Dependent Archipelagos in the Law of the Sea

By

Sophia Kopela
Contents

Preface and Acknowledgements ................................................................. xv
List of Abbreviations .................................................................................. xix
List of Figures ............................................................................................. xxi

Introduction ................................................................................................. 1
  I. Archipelagos, the Archipelagic Concept and the Law of the Sea
     Convention ............................................................................................... 1
  II. Dependent Coastal and Outlying Archipelagos: Definitional
      Aspects ..................................................................................................... 4
  III. The Scope and Structure of the Book .................................................... 7

Chapter One  The Development of the Archipelagic Concept in
International Law of the Sea: From Straight Baselines to the
Archipelagic Regime of the Law of the Sea Convention ................................ 11
  1.1 Introduction ......................................................................................... 11
  1.2 Proposals and Evolution of the Archipelagic Concept Prior
      to the Third UN Conference on the Law of the Sea ............................... 12
      A. Early Proposals Regarding the Treatment of Archipelagos
         in International Law .............................................................................. 12
      B. The Impact of the Fisheries Case upon the Evolution
         of the Archipelagic Concept ............................................................... 14
      C. Proposals and Discussions on Archipelagos in the
         Aftermath of the Fisheries Case .......................................................... 16
         I. Straight Baselines and Outlying and Coastal
            Archipelagos in the Discussions of the ILC ................................... 16
         II. Straight Baselines and Archipelagos during
             UNCLOS I ....................................................................................... 18
         III. The Regime of Enclosed Waters in the
              Discussions of the ILC ad UNCLOS I ............................................ 20
         IV. Special Treatment of Archipelagos on the Basis of
            Historic Reasons in UNCLOS II ...................................................... 22
      D. Factors Impeding the Acceptance of a Special Regime
         for Outlying Archipelagos: An Interplay of Geographic
         and Political Considerations .............................................................. 23
1.3 Archipelagos and the Third UN Conference on the Law of the Sea ................................................................. 25
   A. Political Developments Influencing UNCLOS III ............... 25
   B. Outlying Archipelagos and the Archipelagic Regime Adopted in UNCLOS III .............................................. 28
      I. Distinction on the Basis of the Political Status of Archipelagos ................................................................. 30
      II. Conditions for the Application of the Archipelagic Regime: Archipelagic Definition vs. Quantitative Requirements ......................................................................................... 38
      III. The Archipelagic Regime: A Regime to Satisfy Conflicting Interests .............................................................. 42
1.4 Concluding Remarks: The Application of the Archipelagic Concept in the LOSC: Gains and Losses ......................... 49

Chapter Two The Application of Straight Baselines on the Basis of Article 7 LOSC and State Practice: Implications for Coastal Archipelagos ......................................................................................... 53
2.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................................................................... 53
2.2 Article 7 LOSC and Application of Straight Baselines in Localities where there is a ‘Fringe of Islands along the Coast in Its Immediate Vicinity’ ........................................................................... 54
   A. Rationale and Objectives for the Application of Straight Baselines to ‘Fringes of Islands’ ........................................... 54
   B. Conditions for the Application of Article 7 to ‘Fringes of Islands along the Coast in Its Immediate Vicinity’ .................... 56
      I. ‘Fringe of Islands’ .............................................................................................................................................. 56
         a. Background ....................................................................................................................................... 56
         b. Islands vs Article 121 (3) LOSC Rocks ......................................................................................... 57
         c. Number of Islands ......................................................................................................................... 60
         d. Compactness of the Group: Distances between the Islands ................................................................. 61
      II. The Relationship between the Coast and the Fringe of Islands: ‘Along the Coast in Its Immediate Vicinity’ .................. 61
      III. Conditions Regarding the Application of the Straight Baselines System per se .................................................. 63
         a. Article 7 (2–5) LOSC .................................................................................................................... 63
         b. Maximum Length of Straight Baselines ...................................................................................... 66
      IV. Some Guidance from International Courts and Tribunals .................................................................................... 66
C. Coastal Archipelagos and Article 7 LOSC ........................................ 70
   I. 'Fringe of Islands' vs Coastal Archipelagos ................................ 70
   II. Coast and Coastal Archipelagos ............................................. 72

2.3 The Provision, the Most (mis)used? Reflections on State Practice
with an Emphasis on Coastal Archipelagos ..................................... 73

A. Using Straight Baselines in the Case of a Few Off-Lying
   Islands: From Rationalisation Technique to Expansion
   of Coastal Jurisdiction ................................................................... 74

B. Using Straight Baselines in the Case of Coastal Archipelagos:
   Protection of Vulnerable Maritime Areas ...................................... 76
   I. Chile – Chilean Archipelago ...................................................... 77
   II. Finland – Aaland Archipelago .................................................. 77
   III. United Kingdom – Outer Hebrides .......................................... 78
   IV. Guinea-Bissau – Bijagos (Bissagos) Archipelago ...................... 79
   V. Canada – Canadian Arctic Archipelago .................................... 79
   VI. Myanmar – Mergui Archipelago .............................................. 81
   VII. Thailand – Ko Samui Archipelago .......................................... 82
   VIII. Italy – Tuscany Archipelago ............................................... 83
   IX. Honduras – Islas de La Bahia (Bay Islands) ............................ 83
   X. Russian Federation ............................................................... 84

2.4 The Contemporary Relevance of Straight Baselines in Coasts
   Fringed with Islands ..................................................................... 86

A. Application of Straight Baselines and Impact
   on Maritime Space .......................................................................... 86
   I. (External) Extension of Coastal State Jurisdiction ...................... 86
   II. (Internal) Extension of Coastal State Jurisdiction:
       The Status of Enclosed Waters ................................................. 89

B. Interpretation of Article 7 LOSC on the Basis of Subsequent
   State Practice and the Significance of Precedents ......................... 93

2.5 Concluding Remarks: Reconsideration of the Rationale
   of Article 7 and Coastal Archipelagos .......................................... 97

Chapter Three Dependent Outlying Archipelagos: Straight Baselines,
   the LOSC and State Practice ......................................................... 99

3.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 99

3.2 Potential Application of Straight Baselines on the Basis of the
   Law of the Sea Convention to Dependent Outlying
   Archipelagos ................................................................................ 100

A. Article 7 of the LOSC: 'Fringes of Islands' and Outlying
   Archipelagos ................................................................................ 100
I. Conditions for the Identification of Groups of Islands Qualifying for the Application of Straight Baselines
(Article 7 Paragraph 1 of the LOSC) .................................. 103
   a. The Relevance of the Size of the Islands of the Group .................................. 103
   b. The Relationship between the Coast of the Main Island and the Rest of the Islands of the Group: Fringe and Masking Criterion .......................... 104

II. Conditions Regarding the Application of the Straight Baselines Systems per se .................................. 105

   B. Article 10 of the LOSC: Islands Forming Juridical Bays .......................... 106

   3.3 Practice of States in Outlying Archipelagos .................................. 112

   A. The Practice of Continental States Applying a Special System for the Measurement of the Maritime Zones of Their
       Outlying Archipelagos .................................. 112

   I. Archipelagos Dominated by One or Two Large Islands .......................... 113
       a. Kerguelen Islands – France .................................. 117
       b. Svalbard Archipelago – Norway .......................... 118
       c. Sjælland and Laesø Islands – Denmark .......................... 120
       d. Furneaux Group – Australia .................................. 121
       e. Falkland Islands – United Kingdom .................................. 122
       f. Guadeloupe – France .................................. 124

   II. Archipelagos with Similarly Sized Islands or Islands Located in a Random Way .................................. 124
       a. Galapagos Islands – Ecuador .................................. 125
       b. Faroe Islands – Denmark .................................. 126
       c. Houtman Abrolhos Islands – Australia .................................. 127
       d. Canary Islands – Spain .................................. 127
       e. Balearic Islands – Spain .................................. 130
       f. Azores and Madeira Islands – Portugal .......................... 131
       g. Turks and Caicos Islands – United Kingdom .................................. 132
       h. Loyalty Islands (New Caledonia) – France .................................. 134
       i. Kong Karls Land (Svalbard) – Norway .......................... 134
       j. Dahlak Archipelago – Eritrea .................................. 135
       k. Sudan .................................. 136
       l. Co Co Islands and Preparis Islands – Myanmar .................................. 136
       m. Andaman and Nicobar Islands – Lakshadweep Islands – India .................................. 137
       n. Paracel Islands – China .................................. 138
       o. Iran, Syria and United Arab Emirates .................................. 139
Chapter Five  The Archipelagic Concept and Special Customary and Historic Rights: Three Case Studies  .............................................................. 191
5.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 191
5.2 Some Introductory Remarks on Special Customary/Historic Rights ......................................................................................... 192
5.3 The Faroe Islands ......................................................................... 195
5.4 The Galapagos Islands .................................................................. 200
5.5 The Canadian Arctic Archipelago .................................................. 207
   A. Historic Waters Based on Title Acquired and Transferred to Canada by the Inuit ................................................................. 209
   B. Historic Waters and the Exercise of Sovereign Authority ......... 211
      I. Activities Manifesting Sovereign Intention .............................. 211
      II. Canadian Legislation Related to the Arctic Archipelago .......... 214
      III. Assertion of the Claim via Statements of Canadian Governmental Officials ............................................................... 217
      IV. The Reaction of Other States: Critical Time for the Establishment of the Historic Title and Acquiescence ......... 220
   C. Weighing Strengths and Weaknesses in an Historical Context ......................................................................................... 225
5.6 Conclusion ..................................................................................... 226

Chapter Six  Legitimacy of the Archipelagic Regime and Future Developments ...................................................................................... 229
6.1 Introduction ..................................................................................... 229
6.2 Contemporary Relevance of the Archipelagic Regime: Part IV of the LOSC and Dependent Outlying Archipelagos ...................... 230
   A. The Archipelagic Concept and the Element of Statehood ......... 230
      I. Legal Definition of Archipelagos according to the LOSC .. 230
      II. Statehood as a Means of Distinguishing Archipelagos ....... 230
      III. Self-Governing and Non-Self-Governing Archipelagic Territories as 'Quasi' Archipelagic States .......................... 234
   B. Reasons for the Application of the Archipelagic Regime in Terms of Needs and Interests and the Exclusive Economic Zone ...................................................................................... 236
      I. Economic Considerations ......................................................... 236
      II. Protection of the Marine Environment ...................................... 237
      III. Issues Related to Internal and External Security ................. 240
      IV. Psychological and Symbolic Reasons ...................................... 242
C. An Answer to the 'Proliferation of Claims' Argument:
   Is the Archipelagic Regime a Threat to Other States? .......... 243
      I. Freedom of Navigation and Overflight and Other Uses of
         Sea Exercised in the High Seas .................................. 243
      II. Rights of States Neighbouring an Archipelago .............. 245

6.3 Application of the Archipelagic Regime to Archipelagic
   Dependencies: Potential and Implications .......................... 247
      A. Canary Islands ...................................................... 247
      B. French Polynesia .................................................... 252

6.4 Conclusion .................................................................... 255

Conclusion ........................................................................ 257
      I. The Manifestation of the Archipelagic Concept in International
         Law of the Sea ............................................................ 257
      II. Straight and Archipelagic Baselines, Accommodation of
         Conflicting Interests and the Legitimacy of the Archipelagic
         Concept ......................................................................... 261

Appendix .......................................................................... 265
Bibliography ....................................................................... 291
Index .............................................................................. 315