291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Freedom of Political Communication: Testing Boundaries</td>
<td>1292-1311</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. The Judicial Process
   (a) Criticising Judges 1316
   (b) Limitations from Ch III 1322
6. Lange’s Two Questions
   (a) Burdens on Political Communication 1328
   (b) Legitimate Ends and Proportionate Means 1328
7. Further References 1336

Part 8
Constitutional Change

Chapter 30  Constitutional Change
1. Amending the Constitution 1338
2. The Referendum Record 1339
3. An Australian Republic? 1343
4. Aboriginal Peoples 1352
5. Further References 1359

Part 9
Appendix

Appendix
1. Australian Constitution 1362
2. Colonial Laws Validity Act 1865 (Imp) 1379
3. Statute of Westminster Adoption Act 1942 (Cth) 1380
4. Australia Act 1986 (Cth) 1382
5. Justices of the High Court of Australia 1386
   (a) The Justices 1386
   (b) Composition of the Court 1387

Index 1390