Reproductive Freedom, Torture and International Human Rights: Challenging the Masculinisation of Torture

Ronli Sifris
# Contents

*Foreword*  
*Dedication*  
*Acknowledgements*  
*Table of abbreviations*  

## 1 Introduction  
1 Background  
2 Scope  
   (a) Reproductive rights  
   (b) Restrictions on reproductive freedom  
3 Aims and contribution  
4 Context: the gendered nature of international law  
   (a) Working within the system  
      (i) Gender sidestreaming  
      (ii) Gender mainstreaming  
      (iii) Working within a defective system  
   (b) Challenging the system  
      (i) Examples of the gendered nature of the international legal system  
      (ii) A positive example  
5 Structure and methodology  

## 2 Overview of the prohibition of torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment  
1 The international system  
   (a) The international law approach  
   (b) The United Nations Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment of Punishment  
   (c) Customary international law  
2 The regional systems  
   (a) Europe  
      (i) European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ECHR)  

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of abbreviations</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Overview of the prohibition of torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 The international system</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The regional systems</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ECHR)</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

(i) European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (European Torture Convention) 42
(b) America 44
(c) Africa 47
3 Extension of the prohibition to encompass situations beyond the traditional detainee context 49
(a) Human Rights Committee 52
(b) Committee against Torture 55
(c) Special Rapporteur on Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment 60
4 Conclusion 61

3 Severe pain or suffering 62
1 Introduction 62
2 The meaning of an 'act' 63
3 The meaning of 'severe' 65
4 Restrictions on abortion 67
(a) Mental pain or suffering 68
(i) Restrictions on abortion cause mental pain and suffering 68
(ii) Negating post-abortion syndrome 71
(iii) The stigmatising effect of restrictions on abortion 75
(b) Physical pain or suffering 77
(i) The physical effects of unsafe abortion 77
(ii) The link between safety and legality 79
(iii) The pain and suffering of childbirth 81
5 Involuntary sterilisation 83
(a) Mental pain or suffering 83
(i) Mental pain and suffering caused by infertility 83
(ii) Mental pain and suffering caused by involuntary sterilisation 86
(b) Physical pain or suffering 89
(i) The literal approach 89
(ii) The broad approach 91
6 Conclusion 95

4 Intentionally 97
1 Introduction 97
2 The meaning of 'intentionally' in article 1 of CAT 98
(a) 'Intentionally' excludes negligent conduct 98
(b) Distinction between 'intention' and 'negligence' under domestic law 99
(c) Broad conceptualisation of 'intention' pursuant to article 1 of CAT 102
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 Doctrine of double effect</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Conclusion</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Purpose: discrimination</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Restrictions on abortion</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Legal context</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Social context</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Legislative purpose</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) Legislative impact</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Involuntary sterilisation</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Involuntary sterilisation as discrimination against women</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Discrimination within the feminist movement</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Case studies</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) China</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Peru</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) Roma (Czech Republic)</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Conclusion</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Public official</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Direct state responsibility</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Restrictions on abortion</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Involuntary sterilisation</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Indirect state responsibility</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Gendered dimension of the public/private distinction</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) International position</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Application of the 'due diligence' requirement to torture and CIDT in international human rights law</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approach of the HRC</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional approach</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Interpretation of the 'public official' requirement in CAT</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAT Committee decisions</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General comments</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concluding observations</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Conclusion</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 'Powerlessness'</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Additional requirement of 'powerlessness'?</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Approach under CAT</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Intimate partner violence and rape: examples of 'powerlessness' from a gendered perspective</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Intimate partner violence</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contents</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Torture, inhuman or degrading treatment?</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Current approach to conceptualising restrictions on reproductive freedom as torture or CIDT</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Restrictions on abortion</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Involuntary sterilisation</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 A normative approach</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Fear of dilution</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Most appropriate category</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Conclusion</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Conclusion</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Summary</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Overview</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Torture</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Restrictions on abortion</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Involuntary sterilisation</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Torture or CIDT?</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Directions for future research</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 A final word</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Selected bibliography** 272

**Index** 303