Individual Criminal Responsibility in International Law

ELIES VAN SLIEDREGT
PART 1: INTRODUCTION

1. Criminal Responsibility in International Law 3
   1.1 War and law 3
   1.2 From war crimes law to international criminal law 4
   1.3 State responsibility vis-a-vis individual responsibility 5
   1.4 International criminal law 8
      1.4.1 Nature of norms 8
      1.4.2 Pluralism or uniformity? 9
      1.4.3 Sources of law 12

2. Collective Criminality, Individual Responsibility 17
   2.1 Individual criminal responsibility 17
      2.1.1 Developments in municipal criminal law 17
      2.1.2 International criminal responsibility 18
   2.2 System criminality 20
   2.3 Bernays' collective criminality theory 22
      2.3.1 Conspiracy—criminal responsibility at leadership level 23
      2.3.2 Criminal organizations—criminal responsibility at execution level 26
   2.4 Subsequent proceedings 30
      2.4.1 Membership liability 32
      2.4.2 Common design 33
      2.4.3 Complicity 35
   2.5 Concluding observations 36

3. Parameters of Criminal Responsibility 39
   3.1 Terminology 39
   3.2 Subjective element 40
      3.2.1 ICC Statute 45
      3.2.2 Ad hoc tribunals 50
   3.3 Objective element 52
      3.3.1 Broad and narrow understanding 53
      3.3.2 Commission and omission 54
## PART 2: ATTRIBUTING CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY

### 4. Perpetration and Participation

4.1 Codifying individual criminal responsibility 61
4.2 Participation in crime: a comparative perspective 65
  4.2.1 Unitary and differentiated models 65
  4.2.2 Derivative and autonomous models 67
  4.2.3 Contribution and crime-oriented models 70
  4.2.4 Naturalistic and normative models 71
  4.2.5 Differentiated and unitary: a fading distinction 73
4.3 International models of participation: preliminary observations 74
4.4 Concluding remarks 74

### 5. Principals and Accessories

5.1 Introduction 77
5.2 The principal–accessory distinction 77
  5.2.1 The advance of the normative approach 77
  5.2.2 Bolstering the principal status 80
5.3 Distinguishing criteria: Roxin's theory 81
5.4 'Control of the crime'
  5.4.1 Dualism 85
  5.4.2 Roxin's theory and the ICC 86
5.5 Concluding observations 88

### 6. Forms of Criminal Responsibility

6.1 Introduction 89
6.2 Direct and indirect perpetration 89
  6.2.1 Comparative perspective 89
  6.2.2 International criminal tribunals 91
  6.2.3 ICC 93
6.3 Co-perpetration 95
  6.3.1 Comparative perspective 95
  6.3.2 International criminal tribunals 96
  6.3.3 ICC 99
6.4 Instigation, ordering, soliciting, and inducing 102
  6.4.1 Comparative perspective 102
  6.4.2 International criminal tribunals 104
  6.4.3 ICC 107
6.5 Planning 110
  6.5.1 Comparative perspective 110
  6.5.2 International criminal tribunals 110
6.6 Aiding and abetting 112
  6.6.1 Common law origin 112
  6.6.2 Comparative perspective 116
  6.6.3 International criminal tribunals 120
  6.6.4 ICC 127
6.7 Common purpose liability 131
   6.7.1 Comparative perspective 131
   6.7.2 International criminal tribunals 133
   6.7.3 ICC 145
6.8 Attempt 147
   6.8.1 Comparative perspective 147
   6.8.2 International criminal tribunals 150
   6.8.3 ICC 151
6.9 Conclusion: mixed models of criminal participation 153

7. Crime-Specific and Leadership Modalities 157
   7.1 Introduction 157
   Leadership modalities
   7.2 JCE at leadership level 157
      7.2.1 Indirect co-perpetration and interlinked JCE 158
      7.2.2 Observations 163
   7.3 Indirect co-perpetration at the ICC 165
      7.3.1 Observations 168
   7.4 Indirect co-perpetration and interlinked JCE compared 170
      Crime-specific modalities
   7.5 Complicity in genocide 171
      7.5.1 International criminal tribunals 172
      7.5.2 ICC 178
   7.6 Inchoate offences 179
      7.6.1 Conspiracy to commit genocide 179
      7.6.2 Incitement to commit genocide 180
   7.7 Concluding observations: theories of imputation 181

8. Superior Responsibility 183
   8.1 Introduction 183
   8.2 Developments in the law on superior responsibility 184
      8.2.1 The Čelebići case 185
      8.2.2 Successor superior responsibility 187
      8.2.3 Loosening the superior–subordinate relationship 189
      8.2.4 Observations 192
   8.3 The ambiguous nature of superior responsibility 195
   8.4 Article 28 of the ICC Statute 197
      8.4.1 Textual analysis 197
      8.4.2 Nature of liability 199
   8.5 Superior responsibility in national law 202
   8.6 A multilayered concept 204
   8.7 Superior responsibility as parallel liability 206
      8.7.1 Revisiting its nature 206
      8.7.2 Superior responsibility as ‘lex specialis’ 207
   8.8 Concluding observations 209
PART 3: DEFENCES

9. Grounds for Excluding Criminal Responsibility

9.1 Introduction

9.2 Preliminary observations
9.2.1 International law defences and criminal law defences
9.2.2 Justification and excuse
9.2.3 The mental element and defences
9.2.4 The reasonable person standard and Garantenstellung
9.2.5 The culpa in causa or 'conduct-in-causing' analysis

9.3 Article 31 of the ICC Statute

9.4 Mental defect
9.4.1 Text
9.4.2 Comparative perspective
9.4.3 International jurisprudence

9.5 Intoxication
9.5.1 Text
9.5.2 Comparative perspective
9.5.3 International jurisprudence

9.6 Self-defence
9.6.1 Preliminary observations
9.6.2 Text
9.6.3 Comparative perspective
9.6.4 International jurisprudence

9.7 Duress
9.7.1 Text
9.7.2 Comparative perspective
9.7.3 International jurisprudence

9.8 Non-statutory defences
9.8.1 Belligerent reprisals
9.8.2 Tu quoque
9.8.3 Military necessity

9.9 Concluding observations

10. Mistake of Fact and Law

10.1 Introduction

10.2 The defence of mistake
10.2.1 Descriptive and normative elements
10.2.2 Mistake of fact
10.2.3 Mistake of law
10.2.4 The scope of mistake of law in ICL

10.3 International jurisprudence

10.4 Comparative perspective
10.4.1 Anglo-American law
10.4.2 Civil law
10.5 Article 32 of the ICC Statute 281
  10.5.1 The interplay between Articles 32 and 30 of the ICC Statute 281
  10.5.2 Interpreting Article 32 284
10.6 Concluding observations 285

11. Superior Orders 287
  11.1 Introduction 287
  11.2 Legal history 287
  11.3 Article 33 of the ICC Statute 293
    11.3.1 Text 293
    11.3.2 Three conditions 295
  11.4 International jurisprudence 296
  11.5 Superior orders in national law 299
    11.5.1 The conditional liability approach 299
    11.5.2 Absolute liability approach 301
    11.5.3 A combined approach 302
    11.5.4 Justification or excuse? 303
  11.6 Battlefield reality 304
  11.7 Concluding observations 306

Annex: Selected Provisions 307
Bibliography 313
Index 333