THE FUTURE OF FAMILY PROPERTY IN EUROPE

Edited by
KATHARINA BOELE-WOELKI
Jo Miles
JENS M. SCHERPE
CONTENTS

Preface ................................................................. v
List of authors ....................................................... xix

PART ONE - KEYNOTE LECTURE

FINANCIAL CONSEQUENCES OF DIVORCE: ENGLAND VERSUS
THE REST OF EUROPE
Mathew Thorpe ...................................................... 3

1. Introduction ......................................................... 4
2. History .............................................................. 4
3. The problem ......................................................... 5
4. Solutions ............................................................ 6
5. Domestic law reform ............................................. 8
6. Transfer ............................................................. 9
7. Moore v Moore ..................................................... 12
8. Agbaje v Agbaje ................................................... 13
9. Applicable law versus transfer ................................ 14
10. Conclusion ......................................................... 14

PART TWO - MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY LAW IN EUROPE

MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY LAW IN EUROPE
Walter Pintens ........................................................ 19

1. Property relations between spouses: a difference in approach between
civil and common law ............................................. 20
2. Default regime .................................................... 21
   2.1. Community of acquests in the Romanic legal family and in
        Eastern European legal systems .......................... 22
       2.1.1. Composition of the categories of property ...... 23
       2.1.2. Administration of assets ............................ 25
       2.1.3. Liquidation and distribution ....................... 26
INITIAL RESULTS OF THE WORK OF THE CEFL IN THE FIELD OF PROPERTY RELATIONS BETWEEN SPOUSES
KATHARINA BOELE-WOELKI and MAARIT JÄNTERÄ-JAREBORG

Introductory remarks
1. Preparatory results
2. The existing European and international legal framework
3. Guiding principles
4. Cross-border relationships
5. Other proposals and the CEFL
6. Crucial choices and considerations
7. Structure
8. Concepts
  8.1. Rights and duties
  8.2. Community of acquisitions
  8.3. Participation in acquisitions
  8.4. Marital property agreements
Concluding remarks
PART THREE - FAMILY CONTRACTS - ISSUES OF AUTONOMY

CONTRACTING IN FAMILY LAW: A EUROPEAN PERSPECTIVE
Nina Dethloff ............................................................... 65

1. Introduction .......................................................... 67
2. Party autonomy and the consequences of divorce - Divergence and convergence ......................................................... 70
   2.1. Role of party autonomy in view of the different statutory rules - The traditional gap ...................................................... 70
   2.2. Marital agreements in recent English case law - Narrowing of the gap ................................................................. 72
   2.3. Contractual freedom in Continental European matrimonial property law - Preconditions and limits ........................................ 74
      2.3.1. Formal requirements ................................................ 74
      2.3.2. Pre- and post-nuptial agreements .................................. 76
      2.3.3. General rules of contract law ........................................ 76
      2.3.4. Special provisions in matrimonial law ............................ 79
   2.4. Contractual freedom regarding maintenance and other financial consequences of divorce ................................................ 81
3. Autonomy and its boundaries - Perspectives ........................................ 84
   3.1. The principle of self-determination .................................... 84
   3.2. The boundaries of contractual freedom ................................ 85
      3.2.1. Their justification .................................................... 85
      3.2.2. The requirement of special provisions ............................ 87
         3.2.2.1. Procedural safeguards .......................................... 87
         3.2.2.2. Judicial control .................................................. 89
         3.2.2.3. Criteria for fairness - fundamental principles of statutory rules as yardstick .................................................. 90
            3.2.2.3.1. Compensation for marriage-related economic disparities ............................................. 90
            3.2.2.3.2. Consequences for party autonomy ....................... 91
               3.2.2.3.2.1. Limits on waiving compensation for marriage-related detriments .................................................. 91
               3.2.2.3.2.2. Consideration of the overall financial consequences .................................................. 93
4. Conclusion ............................................................. 94
MARITAL PROPERTY AGREEMENTS AND THE WORK OF THE LAW COMMISSION FOR ENGLAND AND WALES

ELIZABETH COOKE .......................................................... 95

1. Introduction .......................................................... 96
2. The Law Commission's project on marital property agreements .......... 97
3. The current law ...................................................... 98
   3.1. Separation of property during marriage: .............................. 98
   3.2. The law of ancillary relief ........................................... 98
4. Marital property agreements: The current law in England and Wales .. 102
5. Marital property agreements: The options for reform .................... 103
   5.1. A small step ..................................................... 104
   5.2. Going further: The arguments for and against enforceable contracts .................................................. 105
   5.3. Enforceable contracts: The pre-conditions for validity .......... 107
   5.4. Enforceable contracts: The remaining scope for discretion .... 109
6. Conclusion .................................................................. 112

COHABITANT OBLIGATIONS: CONTRACT VERSUS STATUS

MARSHA GARRISON ......................................................... 115

1. Cohabitation and family property law: Tradition and change .......... 116
2. New regulatory regimes: How should we choose? ......................... 119
   2.1. Goals and questions ................................................. 119
   2.2. Cohabitation and marriage: The same or different? .............. 120
   2.3. Contract and registration: Can choice ensure fairness? .......... 127
3. Conclusion .................................................................. 136

PART FOUR - PROTECTION OF OLDER PEOPLE IN LAW

‘LIVING WILL’ LAW UNDER THE GERMAN CIVIL CODE

ALEXANDRA MASCHWITZ .................................................. 141

1. Introduction .......................................................... 142
2. The protection of elderly persons esp. concerning medical care ...... 143
   2.1. Rights and interests ................................................. 143
   2.2. National measures .................................................. 144
3. The “living will” in Germany ............................................. 146
   3.1. Historical development .............................................. 146
   3.2. Legal definition ..................................................... 147
THE PROTECTION OF ELDERLY FAMILY MEMBERS AND THE ROLE OF THE STATE: A FAMILY LAW PERSPECTIVE
IRENA MAJSTOROVIĆ

1. Changes in definition, the role and the function of a family .......... 164
2. Croatian legislation related to the protection of elderly people ... 166
   2.1. The Constitution ........................................ 167
   2.2. International agreements ................................ 167
   2.3. Family Act .............................................. 168
   2.4. Social welfare Act ....................................... 169
   2.5. Act on the prevention of discrimination ................... 170
3. On guardianship, maintenance and protection from family violence as particularly important areas of human rights protection of elderly people ........................................ 170
4. Guardianship ................................................................ 172
   4.1. General remarks .......................................... 172
   4.2. Croatian family law legislation ........................... 173
   4.3. The role of the state ...................................... 175
5. Maintenance .................................................................. 176
   5.1. General remarks .......................................... 176
   5.2. Croatian family law legislation ........................... 177
   5.3. The role of the state ...................................... 179
6. Protection from family violence ....................................... 181
   6.1. General remarks .......................................... 181
   6.2. Croatian legislation ....................................... 182
   6.3. The role of the state ...................................... 183
7. Concluding notes ..................................................... 184
NON-INSTITUTIONAL CARE FOR SENIORS FROM A CIVIL LAW PERSPECTIVE. A comparative study of housing with services and adult placement in France and Germany

ELENI ZERVOGIANNI

1. Introduction ................................................. 186
2. Specialist housing for seniors coupled with services .................................................. 188
  2.1. General remarks ........................................... 188
  2.2. Specialist housing with services in Germany ...................................................... 189
    2.2.1. Housing with general support services ....................................................... 190
    2.2.2. Housing with major care and assistance services for dependent seniors ............. 193
  2.3. Specialist housing with services in France ...................................................... 194
    2.3.1. Logements-foyers ........................................ 194
    2.3.2. Résidences services ....................................... 195
  2.4. Evaluation of the results ........................................... 197
3. Adult placement ............................................. 198
  3.1. General remarks ........................................... 198
  3.2. Adult placement in Germany ........................................... 199
  3.3. Adult placement in France ........................................... 201
  3.4. Evaluation of the results ........................................... 204
4. Comparative conclusions ........................................... 204

CARING BY CONTRACT: CARE ARRANGEMENTS FOR OLDER PEOPLE

JOELLE LONG .................................................................. 207

1. Introduction ................................................. 208
2. Converting the family home into long term care ...................................................... 210
3. Care arrangements for older people as a single genus ............................................. 218
  3.1. Common features ........................................... 218
  3.2. General issues ............................................. 219
    3.2.1. The competence of the frail older people .................................................... 219
    3.2.2. The relationship with care obligations established by the law ......................... 223
4. Conclusion ..................................................... 224
**PART FIVE - FREEDOM OF TESTATION AND PROTECTION OF FAMILY MEMBERS**

**BALANCING INTERESTS – HOW MUCH FREEDOM OF TESTATION?**  
**JOHN ASLAND**  .......................................................... 229

1. Introduction ......................................................... 230
2. Balancing of interests under Norwegian inheritance law  .................................................. 235
   2.1. Introduction .................................................. 235
   2.2. Inheritance rights for cohabitants  .................................................. 235
   2.3. Inheritance with free right to dispose *inter vivos* and *mortis causa* 237
   2.4. Minimum inheritance and legitimate portion  .................................................. 239
   2.5. *Uskifte* ................................................... 241
   2.6. Distribution based on needs .................................................. 245
3. Conclusions ........................................................ 246

**TESTAMENTARY FREEDOM AND CARING ADULT OFFSPRING IN ENGLAND & WALES AND IRELAND**  
**BRIAN SLOAN** .......................................................... 251

1. Introduction ......................................................... 252
2. The purposes of succession law .................................................. 253
   2.1. Giving effect to the wishes of the deceased  .................................................. 253
   2.2. The preservation and security of the family .................................................. 254
   2.3. The welfare of society .................................................. 257
   2.4. Summary ....................................................... 259
3. Family provision and caring offspring in England & Ireland .................................................. 259
   3.1. An outline of English and Irish succession law .................................................. 259
   3.2. General approach to claims by adult offspring .................................................. 263
   3.3. Care and the deceased’s obligations .................................................. 268
   3.4. Care, conduct and neglect .................................................. 271
   3.5. The significance of a promise of provision .................................................. 273
4. Conclusions and scope for development in the law .................................................. 275

**PART SIX - CHILD MAINTENANCE**

**THE LINK BETWEEN CHILD MAINTENANCE AND CONTACT**  
**BRANKA REŠETAR** .......................................................... 279

1. Introduction ......................................................... 280
2. (Non-)linking between contact and maintenance in some European legal systems .................................................. 282

*Intersentia* xiii
2.1. German law .......................................................... 282
2.2. Croatian law ......................................................... 284
2.3. English law .......................................................... 286
2.4. Swedish law .......................................................... 289
2.5. Comparative conclusion ......................................... 291
3. Results of interdisciplinary research ............................ 293
4. Conclusion ............................................................. 295

PARENTAL MAINTENANCE OBLIGATIONS TOWARDS CHILDREN IN CENTRAL EUROPE: THE HIGHWAY TO HELL OR A STAIRWAY TO HEAVEN?
MARTIN KORNEL ............................................................... 297

Summary ................................................................. 298
1. Introduction .......................................................... 298
2. Soviet law as the new family law paradigm (1945–1963) .......... 299
4. Family law after the transition (1990–2010) ....................... 305
5. Are we going to hell or to heaven? ................................. 308

THE PRE-HARMONIZATION AREA: A COMPARISON OF LITHUANIAN, LATVIAN AND ESTONIAN CHILD MAINTENANCE LAWS
GEDIMINAS SAGATYS .......................................................... 311

1. Introduction .......................................................... 312
2. Historical background .............................................. 313
2.1. The period of Soviet occupation ................................. 313
2.2. Family legislation after the restoration of independence ....... 315
3. Child maintenance law .............................................. 316
3.1. The creditor ......................................................... 317
3.2. The debtor .......................................................... 319
3.3. The courts’ discretionary powers ................................. 320
3.4. Forms of child maintenance .................................... 322
3.5. Minimum amount of child maintenance ....................... 324
4. Conclusions .......................................................... 325
PART SEVEN - UNIFICATION OF PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL FAMILY LAW

THE UNIFICATION OF PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW IN EUROPE: A SUCCESS STORY?
Cristina González Beilfuss .................................................. 329

1. Introduction ................................................................. 330
2. Is complexity the price that has to be paid? ....................... 332
3. The relationship between European private international law and national substantive and procedural law .................... 335
4. Private international law unification and legal diversity .......... 338
5. Final remarks ............................................................. 340

THE EUROPEANISATION OF INTERNATIONAL SUCCESSION LAW
Anatol Dutta ................................................................. 341

1. The European succession project ..................................... 342
2. Three general questions ................................................ 346
   2.1. A monist or a dualist approach? ................................. 346
   2.2. The nationality or residence principle? ......................... 347
   2.3. Freedom to choose the applicable law? ......................... 350
3. The scope of the future European lex hereditatis .................. 354
4. Some special issues .................................................... 356
   4.1. Protection of family members and 'clawback' provisions ... 356
   4.2. Testamentary dispositions: Formal validity ................... 357
   4.3. Testamentary dispositions: Existence, material validity, effects and interpretation ........................................ 357
   4.4. Testamentary trusts and statutory trusts upon intestacy .... 358
   4.5. Rights of the State in heirless estates and simultaneous deaths .. 358
   4.6. Administration of the estate ..................................... 358
5. Interaction with neighbouring conflict rules ....................... 359
6. Annex: Selected legal materials ..................................... 361
FREEDOM OF TESTATION AND THE PROTECTION OF THE FAMILY IN PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW
Pia Lokin .................................................. 369

1. Introduction ............................................. 370
2. The Hague Convention and the future European Regulation on Succession ............................................. 372
   2.1. The Hague Convention .................................. 372
   2.2. The future European Regulation on Succession .......... 374
       2.2.1. Report by the German Notary Institute .............. 375
       2.2.2. European Parliament ................................ 376
       2.2.3. The European Succession Proposal .................. 376
3. Conclusions ............................................. 380

EU SUCCESSION REGULATION: CHOICE OF APPLICABLE LAW AND PROTECTION OF FAMILY MEMBERS
Anna Wysocka ............................................. 383

1. Introduction ............................................. 384
2. Applicable law - General rule ................................ 387
3. Choice of the applicable law ................................ 390
   3.1. Protection of family members by excluding the possibility to choose the applicable law ...................... 391
   3.2. Protection of family members by providing an exhaustive list of laws that may be chosen by the future deceased ...... 393
   3.3. Protection of family members by limiting the implications of the choice of the applicable law by the deceased .......... 399
   3.4. Protection of family members by referring to public policy ........................................ 402
   3.5. Protection of family members by following special rules provided in the Member States' private international law .......... 404
4. Conclusion ............................................. 405

INTERNATIONAL CHILD MAINTENANCE IN EUROPE
Philip Bremner* ........................................... 407

Introduction ............................................. 408
2. The 2009 Special Commission ................................ 413
3. Enforcement under the EU Maintenance Regulation .......... 416
4. Relationship between the EU Regulation and the Hague Convention ........................................ 417
Conclusion ............................................. 419
PART EIGHT – CLOSING REMARKS

THE FUTURE OF FAMILY PROPERTY IN EUROPE

Jo Miles and Jens M. Scherpe ........................................ 423

1. Common law meets civil law ........................................ 424
2. Shared social and legal policy challenges ......................... 425
3. Matrimonial property and maintenance: Joint or several issues? 426
4. A special domestic problem: The family home .................... 428
5. The scope for autonomy ............................................. 429
6. Private international law ............................................ 431
7. Conclusions – and the road ahead ................................ 432