THE INTERNATIONAL COMPETITION NETWORK AT TEN

Origins, Accomplishments and Aspirations

Edited by

Paul Lugard
## CONTENTS

_Acknowledgements_ ................................................................. v

From Ditchley Park to The Hague – A Journey Worthwhile  
Pieter Kalbfleisch ................................................................. 1

The ICN at Ten. Origins, Accomplishments and Aspirations:  
An Introduction  
Paul Lugard ................................................................. 5

1. Introduction ................................................................. 5
2. About this Publication ................................................................. 7
3. Scope and Depth ................................................................. 9
4. The Origins of the ICN ............................................................... 10
5. Accomplishments of the ICN ....................................................... 11
6. Implementation of ICN Work Product ........................................... 12
7. Involvement of Non-governmental Advisors (“NGAs”) ................. 14
8. Continued Convergence or Informed Divergence? ....................... 16
9. Future Directions ............................................................... 16

The Origins of the ICN  
Merit E. Janow and James F. Rill ............................................. 21

1. Introduction ................................................................. 21
2. Certain Historical Developments Leading Up to ICPAC ............... 22
   1.1. The Structural Impediments Initiative ........................................ 23
   1.2. Other Justice Department Initiatives to Expand International  
        Antitrust Cooperation ...................................................... 25
   1.3. The Inclusion of Competition Policy as a Potential Agenda Issue  
        for the Trade Community ................................................. 26
   1.4. Periodic Sources of Tension .................................................. 26
   1.5. Assistant Attorney General Joel Klein’s Initiative to Create ICPAC .......... 28
3. The Work and Recommendations of ICPAC .................................. 28
4. The ICN as Proposed by ICPAC ............................................... 29
5. Support for the Concept .......................................................... 31
6. Ditchley Park: An Important Step Forward .................................... 34
## Contents

7. Post Ditchley Park: The Road to Fordham ........................................... 35
8. Concluding Observations................................................................. 36

### From the Halls of Geneva to the Shores of the Low Countries:
The Origins of the International Competition Network
Francois SOUTY ................................................................. 39

1. Why Discussions Concerning Competition Policy Some Time
   Remained Within the Halls of Geneva? ........................................... 40
2. The Geneva WGTCP Proposals and the 2000 ICPAC Report: Setting the
   Prospective ICN Agenda and Guidelines as an Alternative to the WTO... 43
3. “No Bricks and Mortar”: The Creation of the First “Ten-Year ICN
   Agenda” at the Naples Annual Conference .................................... 46
4. Conclusion: To the Shores of the Low Countries .............................. 49

### The International Competition Network: Its Past, Current and Future Role
Hugh M. HOLLMAN and William E. KOVACIC ..................................... 51

1. Introduction ......................................................................................... 51
2. Convergence: Meaning and Methods ................................................ 54
3. ICN in Context: The Major International Competition Networks .......... 61
4. OECD ............................................................................................... 63
5. UNCTAD ......................................................................................... 68
6. WTO ............................................................................................... 72
7. ICN ................................................................................................. 73
8. Interaction with Other Networks ......................................................... 80
9. Convergence Possibilities, Shortcomings & Solutions ......................... 82
10. Earlier Attempts at a Global Competition Law...................................... 83
11. The Havana Chapter ........................................................................ 85
12. ICN: Possible Foundation for International Rules ............................... 88
13. Conclusion: ICN in Its Second Decade .............................................. 90

### The International Competition Network and the OECD Competition
Committee: Differences, Similarities and Complementarities
Frederic JENNY ................................................................. 93

1. The Nature of the Memberships and the Mandates of OECD and ICN.... 93
2. The Plurilateral Nature of OECD Competition Committee Membership
   and the Multilateral Nature of the ICN Membership .......................... 95
3. The OECD Brick and Mortar Organization Versus the ICN Virtual
   Organization .................................................................................... 98
4. The Role of Business Representatives in the ICN and the OECD .......... 100
Contents

5. The Work Products of the ICN and the OECD Competition Committee . 102
6. Conclusion ................................................................. 104

Linked-In: Antitrust and the Virtues of a Virtual Network
Eleanor M. Fox ................................................................. 105

1. Introduction ................................................................. 105
2. Antitrust, the World, and the Stalled Possibility of a Global System ..... 106
   2.1. What Is Antitrust Law? ............................................. 106
   2.2. Why Antitrust Needs a Global Framework .................... 108
   2.3. The Agenda for World Antitrust Law and Why It Has Failed .... 110
3. The Rise of the Network ................................................ 113
   3.1. The Birth of the ICN .............................................. 113
   3.2. The Functioning and Evolution of the ICN .................... 117
4. Assessment: Effectiveness, Legitimacy, Sufficiency .................... 123
   4.1. Effectiveness: Is the ICN Effective? .......................... 123
   4.2. Legitimacy: Is the ICN Legitimate? ............................ 125
   4.3. Sufficiency: Is the ICN Sufficient? ............................ 126
   4.4. Does the ICN Have Power? ...................................... 127
   4.5. Implications of the Hypothesis of ICN’s Power or Influence: The Importance of Convergence Versus the Importance of Recognizing Diversity ........................................... 131
5. Conclusion ................................................................. 132

Acta Non Verba: Keep ‘Talking Shop’, Don’t Become Another Talking Shop
Philip Marsden ................................................................. 135

1. WTO: ‘Trade and ...’: Competition Policy as Suffix and Bargaining Chip . 140
2. UNCTAD: ‘Development and ...’: Competition Policy as Suffix and Luxury Item ...................................................... 141
3. OECD: ‘... and Economic policy’: Competition Policy as Prefix to Broader Inter-governmental Issues ........................................ 142

The ICN in the Context of International Antitrust Institutions
D. Daniel Sokol ................................................................. 149

1. Introduction ................................................................. 149
2. Problems of International Antitrust ................................... 150
   2.1. Mergers .............................................................. 151
   2.2. Cartels .............................................................. 152
   2.3. Unilateral Conduct ................................................. 152
   2.4. Government and Mixed Restraints .............................. 153
3. Global Institutions .................................................. 153
   3.1. Soft Law ....................................................... 153
4. Conclusion ......................................................... 159

The ICN and Global Competition Convergence. Reflections on Its Origins, Its Achievements and Its Future
   Carles ESTEVA MOSSO ........................................... 163

1. Origins ............................................................. 163
2. Achievements ..................................................... 165
   2.1. Mergers ....................................................... 166
   2.2. Cartels ....................................................... 168
   2.3. Unilateral Conduct ......................................... 170
3. Future Direction ................................................ 171

Competition Agencies and Global Markets: The Challenges Ahead
   John FINGLETON .................................................. 173

Introduction / Abstract ............................................. 173
1. Today’s Competition Enforcement Landscape – Increasing Globalisation and Proliferation of National Competition Regimes .... 174
2. Key Problems with the Current System of National Competition Enforcement in a Globalised World ........................................... 176
   2.1. Private Anti-competitive Behaviour .......................... 176
   2.2. Public Restrictions .......................................... 179
   2.3. Different Substantive Standards ............................... 181
   2.4. 'Informed Divergence' ....................................... 183
   2.5. Duplicative and Inconsistent Procedures .................... 184
3. The Role of International Networks ................................ 185
   3.1. Traditional Methods of International Cooperation ........... 185
   3.2. Supra-national Competition Law and Agency ............... 188
   3.3. Reliance on ‘Leading Jurisdictions’ ........................ 190
   3.4. Competition Networks ....................................... 190
   3.5. The Benefits of Competition Networks ...................... 191
   3.6. The EU Model ................................................ 193
   3.7. The ICN and OECD ........................................... 194
4. A Way Forward for the ICN ....................................... 197
   4.1. Medium to Long Term Objectives for the ICN ............... 198
5. Conclusion .......................................................... 200
Postscript ............................................................. 202
Some Reflections on the ICN
David Lewis.......................................................... 205

The Role of the International Competition Network (ICN) in the Promotion
of Competition in Developing Countries: The Case of Mexico
Eduardo Pérez Motta ................................................... 217

1. The Importance and Challenges of Competition Policy in Developing
Countries ................................................................. 217
2. The Role of the ICN in the Development of Competition Policy in
Developing Economies ................................................ 219
3. The Role of ICN in the Development of Competition Policy in Mexico .. 220
   3.1. Cartels ............................................................. 220
   3.2. Mergers ........................................................... 222
   3.3. Advocacy ........................................................ 224
4. Conclusion ............................................................ 226

Competition Policy, Abusive Dominance and Economic Development:
Some Thoughts
Maher M. Dabbah ...................................................... 227

1. Overview .............................................................. 227
2. The “Contexts” of the Topic ......................................... 229
3. The Different Types .................................................. 230
4. Is Abusive Dominance a Serious Issue in the Developing World? .... 231
5. Under-enforcement Against Abusive Dominance .................... 234
   5.1. The “Dominance” of Anti-cartel Enforcement and Competition
        Advocacy ............................................................... 235
   5.2. The Perception of Abusive Dominance Cases as “Hard” Cases .... 235
   5.3. The Question of Resources ...................................... 236
   5.4. The Provisions of the Law ....................................... 238
   5.5. Political Constraints ............................................. 241
       5.5.1. The Issue of Will ............................................. 243
       5.5.2. The Issue of Ability ........................................ 244
6. An International Perspective ........................................ 246
7. A Comment on Exploitative Abuses .................................. 248
8. Conclusions ............................................................ 250

Developing a Common Framework for Good Performances by Agencies
Annetje Ottow .......................................................... 251

1. Introduction: From Better Regulation to Better Regulators ............ 251
2. Reports on Good Market Supervision .................................. 254
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1. ICN Seminar on Competition Agency Effectiveness (2009)</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Model of Das &amp; Quintyn: The Four Pillars of Good Regulatory Governance</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Independence</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Accountability</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Transparency</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4. Integrity</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Principles of Enforcement</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**The Cartel Working Group in the ICN: Firm International Collusion That Would Make Cartelists Jealous...**
Kirtikumar Mehta and Ewoud Sakkers  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The Early International Cartel Workshops – The ICN Avant La Lettre...</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Coming Under the Umbrella of the ICN: The Constitution of the Cartel Working Group</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Aims and Scope of the Cartel Working Group</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Looking Forward: Challenges in Promoting International Cartel Enforcement Through the ICN</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Reflections on the ICN and its NGAs: Advocacy and Implementation**
Dave Anderson  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The NGA and the ICN</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. NGAs and Advocacy: The Private Actions Example</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Looking Forward</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusion</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**The Unilateral Conduct Working Group**
Cynthia Lewis Lagdameo and Andrew J. Heimert  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Past Achievements and Current Work</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Future Work</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Create New Work Product</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Promote Implementation of Work Product and Provide Training Opportunities</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Facilitate Discussion and Enhance Cooperation</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. Expand Participation by Members and NGAs.</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

3. Prospects for Convergence ........................................ 295
4. Informed Divergence ............................................. 295

   Maria COPPOLA and Cynthia LAGDAMEO .................................. 297

1. International Best Practice on Merger Control .................. 297
2. Current Landscape ............................................... 300
3. A Decade of Reform ............................................... 304
   3.1. Thresholds .................................................. 305
   3.2. Timing ..................................................... 306
   3.3. Review Periods .......................................... 306
4. Drivers of Reform ................................................. 307
   4.1. Designing Reforms ....................................... 309
   4.2. Support for Reforms .................................... 310
   4.3. Impetus for Reform ..................................... 311
5. Barriers to Implementation ....................................... 312
6. Conclusion ....................................................... 315

The Role of the ICN in Fostering Convergence – An NGA’s Perspective
   Ronald A. STERN .................................................. 321

1. Laying the Groundwork for Convergence ......................... 322
2. Providing Additional Tools & Encouragement to Promote Implementation ............................................ 324
3. Measuring Success – Real World Changes for the Better ...... 325
4. Unfinished Business and the ICN’s Agenda for Its Second Decade .... 329

The ICN – One of the Many International Priorities. A Portuguese Perspective
   Mariana TAVARES .................................................. 333

1. Introduction .......................................................... 333
2. General Considerations ........................................... 334
3. The Importance for Newer and Smaller Competition Agencies to Be Part of the International Antitrust Community .... 335
4. Some Specific Experiences of the Portuguese Competition Agency .... 336
5. The Need for Prioritisation – Within the Agency and Within the ICN .. 343
6. Final Remarks and Some Modest Suggestions for the Future .... 345
ICN Membership – Opportunities and Challenges for a Competition Authority
Dan SJÖBLOM and Monica WIDEGREN .................................................. 349

1. Why Did We Join the ICN? ................................................................. 349
2. Developments and Achievements of the ICN from Our Perspective ... 351
3. Benefits from a Competition Agency's Perspective .......................... 353
4. Challenges from a Competition Enforcement Agency Perspective ....... 354
5. The ICN in the Next Decade – Our Expectations .............................. 355

Enter the Dragon: Competition Law with Chinese Characteristics
Mark WILLIAMS ................................................................. 357

1. Introduction ...................................................................................... 357
2. Setting the Scene ............................................................................. 358
4. The Long March Toward Competition Law and the Rationale for Adoption .................................................................................. 363
5. Structure of the Antimonopoly Law .................................................. 364
  5.1. Which Entities are Subject to the AML Prohibitions? .................... 365
  5.2. Monopolistic Agreements ............................................................. 367
  5.3. Abuse of Dominance .................................................................... 368
  5.4. Initial Enforcement of the Monopoly Agreement and Abuse of Dominance Prohibitions .......................................................... 369
  5.5. Concentrations of Business Operators ......................................... 370
  5.6. Notification Thresholds ................................................................. 371
  5.7. Mode and Content of Notification ............................................... 372
  5.8. Process of Review ........................................................................ 373
  5.9. Substantive Standard of Review .................................................. 375
  5.10. Assessment of the Treatment of Concentrations Under the AML ... 377
  5.11. Challenges for the Future Development of the Merger Control System .................................................................................. 378
  5.12. Enforcement Agencies ............................................................... 379
  5.13. Investigatory Powers ................................................................. 380
  5.14. Penalties ...................................................................................... 380
  5.15. Appeals ...................................................................................... 381
  5.16. Future Trends ............................................................................. 381

A Perspective on the Role and Contribution of NGAs at the ICN
Calvin S. GOLDMAN, Robert E. KWINTER and Navin JONEJA .............. 383

1. Introduction ...................................................................................... 383
2. Merger Working Group ..................................................................... 385
## Contents

2.1. NGA Work Product in the MWG ............................... 386  
2.2. NGA Contribution to Merger Policy Dialogue at Conferences and Workshops ........................................ 387  
3. Unilateral Conduct Working Group ........................................ 388  
   3.1. NGA Comments on Work Products in the UCWG ............... 388  
   3.2. NGAs Work Product in the UCWG ............................... 389  
   3.3. NGAs Contribution to Unilateral Conduct Policy Dialogue at Conferences and Workshops ............................. 389  
4. Cartel Working Group .................................................. 390  
5. Agency Effectiveness Working Group ................................. 391  
   5.1. NGAs Offer Important Comments on Agency Effectiveness Work Products .................................................. 391  
   5.2. NGA Work Product on Agency Effectiveness ..................... 391  
   5.3. NGA Contribution to Agency Effectiveness Policy Dialogue at Conferences and Workshops ............................. 392  
6. Conclusion ............................................................... 392  

**The Authors** ................................................................... 395  
**Index** ............................................................................. 411