Manuela Zips-Mairitsch

LOST LANDS?
(Land) Rights of the San in Botswana and the Legal Concept of Indigeneity in Africa
**Contents**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface by René Kuppe</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part 1: Indigenous Peoples in International Law</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Historical Overview</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. &quot;Indigenous Peoples&quot;: Term, Concepts, and Definitions</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differentiation from the Term “Minority”</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Special Indigenous Rights or Special Circumstances? Indigenous</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection Standards, Rights of Freedom, and Self-Determination</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Sources of Law</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Binding Norms</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.1 ILO Convention 169</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.2 UN Convention on Biological Diversity</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 “Soft law” Instruments</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1 Agenda 21, Chapter 26 (1992)</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2 UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.3 Declarations and Policies of various International Bodies</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Indigenous Rights as Part of Customary International Law</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. &quot;Sources of Life&quot;: Lands and Natural Resources</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Material Standards of Protection</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1 Cause of Action</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2 The Relationship between Indigenous Peoples and their</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Territories</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3 Collective Land Rights</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4 Scope of Indigenous Territories</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.5 Restriction of Alienation and Disposal</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Universal Human Rights Treaties</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Right of Ownership</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Right to Culture</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 Right to Private and Family Life</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I. Historical Overview ........................................... 79

II. “Indigenous Peoples in Africa”: Applying the Concept ................. 88

III. Indigenous Rights in the African Context .......................... 93
   1. Regional Indigenous Rights .................................. 94
      1.1 The African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights ........ 94
      1.2 The African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights .... 101
      1.3 The African Court on Human and Peoples’ Rights ........... 104
   2. National Indigenous Rights ................................... 110
      2.1 Selected Constitutional Guarantees ....................... 110
      2.2 Jurisdiction using the example of South Africa .......... 116
         2.2.1 The Case of the #Khomani San ...................... 117
         2.2.2 Richtersveld Case .................................. 120
         2.2.2.1 “Aboriginal Title” ................................ 122
         2.2.2.2 “Aboriginal Title” before the South African Constitutional Court ........................................ 128
         2.2.3 “Hoodia Gordonii” Case .............................. 132

Part 3: Legal Perspectives of San Communities

I. Terminology: San, “Bushmen”, Basarwa, Khoesan, N/oakwe or Kwe? .. 155

II. Historical Overview until the End of Colonial Times .................. 161
   1. Regional Historical Differences ................................ 169
      1.1 Botswana .............................................. 169
      1.2 Namibia ............................................... 172
      1.3 South Africa ......................................... 173
      1.4 The “Northern San” .................................... 174

III. Reflections on Indigenous Legal Perspectives and World Views ........ 177
Part 4: Botswana: State and Society

I. Sociopolitical History ................................................................. 187
   1. Pre-colonial Phase ............................................................. 187
   2. Protectorate Bechuanaland .............................................. 189
   3. Republic of Botswana ...................................................... 199

II. Sources of Law and Legal Pluralism ........................................... 216
   1. Constitutional Law .......................................................... 216
   2. Customary Law .............................................................. 219
   3. Common and Statutory Law ............................................. 222
   4. International Law .......................................................... 223
   5. Fundamental and Human Rights ....................................... 225

Part 5: San in Botswana

I. San as Citizens: Basarwa and/or Batswana? .................................. 237

II. Dominant Views of the San in Botswana ..................................... 241

III. Development Policies ................................................................ 246
   1. Remote Area Development Programme .............................. 246
   2. Community Based Natural Resource Management ............. 253


V. NGO Initiatives ......................................................................... 265
   1. National San NGOs ......................................................... 265
   2. Regional San NGOs ....................................................... 268

Part 6: “The Lost Lands”: Relocation from the Central Kalahari Game Reserve

I. History of the Central Kalahari Game Reserve ............................... 291

II. The Relocation of the G|wi and ||Gana (San) ............................... 305

III. The Legal Dispute over the (temporarily?) “Lost Lands” .......... 322
   1. Roy Sesana v. Government of Botswana ......................... 322
      1.1 Termination of Basic and Essential Services ............... 326
      1.2 Restoration of Basic and Essential Services .............. 328
      1.3 Lawful Occupation .................................................... 329
      1.4 Deprivation of Land Possession ............................... 332
1.5 Special Game Licences ......................................................... 337
1.6 Access to the Central Kalahari Game Reserve (CKGR) ............... 339
1.7 Conclusions ........................................................................... 343
2. Consequences of the High Court's Decision: Summary ................. 345

IV. The Legal Dispute over Access to Water ........................................ 359
1. Matsipane Mosetlhanyane, Gakenyatsiwe Matsipane & further applicants v. Attorney General of Botswana ....................... 360
2. Matsipane Mosetlhanyane & Gakenyatsiwe Matsipane v. Attorney General of Botswana, Court of Appeal ......................... 365
3. Consequences of the Courts' Decisions: Summary ....................... 369

Part 7: Conclusion........................................................................... 379

The Return of the Outlaws: An Epilogue by Werner Zips....................... 385

Appendix

Examples of Indigenous Peoples in Africa (not exhaustive!) .................... 392
Abbreviations .................................................................................. 394
Bibliography ..................................................................................... 395
(Selected) Legal Texts ....................................................................... 419
1. International Instruments ............................................................. 419
3. Court Cases ................................................................................. 423
4. Interviews .................................................................................... 424

Index of Figures ............................................................................... 425

Index ................................................................................................ 427

About the Authors ............................................................................ 431