A Coherent European Procurement Law and Policy for the Space Sector
Towards a Third Way

With contributions by

Martin Faix, MJI
Univerzita Karlova v Praze

Rik Hansen
Katholieke Universiteit Leuven

Dr. Oliver Heinrich
Attorney at law, BHO Legal

Prof. Dr. Stephan Hobe, LL.M.
Universität zu Köln

Prof. JUDr. Mahulena Hofmannová, CSc.
Univerzita Karlova v Praze

Julia Holdorf
Universität zu Köln

Irina Kerner
Universität zu Köln

Jan Helge Mey, LL.M.
Universität zu Köln

Milan A. Plücken
Universität zu Köln

Heike Schwier
Universität zu Köln

Dr. Steven Sterkx
Katholieke Universiteit Leuven

Prof. Dr. Jan Wouters, LL.M.
Katholieke Universiteit Leuven

edited by

Stephan Hobe, Mahulena Hofmannová,
and Jan Wouters
## CONTENTS

**Preface** vi

**Executive Summary** vii

**Contents** x

**Contents** xi

**Bibliography** xxiii

**Table of Cases** xlv

**Abbreviations** xlix

### Part A. ESA–EU Cooperation in Space – A New Chapter of the European Space Administration

#### Chapter I. The Pre-Framework Agreement Development

1. The Years of Total Separation 1

2. The Rapprochement and the Common Initiatives of the 1990s Galileo and GMES 6

3. The Way towards a Framework Agreement 12


   b. The Commissioned Studies on ESA–EU Cooperation Models 14

   c. The Setup of the Galileo Joint Undertaking 16

   d. The Green and White Papers of the Commission 19

   e. The Signing of the Framework Agreement 21

#### Chapter II. The Framework Agreement and the Procurement Issues in the European Space Policy (ESP)

1. Procurement Issues in the Drafting Process of the Framework Agreement and Their Relation to Governance 23

2. The Framework Agreement’s Attitude to Procurement 25

3. Drafting and Implementing the European Space Policy 26

#### Chapter III. ESA–EU Procurement Policy Discussions – State of Play and Change(s) of Attitude 28

1. Policy Discussions by the Vantage Point of the EU Council Presidencies: The Footprint of the German and French EU Council Presidencies and the Czech Follow-Up 28

2. Development of the Attitude to the Procurement Issue in the European Space Policy Documents and the Implementation of the ESA–EU Flagship Projects 29

3. Mastering the Economic Crisis: The EU Attitude to Space 2009/2010 33

#### Chapter IV. Determining the Scope of the Study

1. Defining “Space” in Space Procurement 37

2. Focusing on “Procurement” of ESA–EU Joint Projects 38

3. Putting “Space” and “Procurement” Together: A Toolbox 39

### Part B. Current Procurement Law

#### Chapter I. ESA Procurement Rules

1. Introduction 42

   a. Historic Origins 43

   b. Considerations Impacting ESA Procurement 44

   i. The Specificity of ESA as an Objective-driven Intergovernmental
Organisation

ii. Considerations of International Cooperation
   (1) Political Considerations: Balancing the ESA’s Intergovernmental Setup
   (2) The Relationship between ESA Procurement Rules and International Law

iii. Factors Relating to the Nature of the Space Industry and the Space Market

iv. Other Policy Objectives: Involvement of SMEs

c. Conclusion

2. Current ESA Procurement Rules
   a. Legal Basis
      i. ESA Convention
      ii. Implementing Measures
         (1) ESA Procurement Regulations
         (2) General Clauses and Conditions for ESA Contracts
         (3) Best Practices for the Selection of Subcontractors
   b. The Procurement Cycle
      i. Initiation
      ii. Choice of Procurement method
         (1) Competitive Tendering
         (2) Non-Competitive Tendering
      iii. Preparation and Distribution of ITT
      iv. Eligibility, Preparation and Submission of Tender
      v. Evaluation of Tenders and Award of Contract
      vi. Debriefing of Unsuccessful Tenderers and Review Procedures
   c. Geographic Return
      i. Calculation
      ii. Targets
      iii. Preventive and Corrective Measures
         (1) Fair Return or Fair Contribution?
         (2) Proactive Monitoring of Industrial Return
         (3) Inclusion of Corrective Measures from the Outset
         (4) Phased Procurement Approach in Long Duration Programmes
         (5) Corrective Measures after Interim Review
         (6) Flexibility in the Science Programme
         (7) Placing Contracts by Direct Negotiation
         (8) Subsequent Adjustment of Contributions
      iv. Conclusion
   d. Evolution of ESA Procurement Rules
      i. Optimisation
      ii. Rapprochement
   e. Conclusion

3. Interim Conclusion

Chapter II. EU Procurement Rules

1. Introduction
   a. Historical Overview
   b. Overview on Current Procurement Framework
   c. Current EU Procurements
CONTENTS

d. Procurement to Satisfy Public Demand and Procurement as a Tool of Industrial Policy 85
e. European Budget 'Debate' and Correcting Mechanisms 86

2. General Procurement Rules 88
      i. Scope 90
      ii. Award Principles and Policies 94
      iii. Subject-Matter Definition 95
      iv. Publication 97
   v. Numerus Clausus of Procurement Procedures 98
      (1) Open Procedure 100
      (2) Restricted Procedure 100
      (3) Contests 100
      (4) Negotiated Procedure 101
      (5) Competitive Dialogue 102
   vi. Substantive Criteria 103
      (1) Participation 103
      (2) Exclusion Criteria and Administrative Penalties 103
      (3) Selection Criteria 104
      (4) Award Criteria 105
   vii. Review and Remedy 106
   b. Primary Law 107
      i. Applicability 108
      ii. Fundamental Freedoms 108
         (1) Free Movement of Goods 108
         (2) Right of Establishment and Freedom to Provide Services 110
      iii. Charter of Fundamental Rights 112
      iv. Supplementary Rights and Principles 112
         (1) Equal Treatment and Non-Discrimination 112
         (2) Transparency 114
         (3) Legal Certainty 114
         (4) Proportionality 115
         (5) Mutual Recognition 115
      v. Flanking Regulations 115
      vi. Related Policy Objectives 118
      vii. Treaty Amendments 121
   c. International Treaties 121
      i. The European Free Trade Association and the European Economic Area 121
      ii. WTO Government Procurement Agreement 122
      iii. Bilateral Agreements as Supplements to the WTO GPA 124
3. Space Procurement Rules 124
   a. Research and Development – FP7 124
   b. GNSS Regulation – Galileo Deployment Phase 128
   c. GMES Regulation 132
   d. European Defence Agency 135
   e. European Union Satellite Centre 139
4. Interim Conclusion

Chapter III. Difficulties of New Member States Relating to the Transition to EU and ESA Procurement Rules

1. Introduction
   a. The Transformation Scenario and the Scope of this Chapter
   b. Legal Reform as a Part of the General Transformation Process
   c. Legal Reform as a Part of the EU Accession Process and the Implementation of the Acquis

2. Transition to EU Procurement Rules
   a. Introduction
   b. The Czech Republic
      i. EU Accession Experience of the Czech Republic
      ii. Transformation and Development of the Czech Procurement Law
         (2) Act No. 199/1994 Coll., on Awarding Public Contracts
         (3) Act No. 40/2004 Coll., on Public Procurement
         (4) Act No. 137/2006 Coll., on Public Procurement
         (5) Current Situation
         (6) Act No. 139/2006 Coll., on Concession Contracts and Concession Procedure, as Amended
         (7) Conclusions
   c. Hungary
   d. Poland
   e. Common Strengths and Difficulties Identified
      i. Common Strengths
      ii. Common Difficulties
         (1) Ethics and Transparency in Public Procurement Systems of the New Member States
         (2) Formalism in Public Procurement Systems of the New Member States
         (3) Frequent Changes of the Legal Framework
      f. Conclusions

3. Transition to ESA Procurement Rules
   a. Introduction
   b. The Development of Cooperation between the CEE Countries and the ESA
   c. Post-Accession Experience of the Czech Republic
   d. Conclusions

4. Transition to the EU and the ESA Procurement Rules – A Comparison

Part C. Market Analysis and Stakeholder Consultation

Chapter I. Market Analysis

1. Introduction

2. Member State Positions
   a. France
      i. Administration: CNES
      ii. Industry
   b. Germany
      i. Administration: DLR
      ii. Industry
3. Economic Specificities of the Space Market 197
   a. Specificities 197
      i. High Technology Content - Nature of Space Technology 197
      ii. High Cost of Access to Space 199
      iii. (Missed) economies of scale / small size of the European market 199
      iv. Strategic nature of space assets 201
   b. Market segmentation 202
      i. Upstream 202
         (1) Satellite Applications Programmes 202
         (2) Science Programmes 203
         (3) Launchers 203
         (4) Ground Segments 204
      ii. Downstream 204
   4. Interim Conclusion 205

Chapter II. Stakeholder Consultation 206
1. Introduction 206
2. Methodology 206
   a. Selection of Stakeholders 206
   b. Method of contacting / questioning 208
   c. Reply rate 209
   d. Method of reporting 209
3. Question topics 209
4. Results 212
   a. The Structure of the European Space Industry / European Space Market 212
      i. There is no Single Set of Specificities of the Space Market 212
      ii. The European Space Market is Top-Heavy 213
      iii. Telecommunications are the Predominant Commercial Space Market 213
      iv. Profits in the Upstream Space Sector are Limited 213
      v. In the Manufacturing Sector, Consolidation Has Reached Its Limit at Prime Level 213
   b. ESA procurement at present 214
      i. High-Technology Content 214
ii. Small Size of the European Market 214
iii. Strategic Considerations 215
iv. General Evaluation of the ESA 215
v. Personal Experiences with ESA Procurement in Practice 216
vi. Potential to Improve 216
vii. The Relationship between the ESA Procurement System and Its Industrial Policy 217

c. Evolution of ESA Procurement 219
d. EU Procurement 220
i. EU Industrial Policy Objectives 220
ii. Traces of Geographic Distribution in EU Policies 221
iii. Appropriateness of EU Funding Instruments 221
e. Procurement in EU–ESA Cooperative Programmes 221
i. General Evaluation 221
ii. Evaluation of Procurement Tools Used in the GNSS Regulation 222
f. Instruments proposed 223

Chapter I. Context of the Third Way 224
1. Policy Objectives 224
   a. Attractiveness for Member States to Invest in Space 224
   b. Efficient Use of Resources 225
   c. Global Competitiveness of the European Space Industry / Economy 226
   d. European Autonomy / Non-Dependence 226
   e. Balanced Involvement of Capacities in Europe 227
2. Market Conditions 228
   a. Economic Specificities 228
   b. Market Sectors 230
   c. The European Space Market Structure 230
   d. Conclusions for the Third Way 231
3. Legal Framework 231

Chapter II. Analogies, Procurement in Practice and Extra-Procurement Instruments 233
1. Analogies 233
   a. EUMETSAT 233
      i. Financing 234
      ii. Procurement 235
      iii. Results 236
   b. ITER – Fusion for Energy (F4E) 237
      i. EFDA 237
      ii. Institutions 237
      iii. Financing 238
      iv. F4E Procurement 239
      v. ITER Procurement 242
      vi. Results 243
   c. European Security and Defence Procurement 243
      i. Development of cooperation in the defence sector 243
      ii. Defence Procurement Rules for Member States 245
         (1) Communication on Article 296 TEC 246
         (2) Defence and Security Procurement Directive 247
(3) Directive 2009/43/EC on Intra-EU Transfers of Defence Products 252
(4) Codes of Conduct 252

iii. EDA Ad-hoc Programmes 253
d. Aircraft Manufacturing 255
   i. Aircraft market (especially for large civil aircraft) 255
   ii. Key players 256
   iii. Reasons for government influence and support 258
   iv. State Support and WTO Claims 260
   v. KC-X Tanker: EADS v Boeing 263
      (1) No general nationality requirement 265
      (2) Other restrictions 266

2. Cross-Cutting Analysis – Procurement in Practice 268
   a. Practical Difficulties in Defining the Procurement Object 268
      i. Current ESA Procurement Rules 269
      ii. New ESA Procurement Rules 270
      iii. EU Procurement Rules 272
   b. Practical Difficulties of Real Competition 272
      i. Current ESA Procurement Rules 274
      ii. EU Procurement Rules 276
   c. Pre-involved Contractors as Bidders 278
      i. Current and New ESA Procurement Rules 278
   d. Project Consultants for the Preparation of Procurement documents as Bidders 280
      i. Current and New ESA Procurement Rules 280
      ii. EU Procurement Rules 281
   e. Requirement of Flexibility for Procurement in the Space Sector 281
      i. Preliminary Authorisations to Proceed (PATP) and Limitations of Liability (LOL) 282
         (1) Current and New ESA Procurement Rules 283
         (2) EU Procurement rules 283
      ii. Contract Change Notice (CCN) 283
         (1) Current and New ESA Procurement Rules 284
         (2) EU Procurement Rules 284
      iii. Negotiation and Re-negotiations 285
         (1) Current ESA Procurement Rules 286
         (2) New ESA Procurement Rules 287
         (3) EU Procurement Rules 288
      iv. Use of Options and Framework Agreements 288
         (1) Current ESA Procurement Rules 291
         (2) New ESA Procurement Rules 291
         (3) EU Procurement Rules 292
      v. Admitting Alternative Solutions and Variants 293
         (1) Current and New ESA Procurement Rules 294
         (2) EU Procurement Rules 295
      vi. Use of Supplier Lists and Prequalification Procedures 295
         (1) Current ESA Procurement Rules 298
         (2) New ESA Procurement Rules 299
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>vii.</td>
<td>Contract Duration and Prolongations</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1)</td>
<td>Current and New ESA Procurement Rules</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2)</td>
<td>EU Procurement Rules</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>viii.</td>
<td>Requirements for Quick Support and Life-time Support</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1)</td>
<td>Current and New ESA Procurement Rules</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2)</td>
<td>EU Procurement Rules</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f.</td>
<td>Requirements concerning legal remedies</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.</td>
<td>Current ESA Procurement Rules</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii.</td>
<td>New ESA Procurement Rules</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii.</td>
<td>EU Procurement Rules</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g.</td>
<td>Evaluation of Findings and Conclusion</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Extra-Procurement Instruments</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>European Funds for a “Balanced Development”</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.</td>
<td>Cohesion Funds</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1)</td>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2)</td>
<td>Financial Contribution – Ceilings, Types</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3)</td>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation as Procedural Tools</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii.</td>
<td>Structural Funds</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>European Investment Bank Group</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Research and Development</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.</td>
<td>EU Research and Development: Framework Programmes</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1)</td>
<td>Mixed Funding Sources and Co-financing</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2)</td>
<td>Intellectual Property Rights</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii.</td>
<td>ESA Research and Development</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1)</td>
<td>The European Space Technology Strategy and Harmonisation Process</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2)</td>
<td>ARTES</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Extra Procurement Instruments and Mechanisms or Programmes Addressed to SMEs</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.</td>
<td>Competitiveness and Innovation Framework Programme</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii.</td>
<td>SineQuaNet, LET SME, C1-C4 Clauses, Transfer of Technology and Innovation</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Joint Programming</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f.</td>
<td>Pre-commercial Procurement</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.</td>
<td>Nature</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii.</td>
<td>Conditions for Use</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii.</td>
<td>Relevance for Space Procurement</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g.</td>
<td>European Lead Market Initiative</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter III. Tools for Space Procurement | 343 |

1. Definition of Programme and Procurement Object | 345 |
   a. Explanatory Description | 345 |
   b. Policy Assessment | 345 |
   c. Market Assessment | 346 |
   d. Legal Assessment | 346 |
   i. ESA | 346 |
   ii. EU | 346 |

2. Participation Rules: Restrictions, Preferences Based on Nationality | 349 |
   a. Explanatory Description | 349 |
b. Policy Assessment 350

c. Market Assessment 350

d. Legal Assessment 351
  i. ESA 351
  ii. EU 351

3. Work Packages: Splitting, Sizing 355
   a. Explanatory Description 355
   b. Policy Assessment 356
   c. Market Assessment 357
   d. Legal Assessment 358
     i. ESA 358
     ii. EU 358

4. Restricting the Individual Bidding Possibilities 359
   a. Explanatory Description 359
   b. Policy Assessment 359
   c. Market Assessment 360
   d. Legal Assessment 360
     i. ESA 360
     ii. EU 360

5. Balancing the Advantage of Pre-Involved Contractors 366
   a. Explanatory Description 366
   b. Policy Assessment 366
   c. Market Assessment 367
   d. Legal Assessment 368
     i. ESA 368
     ii. EU 368

6. Multiple Sourcing 370
   a. Explanatory Description 370
   b. Policy Assessment 370
   c. Market Assessment 370
   d. Legal Assessment 371
     i. ESA 371
     ii. EU 371

7. Sole Sourcing via Joint Ventures 373
   a. Explanatory Description 373
   b. Policy Assessment 373
   c. Market Assessment 374
   d. Legal Assessment 375
     i. ESA 375
     ii. EU 375

8. Sole Sourcing via IPR Regime 376
   a. Explanatory Description 376
   b. Policy Assessment 376
   c. Market Assessment 377
   d. Legal Assessment 377
     i. ESA 377
     ii. EU 378
9. Sub-contracting 379  
   a. Explanatory Description 379  
   b. Policy Assessment 379  
   c. Market Assessment 380  
   d. Legal Assessment 380  
      i. ESA 380  
      ii. EU 381  
10. n-State Criterion 384  
    a. Explanatory Description 384  
    b. Policy Assessment 384  
    c. Market Assessment 385  
    d. Legal Assessment 385  
       i. ESA 385  
       ii. EU 385  
11. Know-How Transfer 387  
   a. Explanatory Description 387  
   b. Policy Assessment 387  
   c. Market Assessment 388  
   d. Legal Assessment 388  
      i. ESA 388  
      ii. EU 388  
12. Best Value for Money as Award Criterion I 389  
  a. Explanatory Description 389  
  b. Policy Assessment 389  
  c. Market Assessment 389  
  d. Legal Assessment 390  
     i. ESA 390  
     ii. EU 390  
13. Best Value for Money as Award Criterion II 391  
  a. Explanatory Description 391  
  b. Policy Assessment 391  
  c. Market Assessment 392  
  d. Legal Assessment 392  
     i. ESA 392  
     ii. EU 392  
14. Concentration Correcting Mechanism 395  
  a. Explanatory Description 395  
  b. Policy Assessment 395  
  c. Market Assessment 395  
  d. Legal Assessment 395  
     i. ESA 395  
     ii. EU 396  
15. Nationality as Award Criterion 397  
  a. Explanatory Description 397  
  b. Policy Assessment 397  
  c. Market Assessment 398  
  d. Legal Assessment 399  
     i. ESA 399  
     ii. EU 400
16. Varying Degrees of Advantage given to SMEs or Research Institutions 403
   a. Explanatory Description 403
   b. Policy Assessment 403
   c. Market Assessment 403
   d. Legal Assessment 404
   i. ESA 404
   ii. EU 405

17. Abnormally Low Tenders 406
   a. Explanatory Description 406
   b. Policy Assessment 406
   c. Market Assessment 407
   d. Legal Assessment 407
   i. ESA 407
   ii. EU 408

18. Weighting of Votes based on Financial Contribution 412
   a. Explanatory Description 412
   b. Policy Assessment 412
   c. Market Assessment 413
   d. Legal Assessment 413
   i. ESA 413
   ii. EU 413

   a. Explanatory Description 414
   b. Policy Assessment 414
   c. Market Assessment 415
   d. Legal Assessment 415
   i. ESA 415
   ii. EU 415

20. Contact Between Bidders as well as Between Bidders and Contracting Authority 417
   a. Explanatory Description 417
   b. Policy Assessment 417
   c. Market Assessment 418
   d. Legal Assessment 419
   i. ESA 419
   ii. EU 420

21. Flexibility in Procurement Procedure 422
   a. Explanatory Description 422
   b. Policy Assessment 422
   c. Market Assessment 423
   d. Legal Assessment 423
   i. ESA 423
   ii. EU 424

22. Commencement of Work Prior to Signature of Contract 425
   a. Explanatory Description 425
   b. Policy Assessment 425
   c. Market Assessment 426
d. Legal Assessment 426
   i. ESA 426
   ii. EU 426
23. Framework Agreements and Options in Contracts 428
   a. Explanatory Description 428
   b. Policy Assessment 428
   c. Market Assessment 429
   d. Legal Assessment 429
      i. ESA 429
      ii. EU 429
24. Contract Duration 430
   a. Explanatory Description 430
   b. Policy Assessment 430
   c. Market Assessment 431
   d. Legal Assessment 431
      i. ESA 431
      ii. EU 431
25. Re-negotiation and Contract Changes 432
   a. Explanatory Description 432
   b. Policy Assessment 432
   c. Market Assessment 433
   d. Legal Assessment 433
      i. ESA 433
      ii. EU 433
26. Legal Remedies 435
   a. Explanatory Description 435
   b. Policy Assessment 435
   c. Market Assessment 435
   d. Legal Assessment 436
      i. ESA 436
      ii. EU 437
27. Monitoring and Statistics 438
   a. Explanatory Description 438
   b. Policy Assessment 438
   c. Market Assessment 438
   d. Legal Assessment 438
      i. ESA 438
      ii. EU 439
Chapter IV. The Third Way: A Toolbox 441

Index 448