Administrative Law in Context

SECOND EDITION

Edited by

Colleen M. Flood
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Lorne Sossin
Osgoode Hall Law School

<adminlawincontext.emp.ca>

2013
EMOND MONTGOMERY PUBLICATIONS
TORONTO, CANADA
Table of Contents

Foreword to the Second Edition ............................................................... iii
Foreword to the First Edition ................................................................. v
Preface ..................................................................................................... vii
Table of Cases .......................................................................................... xix
List of Contributors ................................................................................. xxxiii

Chapter One  An Introduction to Administrative Law: Some History and
a Few Signposts for a Twisted Path ......................................................... 1
Colleen M. Flood and Jennifer Dolling

I. Introduction .......................................................................................... 2

PART 1: THE ORIGINS OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

II. In the Beginning .................................................................................. 3

III. The Constitution ................................................................................ 4

IV. The Expansion of Government .......................................................... 5
   A. The Early Years: 1850-1913 ............................................................ 5
   B. The First World War and the Growth of Government Controls .... 7
   C. The Inter-War Period .................................................................... 8
   D. The Second World War and Its Aftermath ..................................... 10
   E. A Closer Look at the Reasons for the Expansion of
      Government Activity ..................................................................... 11

V. Administrative Bodies Meet the Law: Conflicts and Tensions in
   Theories of Administrative Law ......................................................... 11

VI. From a Focus on Remedies to a Focus on Review .............................. 16

VII. Section 96 and the Courts' Constitutional Right to Review
    Administrative Decisions ................................................................. 20

PART 2: AN INTRODUCTION TO MODERN ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

VIII. Where to Start? ............................................................................... 23

IX. Review for Procedural Fairness ......................................................... 24
   A. Threshold Question ..................................................................... 25
   B. The Content of Procedural Fairness ............................................. 27
   C. Bias, Independence, and Institutional Decision Making ............ 28

X. Substantive Review ............................................................................ 29

XI. Applying the Concepts: Baker ......................................................... 33
    Questions ....................................................................................... 34

XII. Conclusion ....................................................................................... 36
    Suggested Additional Readings ....................................................... 37
Chapter Two  Governments in Miniature: The Rule of Law in the Administrative State

Mary Liston

I. Introduction

II. The Rule of Law in Theory
   A. The Purpose of the Rule of Law: The Non-Arbitrary Rule of Men (and Women)
   B. Attributes of the Rule of Law
   C. Ruling the Judges

III. The Supreme Court of Canada on the Rule of Law
   A. The Heart of the Canadian Rule of Law
   B. A Foundational Principle, but an “Unwritten” One
   C. The New Minimalist Rule of Law
   D. Lower Court Unruliness?

IV. Administering the Rule of Law
   A. Deference as Respect: The Canadian Model of Administrative Law
   B. An Example of Deference as Respect: National Corn Growers
   C. Three Interpretive Problems for Deference as Respect: Privative Clauses, the Standard of Review, and the Adequacy of Reasons
      1. Privative Clauses
      2. The Standard of Review
      3. The Adequacy of Reasons
   D. Constraining the Charter
   E. Other Routes to Accountability in the Administrative State

V. Conclusion: A Democratic Rule of Law in the Administrative State

Suggested Additional Readings

Chapter Three  Dogs and Tails: Remedies in Administrative Law

Cristie Ford

I. Introduction

II. Remedial Options at the Tribunal Stage
   A. Statutory Authority
   B. Novel Administrative Remedies

III. Enforcing Tribunal Orders Against Parties
   A. The Tribunal Seeks to Enforce Its Order
   B. A Party Seeks to Enforce a Tribunal’s Order
   C. Criminal Prosecution

IV. Challenging Administrative Action
   A. Internal Tribunal Mechanisms
   B. External Non-Court Mechanisms
   C. Using the Courts: Statutory Appeals
      1. Is an Appeal Available?
Table of Contents

D. Using the Courts: Judicial Review ................................. 107
   1. Discretionary Bases for Refusing a Remedy ................ 107
   2. Is Judicial Review Available? ............................... 112
E. Remedies on Judicial Review ..................................... 116
   1. Introduction to the Prerogative Writs ...................... 117
   2. Statutory Reform ............................................ 119
F. Private Law Remedies ............................................... 120
V. Conclusion .......................................................... 122
Suggested Additional Readings ....................................... 123

Chapter Four  Regulations and Rule Making: The Dilemma of Delegation ......................................................... 125
Andrew Green
I. The Spread of Regulations, Rules, and Soft Law .............. 125
II. Why Delegate? ...................................................... 127
III. The Risks of Delegation .......................................... 129
IV. Controlling the Risks ............................................. 132
   A. Structural Approaches ....................................... 132
   B. Legislative Review ........................................... 133
   C. Judicial Review of Substance ............................... 134
   D. Process Requirements ....................................... 138
V. The Ongoing Struggle .............................................. 145
Suggested Additional Readings ....................................... 146

Chapter Five  From Natural Justice to Fairness: Thresholds, Content, and the Role of Judicial Review ................................. 147
Grant Huscroft
I. Introduction .......................................................... 148
II. From Natural Justice to Fairness ................................ 148
III. The Threshold Test: When Is Fairness Required? .......... 153
   A. Rights, Privileges, and Interests ......................... 153
   B. Constitutional Protection .................................. 154
IV. Limitations on the Application of the Duty of Fairness .... 155
   A. The Duty Applies to Decisions ............................. 155
   B. The Duty Does Not Apply to Legislative Decisions ...... 156
      1. Are Cabinet and Ministerial Decisions Covered by the Legislative Exemption? 157
      2. Is Subordinate Legislation Covered by the Legislative Exemption? 159
      3. Are Policy Decisions Covered by the Legislative Exemption? 160
   C. The Duty Does Not Apply to Public Office Holders Employed Under Contracts 161
   D. The Duty May Be Suspended or Abridged in the Event of an Emergency 162
V. The Content of the Duty of Fairness ........................................... 162
   A. *Baker v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)* .................. 165
   B. The *Baker* Synthesis .......................................................... 167
      1. The Nature of the Decision Being Made and the Process Followed in Making It ......................................................... 168
      2. The Nature of the Statutory Scheme and the Terms of the Statute Pursuant to Which the Body Operates ......................... 168
      3. The Importance of the Decision to the Individual or Individuals Affected ................................................................. 168
      4. The Legitimate Expectations of the Person Challenging the Relevant Decision .......................................................... 169
      5. The Choices of Procedure made by the Agency Itself .................. 170
   C. Specific Components of the Duty of Fairness .................................. 171
      1. Notice .............................................................................. 171
      2. Disclosure ....................................................................... 172
      3. Oral Hearings .................................................................... 173
      4. Right to Counsel .................................................................. 174
      5. Right to Call Evidence and Cross-Examine Witnesses .................. 175
      6. Timeliness and Delay ......................................................... 175
      7. The Duty to Give Reasons .................................................. 177

VI. Judicial Review of the Duty of Fairness ........................................... 180
Suggested Additional Readings .............................................................. 182

Chapter Six Advocacy Before Administrative Tribunals ......................... 185
*Freya Kristjanson and Leslie McIntosh*

I. Introduction ............................................................................. 186
II. Sources of Administrative Law .................................................... 187
   A. Governing Statutes and Regulations ........................................... 187
   B. Tribunal Rules, Policies, and Guidelines ..................................... 189
   C. Statutory Procedural Codes ..................................................... 189
   D. Common-Law Principles of Procedural Fairness ......................... 191
   E. Charter of Rights and Freedoms and Constitutional Law ........... 192

III. Pre-Hearing Issues ................................................................. 193
   A. Notice .............................................................................. 193
   B. Disclosure ....................................................................... 193
   C. Oral or Written Hearing ....................................................... 194
   D. Agreed Statement of Facts ................................................... 195
   E. Witnesses ......................................................................... 196
   F. General Conduct ............................................................... 196

IV. Advocacy at the Tribunal Hearing .................................................. 197
   A. Ethical Advocacy ................................................................... 197
   B. Misleading the Tribunal on the Facts or the Law ......................... 198
   C. Public Statements About Proceedings ....................................... 199
   D. An Advocate's Duty to Opposing Counsel .................................. 200
   E. Dealing with Unrepresented Parties ........................................ 201
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F. Preliminary Motions at the Hearing</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Opening Statements</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Evidence</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Relevance</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. Weight</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Admissibility</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. Standard of Proof</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Judicial Notice</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N. Examination-in-Chief</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O. Cross-Examination</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P. Tribunal Precedents</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q. Closing Argument</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. Reasons, Reconsiderations, and Reviews</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Conclusion</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested Additional Readings</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Seven   Access to Administrative Justice and Other Worries</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lorne Sossin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Access to Administrative Justice: The Tribunal</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Standing</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Hearings</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Access to Administrative Justice: Information and Knowledge</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Guidelines</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Simplification</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Language</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Prior Decisions</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Access to Resources Needed to Navigate the Tribunal System</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Legal Representation</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Fees and Costs</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Fees</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Costs</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Budget and Staffing</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Conclusions</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested Additional Readings</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Eight   Caught Between Judicial Paradigms and the Administrative</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State's Pastiche: &quot;Tribunal&quot; Independence, Impartiality, and Bias</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laverne Jacobs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Sources of the Guarantee of an Independent and Impartial Tribunal</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. What Is &quot;Tribunal Independence&quot; and Why Is It Important?</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. The Development of the Law of Tribunal Independence in Canada</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Laying the Groundwork: The Theory of Judicial Independence</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter Nine</strong> Standard of Review: Back to the Future?</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Audrey Macklin</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Prequel</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. The Sequels</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Is Judicial Review Constitutionally Protected?</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Beyond Privative Clauses</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Pragmatic and Functional Redux: <em>Pushpanathan v. Canada</em></td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Privative Clause</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Expertise</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Purpose of the Statute as a Whole and the Provision in Particular</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. The Nature of the Problem</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. <em>Dunsmuir</em>: And Then There Were Two</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Whatever Happened to the Privative Clause?</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Whatever Happened to Jurisdiction?</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Whatever Happened to Patent Unreasonableness?</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. What Is a Question of Central Importance to the Legal System as a Whole (and Outside the Decision-Maker's Area of Expertise)?</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Spin-Offs</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The Charter, Discretion, and the Standard of Review</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Reasoning About Reasons</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Review of Standard of Review: I Laughed, I Cried, I Stood on My Chair and ...</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested Additional Readings</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Chapter 10 | Pas de Deux: Deference and Non-Deference in Action | 323 |
| *Sheila Wildeman* | | |
| I. Introduction | 323 |
| II. Statutory Interpretation and Substantive Review: Working Theories | 328 |
III. The Standards of Review in Theory and Practice ........................................ 332
   A. A Contested Correctness ......................................................... 332
      1. Correctness Review in Theory ............................................. 332
      2. Correctness Review in Practice ........................................... 334
   B. Review for Reasonableness .................................................... 342
      1. Enduring Questions from the Pre-\textit{Dunsmuir} Case Law ............. 342
      2. Reasonableness Post-\textit{Dunsmuir} ........................................ 350
IV. Conclusion .................................................................................. 377
Suggested Additional Readings ........................................................... 379

Chapter Eleven  Administrative Discretion: Between Exercising Power and
Conducting Dialogue ........................................................................ 381

\textit{Geneviève Cartier}

I. Introduction .................................................................................. 382
II. The Role of Discretion and How It Was Viewed by Academics ........ 383
   A. The Role of Discretion in the Administrative State ....................... 383
      1. Discretion to Decide Individual Cases ......................................... 383
      2. Discretion to Adopt General Norms ............................................ 384
   B. Discretion and Academics ........................................................... 385
III. Discretion from \textit{Roncarelli} to \textit{Baker} ........................................ 388
   A. Unauthorized Object or Purpose, Irrelevant Considerations .......... 391
   B. Bad Faith ................................................................................. 392
   C. Acting Under Dictation or Influence ............................................ 392
   D. Wrongful Delegation of Powers .................................................. 393
   E. Fettering of Discretion ............................................................... 393
   F. Unreasonableness ..................................................................... 393

IV. Discretion from \textit{Baker} to \textit{Dunsmuir} and Beyond .................... 396
   A. The Contemporary Framework of Analysis ................................... 396
   B. The Challenges .......................................................................... 399
      1. What Is Left of the Previous Approach? ...................................... 399
      2. The Level of Deference ............................................................ 400
      3. To “Reweigh” or Not to “Reweigh” ............................................. 402
V. Conclusion .................................................................................... 403
Suggested Additional Readings ........................................................... 406

Chapter Twelve  The Charter and Administrative Law: Cross-Fertilization
or Inconstancy? .................................................................................. 407

\textit{Evan Fox-Decent and Alexander Pless}

I. Introduction .................................................................................. 408
II. Procedural Fairness and the Principles of Fundamental Justice ........ 409
   A. Oral Hearings and the Scope of Section 7 ................................. 412
   B. Incorporation of the Common-Law Framework Under Section 7 .... 413
   C. The Duty to Disclose and the Right to Reply ............................... 415
   D. The Duty to Give Reasons ........................................................ 416
   E. The Right to State-Funded Legal Counsel .................................... 417
F. Undue Delay .......................................................... 418
G. Ex Parte, in Camera Hearings ................................. 419

III. Review of Administrative Decisions Under the Charter .................. 422
   A. The Slaight Framework and Doré .......................... 424
   B. Express Authority to Infringe a Protected Right .............. 426
   C. Imprecise Authority to Infringe Charter Rights ............. 429
   D. Conclusion ..................................................... 437

IV. Agency Jurisdiction Over the Charter ............................... 438
   A. The Old Trilogy and "Jurisdiction Over the Whole Matter" .... 438
   B. Vindication of the Dissent in Cooper? ........................ 440
   C. Remedies Under Section 24(1) ............................. 442

V. Conclusion ................................................................ 445
Suggested Additional Readings ........................................... 448

Chapter Thirteen In Search of Aboriginal Administrative Law ............... 449
Janna Promislow and Lorne Sossin

I. What Is Aboriginal Administrative Law? .............................. 450
   A. Developing Administrative Justice for Aboriginal Self-Government .. 452
   B. Applying Administrative Law to Aboriginal Decision-Makers ....... 453
   C. Respecting Aboriginal Rights and Jurisdictions:
      The Duty to Consult and Accommodate .......................... 453

II. Developing Administrative Justice for Aboriginal Self-Government ....... 455
   A. Participation in Public Government, Co-Management, and
      Shared Management ............................................. 457
   B. Self-Management and Self-Administration ....................... 459
   C. Self-Government and Sovereignty ............................... 460

III. Applying Administrative Law to Aboriginal Decision-Makers ........... 463
   A. How Do We Assess Independence? ................................ 463
   B. Is the Canadian Ideal of Independence Applicable in
      Aboriginal Contexts? .......................................... 465
   C. Appropriate Level of Deference ................................ 466

IV. Respecting Aboriginal Rights and Jurisdictions: The Duty to Consult
     and Accommodate .................................................. 467
   A. Overview of the Duty to Consult and Accommodate .......... 467
   B. Standard of Review: Procedure, Substance, and
      Specialized Decision-Makers .................................... 475
   C. The Constitutional Nature of the Obligation ................... 479
   D. The Legislative Exemption ..................................... 481
   E. Other Possibilities and Points of Cross-Fertilization ....... 485

V. Conclusion ................................................................ 486
Suggested Additional Readings ........................................... 486
Chapter Fourteen  The Role of International Human Rights Norms in Administrative Law .......................................................... 489
Gerald Heckman

I. Introduction ........................................................................... 489
II. A Short Introduction to International Human Rights Law .......... 491
III. Rules of Reception of International Law .............................. 495
    A. Reception of Customary International Human Rights Law .... 496
    B. Reception of Conventional International Human Rights Law .. 496
IV. International Human Rights Norms and the Substantive Review of Administrative Decision Making ..................... 499
    A. The Role of Unimplemented Treaties .............................. 499
    B. Implemented International Human Rights Norms and the Substantive Review of Discretion .............................. 504
    C. Norms of Customary International Law and Substantive Review .................................................. 509
    D. The Use of International Law in Charter Interpretation ...... 510
    E. Discretion and Rights of Access to International Human Rights Bodies ................................................. 517
V. The Role of International Human Rights Norms in the Procedural Review of Administrative Decisions .................. 520
VI. Conclusion ................................................................. 523
    Suggested Additional Readings ........................................ 524

Chapter Fifteen  Making a Federal Case Out of It: The Federal Court and Administrative Law ................................................. 525
Craig Forcese

I. Introduction ........................................................................... 526
II. Structure and Jurisdiction of the Federal Courts ................. 526
    A. Federal Courts as Statutory Courts .............................. 526
    B. Administrative Law Jurisdiction of the Federal Courts .... 527
       1. The Federal Court of Canada and the Federal Court of Appeal .................................................. 527
       2. The Federal Court's Exclusive Jurisdiction ................. 528
III. Judicial Review Before the Federal Courts ......................... 529
    A. Statutory Appeals ....................................................... 529
       1. Section 18.5 .............................................................. 530
       2. The Sometimes Tricky Operation of Section 18.5 ........ 530
       3. Leave Requirements and Judicial Review .................. 531
    B. Standing ................................................................. 532
    C. Limitation Periods ...................................................... 533
    D. Grounds of Review .................................................... 533
       1. Acting Without Jurisdiction ...................................... 534
       2. Procedural Fairness .................................................. 534
       3. Error of Law ............................................................ 536
       4. Erroneous Finding of Fact ........................................ 536
       5. Other Way Contrary to Law ...................................... 537
Chapter Sixteen  Getting the Story Out: Accountability and the Law of
Public Inquiries

Peter J. Carver

I. Accountability and the Public Inquiry
   A. Types of Public Inquiries
   B. The Policy Inquiry
   C. The Investigative Inquiry
      1. Balancing the Rights of Individuals Facing Criminal Charges
      2. Balancing Reputational Interests

II. Public Inquiries and Administrative Law Principles
   A. Establishing an Inquiry
      1. Delegation of Authority
      2. Appointing an Inquiry Commissioner
      3. Terms of Reference or Inquiry Mandate
      4. Independence of Inquiries
      5. Reasonable Apprehension of Bias
      6. Constitutional Issues
   B. Procedural Justice Issues
      1. Inquisitorial Process
      2. Standing
      3. Representation by Counsel and Role of Commission Counsel
      4. Notice and Opportunity to Respond
      5. Disclosure
      6. Conducting Hearings in Public
   C. Substantive Review
      1. Interpretation of Terms of Reference
      2. Review of Inquiry Findings

III. Public Inquiries and Public Benefit

Suggested Additional Readings

Appendix: Table of Administrative Boards and Tribunals

Index