CONTENTS

Acknowledgments xii

Introduction 1

1 The global spread of proportionality and some analytical similarities with balancing 10
   The spread of proportionality 10
   Resistance to proportionality 14
   Analytical similarities between balancing and proportionality 16

2 History 24
   The origins of proportionality in German administrative law 24
      Proportionality and Rechtsstaat 25
      Judicial review and the development of the principle of proportionality 26
      Proportionality, natural law, and formalism 28
      Conclusion 32
   The origins of balancing in American constitutional jurisprudence 32
      Balancing as a critique of formalism and Langdellianism 33
      Langdellianism 33
      Balancing as anti-Langdellianism 34
      Progressive balancing in constitutional law: balancing and anti-formalism in constitutional law 37
      Lochnerism 37
      Balancing as anti-Lochnerism 38
      Progressive balancing during the McCarthy era 41
      Conclusion 43

3 Culture 44
   The German communitarian and organic conception of the state 44
      Proportionality as an intrinsic element of the communitarian and organic conception of the state 49
   The American individualistic and suspicion-based conception of the state 52
      The suspicion-based conception of the state and balancing 57
CONTENTS

Pragmatic versus conceptual balancing 58
Political culture and the expansiveness of rights 60

4 Impact, intent, and indifference 64
Impact-based and intent-based constitutional models:
the ideal types 64
The European impact-based model 64
The American intent-based model 66
Impact-based and intent-based: exceptions 71
Intent-based: indifferent infringement of the Constitution 73
Two illustrations: Minnesota v. Barber and the indifferent bomber 73
Indifference in experimental philosophy: the Knobe Effect 76
Possible objections 78

5 Epistemology 82
Rules and standards in the USA 82
American epistemological skepticism 82
Epistemological skepticism and rules and standards 85
Epistemological skepticism and rules 85
Epistemological skepticism and standards: balancing and minimalism 87
European epistemological optimism 90
Epistemological optimism and standards 91
Proportionality and epistemological optimism 92
Balancing, proportionality, and control 94
Vertical and horizontal control 95
The size of the system and docket: America versus Israel 97
Supreme Court coherency 100

6 Justification and authority 103
A functional accounting for the spread of proportionality 104
Early legal development 104
Pluralism and conflict management 106
A global community of judges and lingua franca 109
Judicial power 110
Culture of justification and culture of authority 111
Division of labor and “black holes” 113
The meaning of rights 118
The role of text and interpretation 119
Finality and the limits of reason 120
Pluralist versus substantive/deliberative democracy 121
The historical roots of the culture of justification 122
The impact of legal culture on balancing and proportionality 126
The administratization of constitutional law 129
7  **The effects of proportionality**  133
   "Race to the top"  134
   The German baggage of proportionality  136
      Canada  139
      Israel  142
      Canada and Israel: foreign law citation  146
   Common law baggage? Some objections  148
   Proportionality's doctrinal imperialism  150

*Conclusion*  153

*Index*  159