Joint Ventures and EU Competition Law

Luis Silva Morais
Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations .............................................................................................................................. xiii
Table of Cases .......................................................................................................................................... xvii
Table of Legislation ................................................................................................................................ xxv
General Notes on the Text .................................................................................................................. xxxv

Introduction ............................................................................................................................................... 1
1 Objectives of the Research in this Book .......................................................................................... 1
   1.1 General Aspects of Joint Ventures in the Context of Cooperation between Undertakings .................................................................................................................. 1
   1.2 How to Define the Category of Joint Venture in the Field of Competition Law and in Other Areas of Law.................................................................................. 4
   1.3 The Treatment of Joint Ventures under EU Competition Law ......................................... 5
   1.4 The Treatment of Joint Ventures and Changes in EU Competition Law ......................... 8
      1.4.1 The Various Phases of Evolution of EU Competition Law ................................ 8
      1.4.2 The Treatment of Joint Ventures Before and After the Adoption of the EU Merger Control Regulation ................................................................. 12
      1.4.3 Treatment of Joint Ventures Focused on Article 101 TFEU ................................ 17
   1.5 The Building of a General Model of Evaluation of Joint Ventures under Competition Law Rules and the Transition to a New Stage of EU Competition Law ................. 17
   1.6 Particular Features of Joint Ventures in the Financial Sector ......................................... 19
2 Methodology ........................................................................................................................................ 20
3 Structure of the Book ........................................................................................................................ 23

Chapter 1 The Concept of Joint Ventures in Competition Law ............................................................ 25
1 Introduction—The Inherent Vagueness of the Concept of Joint Venture in US Antitrust Law and EU Competition Law ......................................................................... 25
   1.1 Relevant Definitions of the Concept of Joint Venture in Competition Law ....................... 27
   1.2 Distinctive Features of the Concept of Joint Venture—A Preliminary View ....................... 28
   1.3 Factors Underlying the Vagueness of the Concept of Joint Venture in Competition Law .................................................................................................................. 30
   1.4 Different Legal Models of Structuring Cooperation Links between Undertakings—The Creation of Joint Ventures and their Underlying Goals ................................................................. 31
      1.4.1 The Emergence of the 'Joint Venture' Nomen Juris in Various Legal Systems .......... 31
      1.4.2 Structuring Cooperation through Joint Ventures as a Common Form of Innominate or Atypical Contract ................................................................. 51
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.4.3 The Basic Constituent Elements of Different Joint Venture Structures as a Socially Recurrent Type of Contract (Statutory Atypical) .......................................................................60
1.4.4 The Joint Venture Category in the Context of Cooperation between Undertakings—Comprehensive Overview .........................................................92

2 The Concept of Joint Venture and the Concept of Undertaking in EU Competition Law ........................................................................................................96
2.1 General Perspective .....................................................................................................................96
2.1.1 The Key Elements of the Concept of Undertaking in Competition Law and the Joint Venture Category ...........................................96
2.1.2 Clarification of the Concept of Single Economic Unit When Applied to Joint Ventures ...............................................................103

3 The Dual Treatment of Joint Ventures in EU Competition Law ........................................107
3.1 Systemic Approaches to Joint Ventures in US Antitrust Law and EU Competition Law ........................................................................................................107
3.1.1 General Perspective ........................................................................................................107
3.2 The Two Fundamental Categories of Joint Ventures in EU Competition Law ................111
3.2.1 The Systematic Divide Arising from the Adoption of the MCR ..........111
3.2.2 The Limits of Convergence in the Systematic Treatment of Joint Ventures in EU Competition Law .................................................................114

4 The Basic Elements of a Legal Definition of Joint Venture in EU Competition Law ..................................................................................................................119
4.1 Introductory Remarks ..............................................................................................................119
4.2 Initial References to the Concept of Joint Venture in Guidelines and Reports on Competition Policy ........................................................................................................120
4.2.1 First Formal References to Joint Ventures ..............................................................120
4.2.2 Elements of Characterization of Joint Ventures in Reports on Competition Policy ....................................................................................121
4.3 The Concept of Joint Venture Arising from Various Regulations in the Field of EU Competition Law ........................................................................................................123
4.3.1 Joint Ventures and Block Exemption Regulations ................................................123
4.3.2 Elements Relevant to Establishing a Legal Concept of Joint Venture as Dealt with in other EU Regulations .................................................................124
4.4 Elements of a Legal Definition of Joint Venture in the EU Merger Control Regulation ........................................................................................................125
4.4.1 The Adoption of the EU Merger Control Regulation Setting the Basis for a First Legal Definition of the Joint Venture Category in EU Competition Law ........................................................................................................125
4.4.2 The Reforms of the EU Merger Control Regulation; its Impact on the Legal Definition of Joint Ventures; and Parallel Developments ........................................................................................................128
4.5 The Legal Definition of Joint Venture in the Competition Law of other Jurisdictions .................................................................................................................133
4.5.1 General Overview ........................................................................................................133
4.5.2 The Legal Definition of Joint Venture in US Antitrust Law ........................................134
4.5.3 The Legal Definition of Joint Venture Arising from Guidelines Adopted in the Context of US Antitrust Law ..................................137
4.6 The Legal Definition of Joint Venture Arising from Guidelines Adopted in the Context of EU Competition Law.................................143
4.6.1 General Overview—The Guidelines on the Concept of Full Function Joint Ventures ..............................................................143
4.6.2 Other Relevant Guidelines in the Field of Concentration Control ..........................................................................................151
4.6.3 Commission Guidelines on the Assessment of Cooperative Joint Ventures ...................................................................................153
5 The Definition of Joint Venture in EU Competition Law—Conclusion ..........................................................................................156
5.1 Overview......................................................................................................................................................................................156
5.2 The Ratio Underlining the Autonomy of the Joint Venture Category in a Middle Ground between Cooperation and Concentration of Undertakings .................................................................................157
5.3 Proposed Approach for the Definition of Joint Venture ................................................................................................................159
5.3.1 The Key Elements of the Proposed Concept of Joint Venture in the Context of EU Competition Law .................................................................159
5.3.2 The *Praxis* of Identifying and Assessing the Key Elements of the Definition of Joint Venture .......................................................161
5.3.3 The Time Horizon of Cooperation of Undertakings and its Relevance for the Definition of Joint Venture .......................................................163
5.4 Final Conclusion ............................................................................................................................................................................165

Chapter 2 An Analytical Model for the Assessment of Joint Ventures in EU Competition Law..........................................................................................169
1 The Substantive Assessment of Competitive Effects of Joint Ventures—General Perspective .................................................................169
1.1 Introductory Remarks—Reasons for Privileging the Assessment of Joint Ventures under Article 101 TFEU .................................................................169
1.2 The Key Legal Tests for the Substantive Assessment of Anticompetitive Effects of Joint Ventures .................................................................172
1.3 The First Fundamental Dimension of Assessment of Joint Ventures ..........................................................................................174
1.4 The Second Fundamental Dimension of Assessment of Joint Ventures and the Focus of My Analysis ..........................................................................................176
1.5 The Treatment of Joint Ownership of Undertakings Without Joint Control ..........................................................................................182
1.6 General Overview of the Analysis to be Developed .........................................................................................................................183
2 The Main Elements of the Proposed Analytical Model for the Assessment of Joint Ventures .................................................................184
2.1 General Remarks ............................................................................................................................................................................184
2.2 First Stage of Analysis of Joint Ventures—Types of Situations Not Usually Prohibited ..............................................................................................................185
2.2.1 Preliminary Considerations on the Delineation of a First Level of Analysis of Joint Ventures in Light of the 2001 and 2011 Horizontal Cooperation Guidelines ..............................................................................................................185
2.2.2 Relevance and Shortcomings of the Revised 2011 Horizontal Cooperation Guidelines to My Analytical Model of Joint Ventures ..............................................................................................................190
2.3 First Stage of Joint Venture Analysis—Types of Situations
   Usually Prohibited under EU Competition Rules ......................................................... 192
   2.3.1 First Stage of Joint Venture Analysis and Normally
      Prohibited Joint Ventures ............................................................................................. 192
   2.3.2 Normally Prohibited Joint Ventures vis a vis Restrictions of Competition by Object in General in the 2011
      Horizontal Guidelines ................................................................................................... 194
2.4 The Situations that May be Prohibited under Article 101, Paragraph 1 TFEU and the Successive Stages of Joint
   Venture Assessment in My Analytical Model .................................................................... 196
   2.4.1 Preliminary Remarks ..................................................................................................... 196
   2.4.2 The Second Stage of Analysis of Joint Ventures .................................................... 198
   2.4.3 The Third Stage of Analysis of Joint Ventures ....................................................... 204
   2.4.4 Third and Complementery Stages of Analysis of Joint Ventures—The Analytical Parameter Based on the Relation
      of the Joint Venture to the Parents’ Markets ..................................................................... 214
   2.4.5 Other Complementery Analytical Elements .......................................................... 221
   2.4.6 Conditions or Remedies Imposed on Undertakings Participating in Joint Ventures......... 227

Chapter 3 The Substantive Assessment of Different Types of Joint Ventures
   under Article 101 TFEU .............................................................................................. 231
1 General Overview ............................................................................................................................. 231
   1.1 Envisaged Sequential Analysis ...................................................................................... 231
   1.2 The Particular Relevance of Specific Types of Joint Ventures
      According to their Prevailing Economic Function ......................................................... 234
   1.3 The Main Types of Risks of Anticompetitive Effects Arising from Joint Ventures .......... 237
   1.4 The Fundamental Analytical Tools Applicable to Partial Function Joint Ventures on the Basis of the Prevailing
      Economic Function of Such Joint Ventures ..................................................................... 238
2 Research and Development Joint Ventures ............................................................................... 242
   2.1 Introductory Remarks—How to Define and Qualify Research and Development Joint Ventures ....242
   2.2 Typical Goals Underlying the Creation of Research and Development Joint Ventures ........... 245
      2.2.1 The European Commission View .............................................................................. 245
      2.2.2 Critical and Systemic View of the Chief Aims Underlying the Creation of Research and Development Joint Ventures ...... 246
2.3 Analytical Model for the Antitrust Assessment of Research and Development Joint Ventures .. 251
      2.3.1 The Analytical Model Proposed—Overview and First Stage of Analysis ....... 251
      2.3.2 Main Anticompetitive Risks Arising from Research and Development Joint Ventures .... 254
      2.3.3 First Level of Analysis of Research and Development Joint
          Ventures—Categories of Joint Ventures Normally Allowed (Not Falling Under Article 101, Paragraph 1 TFEU) ............. 258
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4 First Level of Analysis of Research and Development Joint Ventures—Categories of Joint Ventures Normally Prohibited (Almost Always Falling under Article 101, Paragraph 1 TFEU)</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.5 Research and Development Joint Ventures that Require Further Analysis</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Production Joint Ventures</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 General overview—How to Define and Qualify Production Joint Ventures</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1 The Concept of Production Joint Venture</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2 Overall Characterization of Production Joint Ventures</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Typical Goals Underlying the Creation of Production Joint Ventures</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 The European Commission View</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 Critical and Systemic View of the Chief Goals Underlying the Creation of Production Joint Ventures</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Analytical Model for the Antitrust Assessment of Production Joint Ventures</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1 First Level of Analysis of Production Joint Ventures—Categories of Joint Ventures Normally Allowed (Not Falling under Article 101, Paragraph 1 TFEU)</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2 Chief Risks of Anticompetitive Effects Arising from Production Joint Ventures</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3 First Stage of Analysis of Production Joint Ventures—Categories of Joint Ventures Normally Permitted (Not Falling under Article 101, Paragraph 1 TFEU)</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4 First Level of Analysis of Production Joint Ventures—Categories of Joint Ventures Normally Prohibited (Almost Always Falling under Article 101, Paragraph 1 TFEU)</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.5 Production Joint Ventures that Need Further Analysis</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Commercialization Joint Ventures</td>
<td>399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 General Overview</td>
<td>399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1 How to Define and Qualify Commercialization Joint Ventures</td>
<td>399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.2 The Distinction between Commercialization Joint Ventures and Several Forms of Joint Commercialization Agreements</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.3 The Distinction between Commercialization Joint Ventures that Cover Joint Selling and Commercialization Joint Ventures with Narrower Functions</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.4 Complementary Systemic Qualification of Subcategories of Commercialization Joint Ventures</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.5 The Organizational and Functional Diversity of Commercialization Joint Ventures and its Main Consequences</td>
<td>410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Typical Aims Underlying the Creation of Commercialization Joint Ventures</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 The European Commission View</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Critical and Systemic View of the Chief Goals Underlying the Creation of Commercialization Joint Ventures</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3 Analytical Model for the Antitrust Assessment of Commercialization Joint Ventures
4.3.1 First Level of Analysis of Commercialization Joint Ventures—Categories of Joint Ventures Normally Allowed (Not Falling under Article 101, Paragraph 1 TFEU) ........................................... 415
4.3.2 Chief Risks of Anticompetitive Effects Arising from Commercialization Joint Ventures ........................................... 417
4.3.3 Commercialization Joint Ventures Normally Prohibited (Almost Always Falling under Article 101, Paragraph 1 TFEU) ............. 422
4.3.4 Commercialization Joint Ventures Normally Permitted (Not Falling under Article 101, Paragraph 1 TFEU) .......................... 423
4.3.5 Specific Factors to be Taken into Consideration for the Assessment of Commercialization Joint Ventures ........................................... 426
4.3.6 Reasons for Rejecting a Negative Pre-Established Hermeneutical Understanding of Commercialization Joint Ventures ........................................... 427
4.4 Commercialization Joint Ventures that Need Further Analysis ........................................... 428
4.4.1 General Overview .................................................................................. 428
4.4.2 The Participating Undertakings’ Market Share Criterion .................................................................................. 428
4.4.3 Third Level of Analysis of Commercialization Joint Ventures .................................................................................. 429
4.4.4 Complementary Levels of Analysis of Commercialization Joint Ventures .................................................................................. 450
4.4.5 Critical Analysis of Relevant Case Law in the Field of Commercialization Joint Ventures and Related Situations ........................................... 451

5 Purchasing Joint Ventures ................................................................................................. 469
5.1 General Overview ................................................................................................. 469
5.2 Analytical Model for the Antitrust Assessment of Purchasing Joint Ventures .................................................................................. 473
5.2.1 Risks of Anticompetitive Effects Arising from Purchasing Joint Ventures .................................................................................. 473
5.2.2 Purchasing Joint Ventures that Need Further Analysis .................................................................................. 477

6 Joint Ownership of Undertakings Without Joint Control ................................................................................................. 481
6.1 General Overview ................................................................................................. 481
6.2 Analytical Criteria for Assessment of Effects on Competition Arising from Ownership of Undertakings Short of Individual or Joint Control .................................................................................. 488
6.2.1 Identifying Relevant Situations which Inherently Lead to Potential Restrictions of Competition .................................................................................. 488
6.2.2 Possible Anticompetitive Effects Arising from Minority Shareholdings in Particular Undertakings .................................................................................. 491

Chapter 4 Concluding Remarks on Joint Ventures and Global Changes of EU Competition Law ................................................................................................. 495
1 General Overview ................................................................................................. 495
2 The Changes of Teleological Priorities and the Renewal of Legal Methodology as Essential Dimensions of the Transition to a New Model of EU Competition Law More Closely Associated with Joint Venture Analysis ................................................................................................. 497
2.1 The Redressing of Teleological Priorities of EU Competition Law ................................................................................................. 497
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1 Joint Venture Analysis and the Definition of Teleological</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coordinates of Competition Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The Renewal of the Understanding of the Main Categories</td>
<td>509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of Cooperation between Undertakings and of the Legal Methodology of EU</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competition Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 General Perspective</td>
<td>509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Complementary Observations on the Development of General</td>
<td>519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analytical Models in Competition Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 Establishing a New Normative Logic in the Systematic</td>
<td>523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretation of Article 101, Paragraphs 1 and 3 TFEU</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Index** ......................................................................................................................................... 537