Proportional Liability: Analytical and Comparative Perspectives

Israel Gilead
Michael D Green
Bernhard A Koch (eds)

With Contributions by
Bjarne Askeland • Ewa Bagińska • Giovanni Comandé • Eugenia Dacoronia • Andreas Bloch Ehlers • Israel Gilead • Michael D Green • Jiří Hrádek • Anne LM Keirse • Bernhard A Koch • Ulrich Magnus • Miquel Martín-Casals • Olivier Moréteau • Johann Neethling • Luca Nocco • Ken Oliphant • Boaz Shnoor • Josep Solé • Luboš Tichý • Vibe Ulfbeck • Pierre Widmer • Bénédict Winiger
Table of Contents

Israel Gilead, Michael D Green and Bernhard A Koch

General Report: Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability: Analytical and Comparative Report — 1

I. Introduction — 1
   1. Meaning and Definition of Proportional Liability in the Project — 1
   2. Causal Proportional Liability Contrasted with Proportional Liability Among Multiple Tortfeasors Based on Contributory (Comparative) Negligence — 3
   3. The Aim of This Project — 4
   4. Structure — 8

II. Categories of Proportional Liability — 10
   1. Why Categorize? — 10
   2. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 12
      A. Sub-category A1 – ‘alternative liability’ – indeterminate tortfeasors — 12
      B. Sub-category A2 – ‘market-share liability’ – causally unrelated tortfeasors and victims — 13
      C. Sub-category A3 – ‘pollution or drug cases’ – indeterminate victims — 13
      D. Sub-category A4 – ‘The hard case’ — 14
      E. Sub-category A5 – ‘lost chances’ — 14
   3. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 15
      A. Sub-category B1 – all parts of P’s harm were caused by liable Ds — 15
      B. Sub-category B2 – some parts of P’s harm were caused by other factors — 16
   5. Category D – ‘Combination Cases’ — 17

III. Policy Considerations — 17

IV. Burden and Standard of Proof — 20
V. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 22
   Tortfeasor — 23
   A. Analysis — 23
   B. A1 cases in comparison — 25
2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated
   Tortfeasors and Victims — 26
   A. Analysis — 26
   B. A2 cases in comparison — 30
3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate
   Victims — 31
   A. Analysis — 31
   B. A3 cases in comparison — 34
   A. Analysis — 35
   B. A4 cases in comparison — 38
5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 39
   A. Analysis — 39
   B. A5 cases in comparison — 43

VI. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 44
1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious
   Actors — 45
   A. Analysis — 45
   B. B1 cases in comparison — 47
2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious
   Factors — 48
   A. Analysis — 48
   B. B2 cases in comparison — 49

VII. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 50
1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — 51
   A. Analysis — 51
   B. C1 cases in comparison — 52
2. Sub-Category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — 54
   A. Analysis — 54
   B. C2 cases in comparison — 55

VIII. Category D – ‘Combination Cases’ — 56
1. On the meaning of combination cases — 56
2. How to cope with ‘combination cases’ — 57
IX. Summary and Conclusions — 58
1. How to Approach CPL Issues? — 59
2. The Relevant Factual Effects of CPL — 59
3. Normative Considerations — 61
4. On the Cautious Monitored Development of CPL — 62
5. On the Comparative Landscape — 64
6. On Future Developments — 66

Categories of Proportional Liability — 69
Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 69
   Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — 69
   Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 69
   Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — 70
   Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — 70
   Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 71
Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 71
   Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — 71
   Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — 72
Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 72
   Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — 73
   Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — 73
Category D – ‘Combination Cases’ — 73

Country Reports

Bernhard A Koch
Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Austria — 77
I. Standard of Proof — 77
II. The Discussion of Proportional Liability in Austria — 79
   A. The Starting Point – Multiple Tortfeasors under the ABGB — 79
   B. Alternative Causes — 80
      1. Alternative External Causes — 80
      2. Alternative External Causes Competing with Risks within the Victim’s own Sphere — 83
C. Other Instances of Causal Uncertainty — 87
   1. Alternative Victims — 87
   2. Minimal Causation — 88
   3. Loss of a Chance — 88
   4. Market-Share Liability — 90
D. The Two Drafts of a Tort Law Reform — One Step Forward and
Two Steps Back — 90
III. The Case Hypotheticals from an Austrian Perspective — 92
A. Category A — Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 92
      Tortfeasor — 92
   2. Sub-category A2 — ‘Market-share Liability’ — Causally Unrelated
      Tortfeasors and Victims — 92
   3. Sub-category A3 — ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ — Indeterminate
      Victims — 93
   4. Sub-category A4 — ‘The Hard Case’ — 93
   5. Sub-category A5 — The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 93
B. Category B — Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 94
   1. Sub-category B1 — Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by
      Tortious Actors — 94
   2. Sub-category B2 — Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by
      Non-tortious Factors — 95
C. Category C — Risks of Future Harm — 95
D. Category D — ‘Combination Cases’ — 96
IV. Summary — 96

Luboš Tichý and Jiří Hrádek
Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in the Czech Republic — 99
I. Definition of Proportional Liability — 99
   A. Introduction — 99
   B. Legal Provisions of Substantive Law — 99
      1. Provisions on Multiple Tortfeasors — 99
      2. Causation — 101
      3. Provisions on Proportional Liability — 104
II. Policy Consideration — 105
III. Burden of Proof — 106
   A. Legal Provisions — 106
   B. Possible Changes — 108
IV. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 110
   2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 111
   3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — 111
   4. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — 113
   5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 113
V. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 114
   1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — 114
   2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — 115
VI. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 116
   1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — 116
   2. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — 116

Andreas Bloch Ehlers and Vibe Ulfbeck
Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Denmark — 117

Ken Oliphant
Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in England and Wales — 121
I. Introduction — 121
   Meaning of ‘Proportional Liability’ — 121
II. Proportional Liability: The Fairchild Exception — 122
   A. Starting Points — 122
   B. Orthodox Approach to Alternative Causes — 123
   C. Fairchild and beyond — 124
III. The Categories of Proportional Liability — 128
   A. Alternative Liability (Unidentified Tortfeasor) — 128
   B. ‘Market-Share Liability’ (A Closed Set of Tortfeasors and Victims) — 128
   C. Pollution and Drug Cases (Unidentified Victim) — 129
   D. Increased Risk — 130
   E. The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 131
   F. Certain Causation – Uncertain Extent (Only Tortious Causes) — 134
   G. Certain Causation – Uncertain Extent (Tortious and Non-Tortious Causes) — 135
   H. Causal Uncertainty as to Future Harm — 136
IV. Concluding Remarks — 139
Olivier Moréteau

Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in France — 141

I. Introduction — 141

II. Burden and Standard of Proof — 141

III. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 143
   1. Sub-Category A4 – A5: The ‘Hard Case’ and Lost Chances — 143
   3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ — Indeterminate Victims — 147
   4. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ — Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 147

IV. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 148

V. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 150
   1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — 151
   2. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — 151

Ulrich Magnus

Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Germany — 153

I. Definition of Proportional Liability — 153

II. Categories of Proportional Liability — 155

III. Policy Considerations — 155
   1. Deterrence — 156
   2. Justice/Fairness — 157
   3. Reduction of Administrative Costs — 158
   4. Further Policy Considerations — 158

IV. Burden of Proof — 158
   1. In General — 158
   2. Standard of Proof — 159

V. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 160
   2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ — Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 161
   3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ — Indeterminate Victims — 162
   5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 163
VI. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 163
   1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — 163
   2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — 164

VII. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 164
   1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — 164
   2. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — 164

VIII. Category D – ‘Combination Cases’ — 165

IX. Conclusions — 165
   1. In General — 165
   2. The Relevant Factual Effects of Proportional Liability — 165
      (a) Gainers and Losers — 165
      (b) Effect on Incentives — 166
      (c) Number of Suits — 167
      (d) Costs of Suits — 167
      (e) Informational Difficulties — 168
      (f) Distribution of Probabilities — 168
      (g) Degree of Fault — 168
      (h) Degree of Uncertainty — 168
   3. Policy Considerations — 168

Eugenia Dacoronia

Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Greece — 171
I. Introduction — 171
   General Definition — 171
II. Policy Considerations — 173
III. Burden and Standard of Proof — 173
IV. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 174
   2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 175
   3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — 176
   4. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — 177
   5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 178
Giovanni Comandé and Luca Nocco

Proportional Liability in Uncertain Settings: Is it Precautionary? Italian Insights and Comparative Policy Considerations — 199

I. In Search of a Definition for Proportional Liability — 199
   A. Introduction — 199
   B. The Standard of Proof — 201
   C. Reasons to Introduce a Rule of Proportional Liability and Policy Related Implications — 203

II. In Search of Instances for Proportional Liability — 206
   A. The First Category of Proportional Liability (and Tools Aiming to Achieve Similar Objectives): Uncertainty Regarding the Link Between Defendant’s Conduct and Harm. — 206
      2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 211
      3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — 212
      4. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — 212
      5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 213
   B. Some Insights on Proportional Liability and Uncertainty — 215
   C. The Second Category of Proportional Liability: Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 219
   D. The Third Category of Proportional Liability: Uncertain Materialisation of Risk — 220

III. In Search of a Reasonable Proportional Liability Rule for Uncertain Settings — 223

Anne LM Keirse

Going Dutch: How to Address Cases of Causal Uncertainty — 227

I. Preface — 227
II. An All-or-Nothing External Liability Paired with an Internal Proportional Apportionment — 228
III. The Reversal of the Burden of Proof — 232
V. Proportional Liability: No Longer an ‘Internal Matter’ — 235
VI. Proportional Liability Confirmed — 240
VII. Follow-up case law — 242
VIII. Concluding Remarks — 245
   Annex: Short answers to the cases from a Dutch perspective — 246

Bjarte Askeland
Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Norway — 249
   Existing Solutions to the Various Categories — 251

Ewa Bagińska
Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Poland — 253
I. Introduction — 253
II. General Remarks on Causation and Burden of Proof in Polish Law — 254
   A. Causation — 254
   B. Burden of Proof — 256
III. The Way to the Coronation of the Rule of Joint and Several Liability in Polish Law — 259
   A. The Rise and Fall of Proportional Liability in Polish Law — 259
   B. The Main Characteristics of Joint and Several Liability — 261
IV. Possible Application of Proportional Liability – Specific Categories — 262
   A. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 262
      2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 264
      3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — 265
      4. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — 266
      5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 268
   B. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 270
      1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — 270
      2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — 273
   C. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 274
   D. Category D – Combination Cases — 276
V. Final Observations — 278
Johann Neethling

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in South Africa — 283**

I. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 283
   A. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — 283
   B. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 285
   C. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — 286
   D. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — 287
   E. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 288

II. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 289
   A. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — 289
   B. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — 290

III. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 292
    A. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — 292
    B. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — 292

Miquel Martín-Casals and Josep Solé

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Spain — 295**

I. Introduction — 295
   A. The proof of causation under Spanish Law — 295
   B. Procedural means to overcome uncertainty — 296
   C. The notion of ‘proportional liability’ in current Spanish law — 297
   D. Policy considerations in the Spanish debate — 299

II. Categories of proportional liability — 300
   A. Uncertainty about past harm — 300
      1. Indeterminate tortfeasors (‘alternative liability’) — 300
      2. Causally unrelated tortfeasors and victims (‘market-share liability’) — 304
      3. Indeterminate Victim (‘Pollution or Drug Cases’) — 306
      4. The ‘Hard Case’ category — 306
      5. The ‘Loss of Chance’ Doctrine — 309
   B. Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 312
      1. All the parts of the harm were caused by a group of tortious defendants — 312
      2. Part of the harm caused by contributory negligence of the victim or by a non-tortious factor — 314
C. Unrealised risks of future harm — 315
D. Combination cases — 317
III. Final remarks — 318

Pierre Widmer and Bénédict Winiger

Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Switzerland — 323
I. Definition of Proportional Liability — 323
II. Categories of Proportional Liability — 325
III. Policy Considerations — 326
IV. Burden and Standard of Proof — 328
V. Category A — Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 330
   2. Sub-category A2 — ‘Market-share Liability’ — Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 331
   3. Sub-category A3 — ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ — Indeterminate Victims — 332
   4. Sub-category A4 — ‘The Hard Case’ — 333
   5. Sub-category A5 — The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 333
VI. Category B — Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 336
   1. Sub-category B1 — Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — 336
   2. Sub-category B2 — Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — 337
VII. Category C — Risks of Future Harm — 337
   1. Sub-category C1 — Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — 337
   2. Sub-category C2 — Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — 338
VIII. Category D — Combination Cases — 339
IX. Conclusions — 340

Michael D Green

Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in the US — 343
I. Burden and Standard of Proof — 343
II. The Meaning of Proportional Liability — 343
III. Scholarly Treatment of Proportional Liability in the US — 344
IV. Policy Considerations — 351
V. The Categories of Proportional Liability — 353
A. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 353
   1. Introduction — 353
   3. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 357
   4. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — 357
   5. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — 360
B. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 365
   1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — 365
   2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — 367
C. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 368
   1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — 368
   2. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — 369

List of Contributors — 371

Index — 373