Enforcing International Cultural Heritage Law

Edited by
FRANCESCO FRANCIONI
JAMES GORDLEY

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

List of Contributors ix
Table of Cases xiii
Table of Legislation xvii

Introduction 1

I. THE INTERNATIONAL LEGAL FRAMEWORK

1. Plurality and Interaction of Legal Orders in the Enforcement of Cultural Heritage Law 9
   I. Introduction 9
   II. Plurality of Perspectives 10
   III. Plurality and Interaction of Legal Regimes 12
   IV. Plurality and Interplay of Enforcement Mechanisms 17
   V. Interaction between Domestic Adjudication and International Enforcement 20
   VI. Conclusion 20

2. Enforcement of Restitution of Cultural Heritage through Peace Agreements 22
   I. Introduction 22
   II. Peace through Reparations 23
   III. Peace through Unity 27
   IV. Peace through Division 31
   V. Conclusion 38

3. The Role of International and Mixed Criminal Courts in the Enforcement of International Norms Concerning the Protection of Cultural Heritage 40
   I. Introduction: The Enforcement of Crimes against Cultural Heritage 40
## Contents

II. Enforcement of International Law on Cultural Heritage in Practice: The Case Law of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia 44

III. The Contemporary Significance of Cultural Heritage: Beyond State Property and Exterior Worth 55

IV. Conclusion: Taking a Lesson for the Future from the Balkan Wars 58

V. Postscript 59

4. Illicit Trade in Antiquities: A View 'From the Ground' 65
   I. Introduction 65
   II. This Way to the Mummy 66
   III. Local Impacts at Home in the United States 66
   IV. Looting in Conflict Zones 68
   V. Proactive Approaches for Site Protection in Conflict Zones 70
   VI. The Market for Illicit Antiquities 73
   VII. Conclusion 76

II. ENFORCEMENT BY DOMESTIC COURTS

5. Sovereign Immunity and the Enforcement of International Cultural Property Law 79
   I. Introduction 79
   II. Should Sovereign Immunity from Jurisdiction be Granted in Art-Recovery Suits? 81
   III. Immunity of Cultural Property from Execution: An Absolute Rule? 92
   IV. Conclusion 108

6. The Enforcement of Foreign Law: Reclaiming One Nation's Cultural Heritage in Another Nation's Courts 110
   I. Introduction 110
   II. The Enforcement of the Export Laws of One Nation in the Courts of Another 110
   III. The Repatriation of Cultural Heritage 119
   IV. Conclusion 124
## Contents

### 7. The Enforcement of Underwater Cultural Heritage by Courts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Claimants to Rights over Cultural Objects at Sea</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Domestic Courts' Arguments: A Critical Analysis</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Some Unanswered Questions</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 8. Enforcement by Domestic Courts: Criminal Law and Forfeiture in the Recovery of Cultural Objects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Types of Illegal Conduct in the Movement of Antiquities</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Legal Actions</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Shifts in Recovery Methods and Deterrent Effect: Unintended Consequences</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### III. ALTERNATIVE METHODS OF ENFORCEMENT

### 9. Plurality and Coordination of Dispute Settlement Methods in the Field of Cultural Heritage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Legal Framework for Cultural Heritage Protection</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. A Critical Appraisal of the Legal Parameters</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. The Enforcement of Cultural Heritage Law through Dispute Settlement Means</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Critical Appraisal of the Dispute Resolution Methods</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Disclosing the Judicial's Ongoing Pecchant for Culture-Sensitive Rulings</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. International Public Policy and Coordination in Dispute Settlement for the Enforcement of Cultural Heritage Law</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 10. Social Norms and Illicit Cultural Heritage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Antiquities Appearing on the Market Since 1970 are Presumed Illicit</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The Return of Illicitly Excavated Objects</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. The Culture of Antiquities Looting in the American Four Corners Region</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Conclusions</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

### 11. The Quest for the Masterpiece: Traditional Practices of Collecting in American Museums

I. Introduction 228  
II. Recently Revised Ethical Standards and Acquisition Policies 230  
III. From Ethics to Action: What Else Can Museums Do? 237


I. Introduction 240  
II. Legal Basis for the MOU 241  
III. The Signing of the MOU and Its Main Contents 244  
IV. Positive Impact on Protection of Chinese Cultural Heritage by the MOU 247  
V. Conclusion 254

*Index* 257