Remedial Secession
A Right to External Self-Determination
as a Remedy to Serious Injustices?

SIMONE F. VAN DEN DRIEST
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements vii
List of Abbreviations xv

Chapter I
Introduction 1

1. Balancing Order and Justice: External Self-Determination after Serious Injustices? 1
   1.1. The Contentious Issue of Unilateral Secession 1
   1.2. Unilateral Secession and Self-Determination 3
   1.3. Unilateral Secession as a Remedial Right? 4
2. The Approach of this Study 5
   2.1. Defining (Unilateral) Secession and Remedial Secession 5
   2.2. Principal Research Question 8
   2.3. Structure and Methodology 8

Chapter II
Self-Determination: The Development from Principle to Right 13

1. Introduction 13
2. The Emergence of the Principle of Self-Determination 14
   2.1. Democratic Political Theory 14
   2.2. Ethnic Nationalism 15
   2.3. Liberal Nationalism 16
3. Self-Determination Before the Second World War 16
   3.1. Lenin's Conception of Self-Determination 17
   3.2. Wilson's Conception of Self-Determination 18
   3.3. Self-Determination in the Wake of the First World War 21
   3.4. The Åland Islands Case 24
4. Self-Determination in the Post-War Era 26
   4.1. The Charter of the United Nations 27
   4.2. The Decolonization Process 29
Table of Contents

4.2.1. The Meaning of Self-Determination in the Context of Decolonization 29
4.2.2. The Subjects and Legal Status of Self-Determination in the Context of Decolonization 31

5. Conclusions 35

Chapter III
The Contemporary Meaning of the Right to Self-Determination 37

1. Introduction 37
2. Self-Determination as a Continuous Entitlement 39
   2.1. The International Human Rights Covenants of 1966 39
   2.2. The Friendly Relations Declaration 43
   2.3. Subsequent Documents 46
3. Internal Self-Determination 50
   3.1. The Content of the Right to Internal Self-Determination 50
      3.1.1. Implementation of the Right to Internal Self-Determination 51
      3.1.2. Internal Self-Determination and Democratic Governance? 54
   3.2. The Status of the Right to Internal Self-Determination 60
   3.3. The Subjects of the Right to Internal Self-Determination 64
      3.3.1. All Inhabitants of a State 65
      3.3.2. Subgroups within States 66
      3.3.3. Minorities 70
      3.3.4. Indigenous Peoples 76
   3.4. Conclusions on Internal Self-Determination 83
4. External Self-Determination 84
   4.1. The Content of the Right to External Self-Determination 84
      4.1.1. Dissolution 85
      4.1.2. (Re)union or Merger 86
      4.1.3. Secession 87
      4.1.4. Dissolution and Secession: A Blurred Distinction 89
   4.2. The Status and Subjects of the Right to External Self-Determination 92
   4.3. Conclusions on External Self-Determination 94
5. Conclusions 94

Chapter IV
Traces of a (Remedial) Right to Unilateral Secession in Contemporary International Law? 97

1. Introduction 97
2. Recognizing a (Remedial) Right to Unilateral Secession? 99
2.1. Traces of a (Remedial) Right to Unilateral Secession in International Conventions 99

2.2. Traces of a (Remedial) Right to Unilateral Secession in Doctrine 103
   2.2.1. The Content of a (Remedial) Right to Unilateral Secession 107
   2.2.2. The Subjects of a (Remedial) Right to Unilateral Secession 115
   2.2.3. Contraindications 117
   2.2.4. Conclusions on Doctrine 121

2.3. Traces of a (Remedial) Right to Unilateral Secession in Judicial Decisions and Opinions 121
   2.3.1. The Åland Islands Case 123
   2.3.2. Katangese Peoples' Congress v. Zaire 128
   2.3.3. Loizidou v. Turkey 129
   2.3.4. Reference re Secession of Quebec 131
   2.3.5. Kevin Ngwanga Gumne et al. v. Cameroon 138
   2.3.6. Accordance with International Law of the Unilateral Declaration of Independence by the Provisional Institutions of Self-Government of Kosovo 140
      2.3.6.1. Background of the Case 141
      2.3.6.2. The Advisory Opinion 144
      2.3.6.3. Individual Opinions of Judges on a Right to Remedial Secession 149
   2.3.7. Conclusions on Judicial Decisions and Opinions 155

2.4. Traces of a (Remedial) Right to Unilateral Secession in General Principles of (International) Law 155
   2.4.1. The Principle of Respect for the Territorial Integrity of States 157
      2.4.1.1. The Content of the Principle of Territorial Integrity 158
      2.4.1.2. The Principle of Territorial Integrity and the Right to Self-Determination 159
      2.4.1.3. A Balancing Approach 165
      2.4.1.4. Conclusions on the Principle of Territorial Integrity 167
   2.4.2. The Principle of Uti Possidetis Juris 168
      2.4.2.1. The Content of the Principle of Uti Possidetis Juris 168
      2.4.2.2. The Applicability of the Principle of Uti Possidetis Juris 170
      2.4.2.3. The Principle of Uti Possidetis Juris and the Right to Self-Determination 174
      2.4.2.4. Conclusions on the Principle of Uti Possidetis Juris 175
   2.4.3. The Principle of Self-Determination 175
   2.4.4. Conclusions on General Principles of (International) Law 177

2.5. Traces of a (Remedial) Right to Unilateral Secession in Other Possible Sources of International Law 178
### Table of Contents

2.5.1. Unilateral Acts of States 179  
2.5.2. Acts of International Organizations 181  
2.5.3. Conclusions on Other Possible Sources of International Law 185  

3. Conclusions 186

#### Chapter V

**Customary International Law: Preliminary Remarks on Assessing the Existence of a Customary Right to Remedial Secession** 189  

1. Introduction 189  
2. The Two Conventional Elements of Customary International Law 190  
   2.1. State Practice 193  
   2.1.1. Uniformity 196  
   2.1.2. Extensiveness and Representativeness 197  
   2.1.3. Duration 199  
   2.1.4. The Interrelationship of the Three Factors 201  
   2.2. *Opinio Juris* 201  
3. Customary International Law beyond the Conventional Model? 206  
   3.1. Progressive Approaches towards Customary International Law 208  
   3.2. A Critical Appraisal 213  
5. Conclusions 221

#### Chapter VI

**A Customary Right to Remedial Secession?** 223  

1. Introduction 223  
2. The Recognition of States: a Brief Introduction 224  
   2.1. The Constitutive and Declaratory Approach 226  
   2.2. Recognition and Unilateral Secession 230  
   3.1. The Case of Kosovo 233  
   3.1.1. General Responses to Kosovo’s Declaration of Independence 234  
   3.1.1.1. Recapitulation 243  
   3.1.2. The Advisory Proceedings before the International Court of Justice 245  
   3.1.2.1. Support for the Existence of a Right to Remedial Secession 245  
   3.1.2.1.1. Views and Arguments Supporting a Right to Remedial Secession 245  
   3.1.2.1.2. Recapitulation 259
3.1.2.2. Opposition to the Existence of a Right to Remedial Secession 261
   3.1.2.2.1. Views and Arguments Opposing the Existence of a Right to Remedial Secession 261
   3.1.2.2.2. Recapitulation 272
3.1.3. Conclusions on the International Responses to Kosovo’s Declaration of Independence 273

3.2. Other Cases 275
   3.2.1. Bangladesh 276
   3.2.2. Eritrea 279
   3.2.3. The Baltic Republics (and the Other Successor States to the USSR) 280
   3.2.4. Croatia and Slovenia (and the Other Successor States to the SFRY) 284
   3.2.5. Conclusions on the International Responses to Other Cases 289

4. Legal Appraisal of International Responses to Attempts at Unilateral Secession: State Practice and Opinio Juris 290
   4.1. State Practice 290
   4.2. Opinio Juris 292
   4.3. Taking Stock: A Customary Right to Remedial Secession? 294

5. Conclusions 295

Chapter VII
Recapitulation, Conclusions, and Final Reflections 297

1. Introduction 297
2. A Right to Remedial Secession? 297
   2.1. The Development of the Right to Self-Determination 298
   2.2. The Contemporary Meaning of the Right to Self-Determination 299
   2.3. Traces of a Right to Remedial Secession in Contemporary International Law 301
   2.4. Preliminary Remarks on Assessing the Existence of a Customary Right to Remedial Secession 306
   2.5. A Customary Right to Remedial Secession? 307
   2.6. Conclusions on a Right to Remedial Secession De Lege Lata and De Lege Ferenda 310
      2.6.1. A Right to Remedial Secession De Lege Lata 310
      2.6.2. A Right to Remedial Secession De Lege Ferenda 311
3. Final Reflections on Remedial Secession 313
   3.1. Effectuating Remedial Secession through Recognition? 313
3.2. Remedial Secession and the Humanization of the International Legal Order 314

Samenvatting 321
Bibliography 339
Index 373
Curriculum Vitae 383