The Conflict of Laws in India

Inter-Territorial and Inter-Personal Conflict

V.C. Govindaraj

Oxford University Press
Contents

Foreword by Justice V.R. Krishna Iyer xvii
Preface xix

1. Introduction 1
   APPROPRIATENESS OF THE TITLE ‘CONFLICT OF LAWS’ 3
   AVOIDANCE OF CONFLICTS: WAYS AND MEANS 5
   UNIFICATION OF INTERNAL LAWS 5
   UNIFICATION OF RULES OF CHOICE OF LAW 6
   CONFLICT OF LAWS: ITS EVOLUTION IN RETROSPECT AND IN PROSPECT 8
   MODERN THEORIES OF CONFLICT OF LAWS: A BRIEF SURVEY 11
   The Doctrine of Comity 12
   The Doctrine of Public Policy 13
   Theory of Vested or Acquired Rights 14

2. Exclusion of Foreign Law 17
   FOREIGN LAW, FOREIGN JUDICIAL DECREES, AND INDIAN COURTS 17
   Public Policy 17
   Foreign Penal Law 18
   Foreign Revenue Law 19
   Foreign Public Law 19

3. Consecutive Stages of Conflict of Laws 22
   DETERMINATION OF CONFLICTS 22
   JUDICIAL JURISDICTION 23
   Consent 25
   Appearance in an Action 26
   What Amounts to Submission? 27
   What Does Not Amount to Submission? 27
Contents

JURISDICTION OF AN INDIAN COURT  28
CLASSIFICATION OF THE CAUSE OF ACTION  28
SELECTION OF THE Lex CAUSAEM  31
   The Incidental Question  33
   Depe'cage  34
   Application of the Lex Causae: Renvoi  34
   Indian Courts and the Doctrine of Renvoi  36

4. Domicile and Residence  40
   MEANING AND FUNCTION OF DOMICILE  40
   LIMITS OF DOMICILE AREAWISE  41
   DETERMINATION OF ACQUISITION OF DOMICILE  41
   DOMICILE IS A MUST FOR EVERYONE  41
   DOMICILE OF ORIGIN AND DOMICILE OF CHOICE:
      NATURE AND CHARACTER  41
   DOMICILE OF DEPENDENT PERSONS  42
      Married Woman  43
      Minors  44
      Domicile of Dependent Children: The 1973 Act
         vis-à-vis The Common Law Rules  45
      Mentally retarded persons  46
   DOMICILE OF CORPORATIONS  47
      Presence  47
      Residence  47
   DOMICILE, NATIONALITY, AND RESIDENCE  49
      Ordinary Residence and Habitual Residence  49

5. The Law of Obligations  53
   FOREIGN CONTRACTS  53
      FOREIGN CONTRACTS AND THE CONFLICTS
         RESOLUTION PROCESS  53
      EXPRESS CHOICE OF LAW  56
         Informed or Implied Intention  57
      INFERRED CHOICE OF LAW  57
      INFERENCE AS TO THE VALIDITY OF A CONTRACT IN CASE OF
         CONFLICT  57
      ABSENCE OF EXPRESS OR INFERRED CHOICE OF LAW  58
      PRESUMPTIONS RELATING TO THE PROPER LAW DOCTRINE  60
      DOES THE PROPER LAW SIGNIFY CONNECTION WITH
         A COUNTRY OR WITH THE SYSTEM OF LAW?  60
      TIME FACTOR AS AN AID TO INTERPRETATION  60
Contents

ix

THE DOCTRINE OF RENVOI VIS-À-VIS THE PROPER LAW 60
FOREIGN TORTS 62

6. Negotiable Instruments 69

THE MAKING AND ASSIGNMENT OF NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS 69
NEGOTIABILITY 70
NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS: THE GOVERNING LAW 70
LIABILITY 70
TRANSFERABILITY 71

7. Law of Persons: Marriage and Divorce 73

INTRODUCTION 73
SECTION I: PRE-SOLEMNIZATION REQUISITES 75
The Hindu Marriage Act, 1955 76
Christian Law: The Indian Christian Marriage Act, 1872 76
Muslim Law 76
The Parsi Marriage & Divorce Act, 1936 76
Special Marriage Act, 1954 77

THE INTENDED MATRIMONIAL HOME THEORY 78
Position in India 82
Ambiguity in the Concept of the Intended Matrimonial Home Theory 85

SECTION II: SOLEMNIZATION 86
Christian Law 87
Muslim Law 87
Parsi Law 87
Special Marriage Act, 1954 87
Hindu Law 88

SECTION III: DIVORCE 89
The pre-1955 Hindu Law 91
Hindu Law: Hindu Marriage Act, 1955 91
Aijesha Bibi v. Subhodh Chandra 91
Rakeya Bibi v. Anil Kumar Mukherji 92
Vileyati Raj v. Sunila 92
Promila Khosla v. Rajneesh Khosla 92
Christian Law 94
Muslim Law 94
Parsi Law: The Parsi Marriage & Divorce Act, 1936 95
The Special Marriage Act, 1954 96
Marriages with Foreign Elements 96
Contents

Nullity 97
  Hindu Law 97
  Muslim Law 97
  Christian Law 97
  Special Marriage Act, 1954 98
    Void Marriage 98
  Jurisdiction 100

Section IV: Marriages Solemnized under the Foreign Marriages Act, 1969. 100

Section V: Conversion of Spouses of the Hindu, Christian and Parsi Marriages to Islam: Right to Polygamy after Such Conversion 104
  The Hindu Marriage Act, 1955 104
    Sarveen Khatun v. M. Obadiah 105
    Robasa Khanum v. Khodadad Bomanji Irani 105

Parsi Law 107

Christian Law 107
  Sarvar Merwan Yazdiar v. Merwan Rashid Yazdiar 111

Special Marriage Act, 1954 112
  Aulvin V. Singh v. Chandravati 112
  Christopher Andrews Neelkantan v. Anne Neelkantan 112
  Abdul Rahim v. Smt. Padma Abdul Rahim 114

Conclusion 116


Introduction 125
  Custodial Orders of Minors as Part of Matrimonial Reliefs 126
  Custodial Orders of Minors Independent of Matrimonial Reliefs 126
  The Role of Courts as Parens Patriae 126
  Foreign Custody and Guardianship Order: Recognition 127
  Law Relating to Property of Children 127

Legitimacy and Legitimation 128
  Declaration of Legitimacy or Parentage:
    Jurisdictional Competence of Courts 128
    Proof of Legitimacy 128
    Jurisdictional Competence of Indian Courts to Grant Declarations of Legitimation 129

Adoption 129
  Nature and Scope 129
ADOPTION UNDER FOREIGN LAW OF ADOPTION 130
ADOPTION ORDERS OF INDIAN COURTS: THEIR RECOGNITION 131
FOREIGN ADOPTION ORDERS: THEIR RECOGNITION IN INDIA 131
FOREIGN ADOPTIONS: SUCCESSION RIGHTS OF ADOPTED PERSONS 131
MAINTENANCE ORDERS 131
SUITES FOR GRANT OF MATRIMONIAL RELIEFS 131
FINANCIAL PROVISION AS PART OF MAINTENANCE OBLIGATION 133
SERVICE OF PROCESS 133
PROOF OF DECLARATIONS AND OTHER DOCUMENTS 133
RECIPROCAL ENFORCEMENT OF MAINTENANCE ORDERS 133
ENFORCEMENT OF ORDERS 133

9. Validity of Marriage: Could it be Deemed an Omnific Concept in Conflicts Resolution of Related Issues?
THE AMERICAN REVOLUTION 138
SECTION 283: VALIDITY OF MARRIAGE 142
THE INSULATED APPROACH OF COURTS IN ENGLAND 145
THE HIDEBOUND ATTITUDE OF INDIAN COURTS TO MARRIAGE AND OTHER PERSONAL LAW ISSUES 150

10. Law of Property 155
CLASSIFICATION AND SITUS 155
CLASSIFICATION: A MATTER OF SEMANTICS 155
IMMOVABLES: AN INCLUSIVE CONCEPT 155
SITUS OF PROPERTY: GENERAL OBSERVATIONS 156
NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS AND OTHER TRANSFERABLE DOCUMENTS: THEIR LOCATION 157
JURISDICTION IN RESPECT OF FOREIGN IMMOVABLES 157
GENERAL RULES OF CONFLICT OF LAWS 157
EQUITABLE JURISDICTION IN PERSONAM 157
APPLICATION OF EQUITABLE PRINCIPLES: SCOPE AND EFFECT 158
ADMINISTRATION OF ESTATES AND TRUSTS 160
RULES OF CONFLICT OF LAWS IN RELATION TO IMMOVABLES 160
INTRODUCTION 160
CAPACITY 161
FORMALITIES 161
MATERIAL OR SUBSTANTIVE OR ESSENTIAL VALIDITY 162
MORTGAGE DEBT: CURRENCY FOR MEASUREMENT 162
LEX SITUS AND THE LAW OF LIMITATION 162
RULES OF CONFLICT OF LAWS IN RELATION TO MOVABLES 162
   LAW RELATING TO NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS AND
   DOCUMENTS OF TITLE 163
   LAW RELATING TO ASSIGNMENT OF BARE CHOSES IN ACTION 164
GOVERNMENT DECREES OF SEIZURE OF PRIVATE
PROPERTY: THEIR LEGAL EFFECTS (TERRITORIAL
AND EXTRA- TERRITORIAL) 164
THE LAW RELATING TO TRUSTS 165
   THE INDIAN TRUSTS AND APPLICABLE LAW 165
   THE SCOPE AND AMBIT OF THE APPLICABLE LAW 166
   THE GOVERNING LAW 166
   RECOGNITION OF TRUSTS 166
SUCCESSION 166
   ADMINISTRATION OF ESTATES 166
      Law Governing Administration 166
         Choice of Law 166
         Administration and Succession Distinguished 167
         Administration of Estates: Role of the Judiciary 167
      Legal Status of Personal Representative 168
         Legal Effect of Indian Grants 168
         Duties of the Executor 168
         Payment of Debts to Creditors 168
         Distribution and Remission of Net Assets 169
      Right, Duties, and Legal Liabilities of Foreign Personal
      Representative 169
         Legal Liabilities of Foreign Personal Representatives 169
   BENEFICIAL DISTRIBUTION 169
      Judicial Jurisdiction of an Indian Court 169
      Judicial Jurisdiction of Foreign Courts 170
      Choice of Law 170
         Succession to Moveables and Immovables: The Governing Law 170
         Renvoi 170
      Succession: Changes in the Law of Domicile of the Deceased 170
      Legal Effects of Grant of Representation 171
      Intestate Succession 171
      Testate Succession 171
         Capacity: Rules of Choice of Law 171
         Formal Validity under Common Law 171
         Formal Validity of a Will under the Indian Law of Succession 172
         Construction 172
         Wills in Foreign Languages 172
11. Insolvency and Corporations 197

INSOLVENCY 197

Insolvency Jurisdiction of an Indian Court 197
Effect of an Indian Bankruptcy Order on Debtor’s Property 197
Choice of Law in an Indian Insolvency 197
Discharge by Virtue of an Indian Order 198
Effect in India of Foreign Insolvencies 198

CORPORATIONS 198

Legal Status, Domicile, and Powers 199
Recognition of Foreign Corporations 199
Amalgamation 200
Dissolution 200
Domicile of Corporations 202
Powers of Foreign Corporations 202

Jurisdiction over Corporations 202

Corporations and Local Courts’ Jurisdiction 202
Corporations and Service of Summons 202
Winding Up of Corporations 203

Indian Courts: Their Jurisdictional Competence 203
The Scope and Ambit of an Indian Winding-up Order 203
The Scope and Ambit of a Foreign Winding-up Order 204
Multinational Insolvencies: the Norm of Judicial Cooperation 204
Receivership 205

12. Foreign Judgments 211

Recognition and Enforcement 211
Refusal to Recognize the Applicable Indian Law 212
Judgment Opposed to Natural or Substantial Justice 212
What Constitutes Denial of Natural or Substantial Justice? 212
Judgment Obtained by Fraud 213
Sustaining a Claim Founded on a Breach of Any Law in Force in India 214

Foreign Arbitral Awards and Foreign Judgments Based Upon Such Awards: A Juridical Inquiry 216
GENERAL OBSERVATIONS 216
FORUM FOR ARBITRATION, WHETHER IRREVOCABLE: SCOPE FOR THE
OPERATION OF THE DOCTRINE OF BALANCE OF CONVENIENS 220

13. Procedure 222
SUBSTANCE AND PROCEDURE: THE BASIC DISTINCTION 222
PROCEDURAL MATTERS OF INTERLOCUTORY CHARACTER 223
REMEDIAL MEASURES FOR ENFORCING A RIGHT 224
CONFLICT OF LAWS AND THE LAW OF LIMITATIONS 225
MATTERS OF ENFORCEMENT 226
STAY OF PROCEEDINGS: UNDERLYING NORMS AND PRINCIPLES 226
GENERAL OBSERVATIONS 226
STAY OF ACTION: FORUM NON CONVENIENS 227
OTHER CAUSES FOR STAY OF PROCEEDINGS 228
BREACH OF JURISDICTION CLAUSE: APPLICABLE NORMS 229
GRANT OF INJUNCTION TO RESTRAIN FOREIGN PROCEEDINGS:
UNDERLYING JURIDICAL CRITERIA 229
PROOF OF FOREIGN LAW 230
FOREIGN LAW NEEDS PROOF 230
MODE OF PROOF OF FOREIGN LAW 231

INTRODUCTION 236
RECOGNITION OF DECREES OF DIVORCES AND JUDICIAL SEPARATION AND MAINTENANCE OBLIGATIONS 237
CHILD CUSTODY AND CHILD ABDUCTION 239
INTRODUCTION 239
WHETHER INDIA SHOULD EMBRACE THE 1980 HAGUE CONVENTION ON THE CIVIL ASPECTS OF INTERNATIONAL CHILD ABDUCTION 243
THE HAGUE CONVENTION ON PROTECTION OF CHILDREN AND COOPERATION IN RESPECT OF INTER-COUNTRY ADOPTION, 1993 246
Inter-Country Adoptions: Strategies for Eliminating Misuse 246
THE LAW RELATING TO SUCCESSION 249
GENERAL RULES OF CONFLICT OF LAWS 249
FORMAL VALIDITY UNDER THE HAGUE CONVENTION ON THE CONFLICTS OF LAWS RELATING TO THE FORM OF TESTAMENTARY DISPOSITION 250
Contents xv

The Hague Convention on the Law Applicable to Succession to the Estates of Deceased Persons 251

The Law Relating to Service of Summons Abroad 252

The Existing Procedure for Service of Summons Under the (Indian) Code of Civil Procedure, 1908:

Service of Summons 252

Summons under 26A to be Sent to Officers of Foreign Countries 253

The Limitations of the Existing State of the Law Relating to Service Abroad 254

The Hague Convention on Service of Summons Abroad, 1965: A Review 255

Hague Convention Abolishing the Requirement of Legalization for Foreign Public Documents, 1961 257

Hague Convention on Taking of Evidence Abroad in Civil or Commercial Matters, 1970 259

Chapter I: General Observations 260

Chapter II: Taking of Evidence by Diplomatic Officers, Consular Agents, and Commissioners 264

Chapter III: General Clauses 266

15. The Trend-setting Developments in

Conflict of Laws

The 'Rule Selection' Rule in Conflict of Laws: A Critique of the So-called American Revolution 270

Introduction 271

Morris and the Proper Law Theory 274

The Proper Law Doctrine: Case Illustrations 277

Walter Wheeler Cook: The Local Law Theory 280

Justice Learned Hand: His So-called, Local Law Theory 280

David F. Cavers: The 'Rule Selection' Rule 281

Professor W.F. Baxter: The Comparative Impairment Theory 283

Professor Brainerd Currie: The Governmental Interest Theory 287

Willis L.M. Reese’s Restatement (Second), Conflict of Laws: ‘A Holistic Approach to Conflict Resolution’ 289

Conclusion 294

A Complementary Resume 298
ANNEXURES


2. Convention on the Service Abroad of Judicial and Extrajudicial Documents in Civil or Commercial Matters, 1965

3. Convention on the Taking of Evidence Abroad in Civil or Commercial Matters, 1970


5. Convention of 29 May 1993 on Protection of Children and Co-operation in Respect of Intercountry Adoption


ANNEX 1: TRANSMITTAL FORM UNDER ARTICLE 12(2) 396
ANNEX 2: ACKNOWLEDGMENT FORM UNDER ARTICLE 12(3) 399


Case Index 412
Index 423