CRIMINAL LAW

TJ McIntyre
Sinead McMullan
Seán Ó Toghda
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Foreword</th>
<th>vii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Legislation</td>
<td>xxxi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 1 GENERAL PRINCIPLES

- **Defining the Criminal Law** ................................................. 1
  - **Background** ..................................................................... 1
  - **Nature of the criminal law** .......................................... 3
  - **Effect of the civil–criminal distinction** .......................... 5
  - **The indicia of a criminal offence** .................................. 6
  - **Administrative penalties** ............................................. 8
  - **Tribunals of inquiry** .................................................. 11
  - **Proceeds of crime legislation** ....................................... 13
  - **Criminal offences under the European Convention on Human Rights** ................................................. 16
- **Classification of Crimes** ................................................ 20
  - **Felonies, misdemeanours and treason** .............................. 20
  - **Summary and indictable offences** .................................... 22
  - **Minor and non-minor offences** ....................................... 25
  - **Serious and non-serious offences** ................................... 30
  - **Arrestable and non-arrestable offences** ............................ 32
- **Fundamental Principles of Criminal Law** ............................. 35
  - **The presumption of innocence** ....................................... 35
  - **The principle of legality** ............................................ 45

## CHAPTER 2 MENTAL ELEMENT OF CRIMES

- **Introduction** ................................................................. 52
- **Intention** .......................................................................... 53
  - **Defining “intention”** ................................................... 53
  - **The problem of indirect/oblique intention** ......................... 54
  - **The English approach to oblique intention** ......................... 54
  - **The Irish approach to oblique intention** ............................ 57
  - **The presumption of intention** ......................................... 60
  - **Reform of intention** .................................................... 61
  - **Recklessness** ............................................................... 61
    - **Irish approach** .......................................................... 62
    - **The approach in England and Wales** ............................... 64
- **Criminal Negligence** ........................................................ 68
  - **Negligence** ...................................................................... 68
  - **Strict or Absolute Liablity** ........................................... 68
    - **Introduction** ............................................................. 68
    - **Strict liability versus absolute liability** ......................... 69
### CRIMINAL LAW

*Determining whether an offence is one of strict liability* ........................................... 69  
*The Irish approach pre-CC v Ireland* ................................................................. 71  
*The constitutional status of strict liability offences and CC v Ireland* ................. 73  
*The Irish approach since CC v Ireland* ............................................................... 76  
The Doctrine of Transferred Malice ................................................................. 77

### CHAPTER 3 ACTION ELEMENT OF CRIMES

**Introduction** ......................................................... 81  
Actus Reus as a State of Affairs ................................................. 81  
Actus Reus and Mens Rea must coincide ............................................. 83  
The Actus Reus may be an Omission ..................................................... 84  
  *Duty of parents towards their children* ............................................... 85  
  *Duty voluntarily assumed* ................................................................. 86  
  *Creation of a danger* ................................................................. 87  
  *Duty under contract* ................................................................. 88  
  *Statutory duties to act* ................................................................. 89  
  *Is the act–omission distinction artificial?* ........................................ 89  
Actus Reus and Causation ................................................................. 90  
  *Break in the chain of causation?—Novus actus interveniens* .............. 92  
  *Can a victim of crime break the chain of causation by his own actions?* 94

### CHAPTER 4 HOMICIDE

**General Principles** ..................................................... 96  
  *Year-and-a-day-rule* ................................................................. 96  
  *Absence of a body* ................................................................. 97  
**Murder** ................................................................. 97  
  *Of sound memory and of the age of discretion* .................................. 97  
  *Unlawfully killeth* ................................................................. 98  
  *Within any county of the realm* .................................................. 98  
  *Any reasonable creature in rerum natura* ....................................... 98  
  *Under the King’s peace* ............................................................ 100  
  *With malice aforethought* .......................................................... 100  
  *Either expressed by the party or implied by law* .............................. 101  
  *So as the party, wounded or hurt, etc. die of the wound or hurt, etc. within a year and a day after the same* .................................................. 102  
  *Attempted murder* ................................................................. 102  
  *Aggravated murder* ................................................................. 102  
  *Murder and the defences* ........................................................... 104  
  *Mandatory sentence for murder* .................................................. 104  
  *The murder–manslaughter distinction* .......................................... 109  
  *Should the mens rea for murder include an intention to cause serious injury?* ................................................................. 112  
  *Should the mens rea for murder be expanded to include other fault elements?* ................................................................. 113  
**Manslaughter** ............................................................. 114  
  *Manslaughter by criminal negligence* .......................................... 115  
  *Manslaughter by criminal and dangerous act* .................................. 121  
  *Death on the roads* ................................................................. 125  
**Suicide** ................................................................. 126
**Table of Contents**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Table of Contents</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Legality of suicide</strong></td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Suicide pacts</strong></td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Assisted suicide</strong></td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Euthanasia</strong></td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Discontinuation of medical treatment</strong></td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Infanticide</strong></td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 5</strong></td>
<td><strong>SEXUAL OFFENCES</strong></td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Rape</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Actus reus of common law rape</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Section 4 rape</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Consent</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Consent vitiated by fraud</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fraud as to existence of HIV or other diseases</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Consent vitiated by fear</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Incapacity to give consent</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Mens Rea of Sexual Offences</strong></td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Honest but unreasonable belief in consent</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recklessness as to consent</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Sexual Assault and Aggravated Sexual Assault</strong></td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Incest</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Incest by a male</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Incest by a female</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Punishment of incest</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reform</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Sexual Offences Against the Mentally Handicapped</strong></td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Sexual Abuse of Children</strong></td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Statutory rape—unlawful carnal knowledge</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Defilement of a child under the age of 15 years and defilement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>of a child under the age of 17 years</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reckless endangerment of children</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Child trafficking and pornography</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Child sex tourism</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Register of sex offenders</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Human Trafficking</strong></td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 6</strong></td>
<td><strong>OFFENCES AGAINST THE PERSON</strong></td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Background</strong></td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Assault</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Consent</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Corporal punishment</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Force</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Immediacy</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Causes another to believe</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can words alone amount to an assault?</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect use of force</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Punishment</strong></td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Assault Causing Harm</strong></td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Punishment</strong></td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Causing Serious Harm</strong></td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Is consent a defence to causing serious harm? .......................... 173
Punishment .................................................. 176
Threats to Kill or Cause Serious Harm ..................................... 176
Punishment .................................................. 177
Syringe Attacks And Related Offences ..................................... 177
Punishment .................................................. 178
Possession of syringes .............................................. 178
Coercion .................................................... 179
Punishment .................................................. 179
Harassment .................................................. 179
Mens rea .................................................... 180
Persistently .................................................. 181
Lawful authority or reasonable excuse ..................................... 182
Non-contact orders .............................................. 182
Punishment .................................................. 183
Demands for Payment of Debts .............................................. 183
Poisoning .................................................... 183
Endangerment .................................................. 184
Endangering Traffic .............................................. 186
False Imprisonment .............................................. 187
Child Abduction .............................................. 188
Assault with Intent to Cause Bodily Harm or Commit an Indictable
Offence ...................................................... 189
Assault of Certain Classes of Workers ..................................... 189
Blackmail ..................................................... 190

CHAPTER 7 OFFENCES AGAINST PROPERTY .................................. 192
Criminal Justice (Theft and Fraud Offences) Act 2001 ................. 192
Introduction .................................................. 192
Theft ......................................................... 192
Background .................................................. 192
Dishonestly: without a claim of right made in good faith ............ 193
Intention to temporarily or permanently deprive ..................... 195
Actus reus of theft .......................................... 195
Fraud Offences .............................................. 197
Background .................................................. 197
Making a gain or causing a loss by deception ......................... 198
Obtaining services by deception ....................................... 199
Making off without payment ......................................... 199
Unlawful use of a computer ......................................... 200
False accounting .............................................. 201
Suppression, etc. of documents ....................................... 201
Handling stolen property .......................................... 201
Possession of stolen property ....................................... 202
Withholding information regarding stolen property ............... 203
Burglary ...................................................... 203
Trespass ..................................................... 204
Entering a building or part of a building ............................... 206
Burglary: the mental element ....................................... 208
Aggravated burglary .......................................... 209
Robbery ..................................................... 211
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table of Contents</th>
<th>xv</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Possession of Certain Articles</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forgery and Counterfeiting Offences.</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arson and Criminal Damage</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defence of lawful excuse</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Damaging property</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Damaging property with intent to endanger life or recklessness as to whether life would be endangered</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Damaging property with intent to defraud</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arson</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threats to damage property</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possessing any thing with intent to damage property</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unauthorised accessing of data</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 8  OFFENCES AGAINST THE ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perjury</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On oath or affirmation</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Before a competent court or authority in the course of a judicial proceeding</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material to the matter in question</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Which to the knowledge of such person is false, or which, whether true or false, he does not believe to be true, or as to which he knows himself to be ignorant</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case law</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reform</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attempting to Pervert the Course of Justice</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contempt of Court</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil versus criminal contempt.</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types of criminal contempt</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scandalising the court</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mens rea and criminal contempt</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reform of the law of contempt of court</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 9  PUBLIC ORDER OFFENCES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Offences Relating to Public Order</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of “public place”</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intoxication in a public place</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offensive conduct in a public place</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offence of threatening, abusive or insulting behaviour in a public place</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offence of breach of the peace contrary to common law</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Display of material which is threatening, abusive, insulting or obscene</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offence of failure to comply with direction of member of An Garda Síochána</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obstruction offences</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Begging Offences</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offence of begging</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Offence of failure to comply with a Garda direction to desist from begging ........................................ 249
Offences related to organised begging. ........................................ 249
Trespass Offences ........................................ 250
Criminal trespass ........................................ 250
Offence of entering a building or curtilage with intent to commit an offence ........................................ 252
Offence of trespass on a building or curtilage causing fear in another person ........................................ 253
Offences relating to entering and occupying land without consent ........................................ 254
Riot, Violent Disorder and Affray ........................................ 255
Riot ........................................ 255
Violent disorder ........................................ 256
Affray ........................................ 257

CHAPTER 10 DEFENCES SPECIFIC TO MURDER ........................................ 260
Introduction ........................................ 260
Diminished Responsibility ........................................ 260
Provocation ........................................ 261
Introduction ........................................ 261
Historical background ........................................ 262
The Irish position on provocation: subjective test ........................................ 263
Immediacy requirement ........................................ 267
Excessive Self Defence ........................................ 268

CHAPTER 11 GENERAL DEFENCES ........................................ 271
Duress ........................................ 271
Imminence of threats ........................................ 272
The nature of the threats ........................................ 273
Objective or subjective test? ........................................ 274
Application to murder ........................................ 274
Membership of a violent organisation ........................................ 275
Duress and marital coercion ........................................ 277
Law Reform Commission recommendations ........................................ 277
Necessity ........................................ 279
When can necessity be used as a defence? ........................................ 279
Necessity and murder ........................................ 281
Lawful Use of Force ........................................ 283
Defence of the person ........................................ 283
Protection from trespass to the person; defence of property; prevention of crime. ........................................ 284
Preparation in anticipation of an attack ........................................ 285
Self-induced self defence ........................................ 285
Force ........................................ 286
Criminal Law (Defence and the Dwelling) Act 2011 ........................................ 287
Other defences preserved ........................................ 287
Proportionality of response ........................................ 288
Mistake and self defence ........................................ 288
Defence and the dwelling ........................................ 288
Table of Contents

Intoxication ........................................ 293
  Dutch courage .................................. 294
  Basic/specific intent .......................... 294
  Intoxication under Irish law .................. 297
  Intoxication by other drugs .................. 299
  Involuntary intoxication ....................... 299
  Law Reform Commission ........................ 300
Mistake ............................................ 300
Consent ............................................ 302
Infancy ............................................ 302
Entrapment ........................................ 304
  Traditional approach to entrapment ........ 304
  Modern English approach ..................... 305
  United States approach ....................... 305
  Influence of the European Convention on Human Rights 306
  Irish approach ................................ 307
Automatism ....................................... 309
  Definition .................................... 309
  Defence unavailable in cases of voluntary intoxication 310
  External factors versus internal factors .... 311
  Self-induced automatism ...................... 313
  Loss of control must be total ................ 314
Insanity ........................................... 315
  Insanity under Irish law pre-2006 .......... 315
  Reform of defence of insanity ............... 321
  Section 4 of the Criminal Law (Insanity) Act 2006: fitness to be tried .... 321
  Section 5: verdict of not guilty by reason of insanity ........ 323
  Section 6: diminished responsibility ....... 323
  Procedural aspects ............................ 324
  Unconstitutionality ............................ 326

CHAPTER 12 INCHOATE OFFENCES ................. 328
Introduction ...................................... 328
Attempt ............................................ 329
  Introduction .................................. 329
  Actus reus of attempt ......................... 331
  Mens rea of attempt .......................... 335
  Identifying the types of offences that may be attempted ............ 337
  Legal impossibility and factual impossibility ................. 338
  Abandonment .................................. 338
Conspiracy ........................................ 339
  Introduction .................................. 339
  Actus reus of conspiracy: an agreement ......................... 339
  The object of conspiracy ....................... 342
  Mens rea of conspiracy ........................ 344
  Specific offences of conspiracy ............... 345
  Impossibility .................................. 347
  Abandonment .................................. 348
Incitement ........................................ 348
  Introduction .................................. 348
Actus reus of incitement .................. 350
Mens rea of incitement .................. 351
Impossibility .................. 353
Abandonment .................. 354
Specific offences of incitement .................. 354

CHAPTER 13 DEGREES OF COMPLICITY IN CRIME .................. 355
Introduction .................. 355
Criminal Law Act 1997 .................. 356
Innocent Agency .................. 358
Elements of secondary liability .................. 359
Secondary liability—the conduct element .................. 360
Aiding .................. 361
Abetting and counselling .................. 363
Procuring .................. 364
Failure to act or mere presence as an actus reus .................. 365
Secondary liability—the mental element .................. 369
The doctrine of common design/joint enterprise .................. 373
Victims as participants in crime .................. 378
Withdrawal .................. 379
Assistance after a crime has been committed .................. 380
Withholding information .................. 382

CHAPTER 14 CRIMINAL LIABILITY OF CORPORATIONS .................. 383
Introduction .................. 383
The Identification Doctrine—Controlling Mind—Directing
Mind Theory .................. 384
The Organisational—Aggregation Theory .................. 386
Statutory Construction Approach .................. 387
Restrictions on Corporate Liability
Where the corporation is incapable of committing the particular crime .................. 389
Where the corporation is the victim .................. 390
Where employees act contrary to instructions .................. 390
Punishment of Companies .................. 390
Corporate Manslaughter and Homicide Act 2007 (UK) .................. 391
The Irish Position .................. 392
Common law .................. 392
Law Reform Commission proposals .................. 393
Corporate Manslaughter Bill 2011 .................. 394

INDEX .................. 397