Johan van der Walt

The Horizontal Effect Revolution and the Question of Sovereignty
Contents

Acknowledgements and Disclaimers — XIX

Introduction — 1
I The Horizontality Revolution — 1
II Two Histories, Four Questions, Twelve Cases, Two Scholarly Debates — 6
III Liberal Democratic Constitutionalism — 13
IV Liberal Democratic Sovereignty — 19
V Liberal Democratic Historicity — 21
VI Liberal Democratic Constitutional Review — 25
VII Outline of Arguments and Chapters — 31

Part One:
Horizontal Effect

Chapter One: Erased Baselines and Inversed Coordinates: 19th Century Backgrounds of the Horizontality Question — 37
I Introduction — 37
II The Privatisation of Constitutional Rights in America — 41
III The Nineteenth Century Transformation of Private Law Rights in America — 48
IV The Privatisation of Constitutional Rights in Germany — 59
V The Nineteenth Century Transformation of Private Law Rights in Germany and its Impact on Early Twentieth Century German Public Law — 66
VI The Baseline of Erased Baselines — 74
VII Inversed Coordinates — 78

Chapter Two: Twelve Pivotal Cases — 85
I Introduction — 85
II The Civil Rights Cases (and their Unlikely South African Echoes) — 86
III Shelley v Kraemer — 92
V RWDSU v Dolphin Delivery Ltd — 102
VI Lüth — 107
VII  Du Plessis v De Klerk — 114
VIII Flagg Brothers, Inc. v Brooks — 120
IX  DeShaney v Winnebago County Department of Social Services — 124
X  The Duty to Protect: Roe v Wade and Erste Abtreibung — 130
XI  Reiten im Walde — 151
XII Summary Reflections — 155
1 Vicissitudes of the State Action Doctrine — 155
2 The Contradictory Legacies that Informed Du Plessis — 156
3 The Dismantling of Swing, Shelley and Sullivan in Flagg Brothers and DeShaney — 157
4 Shifting Horizontal Effect Jurisprudence from Private to Legislative Relations — 157
5 Substantive and Procedural Due Process and the Question of Sovereignty — 158
6 Constitutional Histories of Peoples — 163

Chapter Three: State Action — 166
I  Introduction — 166
II  Michelman’s “Hohfeldian Point” — 168
III Wechsler and Tribe: Two Readings of Shelley — 172
IV  Seidman’s Reading of DeShaney — 181
V  One Way out of the American Conceptual Impasse — 190

Chapter Four: Drittwirkung — 201
I  Introduction — 201
II  Nipperdey’s Position — 203
III  Dürig’s Position — 207
IV  Leisner’s Position — 212
V  Schwabe’s Position — 222
VI  Canaris’ Response — 227
VII Schutzpflicht and/or Drittwirkung? — 230

Part Two: Sovereignty

Chapter Five: Uninterrupted Sovereignty — 235
I  Introduction — 235
II  Divided Sovereignty — 241
III  Between Deism and Deontology – Europe and Ordo- Liberalism — 246

IV  Dispersed Sovereignty – Government and Governance — 252

V  Dispensed Sovereignty – The Davidsonian Road to Luhmann — 260

VI  Uninterrupted Sovereignty – A “Luhmannian” Return to Hegel — 275

Chapter Six: Différential Sovereignty — 293
I  Introduction — 293
II  Coercive Enlightenment Ideals — 296
III  Carl Schmitt’s Unitary Substantive Due Process and Indirect Horizontal Effect Jurisprudence — 300
IV  Hans Kelsen and the Open Duality of the Constitutional Democratic Whole — 315
V  Leisner’s “Kelsenian” Horizontal Effect Jurisprudence — 323
VI  Différential Sovereignty — 327

Chapter Seven: Sovereignty and the Dual Destiny of Lüth in Europe — 334
I  Introduction — 334
II  The Rise of European Union Sovereignty — 338
III  The Demise of German Sovereignty and the Marginalisation of Lüth in Germany — 348
IV  European Union Sovereignty – Vertical and Monistic or Horizontal and Différential? — 352

Chapter Eight: Liberal Democratic Constitutional Review — 361
I  Introduction — 361
II  The Recognition of Sovereignty — 366
III  Liberal Democratic Sovereignty — 368
IV  Substantive and Procedural Due Process Constitutional Review — 369
V  The Proceduralisation of Minimum Substance and the First Proportionality Question — 374
VI  The Second Proportionality Question: Rationality and Effectiveness — 379
VII  The Third Proportionality Question: Minimal Intrusion — 381
VIII  The Difference between Ordinary and Constitutional Law — 386
IX  Social Liberal Democracy? — 390
Bibliography — 401
Abbreviations — 419
Index of Persons — 420
Subject Index — 423