SEXUAL VIOLENCE AS AN INTERNATIONAL CRIME: INTERDISCIPLINARY APPROACHES

Edited by
Anne-Marie de Brouwer
Charlotte Ku
Renée Römkens
Larissa van den Herik

intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements .......................................................... v
Foreword .............................................................................. vii
Abbreviations ....................................................................... xxiii

INTRODUCTION

Chapter 1
Interdisciplinary Approaches to Recognizing, Investigating and
Prosecuting Sexual Violence as an International Crime
Anne-Marie de Brouwer, Charlotte Ku, Renée Römkens and
Larissa van den Herik ......................................................... 3

PART 1
OVERVIEW OF SEVERAL MILESTONES AND CHALLENGES
CONCERNING INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL PROSECUTION
OF SEXUAL VIOLENCE

A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE, THE WAY FORWARD AND MILESTONES
LONG OVERLOOKED

Chapter 2
Treatment of Sexual Violence in Armed Conflicts: A Historical Perspective
and the Way Forward
Kelly Askin ........................................................................... 19

1. Summary ........................................................................ 19
2. A Historical Perspective of Sexual Violence in Conflict and the
Status of Gender Related Laws ........................................... 21
3. Development of Codified Laws of War On Gender-related Crimes ... 25
   3.1. World War I War Crimes Commission (1919) .................. 29
   3.2. Summary of Laws Prohibiting Sex Crimes Prior to
       World War II ............................................................ 30
   3.3. World War II War Crimes Trials in Nuremberg and Tokyo:
       Treatment of Sex Crimes ........................................... 32
       3.3.1. Evidence of sexual violence in Nuremberg Trial .... 34
Chapter 3
Prosecuting Gender-Based Persecution as an International Crime
Valerie OOSTERVELD .................................................. 57
1. Introduction .......................................................... 57
2. Charges of Gender-Based Persecution before the ICC .......... 59
3. Definition of Persecution in the ICC and Jurisprudence of the ICTY and ICTR ........................................... 61
4. Potential Challenges in the ICC’s Prosecution of Gender-Based Persecution .................................................. 66
   4.1. ICC’s Definition of Gender ........................................ 66
   4.2. Prosecution of Intersectionality .................................. 70
   4.3. Rejection Due to Cumulative Charging .......................... 73
5. Conclusion .................................................................. 77

Chapter 4
Prosecuting Sexual Violence against Men and Boys
Sandesh SIVAKUMARAN .................................................. 79
1. Introduction .............................................................. 79
2. Overview of Male Sexual Violence ................................ 80
3. Prosecutions: Advances .............................................. 82
   3.1. Substantive Law ..................................................... 82
   3.2. Procedural Law ..................................................... 86
   3.3. Actual Prosecutions .............................................. 87
4. Prosecution: Limits ..................................................... 89
   4.1. Investigations ....................................................... 90
   4.2. Charging and Characterization of the Charges ............. 92
5. All Eyes on the International Criminal Court .................... 95
6. Conclusion .................................................................. 97
Chapter 5
Future Challenges to Prosecuting Sexual Violence Under International Law:
Insights from ICTY Practice
Michelle Jarvis and Elena Martin Salgado

1. Introduction
2. ICTY Advances in the Prosecution of Sexual Violence
3. Remaining Challenges: Successful Sexual Violence Prosecutions in Highly Complex Cases
   3.1. Holding High-Level Political and Military Figures Responsible for Sexual Violence Crimes
      3.1.1. Superior responsibility
      3.1.2. Joint Criminal Enterprise
         3.1.2.1. Sexual violence as part of a common criminal purpose
         3.1.2.2. Sexual violence as a natural and foreseeable consequence
   3.2. Prosecuting Sexual Violence as Genocide
4. Conclusion

Chapter 6
The Prosecution of Rape and Sexual Violence: Lessons from Prosecutions at the ICTR
Linda Bianchi

1. Introduction
2. The Rwandan Experience
3. The Record of the Office of the Prosecutor – Challenges Encountered
   3.1. Investigations
      3.1.1. The role of management
      3.1.2. The methodology of investigations
   3.2. Prosecution
      3.2.1. Alternative strategies linking accused to crimes
      3.2.2. Other means of eliciting evidence
4. The Contribution to the Legal Framework for the Prosecution of Sexual Violence – Successes Achieved
5. Overall Representation of Sexual Violence in the ICTR Jurisprudence
6. Legacy of the ICTR
7. Conclusion
Chapter 7
The Place of Sexual Violence in the Strategy of the ICC Prosecutor
Luis Moreno-Ocampo ........................................ 151

1. Introduction .................................................. 151
2. Historical Notion ............................................. 151
3. Gender Crimes in the Rome System ....................... 152
4. Case Examples ............................................... 154
5. Conclusion .................................................... 155

Chapter 8
Jurisprudential Developments Relating to Sexual Violence: The Legacy of the Special Court for Sierra Leone
Teresa Doherty .................................................. 157

1. Introduction .................................................. 157
2. Landmark Decisions and Cases on Sexual Violence ....... 158
   2.1. Sexual Slavery ......................................... 165
   2.2. Forced Marriage ....................................... 167
3. Concluding Remarks ......................................... 171

Chapter 9
Victims of Sexual and Gender-Based Crimes Before the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia: Challenges of Rights to Participation and Protection
Silke Studzinsky .............................................. 173

1. Introduction .................................................. 173
2. Overview of the Participation Rights of and the Available Protection Scheme for Victims of Sexual Violence before the ECCC ...... 175
   2.1. Participation Rights .................................. 175
   2.2. Protective Measures at the ECCC .................... 177
3. Dealing with Sexual Crimes – The Status Quo ............. 178
4. Challenges ................................................... 184
5. Lessons Learned ............................................. 185
6. Conclusion .................................................... 185
PART 2
SOCIAL, ARCHIVAL AND MEDICAL DATA COLLECTION AND ITS USE FOR THE CRIMINAL LAW PROCESS: METHODOLOGY ISSUES

Chapter 10
Ethical, Safety and Methodological Issues Related to Collection and Use of Data on Sexual Violence in Conflict
Chen Reis ........................................ 189

1. Introduction .................................. 189
2. Background .................................. 190
3. Data on Sexual Violence .................... 193
   3.1. Limitations Related to Under-Reporting .. 194
   3.2. Sources of Data ......................... 196
      3.2.1. Medico-legal evidence ............... 196
      3.2.2. Individual testimonies ............... 197
      3.2.3. Aggregated data from cases reported to services ... 198
      3.2.4. Population based surveys ............ 199
4. Ethical and Safety Issues ................. 201
   4.1. Consultation .......................... 202
   4.2. The WHO Recommendations Document ... 204
   4.3. The Recommendations ................. 205
      4.3.1. Risks and benefits .................. 205
      4.3.2. Methodology ......................... 206
      4.3.3. Referral services .................... 206
      4.3.4. Safety ................................ 207
      4.3.5. Confidentiality ...................... 207
      4.3.6. Informed consent ..................... 208
      4.3.7. Information gathering team ........... 208
      4.3.8. Children ........................... 209
5. Conclusion .................................. 209

Chapter 11
Investigation of Crimes of Sexual and Gender-Based Violence Under International Criminal Law
Maxine Marcus ................................. 211

1. Introduction ................................ 211
2. The Investigation Plan ..................... 212
3. Informed Preparation ...................... 213
   3.1. Information ............................ 213
   3.2. Topics for Advanced Preparation ........ 214
      3.2.1. Political structures, affiliations, motivations and methodology ... 214
3.2.2. Military, police, paramilitary and/or other armed group structures and affiliations, motivations and methodology ................................................................. 215
3.2.3. The history and pattern of the conflict ......................................................... 215
3.2.4. Customary and traditional context within which the witnesses/survivors live(d) and within which the crimes took place, and within which the investigation will be conducted ................................................................. 215
3.2.5. The security situation from the highest levels of official government or non-state party control levels to the direct communal security situation ......................................................... 216
3.2.6. Presence and mandate of other agencies ..................................................... 216
3.2.7. Existence of other research/interviewing/evidence gathering or information gathering activities in which prospective witnesses have engaged ................................................................. 217

3.3. Security and Access to Evidence ................................................................. 219

4. The Field Investigation – Evidence-Gathering ................................................ 222
4.1. First Contact .................................................................................................... 222
4.2. Greetings and Introductions ......................................................................... 224
4.3. Power Dynamics ............................................................................................ 225
4.4. Informed Consent .......................................................................................... 226

5. Organisation of the Evidence-Gathering to Support What Needs to Be Proven in Court: The “Evidence Checklist” ......................................................... 227
5.1. Specific Elements of Specific Crimes .............................................................. 229
5.2. Common Elements of the Category of Crime – War Crimes, Crimes Against Humanity, or Genocide ................................................................. 231
5.3. Linkage Elements .......................................................................................... 232
5.4. Example of an Evidence Checklist for International Criminal Investigations into Crimes of Sexual Violence ................................................................. 233

6. Strategies for Presentation of Evidence in Court ............................................. 238
6.1. Measures to Protect Survivor Witnesses in Court ........................................ 238
6.2. Summary Witnesses ..................................................................................... 239
6.3. Expert or Specialist Witnesses .................................................................... 240

7. Post-Interview and Post-Testimony Follow Up .............................................. 240

8. Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 241

Chapter 12
Evidence-Based Documentation of Gender-Based Violence
Lynn LAWRY, Kirsten JOHNSON and Jana ASHER ................................................. 243

1. A Brief History of the Prosecution of Sexual Violence as an International Crime .............................................................................................................. 243
1.1. The International Criminal Court and Sexual Violence ............................ 247
1.2. The Evolution of the Definition of Rape as it Pertains to the International Criminal Court .......................... 247

2. Collecting Evidence that is Useful for the ICC for Cases of Sexual Violence .................................................. 250
   2.1. Using Evidence Based Studies to Assess Human Rights Violations Including SGBV. ................................. 252
   2.2. The Link Between Health and Human Rights. ......................... 253

3. Research Methods ................................................................. 255
   3.1. Initial Planning. .......................................................... 256
   3.2. Qualitative Methodology ............................................. 257
   3.3. Quantitative Methodology ........................................... 259

   4.1. Survey/Instrument Design ......................................... 261
   4.2. Sample Design ......................................................... 262
   4.3. Use of Clinical Data from Health Facilities ..................... 266
   4.4. Use of Secondary Indicators in the Documentation of SGBV . 268
   4.5. Protecting Human Subjects ....................................... 269
   4.6. Building a Research Team. ....................................... 270
   4.7. Cultural Context ...................................................... 271
   4.8. Training Data Collectors ......................................... 272
   4.9. Entering and Cleaning Data ....................................... 273

5. Conclusions ........................................................................... 274

Chapter 13
"Reasonable Grounds" Evidence Involving Sexual Violence in Darfur
John HAGAN, Richard BROOKS and Todd HAUGH ............................. 275

1. Introduction ........................................................................... 275
   1.1. The Call for a New Type of Evidence. ............................... 275
   1.2. The Role of Social Science Evidence ............................... 278

2. Devastation, Impunity, Denial, and Obstacles to Research Involving Sexual Violence Committed During Conflict .......... 280
   2.1. Devastation ................................................................ 281
   2.2. Impunity .................................................................... 281
   2.3. Denial ....................................................................... 283
   2.4. Obstacles to Research ................................................. 284

3. A New Approach ................................................................. 285
   3.1. Building the Darfur Case .............................................. 286
   3.2. The ADS Sample and Interviews .................................... 288
   3.3. The Reporting of Racial Epithets .................................... 294
   3.4. Enumerating Sexual Violence and Mass Atrocities ............ 297
4. Applying an Appropriate Analytic Method ........................................ 300
   4.1. Mapping the Racial Targeting .................................................. 301
   4.2. Modeling the Racial Epithets .................................................. 303
   4.3. Modeling the Sexual Victimization ......................................... 305
5. Conclusions .................................................................................. 308

Appendix: The Issue of Dependency in Modeling the Reported Sexual Victimization of Others in Darfur ................................. 310

PART 3
SURVIVING SEXUAL VIOLENCE, STORY TELLING AND CREATING AWARENESS

Chapter 14
Partners for Gender Justice
  Brigid INDER ................................................................................. 315
  1. Introduction .......................................................... 315
  2. Complementarity and Potential of the Rome Statute for Gender Justice .................................................. 321
  3. Documenting Gender-Based Crimes ................................. 323
  4. Missed Opportunity .................................................. 325
  5. Lubanga – Legal Proceedings ........................................ 327
  7. Legal Filings as a Strategy for Gender Justice ................ 334
  8. Continuing Efforts .................................................. 336

Chapter 15
“How Can You Meet Your Rapist and Shake His Hand?” The Role of Documentarians in Creating Awareness about Sexual Violence – An Interview with Filmmakers Ilse and Femke van Velzen
  Rachel IRWIN ................................................................................. 339

Chapter 16
Voices of Court Members: A Phenomenological Journey – The Prosecution of Rape and Sexual Violence at the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (ICTY) and the Bosnian War Crimes Court (BIH)
  Sara SHARRATT .............................................................................. 353
  1. Introduction ........................................................................ 353
  2. Methodology ........................................................ 354
  3. Review of the Literature ........................................ 355
4. A Phenomenological Journey ........................................... 360
   4.1. Credibility and Gender Injustice: A No-Win for Survivors ... 360
   4.2. Perceptions and Relationships among Court Members ....... 363
   4.3. Rape Myths and Stereotypes of Survivors ....................... 364
   4.4. Attitudes and Feelings about Cases Involving Sexual Violence 365
   4.5. Presence of Women ............................................... 367
5. Concluding Remarks .................................................. 368

CONCLUDING REMARKS

Chapter 17
How to Move Forward? Interdisciplinary Approaches to Recognizing,
Investigating and Prosecuting Sexual Violence as an International Crime
Anne-Marie de Brouwer, Charlotte Ku, Renée Römkens and
Larissa van den Herik ..................................................... 373

About the Contributors .................................................. 389