Free Trade and Cultural Diversity in International Law

Jingxia Shi
# Contents

**Foreword**  
**Acknowledgements**  
**Table of GATT/WTO Reports and Rulings**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1  Introduction: Globalisation as the Context</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Globalisation and Culture</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Globalisation and Trade</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Raising the Issue: Globalisation, Culture and Trade</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.1 The Conflicting Conceptions about Trade and Culture</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.2 Three 'Duals'—Dual Nature, Dual Legislators and Dual Systems</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 The Structure of the Book</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2  Culture and Cultures in Comparative Perspectives: Towards a Synthesis</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Humanist: Culture as 'The Best of Everything'</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 An Anthropological View: We Are Our Culture</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Culture as Identity: Centering on Identity Crisis</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 On Identity and Cultural Identity</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 The Collectivity of Identity: Linking Culture with Nation Building</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.3 Culture and Identity Crisis</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Culture as Commerce: The Perspective of Cultural Economic Interests</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1 The US as the Advocate of the Commerce Argument</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2 An Appraisal of the Root of the Issue</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Culture as Human Rights: Revisiting Cultural Rights</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.1 The Hallmarks of Universalism and Cultural Relativism</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.1.1 Universalism</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.1.2 Cultural Relativism</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2 A Critique of Universalism and Cultural Relativism</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3 Reconciling Human Rights with Cultural Diversity</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3.1 The Necessity to Reconcile Human Rights with Cultural Diversity</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3.2 The Reconcilability of Human Rights with Cultural Norms</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3.3 The Strategies to Reconcile Human Rights with Cultural Norms</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.4 The Margin of Appreciation Doctrine in Reconciling Universalism and Cultural Relativism</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.7 Culture as Resource: A Sustainability Perspective

2.7.1 Culture as Resource 43
2.7.2 Culture as Resource and Sustainable Development 44

2.8 Chapter Recap and Further Reflections

2.8.1 From Humanist to Anthropological Notions of Culture 47
2.8.2 Culture-as-Identity versus Culture-as-Commerce 47
2.8.3 Culture as Human Rights and Culture as Resource 48
2.8.4 Towards an Integrated Concept of Culture? 49

3 Domestic Cultural Policy and Measures: The Case of the Audiovisual Sector

3.1 Introduction 51

3.2 An Overview of Cultural Policies and Measures 53
3.2.1 Two Polar Views on Cultural Policymaking 54
3.2.2 Justifying Government Intervention in Cultural Matters 56
3.2.2.1 The Duality of Cultural Products 57
3.2.2.2 The Dual Mission of Cultural Policies and Measures 58
3.2.2.3 Public Goods and Externalities Theory 59
3.2.3 The Changing Landscape of Technology and its Impact on Culture Policymaking 62

3.3 Foreign Ownership Restriction 64
3.3.1 Domestic Legislations on Foreign Ownership Restriction 65
3.3.2 Disputes Arising from Foreign Ownership Restrictions 67
3.3.2.1 The Polygram Case 68
3.3.2.2 Borders Case 68

3.4 Local Content Regulations 70
3.4.1 Import Quotas 70
3.4.2 Screen Quotas 71

3.5 Subsidies and Tax Concessions 74
3.5.1 Subsidies and Tax Concessions in Several Countries 74
3.5.2 The Effectiveness of Subsidies and Tax Concessions 75

3.6 Other Cultural Policies and Measures 76
3.6.1 Government Censorship or Content Review 76
3.6.2 Copyright Protection Mechanism and Culture Policymaking 77
3.6.3 Film Co-Production Arrangement 79

3.7 Protective Policies versus Efficient Regulation? 80
3.7.1 From the Perspective of Cultural Specificity 81
3.7.2 From the Perspective of Trade Obligations 82
3.7.3 An Effectiveness Perspective 83

3.8 Conclusion 85

4 UNESCO and Cultural Diversity: Theories and Approaches 87

4.1 Introduction 87
4.2 Historicism, Anthropology and UNESCO’S Conception of Culture 88
  4.2.1 Historicism 88
  4.2.2 The Anthropological Notion of Culture 90
4.3 Cultural Diversity: A Core Concept of UNESCO 93
4.4 UNESCO’S Undertakings on Culture and Cultural Diversity: An Overview 95
4.5 Culture and Development 97
  4.5.1 Sustainable Development: Pairing Cultural Diversity with Biodiversity 98
  4.5.2 The Role of Culture in Development 100
4.6 Culture and Globalisation 101
4.7 The UNESCO Convention Cultural Diversity 105
  4.7.1 The Background of the Convention and Dynamics of the UNESCO Negotiation 105
    4.7.1.1 Two Rationales for Negotiating and Adopting the UNESCO Convention 106
    4.7.1.2 The Negotiation Dynamics of the UNESCO Convention 107
  4.7.2 The Scope and Subject Matter of the Convention 110
  4.7.3 The Imbalance between the Parties’ Rights and Obligations 112
  4.7.4 Dispute Settlement Mechanism 114
  4.7.5 A Preliminary Assessment of the Convention 115
4.8 Conclusion 117

5 The Treatment of Culture in the GATT/WTO (I): Theoretical and Legislative Framework 119
5.1 Introduction 119
5.2 Comparative Advantage Theory and its Application to Cultural Products 121
  5.2.1 The Theory of ‘Comparative Advantage’ Underlying Free Trade Regimes 121
  5.2.2 ‘Comparative Advantage’ Applied to Cultural Products 123
5.3 An Institutional Evolution and a Shift in Telos 125
  5.3.1 A Historical Narrative: From GATT to WTO 125
  5.3.2 The Transformation of the Telos 128
5.4 Trade in Cultural Goods: GATT Article IV and its Legacy 129
  5.4.1 The Origin and Background of Article IV 130
  5.4.2 The Scope of Article IV: Is an Evolutionary Interpretation Feasible? 131
  5.4.3 The Legacy Value of Article IV 133
5.5 Trade in Cultural Services: An Observation on the Audiovisual Sector 134
5.5.1 Understanding the Schism: A Tale of Two Histories 134
5.5.2 A Compromise: Agreement to Disagree 135
5.5.3 The Treatment of the Audiovisual Service under the GATS 137
5.5.4 Doha Services Negotiation: Culture Has Not Been a Focal Point 138

5.6 General Exception Clauses 139
5.6.1 Public Morals Exception 140
5.6.2 Securing Compliance with Laws or Regulations 142
5.6.3 National Treasures of Artistic, Historic or Archaeological Value 145
5.6.4 The Chapeau of General Exceptions: An Emerging Jurisprudence? 146

5.7 Trade Remedy Measures Which May Involve Cultural Products 148
5.7.1 Anti-dumping 148
5.7.2 Subsidies 150
5.7.3 Safeguard Mechanism (or the Escape Clause) 152

5.8 The Treatment of Culture in Emerging Areas 153
5.8.1 Investment 154
5.8.2 Telecommunication and Audiovisual Services 155
5.8.3 Intellectual Property Rights Protection and Culture Diversity 155
5.8.4 Geographical Indications (GIs) and Culture Protection 157

5.9 Concluding Remarks 159

6 The Treatment of Culture under the GATT/WTO (II): Case Study and Identification of Problems 161
6.1 Introduction 161
6.2 A Brief Account of GATT/WTO Dispute Settlement 162
6.3 Canada—Periodicals 164
6.3.1 The Case Background and a Procedural Posture 164
6.3.2 Lessons from Canada—Periodicals 166
6.4 China—Publications and Audiovisual Products 168
6.4.1 Case Background and China's Audiovisual Sectors 168
6.4.2 A Procedural Posture and the Summary of Case Decisions 170
6.5 How Likely is a Party to Invoke UNESCO Instruments as a General Cultural Defence? 175
6.6 Applying the 'Public Morals' Exception to Cultural Products 177
6.6.1 The Availability of GATT Article XX(a) as China's Defense 177
6.6.1.1 The Parties’ Arguments and DSB’s Findings Based on Different Approaches 177
6.6.1.2 A Commentary on the Availability Issue 179
6.6.2 Applying Article XX(a) to China's Measures 180
6.6.2.1 The Concept of 'Public Morals' 180
6.6.2.2 The Parties' Arguments on the 'Necessity' Test 182
6.6.2.3 The Analytical Approach to the 'Necessity' Test under Article XX(a) 183
6.6.2.4 The Key Elements of the 'Necessity' Test 183
6.7 Distinguishing Cultural Goods from Cultural Services 185
6.7.1 Identifying the Issue and its Associated Difficulties 186
6.7.2 The Practice of WTO Tribunals 188
6.7.3 The Overlap of the GATT and the GATS in Application to Cultural Products 191
6.8 Factoring Cultural Elements into Deciding the 'Likeness' of Cultural Products 193
6.8.1 GATT/WTO's General Jurisprudence on 'Like Products' 194
6.8.2 'Like Products' Analysis in Canada—Periodicals 196
6.8.3 'Like Products' Analysis in China—Publications and Audiovisual Products 198
6.8.3.1 Reading Materials 198
6.8.3.2 Sound Recordings Intended for Electronic Distribution 200
6.8.3.3 A Commentary: Factoring Cultural Elements into Deciding the 'Likeness' via the Traditional Route Establishing 'Like Products' 202
6.8.4 The 'Aim and Effect' Approach: Another Possibility of Factoring Cultural Elements into Deciding 'Likeness'? 205
6.9 Concluding Remarks 210

7 Culture under Regional Agreements: The Perspectives from the EC/EU and NAFTA 213
7.1 Introduction 213
7.2 The European Community/European Union 214
7.2.1 Culture in the EC/EU: A Unique Situation 215
7.2.2 Culture Clause in the EC Treaty: Article 151 217
7.2.3 Culture in the EC Directives: From TVWF to AVMS 220
7.2.3.1 TVWF 220
7.2.3.2 AVMS: An Improvement to Promote Cultural Diversity? 224
7.2.4 The ECJ and Cultural Diversity 227
7.2.5 A Preliminary Remark on the Cultural Protection in the EC/EU 231
7.3 NAFTA 232
7.3.1 Cultural Exception in NAFTA and Associated Problems 233
Contents

7.3.2 CMT Case: An Unwillingness to Resort to the NAFTA Cultural Exception? 235
7.3.3 UPS Case: A Promising Sign to Use Cultural Exception? 237
7.4 The Interface between Regional and Global Trade Agreements: The Issue of Forum Shopping, Among Others 239
7.5 Further Observations 241

8 Reform Proposals for the Culture and Trade Quandary 245
8.1 Introduction 245
8.2 A Recap of the Interaction between Trade and Culture 247
  8.2.1 On the Specificity of Cultural Products 247
  8.2.2 On the Dynamics and Openness of Culture 248
  8.2.3 On Cultural Diversity and Trade Liberalisation 250
8.3 Designing WTO-Compatible Domestic Policy Measures 251
  8.3.1 The Challenges in Designing Domestic Cultural Policy Measures 252
  8.3.2 A Guiding Principle: Distinguishing Cultural Protection from Cultural Protectionism 254
  8.3.3 Designing WTO-Compatible Domestic Cultural Policy Measures 257
8.4 Searching for Solutions within the Trade System 259
  8.4.1 Exempting Cultural Products from General Trade Rules 260
  8.4.2 Requesting Waiver for Cultural Policy Measures 263
  8.4.3 Other Options 266
  8.4.4 Towards a Jurisprudence of ‘Jus Gentium of International Trade’? 267
8.5 The Relationship between the UNESCO Convention and WTO Agreements 270
  8.5.1 A Background Note: Norm Integration in International Law 270
  8.5.2 Norm Integration versus Authority Integration: The Case of the WTO and UNESCO 271
  8.5.3 The Relationship between the UNESCO Convention and the WTO Rules 274
    8.5.3.1 An Overview of the Relationship Prescribed in the UNESCO Convention 274
    8.5.3.2 ‘Mutual Supportiveness’ in Article 20(1) 275
    8.5.3.3 When the Issue Gets Tough: Article 20(2) 277
8.6 Connecting WTO Rules with the UNESCO Convention: The Perspective of Dispute Settlement 278
  8.6.1 Identifying the Legal Basis for Linking WTO Rules with the UNESCO Convention 279
  8.6.2 Connecting WTO Rules with the UNESCO Convention under VCLT Article 31(1) 280